Historic Architectural Review Commission

Staff Report Item 5

Meeting Date:	September 23, 2014
Applicant:	Thomas Kelly, Designer
Application Number:	H14-01-1248
Address:	#629 Elizabeth Street
Description of Work:	After the fact demolition of front porch and removal of siding.
Building Facts:	The house in question is listed as a contributing resource. The one story house was built in 1900. According to the Sanborn maps and a circa 1965 photograph the attached back cbs addition has been altered through time; it was enlarged in footprint and was covered with wood lap siding. The house sits on an unusual shape lot where Windsor Lane meets Elizabeth and Angela streets. The house has been abandoned and neglected for the past decades.
	The Planning Board approved a resolution for variances for front and rear yard setbacks.
	The house is under construction at this point.
Ordinance Cited in Review:	Secretary of the Interior's Standards (pages 16-23), specifically Standards 2, 4, 6 and 9. Sections 102-217 (3), demolition for contributing and historic structures of the Land Development Regulations.

Staff Analysis

On August 27 the Commission approved with conditions the new proposed design for the front porch and the first reading for an after the fact demolition request. The Commission motioned to approve the proposed design with the condition that that staff review revise plans and written specifications of front porch roof, unadorned 4" by 4" posts, siding

spacing to match original and wood true divided lites windows. This review is for a second reading request for an after the fact demolition of the roof and columns of a front porch of a historic structure. The house in question was built in 1900 and still have its original mortise and tenon frame construction.

It is staff's opinion that the roof demolition that occurred in the house cannot be supported according to Section 102-218 (a) (1). The front porch roof and its wood elements were not irreparable compromised by extreme deterioration. From submitted photographs of existing conditions prior to the demolition it is evident that the existing posts were not historic. A ca. 1965 photograph depicts the front porch with turned wood columns. If the Commission approve the after the fact demolition this will be the final reading for this request.



CITY OF KEY WEST BUILDING DEPARTMENT CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIAT APPLICAT	[ENENSS ¹⁻²⁰¹⁴ 011248
OWNER'S NAME: David Graham	ENENSS 1-2014 011248 TION # DATE: 07/30/14 PHONE #: 305-799-0725
owner's address: 629 Elizabeth Street	PHONE #: 305-799-0725
APPLICANT'S NAME: Thomas Kelly	PHONE #: 304-1984
APPLICANT'S ADDRESS: 19141 Rocky Road, Sugarloat	Key, Fl 33042
ADDRESS OF CONSTRUCTION: 629 Elizabeth Street	# OF UNITS 1
THERE WILL BE A FINAL INSPECTION REQUIRED UNI	DER THIS PERMIT
DETAILED DESCRIPTION OF WORK: Remove front 5'-0" porch roof and columns and replace with same Remove siding at side elevations and replace with wood lap siding ACC Provide A Statements - Whoever knowingly makes a f with the intent to mislead a public servant in the performance of his or her offic a misdemeanor of the second degree punishable as provided for in s. 775.082 or This application for Certificate of Appropriateness must precede applications for building permits, right of way permits, variances, and development review approvals. Applications must meet or exceed the requirements outlined by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for	g. alse statement in writing ial duty shall be guilty of 775.083
Applications that do not possess the required Submittals will F be considered incomplete and will not be reviewed for approval. T	PHOTOGRAPHS OF EXISTING BUILDING (repairs, rehabs, or expansions) PHOTOGRAPHS OF ADJACENT BUILDINGS (new buildings and additions) ILLUSTRATIONS OF MANUFACTURED PRODUCTS TO BE USED SUCH AS SHUTTERS, DOORS, WINDOWS, PAINT COLOR CHIPS, AND AWNING FABRIC SAMPLES ILLUSTRATIONS OF MANUFACTURED PRODUCTS TO BE USED SUCH AS SHUTTERS, DOORS, WINDOWS, PAINT COLOR CHIPS, AND AWNING FABRIC SAMPLES ILLUSTRATIONS OF MANUFACTURED ILLUSTRATIONS OF MANUFACTURED SHUTTERS, DOORS, WINDOWS, PAINT COLOR CHIPS, AND AWNING FABRIC SAMPLES ILLUSTRATIONS OF MANUFACTURED ILLUSTRATIONS OF MANUFACTUR

HISTORIC AI COMMISSIO		RAL REVIEW Y
******	******	* * * * * * * * * * * *
Approved	Denied	Deferred
Reason for Deferral or Denia	al:	
Guidel	lines for siding	porches
Ciuii	ance for demolit	contributing stuctures
Limit of Work Approved, Con Changes: Multiment Mul- Newses and Musi & Laupa Porder norf; Un Spacing to Multime Date: <u>8/27/14</u> S	int provide animes & word in advended and internationali international international i	/or Suggested Staff W/ Itan Specification () + 1×4 TEG posts; siding Word ADL- workows M ic Architectural v Commission



City Of Key West Planning Department 3140 Flagler Avenue Key West, Florida **33**040

September 15, 2014

Mr. Thomas Kelly #19141 Rocky Road Sugarloaf Key, Florida 33042

> RE: AFTER THE FACT DEMOLITION OF FRONT PORCH AND REMOVAL OF SIDING. NEW WOOD FRONT PORCH. REPLACE LAP SIDING WHERE REMOVED. FOR: #629 ELIZABETH STREET - HARC APPLICATION # H14-01-1248 KEY WEST HISTORIC DISTRIC

Dear Mr. Kelly:

This letter is to notify you that the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission **approved with conditions** the request for the above mentioned project on the public meeting held on August 27, 2014. The Commission motioned to approve the proposed design with the condition that you must submit to staff revised plans and written specifications of front porch roof, unadorned 4" by 4" posts, siding spacing to match original and wood true divided lites windows.

Since the proposed design includes the demolition of a historic roof a second reading is required by the Land Development Regulations. I will be including the item on the September 23, 2014 meeting. Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at your convenience.

On behalf of the Historic Architectural Review Commission of our City, thank you for your interest in the preservation of Key West's historic heritage.

Sincerely:

Enid Torregrosa-Silva, MSHP Historic Preservation Planner City of Key West 3140 Flagler Avenue Key West, Florida 33040

305.809.3973

etorregrosa@cityofkeywest-fl.gov





#629 Elizabeth Street Sanborn map 1948



#629 Elizabeth Street Sanborn map 1962





#629 Elizabeth Street. Monroe County Library photo circa 1965







07/15/2014 05:06

Project Photos Before Construction

















	all	6122	71 0	Connission &	-PP-
A THE OUNT	CITY OF KEY WEST				
	BUILDING DEPARTM				
	CERTIFICATE OF APPROP		ENENS ION#		
Mest Florida			IUN #		
OWNER'S NAME:	David Graham		DATE:	11/22/13	
OWNER'S ADDRESS:	1621 Bay Road, Apt.1208, Miami B	leach	PHONE #:	828-733-1604	
APPLICANT'S NAME	Thomas Kelly		PHONE #:	304-1984	
	s: 19141 Rocky Road, Suga	rloaf	Key, F	lorida 33042	
ADDRESS OF CONSTRU	629 Elizabeth Street			#OF UNITS	
THE DAY	RE WILL BE A FINAL INSPECTION REQUIR	ED UND	er this P	BRMIT	
Ramove metal windows in ca Repair wood lap siding on co Replace metal window at rea Chapter 837	and construct new wood frame addition. contributing structure and install wood true divided windows ontributing structure. ar of contributing building with wood door. 	nains a fa	se statement i	in writing	
a misdemoar	nor of the second degree punishable as provided for in s. 71	75.082 or 1	75.083		
precede application permits, variances, Applications must outlined by the Sec	Certificate of Appropriateness must as for building permits, right of way and development review approvals. meet or exceed the requirements pretary of the Interior's Standards for Key West's Historic Architectural		TWO BE OF FLO EX (for new TREE REW PHOTO BUILDING (d Submittals	TU AN TU A
for completeness ar presentation to ti Commission at the n must be present a	application shall be reviewed by staff and either approved or scheduled for he Historic Architectural Review text available meeting. The applicant at this meeting. The filing of this ensure approval as submitted.		(new l LLUSTRATIC PRODUCTS SKUTTERS, D COLOR CHEP	BUILDINGS buildings and additions) NS OF MANUFACTURED TO BE USED BUCH AS OCRS, WINDOWS, PAINT S, AND AWNING FASRIC RAMPLES BUILDINGS (CONV RAMPLES)	TLICATIO
be considered Incom	not possess the required Submittals will plete and will not be reviewed for appro	oval. ch	ns ester 11	Approval:	a Z
Applicant's Signat	ure:				V



-

manning of this in which when



ack 1012271	
CITY OF KEY WEST BUILDING DEPARTMENT CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENENSS APPLICATION #00-21-2014 01:066	HISTORIC
OWNER'S NAME: DAVID GRAHAM DATE: 6/24/14	CKL
OWNER'S ADDRESS: 629 ELIZABETH ST. PHONE #:	
APPLICANT'S NAME: THOMAS KELLY PHONE #: 304-1984	AR
APPLICANT'S ADDRESS: 19141 ROCKY RD., SUGARLOAF KEY, FL. 33042	H
ADDRESS OF CONSTRUCTION: 629 ELIZABETH ST. # OF UNITS	ARCHITEC
THERE WILL BE A FINAL INSPECTION REQUIRED UNDER THIS PERMIT	因
DETAILED DESCRIPTION OF WORK: REMOVE CONC. FRONT BREH & REPLACE W/	
WOOD PORCH ON CONC. PIERS	TURAL
This application for Certificate of Appropriateness must precede applications for building permits, right of way permits, variances, and development review approvals. Applications must meet or exceed the requirements outlined by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Key West's Historic Architectural	AL REVIEW APPLIC
must be present at this meeting. The filing of this application does not ensure approval as submitted.	ICATIC
Date: 6/24/14 Date: 6/25/14 71=31 19104	Z
Applicant's Signature: Thins C.G. Fee Due:	







		EX	TERIOR OPE	ININGS	
MARK	WIND LOAD	MANUF.	SERIES	GLASS	
Α	41.3 -44.8	Andersen	400 Series	impact	
В	42.4 -46.0	Andersen	400 Series	impact	
С	40.3 -43.9	PGT Industries	Horz. Slider	impact	
D	38.4 -48.8	Andersen	A-Series	impact	
E	35.6 - 39.1	Nana	Bi-Fold	impact	6







The Historic Architectural Review Commission will hold a public hearing <u>at 5:30 p.m., August 27, 2014 at Old</u> <u>City Hall, 510 Greene Street</u>, Key West, Florida. The purpose of the hearing will be to consider a request for:

NEW WOOD FRONT PORCH. REPLACE LAP SIDING WHERE REMOVED. AFTER THE FACT DEMOLITION OF FRONT PORCH AND REMOVAL OF SIDING FOR- #629 ELIZABETH STREET

Applicant-Thomas Kelly

Application # H14-01-1248

If you wish to see the application or have any questions, you may visit the Planning Department during regular office hours at 3140 Flagler Avenue, call 809-3973 or visit our website at <u>www.keywestcity.com</u>.

THIS NOTICE CAN NOT BE REMOVED FROM THE SITE UNTIL HARC FINAL DETERMINATION

HARC POSTING AFFIDAVIT

STATE OF FLORIDA: COUNTY OF MONROE:

BEFORE ME, the undersigned authority, personally appeared

depose and says that the following statements are true and correct to the best of his/her knowledge and belief:

1. That a legal notice for Public Notice of Hearing of the Historic Architectural Review Commission (HARC) was placed on the following address:

6.5.	LICHDEIH		
17 day of	AUGUST	<u>, 20 14</u> .	

This legal notice(s) contained an area of at least 8.5"x11".

The property was posted to notice a public hearing before the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission to be held on AUGUST 27, 2014.

The legal notice(s) is/are clearly visible from the public street adjacent to the property.

The Certificate of Appropriateness number for this legal notice is $\frac{144-01-1248}{1248}$

2. A photograph of that legal notice posted in the property is attached hereto.

Signed	Nam	e of /	Affia	nt:	
Date:	8/	107	14		
Addres					Rp.
City:	506	ARICA	HF (Key	(
State,	Zip: _	FL.	33	5047	

The forgoing instrument	was acknowledged	before me on this	18 day of
AUQUET	, 20 <u>/4</u> .		

By (Print name of Affiant)	Thomas	Kelly	who is
personally known to me or I	nas produced		as
identification and who did ta	ike an oath.		

NOTARY PU	BLIC /
Sign Name:_	Susan Mencsel
Print Name:_	Susta U. Meneses
D.	Intony Public State of Elevida (coal)

Notary Public - State of Florida (seal) My Commission Expires:







Property Appraiser Information



Scott P. Russell, CFA Property Appraiser Monroe County, Florida

Key West (305) 292-3420 Marathon (305) 289-2550 Plantation Key (305) 852-7130

Property Record Card - Website tested on IE8, Maps are now launching the new map application version of Firefox. 10.3 or higher

Alternate Key: 1012271 Parcel ID: 00011940-000000

Ownership Details Mailing Address: 629 ELIZABETH STREET LLC 1621 BAY RD APT 1208 MIAMI BEACH, FL 33139-3266 **Property Details** PC Code: 01 - SINGLE FAMILY Millage Group: 10KW Affordable No Housing: Section-Township- 06-68-25 Range: Property 629 ELIZABETH ST KEY WEST Location: Legal KW PT LOT 4 SQR 59 WW-361 PT OF TR 5 OR350-72/73 COUNTY JUDGES SERIES 3M4 OR1297-785AFF Description: OR1317-832/833/834/835D/C OR2012-1375/76F/J OR2162-1816ORD OR2318-1459/60 OR2329-309/10 OR2329-311/12 OR2342-1072/73 OR2359-1353 OR2620-150/51 OR2620-152/53 OR2675-388/89



Land Use Code	Frontage	Depth	Land Area
010D - RESIDENTIAL DRY	50	0	3,697.00 SF

Building Summary

Number of Buildings: 1 Number of Commercial Buildings: 0

—	tails							
Building Type R1 Effective Age 80 Year Built 190 Functional Obs 0	0	l Spe	Condition Perimeter scial Arch omic Obs	120 0		Dep	uality Grade 350 preciation % 72 I Floor Area 819	
Roof Type IRR Heat 1 NOI Heat Src 1 NOI	NE	Ro	1 kitchen. oof Cover Heat 2 leat Src 2	MET.	E		Foundation WD Bedrooms 3	CONC PADS
Extra Features:	2 Fix Bath 3 Fix Bath 4 Fix Bath 5 Fix Bath 6 Fix Bath 7 Fix Bath Extra Fix	0 0 0 0					Garbage D Con S In Fire	Vacuum 0 isposal 0 npactor 0 iecurity 0 tercom 0 eplaces 0 washer 0
			21 FT					
		39 F	FLA 819-1) T					
		5 FT	21 FT OPI 105-1					
Sections:								
sections.	Wall	# Stories	Vear Built	Attic		asoment %	Finished Basen	ent % Area
			1987	N	N		0.00	819
Nbr Type Ext 1 FLA 12:ABOVE AV	/Erage wood	•						

1			# Units	Length	Width	Year Built	Roll Year	Grade	Life
1	CL2:CH		684 SF	0	0	1964	1965	1	30
uile	ding Per	mits							
Bidg	Number	Date Issued	Date Completed	Amount	Des	cription	Notes		
	B950533	02/01 /1 995	10/01/1995	800		R	EPL SIDING ON	RITE SID	E
arc	el Value	History			-				
ertifie	ed Roll Value	es.							
iew	<u>Taxes for th</u>	nis Parcel.							
Roll Year	Total Bidg Value	Total Misc Improvement Va	Total Land lue Value	l Total (Market)		Total Assessed Value	School Exempt Value	School Ta Valu	
2014	19,310	479	407,268	427,0	57	427,057	0	427,0	57
2013	41,302	479	351,842	393,6	523	319,872	0	393,6	23
2012	42,145	479	248,169	290,7	/93	290,793	0	290,7	93
2011	[·] 42,145	479	239,542	282,1	66	282,166	0	282,1	66
2010	72,949	479	302,372	375,8	00	375,800	0	375,8	00
2009	81,343	479	459,605	541,4	27	541,427	0	541,4	27
2008	75,020	479	528,675	604,1	74	604,174	0	604,1	74
2007	112,530	427	403,304	516,2	61	5 16,26 1	0	516,2	51
2006	243,270	427	286,995	530,6	92	530,692	0	530,6	92
2005	193,071	427	259,806	453,3	04	453,304	0	453,3	04
2004	158,576	427	226,575	385,5	78	385,578	0	385,5	78
2003	126,140	427	105,735	232,3	02	232,302	0	232,3	02
2002	120,689	427	84,588	205,7	04	205,704	0	205,7	04
2001	94,782	427	84,588	179,7	97	123,963	25,000	98,96	3
2000	97,941	806	51,357	150,1	04	105,678	25,000	80,67	8
999	77,405	637	57,399	135,4	41	96,469	25,000	71,46	9
998	67,927	559	57,399	125,8	85	94,950	25,000	69,95	0
997	61,608	507	51,357	113,4	72	93,363	25,000	68,36	3
996	42,652	351	51,357	94,36	60	90,644	25,000	65,64	4
995	38,861	0	51,357	90,2	18	88,434	25,000	63,43	4
994	34,753	0	51,357	86,1	10	86,110	25,000	61,11	0
993	34,753	0	51,357	86,11	10	86,110	25,000	61,11	0
992	34,873	0	51,357	86,23	30	86,230	25,000	61,23	0
991	34,873	0	51,357	86,23	30	86,230	25,000	61,23	0
990	21,238	0	40,028	61,26	6	61,266	24,506	36,76	0
989	17,552	0	39,273	56,82	25	56,825	22,730	34,09	5
988	15,321	0	34,742	50,06	63	50,063	20,025	30,03	8
987	15,125	0	22,506	37,63	31	37,631	15,052	22,57	
986	15,209	0	21,751	36,96	50	36,960	0	36,96	_

1984	13,748	0	12,295	26,043	26,043	25,500	543
1983	13,748	0	12,295	26,043	26,043	25,000	1,043
1982	14,025	0	12,295	26,320	26,320	25,000	1,320
		·					

Parcel Sales History

NOTE: Sales do not generally show up in our computer system until about two to three months after the date of sale. If a recent sale does not show up in this list, please allow more time for the sale record to be processed. Thank you for your patience and understanding.

Sale Date	Official Records Book/Page	Price	Instrument	Qualification
3/13/2014	2675 / 388	100	QC	<u>11</u>
3/18/2013	2620 / 152	100	QC	<u>11</u>
3/18/2013	2620 / 150	380,000	WD	19

This page has been visited 370,664 times.

Monroe County Monroe County Property Appraiser Scott P. Russell, CFA P.O. Box 1176 Key West, FL 33041-1176