



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final - Final Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, August 25, 2015

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Present 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

Approval of Agenda

Assistant City Attorney Mr. Ron Ramsingh suggested that due to the project approval for 616 Eaton Street being under appeal to the Special Magistrate that the item #4 (Second Reading for demolition at 616 Eaton Street) be postponed indefinitely until the appellate process has run its course, a motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the Action Item#4 be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote: No: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Mr. Logan; Yes: Ms. Hinkle, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the agenda be approved as amended. The motion carried by the an unanimous Roll Call Vote.

Approval of Minutes

1 July 28, 2015 Minutes

Attachments: [July 28, 2015 HARC Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Minutes be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

HARC Planner's Report

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Action Items

- 2 Approval to change September 22 regular meeting to September 29, 2015, due to conflict with City Commission's budget workshop.

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved to move the September 2015 Monthly meeting to September 29th. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

Old Business

- 3 Demolition of rear addition and front porch. Partial demolition of south side walls. - **#805 Shavers Lane - Thomas Pope (H15-01-0829)**
Second Reading

Attachments: [805 Shavers Lane - Demolition Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

- 4 Demolition of rear additions of contributing house - **#616 Eaton Street - William Horn Architects (H15-01-0842)** **Second Reading**

Attachments: [616 Eaton Street - Demolition Second Reading](#)

[Public Comments - September 29, 2015](#)

[Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

**Ashley Sybesma, the representative for Owner
Dana Dey - 416 Elizabeth Street**

During Agenda setting, Assistant City Attorney Mr. Ron Ramsingh suggested that due to the project approval being under appeal to the Special Magistrate that the item be postponed indefinitely until the appellate process has run its course, a motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Mr. Logan

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

5 Demolition of dilapidated carport and accessory structure - **#210 Olivia Street - David Knoll (H15-01-0980) Second Reading**

Attachments: [210 Olivia Street - Demolition Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

6 Demolition of non-historic rear guest house. Demolition of wall on main house - **#1109 Fleming Street - Matthew Stratton (H15-01-1006) Second Reading**

Attachments: [1109 Fleming Street - Demolition Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

7a New house on vacant lot - **#1402 Whalton Street - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-1014)**

Attachments: [1402 Whalton Street - Design](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Paula Carbonell - 1016 South Street

Donna Bosold - 317 Whitehead Street

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that iron gates would be used. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

7b Partial demolition of historic fence - **#1402 Whalton Street - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-1014)**

Attachments: [1402 Whalton Street- Demolition Second Reading](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Paula Carbonell - 1016 South Street

Donna Bosold - 317 Whitehead Street

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that iron gates would be used. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

New Business

- 8 **Modifications to Major Development Plan** - New bathroom facilities and general park signage - Truman Waterfront Park - **West end of Southard Street - City of Key West/Bermello Ajamil & Partners (H15-01-1201)**
- Attachments: [Truman Waterfront - Modifications to Major Development Plan](#)
- A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
- No:** 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Hinkle
- Yes:** 5 - Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 9a New rear addition and renovations to existing house. New pool, deck and fences - **#732 Poorhouse Lane - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-0841)**
- Attachments: [Postponement Requested by Applicant](#)
 [732 Poorhouse Lane - Design](#)
 [Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)
 [Public Comments - September 24, 2015](#)
 [August 25, 2015 Meeting - 732 Poorhouse Lane - Design](#)
 [August 25, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments](#)
- At the request of the applicant , a motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Postponed.
- 9b Demolition of front concrete porch and back additions. Demolition of shed structure - **#732 Poorhouse Lane - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-0841)**
- Attachments: [Postponement Requested by Applicant.pdf](#)
 [732 Poorhouse Lane - Demolition](#)
 [Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)
 [Public Comments - September 24, 2015](#)
 [August 25, 2015 Meeting - 732 Poorhouse Lane - Demolition](#)
 [August 25, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments](#)
- At the request of the applicant , a motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Postponed.
- Yes:** 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 10 Wood hanging sign exceeding 5 square feet - **#1013 Truman Avenue - Schroeder Builders/Dana Winchell (H15-01-0931)**

Attachments: [1013 Truman Avenue - Sign](#)

11 New front porch- **#1000 Southard Street - William Rowan
(H15-01-1003)**

Attachments: [1000 Southard Street](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Denied based on the Historic Architectural Guidelines, specifically the following guidelines for additions and alterations (pages 36 and 37); Guideline 1- A structure shall not be altered and/or expanded in such a manner that its essential character-defining features are disguised or concealed, Guideline 5- Additions should be attached to less publicly visible secondary elevations of a historic structure, and Guideline 8- New additions should be designated and constructed to be clearly differentiated from the historical so the character defining features are not changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed. The Commission also based their decision on the Secretary of the Interior Standards, included under pages 16 and 17 of the guidelines, specifically; Standard 2- The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided, Standard 9- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment, and Standard 10- New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

12a Restoration of front porch and structural stabilization to historic eyebrow house - **#610-614 Dey Street - Bender and Associates
(H15-01-1078)**

Attachments: [610-614 Dey Street- Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

12b Demolition of attached structure to the front porch and removal of non-historic enclosure of front porch - **#610-614 Dey Street - Bender and Associates (H15-01-1078)**

Attachments: [610-614 Dey Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item

be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

13a

Construction of re-designed wood deck and staircase at east side of the main structure - **#817 Eaton Street Unit 4 - Robert Delaune (H15-01-1123)**

Attachments: [817 Eaton Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

13b

Demolition of non-historic wood staircase and deck - **#817 Eaton Street Unit 4 - Robert Delaune (H15-01-1123)**

Attachments: [817 Eaton Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

14a

Construction of in-ground pool - **#1112 Elgin Lane - Salinero Construction (H15-01-1151)**

Attachments: [1112 Elgin Lane - Design](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Ms. Thompson

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, and Chairman Green

14b

Demolition of trellis - **#1112 Elgin Lane - Salinero Construction (H15-01-1151)**

Attachments: [1112 Elgin Lane - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Ms. Thompson

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, and Chairman Green

- 15** Window signs exceeding the maximum number allowed - **After-the Fact - #824-826 Duval Street - Dana Winchell/Amber Levinson (H15-01-1168)**
- Attachments:** [824-826 Duval Street - Sign \(AFTER-THE-FACT\)](#)
- A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Denied based on based on the Land Development Regulations and Article VI- Design Guidelines in Key West Historic District, particularly Section 114-104 of the Land Development Regulations: Restriction on number of signs permitted. The motion carried by the following vote:
- Yes:** 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 16** Air conditioning unit at front window - **#2 Hunts Lane - McChesney Contractors (H15-01-1196)**
- Attachments:** [2 Hunts Lane - AC Unit](#)
- A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
- Recuse:** 1 - Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 17a** One-story addition and site work - **#618 Free School Lane - Thomas Kelly (H15-01-1199)**
- Attachments:** [618 Free School Alley - Design](#)
[618 Free School Alley - Public Comments](#)
- A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
- No:** 1 - Ms. Thompson
- Yes:** 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, and Chairman Green
- 17b** Demolition of walls to accommodate new addition - **#618 Free School Lane - Thomas Kelly (H15-01-1199)**
- Attachments:** [618 Free School Alley- Demoolition](#)
- A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
- Yes:** 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 18a** Rear two story addition - **#808 Whitehead Street - William P. Horn**
-

(H15-01-1204)

Attachments: [808 Whitehead Street - Design](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Colette Wile - 810 Whitehead Street

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

18b

Demolition of rear wall and partial demolition of roof on non-historic addition. Demolition of shed - **#808 Whitehead Street - William P. Horn (H15-01-1204)**

Attachments: [808 Whitehead Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

19a

New two-story addition and renovations to existing house. Request to move the building to the west as it encroaches City right-of-way. Site work - **#723 Olivia Street - Meridian Engineering (H15-01-1216)**

Attachments: [723 Olivia Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Richard McChesney, seconded by Mr. Richard Logan, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that the rear elevation be changed to use French doors with Staff Approval. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

No: 3 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, and Mr. Miller

Yes: 4 - Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

19b

Demolition of one-story rear addition - **#723 Olivia Street - Meridian Engineering (H15-01-1216)**

Attachments: [723 Olivia Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

Comments from Commissioners

****What options are available to HARC when addressing irreparable after the fact applications?**

Adjournment

8:45pm