



City of Key West, FL

City Hall
1300 White Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, October 23, 2018

5:30 PM

City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3811 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

ALL VISUAL PRESENTATIONS FOR AGENDA ITEMS MUST BE RECEIVED (24) TWENTY-FOUR HOURS PRIOR TO THE MEETING.

Call Meeting To Order 5:30 PM

Roll Call

Absent 1 - Bender

Present 6 - Mr. Cognevich, Mr. Moody, Ms. Powell, Mr. Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Approval of Agenda

The Agenda was approved as amended unanimously.

A motion was made by Commissioner Letisia Powell, seconded by Commissioner Joel Cognevich, that the be Approved on the Consent Agenda. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

Approval of Minutes

1 September 27, 2018

Attachments: [Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Joe Moody, seconded by Vice Chair Richard McChesney, that the Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

HARC Planner's Report

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Old Business

- 2 Demolition of one outer wall on rearmost one-story, demolition of one upstairs wall and partial demolition of roof on second floor rear structure. Demolition of one-story rear portion of the house and partial demolition of rear wall of main house - **#522 Simonton Street - Glenn Anderson (H18-03-0020) Second Reading**

Attachments: [522 Simonton Street -Second Reading](#)
[522 Simonton Street - August Revisions to Demolition](#)
[522 Simonton Street - June Revisions to Demolition](#)
[522 Simonton Redesign Applicants Presentation](#)
[522 Simonton Street - May Previous Demolition](#)
[Applicant's previous review](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 5 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, and Chairman Green

- 3 Demolition of existing additions, decks, sheds and roof deck - **#819 White Street - Albert Hall IV (H2018-0005)**

Attachments: [819 White Street - Second Reading](#)
[819 White Street - Demolition](#)
[Public Comment](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 4 Minor Development Plan - New two-story commercial building and new two-story residential duplex - **#1028-1030 Truman Avenue - William Shepler (H18-03-0013)**

Attachments: [1028-1030 Truman Avenue- Revised design](#)
[1028-1030 Truman Avenue- Previous submitted design](#)
[Public Comment- Previous submitted](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Cognevich, seconded by Commissioner Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed to November 27. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 2 - Commissioner Shepler, and Vice Chair McChesney

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 4 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, and Chairman Green

- 5** New one-story accessory structure and conversion of rear portion of house into a covered patio - **#1317 Grinnell Street - Juan Contin (H17-03-0058)**

Attachments: [1317 Grinnell Street- Design](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Cognevich, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 6** Demolition of non-historic accessory structure and partial demolition of east and north exterior walls of main house - **#1317 Grinnell Street - Juan Contin (H17-03-0058)**

Attachments: [1317 Grinnell Street- Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Cognevich, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 7** New one-story rear ~~addition~~ deck covering - **#409 Margaret Street - David Knoll (H18-03-0035)**

Attachments: [409 Margaret Street- Revised Design](#)
[409 Margaret Street- Previous Design](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Powell, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

8 Demolition of existing structure - **#215 Eneas Lane - T. Seth Neal (H2018-0003)**

Attachments: [215 Eneas Lane- Demolition Second Reading](#)
[215 Eneas Lane- Demolition First Reading](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Cognevich, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

New Business

9 New one-story rear addition - **# 1116 Packer Street - T. Seth Neal (H2018-006)**

Attachments: [1116 Packer Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

10 Renovations to existing house. New one and two-story additions at rear. New side wood fence, new pool and rear deck- **#514 Louisa Street - T. Seth Neal (H2018-012)**

Attachments: [514 Louisa Street- Design](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Shepler, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

11 Demolition of existing concrete porch. Demolition of side stairs. Demolition of rear roof, first floor rear wall and partial

demolition of second floor rear wall - **#514 Louisa Street -
T. Seth Neal (H2018-012) SECOND READING**

Attachments: [514 Louisa Street - Demolition second reading](#)
[514 Louisa Street - Demolition first reading](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Shepler, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

12

Demolition of all buildings with the exception of rear building - **#316
Simonton Street - Michael Ingram (H2018-007)- #316 Simonton
Street - Michael Ingram (H2018-007)**

Attachments: [316 Simonton Street - Design and Demolition **Warning: Large File**](#)
[Public Comment](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Cognevich, seconded by Commissioner Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

13

New parking lot - **#316 Simonton Street - Michael Ingram
(H2018-007)**

Attachments: [316 Simonton Street - Design and Demolition **Warning: Large File**](#)
[Public Comment](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Letisia Powell, seconded by Commissioner Joel Cognevich, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

14

Replacement of 13 deteriorated wood windows with aluminum windows - **#401H Emma Street- Elliot Chwe (H2018-008)**

Attachments: [401H Emma Street](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner William Shepler, seconded by Commissioner Letisia Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

15

Removal of existing skylights and new dormers at front and rear elevations and changes to fenestrations - **#1319-A William Street -
William Shepler (H2018-009)**

Attachments: [1319-A William Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Cognevich, that the Action Item be Approved as amended with the conditions the dormers will be lower than the ridge and the proposed front window will be removed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Commissioner Shepler

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 5 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

16 Partial demolition of roof and demolition of front trellis - **#1319-A William Street - William Shepler (H2018-009)**

Attachments: [1319-A William Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Cognevich, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Commissioner Shepler

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 5 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

17 Renovations of main house including front porch. New one-story rear addition with deck. New one-story accessory structure, pool, spa, deck, fencing, and new carport - **#627 Caroline Street - William Rowan (H2018-010)**

Attachments: [627 Caroline Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Powell, seconded by Commissioner Cognevich, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

18 Removal of enclosing walls at front porch. Demolition of attached garage and rear one-story addition - **#627 Caroline Street - William Rowan (H2018-010) SECOND READING**

Attachments: [627 Caroline Street - Second Reading](#)
 [627 Caroline Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Commissioner Shepler, seconded by Commissioner Cognevich, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Bender

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Cognevich, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Powell, Commissioner Shepler, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Comments from Commissioners

Adjournment 7:00 PM