

City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall 510 Greene Street Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final - Final Historic Architectural Review Commission

Wednesday, August 27, 2014

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number at 305-809-1000 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

Due to the Chair running late, the meeting was called to order at 5:42pm.

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Absent 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Present 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Approval of Agenda

Ms. Hinkle proposed adding an item to the agenda. Item #16 (Resolution Proposing that all City of Key West Project must be brought before HARC not Staff Approved) was added per Ms. Hinkle's request and the approval of the Commissioners.

Approval of Minutes

1 July 15, 2014 Minutes

Attachments: July 15, 2014 HARC Minutes

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Mr. Wright, that the Minutes be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

HARC Planner's Report

2 **HARC Monthly Report**

Attachments: July 2014 HARC Application Statistics Report

July 2014 HARC Staff Approval Statistics

Received and Filed

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Old Business

3

Demolition of existing cistern- #1019 Eaton Street- Thomas E. Pope (H14-01-1044) - Second Reading

> Attachments: 1019 Eaton Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Wright, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Demolition of existing cbs structure-#903 Eaton Street- William P. Horn (H14-01-1097) - Second Reading

Attachments: 903 Eaton Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

New Business

New pre-fabricated horse stables facilities-Southwest corner of Truman Waterfront Park- City of Key West/ Bermello Ajamil

(H14-01-1100)

Attachments: Horse Stables Facilities - Truman Waterfront Park

A motion was made by Mr. Wright, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

5

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

6 New one story structure to be used as Community Center and oval

covered arcade- Southwest corner of Truman Waterfront Park- City of Key West/ Bermello Ajamil (H14-01-1257)

<u>Attachments:</u> Community Center - Truman Waterfront Park

August 25, 2014 Updated Plans - Truman Waterfront Community

Center

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Major Development Plan- Renovation of existing building and enclose existing metal accessory structure-#1001 James Street- Bender and Associates (H14-01-1259)

<u>Attachments:</u> 1001 James Street - Design

A motion was made by Mr. Wright, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Major Development Plan- Demolition of side and back additions. Removal of metal shed and metal elements. Remove fence from Grinnell Street and portion on James Street with no built back-#1001 James Street-

Bender and Associates (H14-01-1259)

<u>Attachments:</u> 1001 James Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Wright, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

New wood and glass french doors at rear. New aluminum and glass doors at commercial space-#330 Julia Street- William Shepler/ Eric Dickstein (H14-01-1107)

8a

7a

7b

8b

9a

9b

Attachments: 330 James Street - Design

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition the the front doors will be one glass panel with wood frame and approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Mr. Wright

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 4 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Demolition of two walls of non-historic rear addition- #330 Julia Street-William Shepler/ Eric Dickstein (H14-01-1107)

Attachments: 330 James Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Mr. Wright

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 4 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Site improvements to allow for private parking- #631 Whitehead Street- Michael Ingram (H14-01-1108)

<u>Attachments:</u> 631 Whitehead Street - Design

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Demolition of existing building- #631 Whitehead Street- Michael Ingram (H14-01-1108)

Attachments: 631 Whitehead Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Wright, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Chairman Miller

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 4 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, and Mr. Wright

Excused: 0

10

Replace 23 deteriorated wood colonial shutters with aluminum colonial units. New removable metal panels for all six openings for the front façade-#1205 Truman Avenue-Hurricane Shutters of Key West (H14-01-1150)

<u>Attachments:</u> 1205 Truman Avenue

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

11a

New wood front porch. Replace lap siding where removed- #629 Elizabeth Street- Thomas Kelly (H14-01-1248)

<u>Attachments:</u> 629 Elizabeth Street - Design

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved with condition that must submit to staff revised plans and written specifications of front porch roof, unadorned 4" by 4" posts, siding spacing to match original and wood true divided lites windows. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

11b

After the fact demolition of front porch and removal of siding- #629 Elizabeth Street- Thomas Kelly (H14-01-1248)

Attachments: 629 Elizabeth Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Wright, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

12

Renovations of existing house and new addition to connect the garage structure-#1023 Johnson Street- Anthony Sarno(H14-01-1250)

Attachments: 1023 Johnson Street

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Wright, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that the roofing material for the house be metal shingles, as reflected in the original construction plans. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Mr. McChesney

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 4 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Replace windows in contributing structure and cbs addition. Economic hardship request-#1004 Thomas Street- Habitat for Humanity (H14-01-1252)

Attachments: 1004 Thomas Street

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Mr. McChesney

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 4 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

New carport over existing parking area on Packer Street- #912 Truman Avenue- Carlos Rojas (H14-01-1255)

Attachments: 912 Truman Avenue

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Stabilization of existing house. New foundations. Replacement of doors and windows and new wood shutters. New ramp and canvas awning at side. New shingles and gutters for roof and new front fence-#821 Georgia Street- Matthew Stratton (H14-01-1256)

14

15

Attachments: 821 Georgia Street

A motion was made by Mr. McChesney, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Resolution Proposing that all City of Key West Project must be brought before HARC not Staff Approved

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved with minor changes as made by the Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsignh. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Mr. Glorie, and Ms. Gutierrez

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. McChesney, Mr. Wright, and Chairman Miller

Excused: 0

Comments from Commissioners

Adjournment

9:26 PM