

## Karen DeMaria

---

**From:** Jackman, Bryan <Bryan.Jackman@dot.state.fl.us>  
**Sent:** Monday, September 12, 2022 9:40 AM  
**To:** Jett, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Wang, BaoYing; Marrero, Renato; Karen DeMaria  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] RE: Whitehead and Caroline Street Mahogany tree-Key West - Need FDOT Input  
**Attachments:** Key West Mahogany.pdf

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Elizabeth,

Please see the consultant's analysis attached.

After receiving the consultant's feedback, we strongly agree that the Mahogany tree at the corner of Southard and Whitehead should be removed. We also agree that a small native tree could substitute for this tree. The tree could easily be maintained to not interfere with overhead utilities. If there is not an existing maintenance agreement (MMOA) between FDOT and the city, the small native tree should be an FDOT maintained species.

If you have any further questions, please let us know.

**Bryan Jackman**

In-House Consultant Project Manager- WGI  
Consultant Management Office  
Florida Department of Transportation – District VI  
1000 NW 111 Ave, Room 6251  
Miami, FL 33172  
☎ (305) 470-5400  
✉ [Bryan.Jackman@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:Bryan.Jackman@dot.state.fl.us)

**From:** Wang, BaoYing <BaoYing.Wang@dot.state.fl.us>  
**Sent:** Monday, September 12, 2022 7:08 AM  
**To:** Jackman, Bryan <Bryan.Jackman@dot.state.fl.us>  
**Subject:** RE: Whitehead and Caroline Street Mahogany tree-Key West - Need FDOT Input

Please provide a response to Elizabeth.

Thanks.

Bao-Ying Wang, PE, CPM  
Project Management Engineer Supervisor  
Consultant Management Office  
Florida Department of Transportation - District Six  
1000 NW 111th Avenue, Room 6251  
Miami, Florida 33172  
Phone: (305) 470-5211  
E-mail: [BaoYing.Wang@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:BaoYing.Wang@dot.state.fl.us)

**From:** Jett, Elizabeth <[Elizabeth.Jett@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:Elizabeth.Jett@dot.state.fl.us)>  
**Sent:** Friday, September 9, 2022 4:16 PM  
**To:** Wang, BaoYing <[BaoYing.Wang@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:BaoYing.Wang@dot.state.fl.us)>; Marrero, Renato <[Renato.Marrero@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:Renato.Marrero@dot.state.fl.us)>  
**Cc:** Karen DeMaria <[kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov](mailto:kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: Whitehead and Caroline Street Mahogany tree-Key West - Need FDOT Input  
**Importance:** High

Good afternoon, Any input to provide for the Key West Tree Commission hearing on Tuesday?

**Elizabeth Jett, PE**  
District Permit Engineer  
Florida Department of Transportation  
District 6 Maintenance Office  
1000 NW 111<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Miami, FL 33172  
Office: (305) 470-5356/Cell: (305) 951-0015

**From:** Jett, Elizabeth <[Elizabeth.Jett@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:Elizabeth.Jett@dot.state.fl.us)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 6, 2022 3:26 PM  
**To:** Wang, BaoYing <[BaoYing.Wang@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:BaoYing.Wang@dot.state.fl.us)>; Marrero, Renato <[Renato.Marrero@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:Renato.Marrero@dot.state.fl.us)>  
**Subject:** Fw: Whitehead and Caroline Street Mahogany tree-Key West  
**Importance:** High

Good afternoon, Bao Ying. Please advise on this issue. Seems that it would be important for the D6 Landscape Architect to respond to, or an RLA in his/her place.

I read the arborist report and the arborist indicates the tree should be removed.

Thanks.

**Elizabeth Jett, PE**  
District Permit Engineer  
Florida Department of Transportation  
District 6 Maintenance Office  
1000 NW 111<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Miami, FL 33172  
Office: (305) 470-5356/Cell: (305) 951-0015

---

**From:** Karen DeMaria <[kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov](mailto:kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 6, 2022 3:11 PM  
**To:** Jett, Elizabeth <[Elizabeth.Jett@dot.state.fl.us](mailto:Elizabeth.Jett@dot.state.fl.us)>  
**Cc:** Eric Woods <[eric.woods@hotwirecommunication.com](mailto:eric.woods@hotwirecommunication.com)>  
**Subject:** Whitehead and Caroline Street Mahogany tree-Key West

**EXTERNAL SENDER: Use caution with links and attachments.**

Elizabeth:

Elizabeth:

I have a pending enforcement case against a contractor that did trenching work and cut some primary roots of a mahogany tree located in the right of way sidewalk area at the corner of Whitehead and Southard Streets next to the Monroe County courts property. They also did some damage to the surface roots of adjacent trees in the right of way sidewalk areas (see attachments). This case will be heard by the Tree Commission on Tuesday, September 13. According to the City engineering department, this area is owned by the State so I am reaching out to you for some information.

The mahogany tree whose primary roots were cut has been in declining health that is why I asked Hotwire to hire an arborist to document the condition of the tree and give a prognosis. At the Tree Commission meeting a determination will be made regarding what should happen to the tree and the area. The options are removal and replanting, remain and trim, and/or issue a fine to the contractor. What would the FDOT would like to happen?

Do you approve of the potential removal of the tree based on the arborist report?

Do you approve of the replanting of at least one tree in that location?

Do you approve of the replanting of trees in areas along the Whitehead or Southard tree areas, to be mutually identified by the City and FDOT?

Do you prefer that the mahogany tree remain?

Do you object to improvements being made to the sidewalk tree area on Whitehead Street in front of the County courts buildings to include rocks/sod/groundcover/mulch?

I look forward to hearing from you soon. I know Hotwire wants to get this issue resolved at the meeting Tuesday night. I have copied the Hotwire contact person I have been talking with regarding this issue, on this email.

Sincerely,

Karen

*Karen DeMaria*

Urban Forestry Manager  
Certified Arborist FL-6585A  
City of Key West  
305-809-3768



ISO 9001:2015 CERTIFIED

ENGINEERS • PLANNERS • SCIENTISTS • CONSTRUCTION MANAGERS

1425 W Cypress Creek Road, Suite 101 • Fort Lauderdale, FL 33309 • Phone 954-776-1616

Date: September 9, 2022

To: Bruce Reed and Bryan Jackman

From: Gerald Behan

Subject: Key West Mahogany

After reviewing the Arborist Report by Michael McCoy of New Leaf Environmental and his attached photos, I must concur that this Mahogany at the corner of Southard and Whitehead should be removed. With the limitations of not actually visiting the tree and relying on the Arborist Report and photos, I believe the question is not if this tree will fail but when it will fail. The main factors of the cut roots and the trunk decay in a tree with an existing lean and uncorrected one-sided canopy all point in one direction, that of failure.

The combined factors of 3 cavities, cut roots, girdling roots, leaning one sided canopy, conflict with overhead utilities and too big of a tree in too small of a space, are too great to overcome. There are several great small native trees that could substitute for this tree, and even a usually low branching species could be trained into an excellent specimen.

**Gerald Behan – ISA, FNGLA, LIAF**

*Landscape Inspector*



**KCI TECHNOLOGIES INC.**

1425 West Cypress Creek Road. - Fort Lauderdale, FL 33309

[gerald.behan@kci.com](mailto:gerald.behan@kci.com)

o: 954.776.1616 m: 954.234.1002

[www.kci.com](http://www.kci.com)

RISE TO THE CHALLENGE

*Employee-Owned Since 1988*

[www.kci.com](http://www.kci.com)