

## Historic Architectural Review Commission Staff Report for Item 6

To: Chairman Bryan Green and Historic Architectural Review Commission Members<br>From: Enid Torregrosa, MSHP Historic Preservation Planner<br>Meeting Date:<br>Applicant:<br>Application Number: H2020-0002<br>Address: \#323 Angela Street<br>\section*{Description of Work}

Demolition of shed roof and bedroom addition of existing historic structure. Removal of deck. Second Reading.

## Site Facts

The house under review is a contributing resource to the historic district and was build circa 1920. The one-story frame vernacular house has a unique wide configuration with a side gable roof. The one-story shed structure is an addition build between 1948 and 1962 and has substandard interior height. The house has metal jalousie windows, probably installed in the 1950 's, as well as decorative metal poles supporting the existing front porch. Those architectural elements are not original to the house.

## Ordinance Cited on Review

- Section 102-217 (3), demolition for contributing and historic structures of the Land Development Regulations for the rear attached portion.


## Staff Analysis

In January 23, 2020, the Commission approved plans for new additions to the house under review and the first reading for demolition. This report is for the required second reading. The Certificate of Appropriateness proposes the demolition of a shed roof that covers the rear addition. Although the rear portion of the house in not original it was build more than

50 years ago. The interior headroom space between the ceilings and finished floor is substandard and the new design contemplates keeping the exterior walls while creating a new roofline to add height to the interior space. The plan also proposes the demolition of a rear deck, which is not historic.

It is staff's opinion that the request for this demolition of the historic rear shed roof should be reviewed based by the demolition criteria of Chapter 102 Section 218 of the LDR's. The criteria state the following;
(a) The historic architectural review commission shall issue a certificate of appropriateness for an application for demolition:
(1) If the subject of the application is a contributing or historic building or structure, then it should not be demolished unless its condition is irrevocably compromised by extreme deterioration or it does not meet any of the criteria of section 102-125(1) through (9).

The rear roof is structurally sound but the interior height is substandard to current code.

The following is the criteria of section 102-125:

1 Embodies no distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction of aesthetic or historic significance in the city and is not a significant and distinguishable building entity whose components may lack individual distinction;

Staff opines that the rear-shed roof has no distinctive characteristics of a type or method of construction and is not a significant portion of the historic house. The structure is sub-standard, as the ceilings under the existing beams are too low for habitation.

2 Is not specifically associated with events that have made a significant contribution to local, state, or national history;

It is staff understanding that no significant events have ever occurred in the site that have contributed to local, state, or national history.

3 Has no significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the city, state or nation, and is not associated with the life of a person significant in the past;

The portion of the house in question has no significant value as part of a development, heritage, or cultural record of the city.

4 Is not the site of a historic event with a significant effect upon society;

The site is not associated with any significant event.
5 Does not exemplify the cultural, political, economic, social, or historic heritage of the city;

The portion of the house in question is not an example of any social, cultural, or historic heritage of the city.

6 Does not portray the environment in an era of history characterized by a distinctive architectural style;

The portion of the house in question is not an example of a distinctive architectural style.

7 If a part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area, nevertheless should not be developed or preserved according to a plan based on the area's historic, cultural, natural, or architectural motif;

The portion of the house in question is not part of a park, square or distinctive area in the city.

8 Does not have a unique location or singular physical characteristic which represents an established and familiar visual feature of its neighborhood or of the city, and does not exemplify the best remaining architectural type in a neighborhood; and

The portion of the house in question does not exemplify a remaining architectural type in its neighborhood and does not possess any significant visual features.

9 Has not yielded, and is not likely to yield, information important in history.

The portion of the house in question does not yield important information in history.

In conclusion, it is staff's opinion that the request for demolition of the rear shed roof of the house can be considered by the Commission as they comply with the criteria for demolition stated under the Land Development Regulations. The applicant has included a design that replaces the roof, which is consistent with HARC regulations. If approved this will be the last of two required readings for demolition.

```
3|Page-#323 Angela Street - item6
```

HARC MAJOR PROJECTS CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
\$400 NON-REFUNDABLE BASE APPLICATION FEE - OTHER FEES MAY BE APPLICABLE


City of Key West
1300 WHITE STREET
KEY WEST, FLORIDA 33040

| MARC COA \# | REVISION \# | INITIAL \& DATE |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| FLOOD ZONE | ZONING DISTRICT | BLDG PERMIT \# |

A PREAPPLICATION MEETING WITH HARC STAFF IS REQUIRED PRIOR TO SUBMITTAL

ADDRESS OF PROPOSED PROJECT:
NAME ON DEED:
OWNER'S MAILING ADDRESS:

APPLICANT NAME:
APPLICANT'S ADDRESS:

APPLICANT'S SIGNATURE:

ANY PERSON THAT MAKES CHANGES TO AN APPROVED CERTIFICATE OFAPPROPRIATENESS MUST SUBMIT A NEW APPLICATION.
FLORIDA STATUTE 837.06; WHOEVER KNOWINGLY MAKES A FALSE STATEMENT IN WRITING AND WITH THE INTENT TO MISLEAD A PUBLIC SERVANT IN THE PERFORMANCE OF HIS OR HER OFFICIAL DUTY SHALL BE GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR OF THE SECOND DEGREE PUNISHABLE PER SECTION 775.082 OR 775.083. THE APPLICANT FURTHER HEREBY ACKNOWLEDGES THAT THE SCOPE OF WORK AS DESCRIBED IN THE APPLICATION SHALL BE THE SCOPE OF WORK THAT IS CONTEMPLATED BY THE APPLICANT AND THE CITY. THE APPLICANT FURTHER STIPULATES THAT SHOULD FURTHER ACTION BE TAKEN BY THE CITY FOR EXCEEDING THE SCOPE OF THE DESCRIPTION OF WORK, AS DESCRIBED HEREIN, AND IF THERE IS CONFLICTING INFORMATION BETWEEN THE DESCRIPTION OF WORK AND THE SUBMITTED PLANS, THE AFOREMENTIONED DESCRIPTION OF WORK SHALL BE CONTROLLING.

PROJECT INCLUDES: REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS $X$ RELOCATION OF A STRUCTURE $\qquad$ ELEVATION OF A STRUCTURE $\qquad$ PROJECT INVOLVES A CONTRIBUTING STRUCTURE: YES $X$ NO $\qquad$ INVOLVES A HISTORIC STRUCTURE: YES $\qquad$ NO PROJECT INVOLVES A STRUCTURE THAT IS INDIVIDUALLY LISTED ON THE NATIONAL REGISTER: YES $\qquad$ NO $\qquad$ X DETAILED PROJECT DESCRIPTION INCLUDING MATERIALS, HEIGHT, DIMENSIONS, SQUARE FOOTAGE, LOCATION, ETC. GENERAL: NEW CONSTRUCTION OF 4 SINGLE STORY ADDITIONS
TO EXISTING CONCH STYLE HOUSE. NEW POOR ONSIDE OF HOUSE PROPOSED SQFT: 2107
EXISTING SOFT: 850
MAIN BUILDING:
MAN BUILDING TO BE RESTORED, NEW HISTORICAL WOOD IMPACT WINDOWS. REMSUAL OF ALUMINUM TIDING AND INSTALL NEW PIT SIDING. NEW TV CRIMP ROOF, NEW PORCH. CHANGE INTERIOR EATON. DEMOLITION (PLEASE FILL OUT AND ATTACH DEMOLITION APPENDIX):

BEFOUL OF SHED BOOFWITH BEDROOM ADDITION, REMOVE BACKDECK

APPLICATIONS MUST BE SUBMITTED IN PERSON WITH HARD COPIES BY BPM ON THE SCHEDULED DEADLINE PLEASE SEND AN ELECTRONIC COPY OF ALL DOCUMENTS TO HARC@CITYOFKEYWEST-FL.GOV

| ACCESSORY STRUCTURES): |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| AVERS: | PECKS: |
|  | NITE INCLUDING GRADING, FILL, TREES, ETC): |



THIS APPLICATION MAY BE REVIEWED BY PLANNING DEPARTMENT STAFF.

## HARC Certificate of Appropriateness: Demolition Appendix

City of Key West

1300 WHITE STREET
KEY WEST, FLORIDA 33040

| MARC COA \# | INITIAL \& DATE |
| :--- | :--- |
| ZONING DISTRICT | BLDG PERMIT \# |

## ADDRESS OF PROPOSED PROJECT:

## PROPERTY OWNER'S NAME:

APPLICANT NAME:

## 323 ANGELA STREET <br> ANTHONY CHATMAN ANTHONY CHATMAN

I hereby certify I am the owner of record and that the work shall conform to all applicable laws of this jurisdiction. By receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness, I realize that this project will require a Building Permit approval PRIOR to proceeding with the work outlined above and that a submitted for review.
PROPERTY OWNER'S SIGNATURE

DETAILED PROJECT DESCRIPTION OF DEMOLITION
REMOVAL OF SHED ROOF AND BEDROOM ADDITION OF EXISTING STRUCTURE. DEMUUAL OF DECK.

## * CRITERIA FOR DEMOLITION OF CONTRIBUTING OR HISTORIC STRUCTURES:

Before any Certificate of Appropriateness may be issued for a demolition request, the Historic Architectural Review Commission must find that the following requirements are met (please review and comment on each criterion that applies);
(1) If the subject of the application is a contributing or historic building or structure, then it should not be demolished unless its condition is irrevocably compromised by extreme deterioration or it does not meet any of the following criteria:
(a) The existing condition of the building or structure is irrevocably compromised by extreme deterioration.
(2) Or explain how the building or structure meets the criteria below:
(a) Embodies no distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction of aesthetic or historic significance in the
city and is not a significant and distinguishable building entity whose components may lack individual distinction.

> ADDITION EMBODIES NO ESTINCTIUE CHARACTERISTICS OF TYPE, PERIODIOR HISTORIC SIGNIFICANCE

Nothing in this application is intended to alter the authority of the Building Official to condemn for demolition dangerous buildings, as provided in Section 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations and Chapter 14 of the Code of Ordinances.
(b) Is not specifically associated with events that have made a significant contribution to local, state, or national history. No
$\because$
(c) Has no significant character, interest, or value as part fo the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the city, state or nation, and is not associated with the life of a person significant in the past.

## NO

(d) Is not the site of a historic event with significant effect upon society.

NO
(e) Does not exemplify the cultural, political, economic, social, or historic heritage of the city.

NO
(f) Does not portray the environment in an era of history characterized by a distinctive architectural style.

> No
(g) If a part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area, nevertheless should not be developed or preserved according to a plan based on the area's historic, cultural, natural, or architectural motif.

(h) Does not have a unique location or singular physical characteristic which represents an established and familiar visual feature of its neighborhood or of the city, and does not exemplify the best remaining architectural type in a neighborhood.

Nothing in this application is intended to alter the authority of the Building Official to condemn for demolition dangerous buildings, as provided in Section 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations and Chapter 14 of the Code of Ordinances.

## No

(i) Has not yielded, and is not likely to yield, information important in history.

## CRITERIA FOR DEMOLITION OF NON-CONTRIBUTING OR NON-HISTORIC STRUCTURES:

The following criteria will also be reviewed by the Historic Architectural Review Commission for proposed demolitions. The Commission shall not issue a Certificate of Appropriateness that would result in the following conditions (please review and comment on each criterion that applies);
(1) Removing buildings or structures that are important in defining the overall historic character of a district or neighborhood so that the character is diminished.
(2) Removing historic buildings or structures and thus destroying the historic relationship between buildings or structures and open space.
(3) Removing an historic building or structure in a complex; or removing a building facade; or removing a significant later addition that is important in defining the historic character of a site or the surrounding district or neighborhood.
(4) Removing buildings or structures that would otherwise qualify as contributing.



Sanborn map 1948


Sanborn map 1962


323 Angela Street circa 1965

## Boundary Survey Map of part of Lot I, Square 63, Island of Key West



1. The legal description shown hereon was furnished by the client or their agent
2. The legal description shown hereon was furnished by the
3. All angles are $90^{\circ}$ (Measured \& Record) unless otherwise noted
4. Street address: 323 Angela Street, Key West, F'L.
5. This survey is not valid without the signature and the original raised seal of a Florida licensed surveyor and mapper.
6. Lands shown hereon were not abstracted for rights-of-way, easements, ownership, or other instruments of record.
7. North Arrow is assumed and based on the legal description.
8. All bricking and concrete is not shown.
9. Date of field work: January 23, 2018
10. Ownership of fences is undeterminable, unless otherwise noted.
11. Adjoiners are not furnished.

BOUNDARY SURVEY OF': In the City of Key West, Monroe County, Florida, and is part of Lot 1, Square 63, according to Whitehead's Map of the Island of Key West, delineated in February A.D 1829. COMMENCING at a point of the Northerly side of Angela Street 100 feet from the corner of Whitehead Street and running thence along Angela Street in a Southwesterly direction 48 feet, thence at right angles in a Northwesterly direction 100 feet; thence at right angles in a Northeasterly direction 48 feet; thence at right angles in a Southeasterly direction 100 feet back to the Point of Beginning.

BOUNDARY SURVEY FOR: Anthony Wade Chatman;
Quicken Loan
The Closing Department, Inc.;
Westcor Land Title Insurance Company;
$I$ HEREBY CERTIFY that this Survey was made under my responsible charge and meets the Standard of Practice as set forth by the Florida Board of Professional Surveyors \& Mappers in Chapter 5J-17, Florida Administrative Code, pursuant to Section 472.027, Florida Statutes.


ASSIGNABLE
J. LYNN O'FLYNN, Inc.



| Site Data |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Tonct Chatmen |
|  | ${ }_{\text {gin }}^{\text {One }}$ |
|  |  |
| citiol |  |
|  | +180 |
|  | ${ }_{\text {com }}^{60 \%}$ |
|  |  |
| Rears meiback | ${ }_{\substack{10}}^{10}$ |



Back


Left Side


Right Side


Front

EXISTING HOUSE






Exterior Elevation Left


Exterior Elevation Right



The Historic Architectural Review Commission will hold a public meeting at 5:30 p.m., January 29, 2020 at City Hall, 1300 White Street, Key West, Florida. The purpose of the hearing will be to consider a request for:

## RENOVATIONS TO EXISTING HISTORIC STRUCTURE. NEW ONE-

 STORY ADDITIONS TO REAR OF EXISTING HOUSE. NEW POOL. DEMOLITION OF SHED ROOF AND BEDROOM ADDITION OF EXISTING HISTORIC STRUCTURE. REMOVAL OF DECK.
## \#323 ANGELA STREET

## Applicant - Anthony Chatman Application \#H2020-0002

If you wish to see the application or have any questions, you may visit the Planning Department during regular office hours at 1300 White Street, call 305-809-3973 or visit our website at www.cityofkeywest-fl.gov.

THIS NOTICE CAN NOT BE REMOVED FROM THE SITE UNTIL HARC FINAL DETERMINATION



## MARC POSTING AFFIDAVIT

## STATE OF FLORIDA:

## COUNTY OF MONROE:

BEFORE ME, the undersigned authority, personally appeared $\qquad$ Anthony W Chatman $\qquad$ , who, first being duly sworn, on oath, depose and says that the following statements are true and correct to the best of his/her knowledge and belief:

1. That a legal notice for Public Notice of Hearing of the Historic Architectural Review Commission (HARC) was placed on the following address:
$\square$ day of DAN 2020 . on the

This legal notices) contained an area of at least $8.5^{\prime \prime} \times 11^{\prime \prime}$.
The property was posted to notice a public hearing before the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission to be held on $\qquad$ $29^{\text {TH }}$ DAN $\qquad$ 2020 .

The legal notices) is/are clearly visible from the public street adjacent to the property.

The Certificate of Appropriateness number for this legal notice is H2020-0002
2. A photograph of that legal notice posted in the property is attached hereto.

## Signed Name of Affiant:

Date: $1 / 23 / 20$
Address: 323 ANGELA ST.
City: $\qquad$
State, Zip: $\qquad$

The forgoing instrument was acknowledged before me on this $\qquad$ day of


## A qPublic.net ${ }^{\text {m }}$ Monroe County, FL

## Disclaimer

The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office maintains data on property within the County solely for the purpose of fulfilling its responsibility to secure a just valuation for ad valorem tax purposes of all property within the County. The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office cannot guarantee its accuracy for any other purpose. Likewise, data provided regarding one tax year may not be applicable in prior or subsequent years. By requesting such data, you hereby understand and agree that the data is intended for ad valorem tax purposes only and should not be relied on for any other purpose.

By continuing into this site you assert that you have read and agree to the above statement.

| Summary |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Parcel ID | 00012840-000000 |
| Account\# | 1013226 |
| Property ID | 1013226 |
| Millage Group | 11KW |
| Location | 323 ANGELA St, KEY WEST |
| Address |  |
| Legal | KW PT LT 1 SQR 63 G10-203 OR919-1047/48ORD OR1321-1571/72P/R OR2092- |
| Description | 1804/05 OR2412-1221/22 OR2475-1377/78 OR2475-1379/80 OR2475-1383/84 |
|  | OR2545-560/61 OR2731-1862/65 OR2731-1866-69 OR2831-223/24 OR2890-849/50 (Note: Not to be used on legal documents.) |
| Neighborhood | 6021 |
| Property Class | SINGLE FAMILY RESID (0100) |
| Subdivision |  |
| Sec/Twp/Rng | 06/68/25 |
| Affordable | Yes |
| Housing |  |



## Owner

CHATMAN ANTHONY WADE
201 William St
Key West FL 33040

## Valuation

|  | 2019 | 2018 | 2017 | 2016 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| + Market Improvement Value | \$83,085 | \$85,602 | \$84,274 | \$92,213 |
| + Market Misc Value | \$10,338 | \$10,888 | \$4,243 | \$4,487 |
| + Market Land Value | \$529,169 | \$529,169 | \$529,169 | \$416,025 |
| = Just Market Value | \$622,592 | \$625,659 | \$617,686 | \$512,725 |
| = Total Assessed Value | \$622,592 | \$625,659 | \$617,686 | \$512,725 |
| - School Exempt Value | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 | \$0 |
| $=$ School Taxable Value | \$622,592 | \$625,659 | \$617,686 | \$512,725 |

Land

| Land Use | Number of Units | Unit Type | Frontage | Depth |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| RESIDENTIAL DRY (010D) | $4,824.00$ | Square Foot | 0 | 0 |

## Buildings

| Building ID | 898 |  |  |  | Exterior Walls | METAL/ALUM |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Style | 1 STORY ELEV FOUNDATION |  |  |  | Year Built | 1920 |
| Building Type | S.F.R. - R1 / R1 |  |  |  | EffectiveYearBuilt | 1990 |
| Gross Sq Ft | 1288 |  |  |  | Foundation | WD CONC PADS |
| Finished Sq Ft | 840 |  |  |  | Roof Type | GABLE/HIP |
| Stories | 1 Floor |  |  |  | Roof Coverage | ASPHALT SHINGL |
| Condition | AVERAGE |  |  |  | Flooring Type | CONC S/B GRND |
| Perimeter | 130 |  |  |  | Heating Type | NONE with 0\% NONE |
| Functional Obs | s 0 |  |  |  | Bedrooms | 3 |
| Economic Obs | 0 |  |  |  | Full Bathrooms | 1 |
| Depreciation \% | 35 |  |  |  | Half Bathrooms | 1 |
| Interior Walls | WALL BD/WD WAL |  |  |  | Grade | 450 |
|  | Description | Sketch Area |  |  | Number of Fire PI | 0 |
| Code D |  |  | Finished Area | Perimeter |  |  |
| FAT F | FINISHED ATTIC | 280 | 0 | 0 |  |  |
| FLA F | FLOOR LIV AREA | 840 | 840 | 0 |  |  |
| OPF O | OP PRCH FIN LL | 168 | 0 | 0 |  |  |
| TOTAL |  | 1,288 | 840 | 0 |  |  |

Yard Items

| Description | Year Built | Roll Year | Quantity | Units | Grade |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| FENCES | 2012 | 2013 | 1 | 1290 SF | 2 |
| FENCES | 2012 | 2013 | 0 | 192 SF | 2 |
| WOOD DECK | 2012 | 2013 | 1 | 120 SF | 2 |
| WALL AIR COND | 2012 | 2013 | 3 | 3 UT | 2 |


|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sale Date | Sale Price | Instrument | Instrument Number | Deed Book | Deed Page | Sale Qualification | Vacant or Improved |
| 1/30/2018 | \$689,000 | Warranty Deed | 2153925 | 2890 | 849 | 02-Qualified | Improved |
| 12/2/2016 | \$150,000 | Warranty Deed | 2103677 | 2831 | 223 | 30 - Unqualified | Improved |
| 3/27/2015 | \$100 | Quit Claim Deed |  | 2731 | 1866 | 11 - Unqualified | Improved |
| 5/4/2012 | \$0 | Quit Claim Deed |  | 2731 | 1862 | 11-Unqualified | Improved |
| 11/30/2011 | \$67,000 | Warranty Deed |  | 2545 | 560 | 16 - Unqualified | Improved |
| 7/2/2010 | \$65,000 | Warranty Deed |  | 2475 | 1383 | 16 - Unqualified | Improved |
| 6/18/2010 | \$0 | Quit Claim Deed |  | 2475 | 1377 | 11 - Unqualified | Improved |
| 4/28/2010 | \$0 | Quit Claim Deed |  | 2475 | 1379 | 11 -Unqualified | Improved |
| 4/6/2009 | \$0 | Quit Claim Deed |  | 2412 | 1221 | 11 - Unqualified | Improved |

## Permits

| Number <br> $\stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{*}$ | Date Issued <br> $\stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{*}$ | Date <br> Completed | Amount <br> $\stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{*}$ | Permit Type |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | ---: |
| $12-3339$ | $9 / 24 / 2012$ | $12 / 19 / 2013$ | $\$ 5,600$ | Residential | 1500 SQ/FT ROOF OVER 5-CRIMP METAL OVER ASPHALT SHINGLES 1.5 SQ/TPO FREEDOM REAR PORCH |
| FLAT ROOF. |  |  |  |  |  |

## View Tax Info

View Taxes for this Parcel

## Sketches (click to enlarge)



Photos
https://qpublic.schneidercorp.com/Application.aspx?AppID=605\&LayerID=9946\&PageTypeID=4\&PageID=7... 1/24/2020


No data available for the following modules: Commercial Buildings, Mobile Home Buildings, Exemptions.

The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office maintains data on property within the County solely for the purpose of fulfilling its responsibility to secure a just valuation for ad valorem tax purposes of all property within the County. The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office cannot guarantee its accuracy for any other purpose. Likewise, data provided regarding one tax year may not be applicable in prior or subsequent years. By requesting such data, you hereby understand and agree that the
User Privacy Policy
GDPR Privacy Notice
( $)^{\text {Schem }}$

