

THE CITY OF KEY WEST Tree Commission Post Office Box 1409 Key West, FL 33041-1409 Telephone: 305-809-3725

NOTICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING BEFORE THE TREE COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF KEY WEST

October 28, 2020

Tree Commission City of Key West Petitioner,

Vs.

Alfredo Gonzalez 13990 SW 30th Street Miami, FL 33175

An administrative hearing before the Tree Commission for the City of Key West will be held on **Tuesday, November 10, 2020**, at 5:00 p.m., at **Josephine Parker City Hall at Historic Glynn R.** Archer School, 1300 White Street, Key West, Florida.

This hearing will be conducted pursuant to sections 110-288 et. seq. of the Key West City Code. The purpose of this hearing will be to determine if a code violation has been committed by the above named Respondent. Your presence is required at this Tree Commission meeting.

Date of alleged violation: prior to May 28, 2020 at 1409 Whalton Street, Key West, FL:

Sec. 110-321. Required.

- (a) Unless a tree removal permit approved by the tree commission and issued by the Urban Forestry Manager has been obtained, no person, whether on publicly or privately owned land, shall cause tree abuse or other harm, or major maintenance to, hatracking, transplanting, topping or removal of the following:
 - (1) Any tree listed as "specially protected" in section 110-253;

Factual allegation: One (1) Green Buttonwood tree has been removed without benefit of a tree removal permit.

Key to the Caribbean - average yearly temperature 77 ° Fahrenheit.



If the Tree Commission for the City of Key West finds that there has been a violation of the above code section, it will elect to enter into a compliance settlement agreement pursuant to section 110-291 of the Key West City Code or recommend a fine and further hearing before the Special Master of the City of Key West pursuant to section 110-294 of the Key West City Code.

Attendees are hereby notified that a complete and accurate record of the proceeding is required under Florida Statute 286.0105 if an appeal is sought. Appellants are responsible for providing transcription services.

I hereby certify that the forgoing notice has been mailed to the Respondents and has been sent via email, regular mail, and certified U.S. Mail to the above named Respondent's listed address on this **28th day of October 2020.**

If you have any questions, please call the office at (305) 809-3768.

an

Karen DeMaria Urban Forestry Manager <u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>

Kev to the Caribbean - average vearly temperature 77 ° Fahrenheit.

STAFF REPORT

DATE: October 30, 2020

RE: Administrative Hearing for 1409 Whalton Street (TC2020-00036)

FROM: Karen DeMaria, City of Key West Urban Forestry Manager

On October 10, 2019, while driving in the area it was noticed that a coconut palm had been removed and another had been improperly trimmed at 1409 Whalton Street. Photos were taken of the property and the property owner was asked to submit an after the fact permit application for the removal of the palm and educated on proper palm trimming as per City Code (warning letter sent).

In May 2020, a request was made by the property owner to inspect the property to close out the permit. During this inspection it was documented that a buttonwood tree, an Alexander Palm, and a clump of Christmas palms were missing from the property. The property owner subsequently planted four Buccaneer palms as mitigation for the additional palm removals.

Communication with the property owners indicated that they were trying to clean up the property and had building permits to upgrade/renovate the exterior of the existing house. The property owner stated in an e-mail that the buttonwood tree had to be removed as it was growing underneath the deck and lifting it.









Photo showing property and area of interest in May 2020 during inspection.



Updated photo of area showing 4-Buccaneer palms planted as mitigation for palm removals.

It is recommended that the 4 buccaneer palms be accepted as mitigation for the palm removals (1-Alexander and 1-Christmas Palm clump, 2:1 mitigation).

The Green Buttonwood tree was approximately 5-inch diameter. Therefore, it is recommended that either approved dicot replacement trees be planted or donated to a not for profit or the City or a fine issued for the removal of the buttonwood tree.

Additional Information

From: Sent: To: Subject: Ronald Gonzalez <rgonz823@gmail.com> Friday, October 23, 2020 3:02 PM Karen DeMaria Re: 1409 Whalton St Administrative Hearing

Hi Karen,

Confirmed! I will coordinate to be there November 10. Just to confirm city hall, is the same place where the building department is located?

Thank you Ronald

On Fri, Oct 23, 2020 at 12:27 PM Karen DeMaria <kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov> wrote:

Ronald:

I am putting together the agenda for the November 10 Tree Commission meeting and I want to place the administrative hearing regarding the removal of the buttonwood tree on the agenda. Someone must be at the meeting to represent the property. Are you available on that date? The Tree Commission meetings start at 5 p.m. and it will be held in the City Hall chambers on White Street.

Sincerely,

Karen

Karen DeMaria

Urban Forestry Manager

City of Key West

305-809-3768

From: Karen DeMaria Sent: Wednesday, September 9, 2020 4:26 PM To: Ronald Gonzalez <rgonz823@gmail.com> Subject: RE: Permit #TREE2019-0479

Yes I inspected the palms that were planted and they look good and I think should help to resolve the palm issues. We still have the issue of the buttonwood tree removal which will have to be handled by an administrative hearing with the Tree Commission.

Sincerely,

Karen

From: Ronald Gonzalez <<u>rgonz823@gmail.com</u>> Sent: Wednesday, September 9, 2020 7:30 AM To: Karen DeMaria <<u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>> Subject: Re: Permit #TREE2019-0479

Good Morning Karen,

I just wanted to follow up with the process of the tree permit. I'm not sure if you were able to inspect the last 5 Palms we planted. Please if we need to do anything additional at this time please let me know.

Thank you Ronald

On Mon, Aug 10, 2020 at 9:58 AM Karen DeMaria <kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov> wrote:

Received, I will schedule an inspection.

Thank you,

Karen

From: Ronald Gonzalez <<u>rgonz823@gmail.com</u>> Sent: Friday, August 7, 2020 9:34 AM To: Karen DeMaria <<u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>> Subject: Re: Permit #TREE2019-0479

Hello Karen,

Hope all is well, I'm not sure how we stand with out permit, but I wanted to inform you we went ahead and planted new Palms from the list. We planted I new coconut palm and 4 buccaneers. Please see attached pictures. Please if you have an opportunity to come out and inspect them. They are all on the front of the house.

1409 whalton st.

Thank you.

Ronald.

From: Sent: To: Subject: Karen DeMaria Friday, August 7, 2020 3:41 PM Ronald Gonzalez FW: Permit #TREE2019-0479

Received, thank you.

Karen

From: Ronald Gonzalez <rgonz823@gmail.com> Sent: Friday, August 7, 2020 3:25 PM To: Karen DeMaria <kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov> Subject: Re: Permit #TREE2019-0479





On Fri, Aug 7, 2020 at 3:20 PM Karen DeMaria <<u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>> wrote:

Thank you for the e-mail. There are no photos attached.

Sincerely,

Karen

From: Ronald Gonzalez <<u>rgonz823@gmail.com</u>> Sent: Friday, August 7, 2020 9:34 AM On Fri, Jun 12, 2020 at 12:40 PM Karen DeMaria <<u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>> wrote:

I have to initiate an enforcement case to resolve the issue. I have a missing protected green buttonwood tree, a regulated single Alexander Palm, and a regulated clump of Christmas Palms. An Administrative Hearing will be scheduled in front of the Tree Commission probably in August or September. The Tree Commission will require that you plant approved palms and tree species on the property or pay a fine. I have attached some photos showing the locations of the missing tree and palms. I will be in contact with you regarding additional information about the meeting once I get confirmation on the meeting schedule.

By the way, the palm removal permit is still open. You can plant an approved palm (see attached list or pay a fee into the City Tree Fund (\$250).

Sincerely,

Karen

From: Ronald Gonzalez <<u>rgonz823@gmail.com</u>> Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 9:48 AM To: Karen DeMaria <<u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>> Subject: Fwd: Permit #TREE2019-0479

Hi Karen, my apologies it looks like I replied to the wrong email last week, below.

Please let me know what I should do.

Thank you Ronald

Begin forwarded message:

From: Ronald Gonzalez <<u>rgonz823@gmail.com</u>> Date: May 28, 2020 at 1:38:02 PM EDT To: Rw2pan <<u>rw2pan@yahoo.es</u>> Subject: Re: Permit #TREE2019-0479

Hi Karen,

Thank you for coming out. The landscaping was done by my father and myself. We had to remove a tree that was growing from underneath the deck and it was lifting it, I'm not sure if this was the buttonwood. The palms we haven't removed as those are too big for use to do. The little palms in the front we did cut 2 of the bundle. Please let me know how I should procede.

Thank you

Ronald

On May 28, 2020, at 12:15 PM, Ronald Gonzalez <rearchight regions wrote:

From: Karen DeMaria <<u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>> Date: Thu, May 28, 2020 at 10:48 AM Subject: RE: Permit #TREE2019-0479 To: Ronald Gonzalez <<u>rgonz823@gmail.com</u>>

Ronald:

I went by the property yesterday. I can not close out the file because nothing that was planted is on the City of Key West approved palm or tree lists. Also, I noted that several regulated palms have been removed without benefit of a tree removal permit and a protected buttonwood tree is missing, without benefit of a removal permit. Who did the landscaping work?

Sincerely,

Karen

From: Ronald Gonzalez <<u>rgonz823@gmail.com</u>> Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 9:13 AM To: Karen DeMaria <<u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>> Subject: Re: Permit #TREE2019-0479

Hi Karen, thank you.

The plantings are easily inspected. They're outside in the front, no gate.

On Tue, May 26, 2020 at 9:10 AM Karen DeMaria < kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov> wrote:

Please fill out the attached job completion form so I know where the palm was planted on the property and what kind, for our files. Once I receive the form I will schedule a site visit. Can I easily inspect the plantings or do I need an appointment or gate code?

Sincerely,

Karen

From: Ronald Gonzalez <<u>rgonz823@gmail.com</u>> Sent: Monday, May 25, 2020 9:01 PM To: Karen DeMaria <<u>kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov</u>> Subject: Permit #TREE2019-0479

Hi,

This is Ronald González from 1409 Whalton st. I wanted let you know we have planted a new palm, and a few other trees and plants. We're ready to close out permit 2019-0479.

Thank You

Ronald



72019-0479

Tree Permit Application

Please Clearly Print All Information unless indicated otherwise. Date: October 15, 2019 Tree Address 1409 Whalton ST Cross/Corner Street Whalton - Weshinton List Tree Name(s) and Quantity ______ CoconuT. Species Type(s) check all that apply (#Palm () Flowering () Fruit () Shade () Unsure Reason(s) for Application: (Remove (Tree Health () Safety () Other/Explain below () Transplant () New Location () Same Property () Other/Explain below () Heavy Maintenance Trim () Branch Removal () Crown Cleaning/Thinning () Crown Reduction Additional Information and Coconut tree was too trall and not in good Explanation health Being replaced for a new tree. Property Owner Name Alfredo Gonzalez Property Owner email Address rw2 pan @ Yahoo.es Property Owner Mailing Address 13790 sw 30st Aliami F1 33175 Property Owner Phone Number (716) - 541 - 5221. Property Owner Signature **Representative Name** Representative email Address Representative Mailing Address Representative Phone Number NOTE: A Tree Representation Authorization form must accompany this application if someone other than the owner will be representing the owner at a Tree Commission meeting or picking up an issued Tree Permit. Tree Representation Authorization form attached () Sketch location of tree in this area including cross/corner Street Please identify tree(s) with colored tape

If this process requires blocking of a City right-of-way, a separate ROW Permit is required. Please contact 305-809-3740.

whatton

From:	yaquelin gonzalez <yakilez@yahoo.com></yakilez@yahoo.com>				
Sent:	Thursday, October 17, 2019 10:44 AM Karen DeMaria Rw Rw; Ronald Gonzalez				
To:					
Cc:					
Subject:	1409 Whalton St key West Tree Application				
Attachments:	Permiso corte de Arblo.101519.pdf				

Hi, dear Karen.

Attached send application, please if you require additional information, do not hesitate to contact us.

We greatly appreciate your help.

Have an excellent day sincerely Jacqueline Pages

From:	Karen DeMaria				
Sent:	Friday, October 11, 2019 3:18 PM				
To:	rw2pan@yahoo.es				
Subject:	1409 Whalton St key west Tree application				
Attachments:	Tree Permit Application.pdf; Approved Replacement Palm List 2018Dec.pdf; Sec 110				
	plant lists and permit info Jan 2014.pdf				

It was nice speaking with you today. Attached is an application that needs to be filled out regarding the removal of the coconut palm. I will process an after the fact permit which will require the planting of 1-approved native palm, 4 ft tall on the property. I also gave your dad a copy of the approved palm list, for you review.

I have also attached some information regarding regulations in Key West regarding tree and palms. If you have any questions, feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

Karen

Karen DeMaría Urban Forestry Manager Certified Arborist FL# 6585A City of Key West Planning Department 1300 White Street, Key West, FL 33040 305-809-3768









py

THE CITY OF KEY WEST Tree Commission P.O. BOX 1409 Key West, Fl 33041-1409

October 21, 2019

Alfredo Gonzalez 13990 SW 30th Street Miami, FL 33175

Dear Mr. Gonzalez:

On October 10,2019, it came to my attention that trimming of Coconut palms on property located at 1409 Whalton Street, Key West, FL, was done improperly and against the City of Key West Code of ordinances.

Sec. 110-402. Palms.

- (a) Palm pruning should be performed when fronds, fruit, or loose petioles may create a dangerous condition.
- (b) Live healthy fronds, should not be removed above the level horizontal plane initiating at the heart of the tree.
- (f) Hurricane cuts are not approved methods of palm pruning.



With this letter I am warning you of the improper trimming work that was done to the coconut palms at the property. City of Key West regulations require a 9-3 trim (horizontal plane). If this type of trimming occurs again on the property an enforcement case will be processed in front of the Tree Commission.

Sincerely, cy

Karen DeMaria Urban Forestry Manager 305-809-3768 kdemaria@cityofkeywest-fl.gov



Disclaimer

The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office maintains data on property within the County solely for the purpose of fulfilling its responsibility to secure a just valuation for ad valorem tax purposes of all property within the County. The Monroe County Property Appraiser's office cannot guarantee its accuracy for any other purpose. Likewise, data provided regarding one tax year may not be applicable in prior or subsequent years. By requesting such data, you hereby understand and agree that the data is intended for ad valorem tax purposes only and should not be relied on for any other purpose.

By continuing into this site you assert that you have read and agree to the above statement.

Summary

R531-185/186 OR R1054-1681/82 OI I83 OIE: Not to be used 31 ULTI FAMILY LESS ie: Webb Realty Co /68/25	CO SUB PB1-42 PT 621-229 OR865-2 R1054-1683/84 O		9-1341 OR97: 3-243/44C/T (1-1129			
039144 IKW IO9 WHALTON St, W WEBB REALTY (RS31-185/186 OR R1054-1681/82 OI IS3 OIE: NOT to be used 31 ULTI FAMILY LESS IN Webb Realty Co /68/25 0	CO SUB PB1-42 PT 621-229 OR865-2 R1054-1683/84 O	166 OR900-1725 OR96 R2773-610ORD OR292 ts.) 0800) PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St	9-1341 OR97: 3-243/44C/T (1-1129 OR2965-			
DKW KO9 WHALTON St, W WEBB REALTY (RS31-185/186 OR R1054-1681/82 O IIII FAMILY LESS WEB Realty Co (68/25	CO SUB PB1-42 PT 621-229 OR865-2 R1054-1683/84 O	166 OR900-1725 OR96 R2773-610ORD OR292 ts.) 0800) PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St	9-1341 OR97: 3-243/44C/T (1-1129 OR2965-			
109 WHALTON St. W WEBB REALTY (R531-185/186 OR R1054-1681/82 OI 183 014: Not to be used 31 ULTI FAMILY LESS 00 00	CO SUB PB1-42 PT 621-229 OR865-2 R1054-1683/84 O	166 OR900-1725 OR96 R2773-610ORD OR292 ts.) 0800) PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St	9-1341 OR97: 3-243/44C/T (1-1129 OR2965-			
W WEBB REALTY (R531-185/186 OR R1054-1681/82 OI 183 OTE: NOT to be used 31 ULTI FAMILY LESS ie Webb Realty Co /68/25	CO SUB PB1-42 PT 621-229 OR865-2 R1054-1683/84 O	166 OR900-1725 OR96 R2773-610ORD OR292 ts.) 0800) PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St	9-1341 OR97: 3-243/44C/T (1-1129 OR2965-			
R531-185/186 OR R1054-1681/82 OI I83 OIE: Not to be used 31 ULTI FAMILY LESS te Webb Realty Co /68/25	621-229 OR865-2 R1054-1683/84 O on legal document	166 OR900-1725 OR96 R2773-610ORD OR292 ts.) 0800) PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St	9-1341 OR97: 3-243/44C/T (1-1129 OR2965-			
R1054-1681/82 OJ 183 014: Not to be used 31 ULTI FAMILY LESS the Webb Realty Co 768/25	R1054-1683/84 O	R2773-6100RD OR2923 (5.) 0800) PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St	3-243/44C/T (OR2965-			
ole, Not to be used 31 ULTI FAMILY LESS ie Webb Realty Co /68/25		0800) PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St				DE WHATEM ST A	
31 ULTI FAMILY LESS ie Webb Realty Co /68/25		0800) PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St			1000144		
e Webb Realty Co /68/25	THAN 10 UNITS (PAGES JACQUELIN 13990 SW 30th St			1000144	OF WHALTON ST	
0		13990 SW 30th St		a	1000141	UP WHALTON ST	-
		13990 SW 30th St		6	1023144	WHALTON ST M	53
Þ		13990 SW 30th St		1	1023144	WHALTON ST M	
		13990 SW 30th St		-			RIDEIAS
		13990 SW 30th St					areas i a
		13990 SW 30th St	10				
nent Value		13990 SW 30th St	NE				
ment Value		Miami El 33175					
nent Value		P.101117 L 0017 J					
ment Value							
ment Value				2019	2018	2017	2016
and the second se	et Improvement Value \$255,		5,044	\$317,350	\$325,701	\$308,376	
+ Market Misc Value		\$24	4.155	\$24,822 \$25,489		\$26,934	
+ Market Land Value			\$42	3,691	\$456,527 \$434,283		\$477,448
 Just Market Value 			\$702,890		\$798,699	\$785,473	\$812,758
 Total Assessed Value 			\$703	2,890	\$798,699	\$785,473	\$812,758
alue				\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
/alue			\$703	2,890	\$798,699	\$785,473	\$812,758
		Number of Units		Unit Ty	me	Frontage	Denth
(DD)							Depth 45
9					WDFRAME		
					1990		
6							
oor					METAL		
RAGE					TERRAZZO	in the second second	
						vith 0% NONE	
					o		
PANL/CUSTOM					400		
tion	Chatch Arres	Platitud Ave.			0		
INFINOL				_			
	1,376	624	0				
D			E.	tarias Walls	WDEBAME		
	ATION				1990		
04/04			Eff	fectiveYearBuilt	2000		
					CONC PILINGS		
2				NOT IVIDA	GABLE/HIP		
				of Coverage	METAL		
IS ROOT	9 T 1 STORY 2- R1/R1 5 PANL/CUSTOM tion LIV AREA IBLOCK NFIN UL DRY ELEV FOUND R1/R1	P T 1 STORY L - R1/R1 S PANL/CUSTOM tion Sketch Area LIV AREA 624 IBLOCK 624 NFIN VL 128 1,376 DRY ELEV FOUNDATION R1/R1	P T 1 STORY L - R1/R1 Soor RAGE PANL/CUSTOM tion Sketch Area Finished Area LIV AREA 624 624 IBLOCK 624 0 NFIN VL 128 0 1,376 624 ORY ELEV FOUNDATION R1/R1	D) 4,035,15 P 1 1 STORY Y T 1 STORY Y L-R1/R1 E S R Por RAGE R PANL/CUSTOM R H PANL/CUSTOM G H PANL/CUSTOM G H PANL/CUSTOM G H DO PANL/CUSTOM G H B D PANL/CUSTOM G H B D PANL/CUSTOM G H B D PANL/CUSTOM G H B D PANL/CUSTOM G H B D PANL/CUSTOM G H B D PANL/CUSTOM G H B D PANL/CUSTOM G H B D PANL/CUSTOM G C PANL/CUSTOM G PANL/CUSTOM G PANL/CUSTOM G PANL/CUS	D) 4.035.15 Square 9 T 1 STORY 4R1/R1 5 PANL/CUSTOM PANL/CUSTOM PANL/CUSTOM Corr PANL/CUSTOM Corr PANL/CUSTOM Corr PANL/CUSTOM Corr Corr Sketch Area Finished Area Finished Area Finished Area Finished Area Perimeter Corr Co	D) 4.035.15 Square Foot Square Foot Squa	D) 4.035.15 Square Foot 89.7 Square Foot 89.7

https://qpublic.schneidercorp.com/Application.aspx?AppID=605&LayerID=9946&PageT... 10/15/2019