Vicky Walker

From: Kelly Perkins

Sent: Tuesday, August 23, 2016 9:15 AM

To: Vicky Walker

Subject: FW: 616 Eaton Agenda Item 12

FYI

Kelly Perkins, HARC Assistant Planner

Planning Department, City of Key West 3140 Flagler Avenue Key West, Florida 33040-4602

P: 305.809.3975 | E: kperkins@cityofkeywest-fl.gov

From: Mark Jacob [mailto:mjkeywest@aol.com]

Sent: Monday, August 22, 2016 9:15 PM

To: Kelly Perkins <kperkins@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>; Enid Torregrosa <etorregrosa@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>

Subject: 616 Eaton Agenda Item 12

Good evening Ms. Torregrosa and Ms. Perkins:

Please include the following in the public comments for the 616 Demolition application to be heard at the 6/23/16 HARC meeting.

Thank you

Dear HARC Commissioners:

I would like to raise an objection to the 616 Eaton side addition being treated as non-historic. Although it's age is uncertain the premises were long associated with a prominent Key West family and, as such, should be preserved in their entirety. Please allow me to provide a history.

Mr. Wing Lee came to Key West from China in the 1800's. He established a grocery store on Fleming near the corner of Duval and became quite successful. It merged with Lee's Food Center in the early 40's. Wing Lee died in 1943 in his late 80s. A news article from the 40's describes the merger of the two stores and attributes it to the war. Interestingly, it says the great success of the store in later years "was in no small part due to the untiring efforts and business ability of the late Mrs. Louisa Lee (his wife) who assisted by members of her family, Mary, Eva, Louise and George continued to build the business. Until today, they operated as Wing Lee's, one of the best and most sanitary grocery and meat markets in south Florida."

Wing Lee's daughter, Eva (b. 1907; d. 1993), married Paul Newhouse in 1934. This is interesting in that it suggests Eva continued to work in the family business even after her marriage based on the preceding paragraph. Possibly because of the war but that would have been pioneering at the time when women were meant to be home having babies while their husbands supported the family. Paul Newhouse was a marine who was stationed in KW in 1926. Records have him living on the navy base. So he arrived and married into what had become a prominent family. Their marriage license is attached.

Eva was a powerhouse, dying in 1993 at age 85. She and Paul owned/operated the Tropical Package Liquor Store on Fleming near Duval Street for over 25 years. They acquired rental property which Mrs. Eva Newhouse managed until her death. She was very active in civic and charitable work: past president of the Mother's Club at the Convent of St. Mary Immaculate, past president of Business and Professional Women, past president of both the Key West Women's Club and the Garden Club. She also held state office in the Florida Federation of Garden Clubs. Eva and Paul had three children: Paul Jr., Paula and Gregory. I attach an article and photo of Eva Newhouse.

Eva and Paul bought 616 Eaton from Barbara Roland Printz in 1951, Gregory Newhouse inherited the home from his mother. This timeline strongly suggests that Eva and Paul put on the side addition. Eva's sister, Mary Lee Graham, was appointed City Commissioner in 1976 and then elected in her own right. In 1982 she was the only woman on the City Commission and voted against a resolution urging the Florida Legislature to support the national equal rights amendment.

Eva and Paul's daughter, Paula (Wing Lee's granddaughter) married Dr. Rex Cross, a veterinarian with offices at Campbell Court. Paula has been described as tall and rather regal. A Realtor, member of the Women's Club, a long time active member of Key West Sunrise Rotary Club (which was the second Rotary Club chartered in Florida in 1916), and a personage in her own right. Born in 1943, she demonstrated her own commitment to community service at a young age when she was elected Treasurer of the Junior class of the Convent of Mary Immaculate in 1958. After obtaining a degree in education from Florida Southern College, Paula taught elementary school children in Washington, D.C., and Pennsylvania. After returning to her hometown of Key West, she raised three children and helped with her family's business interests. She subsequently became a Realtor with Coldwell Banker Schmitt, where she was working at the time of her death in 2007.

Paula would likely oppose this demolition, as she served a number of terms on the Board of Directors of the Old Island Restoration Foundation, where she devoted hundreds of volunteer hours in support of its programs and goals. Over the years, she worked tirelessly on many of its successful fundraisers and was responsible for recruiting more than 200 red-shawl ladies and red-shirted gentlemen annually to serve as docents for the nationally recognized Key West House and Garden tours.

Paula was a graduate of the Leadership Monroe County program. In the past, she served on the Board of Directors of Barnett Bank and on the Board of Directors for the Key West Association of Realtors. She was a member of Panhellenic, the Key West Yacht Club, the Key West Garden Club, and the Navy League.

Police Chief Donnie Lee is descendant of Wing Lee thereby continuing the family's importance to our community even today.

Based on aerial photographs and the Sanborn maps included in the HARC application, the side addition was likely constructed by Eva and Paul sometime between 1972 and 1994. This site belonged to an influential family with impact throughout the island and, as such, is a record of that family and their times that should not be disturbed. Our own City Code tells us that a site can be considered historic when it is associated in a significant way with the life or activities of a major person important in the city. Eva and Paul Newhouse, and their daughter, Paula, certainly qualify as major personalities in Key West history, and this addition was a part of their homestead. As such, and at a very minimum, HARC should treat this addition with the same deference accorded to other historical properties in Old Town even if its exact age is indeterminable.

In addition, I object to the characterization of the side addition as "inappropriate" because it meets all of the criteria for additions that HARC would consider today.

- 1. It is on a secondary, barely visible elevation (well concealed today by a fence and landscaping could easily substitute)
- 2. It is diminutive as compared to the primary structure and does not challenge the primary structure in any way.
 - 3. It is distinguishable from the historic structure by roof line among other things.
 - 4. It is in keeping and compatible with the neighborhood.
 - 5. It is well set back from the street and front façade.

These are all of the criteria HARC presently applies to owners who are seeking to make additions to historic homes. I submit that, if an application for this addition was made today, then HARC would be hard pressed to deny it based on the Guidelines. It seems the characterization of this addition as "inappropriate" is not based on the Guidelines at all, but instead exposes a bias in favor of the inappropriate rear building this demolition will facilitate.

I urge you to deny this application.

Respectfully,

Mark Jacob

601 Fleming Street



list grows

nother honor for Eva

I LORENCE BABON cocled to The Cribses ... Mrs. Paul) Newhouse, rose members of the Key Garden Club as well as its past presidents, has agnally honored for the rome in recent years by Florida Federation of clubs.

and District Iz chairman the offices in the Key West DLLY'S POINTERS

AR POLLY — Is there any way to finish crochected or obton placemats so that they lay flat with straight — CVNTHIA — The best way to finish such place mouth be to block them and starch them lightly. You is this right on your fronting hoard or on a large tower of over a table. Pirst, cover the ironing board with two towers to the place to vact dimensions you want the finished piece to be, yeery lightly with spray starch. Allow it to dry pletely, then unpin, Nething to it? — POLLY

AR POLLY — If you have difficulty with a clogged or head, fill a small plastic bag with vinegar and tie it the shower head. Allow the thead to sonk in this manner 24 hours. The vinegar will dissolve all the minerals ging up the holes. — SYLVIA

4.1.... D1...1...

Ma

C. J. No.

CENTR

State of Flori

To any Minister of the Gospel, or any o

Othereas, Application having of the State of Florida, for a licen. County Judge that no legal imperate are, therefore, To aut

and that you make return of the same
Chitness, my name as Count
The last, the

CE

From: wszot@comcast.net [mailto:wszot@comcast.net]

Sent: Monday, August 22, 2016 7:33 PM

To: Enid Torregrosa <etorregrosa@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>

Subject: 616 Eaton St

HARC should not approve this demolition application because to do so is a tacit approval by this HARC panel (as compared to last year's HARC panel) of the overall design submitted last year and now on appeal. Does this HARC panel approve that design? Would that design achieve a "yes" vote by a majority of today's HARC panel members? I doubt it. This HARC panel appreciates the grave importance of faithful adherence to the HARC guidelines and well appreciates how wildly inappropriate and aesthetically destructive the proposed design is to the integrity of the Historic District. Do not give tacit or implied approval to that design, which has no place in our Historic District, by approving this part of the overall scheme.

Dawn Szot

From: wszot@comcast.net [mailto:wszot@comcast.net]

Sent: Monday, August 22, 2016 7:09 PM

To: Enid Torregrosa <etorregrosa@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>

Subject:

This demolition application should not be approved because piecemeal applications for isolated individual parts of an overall design plan should not be considered in isolation. Otherwise, HARC has no context or frame of reference for the entire design plan for the site. While a single component part of an overall design scheme might seem innocuous in isolation, it may take on an entirely different perspective when considered as part of a detailed description of the overall site plan. At this point in time, we have no idea what plan may ultimately be approved for and built on this prominent historic site. Any demolition should only be considered in light of the final approved plan for the entire site.

Walter Szot

From: John O'Leary [mailto:joleary311@gmail.com]

Sent: Monday, August 22, 2016 7:25 PM

To: Enid Torregrosa <etorregrosa@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>

Cc: Kelly Perkins <kperkins@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>
Subject: 616 Eaton Street Demolition : Agenda Item 12

Dear HARC Commissioners,

Please include the following email in the record for the 616 Eaton demolition to be heard at the 8/23/16 HARC meeting.

I implore you to vote against approving this demolition request because it was already approved last fall and the Special Magistrate ordered that what was HARC approved last year is not to proceed until the court cases are over. The side addition demolition was approved last Fall because it was included in the plans submitted last year. That the side addition was not included in the brief three-line summary description on page one of last year's application is of no consequence. Even that brief summary directs the reader to "SEE PLANS." The attachments to last year's application run 53 pages! If we reason that demolition of the side addition was not part of last year's application, then none of the design was approved last year because it was not a part of the three or four line summary on page 1 of the application. Not the sky bridge, not the rooftop deck, not the butterfly rooflines. None of it. Neither were two pools approved for the same reason. Please don't allow these applicants to play games or to manipulate their way to completing

----Original Message----

From: Janine Keller [mailto:janinekeller14@gmail.com]

Sent: Monday, August 22, 2016 6:35 PM

To: Enid Torregrosa <etorregrosa@cityofkeywest-fl.gov>

Cc: Kelly Perkins < kperkins@cityofkeywest-fl.gov > Subject: 616 Eaton Demolition: Agenda Item 12

Please include the following email in the record for the 616 Eaton demolition to be heard at the 6/23/16 HARC meeting.

Dear HARC Commissioners:

We write to oppose HARC approval of Application Number H16-03-0058. We urge you to disapprove this demolition request because it paves the way to build the inappropriate modernistic green glass addition that will dwarf virtually everything around it. This demolition is part and parcel of the design approved last year, by mistake, by HARC members who did not understand that the Historic Architectural Guidelines are a part of the City Code, and therefore laws to be applied. They considered the Guidelines to be mere suggestions that the HARC members could disregard in favor of their own misplaced notions about imposing incongruous massive structures in the heart of our beloved Historic District. While that inappropriate design was mistakenly approved, the courts have yet to speak – except that the appeals judge ordered that nothing be done in furtherance of the design until the appeals are over. Approving this piece of the project will be going against that order and will be facilitating or paving the way for the hideously out of scale and proportion design to ultimately be imposed on us for decades to come.

Best regards,

David & Janine Keller 617 Fleming St. #9

Sent from my iPhone