

Minutes  
City Evaluation  
Emergency Ambulance Service for Key West, FL  
RFP 009-10

August 9, 2010

Meeting was opened at 10:00 AM by Assistant City Manager Mark Z. Finigan. Mark thanked everyone for making the trip to Key West.

Mark introduced the evaluation team members. A sign-in sheet was passed around for all prospective vendors. There was one public attendee who was introduced. [Attachment 1]

Mark reviewed the procedures for the meeting and that 3 names will be recommended to the City Commission.

**Review of Basic Standards**

All papers and addendums were submitted in a timely manner.

Spoke about responsiveness. Task force agreed all were responsive.

**References**

References reviewed

No obviously outstanding issues

State of FL EMS Medical Compliance office has yet to respond to the due diligence request

**Lifestar Response**

Reviewed the proposal

Asked various questions concerning finances, medical direction, operations, and other factors

Representative explained the financial model and answered several questions

Explained how the corporate structure benefits the organization.

Explained how reserve unit and personnel can handle emergency situations.

### **American Medical Response**

Excellent history and response

Poor history of working with the city on financial issues

Asked representative about proposal subsidy request

Key West organizational structure not present. Representative explained the local structure.

GPS and AVL equipped

Committed to CAD interface.

### **Lunch Break**

At 11:30 AM, Mark called for a lunch recess until 1:00 PM.

The meeting reconvened at 1:00 PM

### **American Ambulance**

Discussed the issues concerning staffing of the third unit.

Mark was concerned about previous and current 911 experience.

American prefers Plan 2

The only difference between plans 1 and 2 is the 12 hour unit

Emphasized the inclusion of fire and police into first response.

Discussed performance model

Based their subsidy on older data.

Concerns with lack of detail on the quality management

Management structure has extensive experience in 911 service but not as "American Ambulance."

Has contract for evacuating Keys during weather emergencies

Spoke concerning pay rates needed in Key West

Reporting aspects were discussed. Reviewed customer complaint procedures

### **Paramedics Plus**

Questions asked about the implementation of the fine/QA program.

Were informed that per LKMC, the ER group could not contract for medical direction.

Capital investment would be significant

Significant discussion about charge/stipend expenses. Very high

**Vanguard**

Asked to explain the oversight and non-profit model

Concerns about the start-up and organizational loss issues

Lack of experience with hurricane and mass evacuation

CAP is \$200,000 for subsidy

Vanguard will fund any losses

Task force uncomfortable with the proposed organizational structure.

**Summary**

Harold reviewed the stipend to charge ratio. [Attachment 2]

After discussion, the meeting continued.

Each task force member submitted the evaluation sheet for each vendor.

All scores were tabulated. [Attachment 3]

The three top scoring vendors recommended to the City Commission.

- |    |                           |
|----|---------------------------|
| 1. | Lifestar Response         |
| 2. | American Medical Response |
| 3. | American Ambulance        |

Mark advised all vendors that an executive summary would be prepared, reviewed by the City Manager, and transmitted to the City Commission. He is unsure whether it would be included on the September 7 or September 21 agenda.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:45 PM.

# Attachment 1

## Sign-In Sheet

Aug 9<sup>th</sup> 2018

MARK FINIGAN	CKWI	305-809-3877
STEVE SIMONAITIS	KWR	305-797-5452
BARBARA SANTIAGO	KWR	305-496-5072
ALAN AVERETTE	KWFD	305-747-4631
Charles Maymon	American Ambulance	305-925-2000
MARK POSTMA	PARAMEDICS PLUS	727 582 2167
JOSEPH CASELLA	VANGUARD HEALTHCARE	201-562-1800
Harold C. Cohen	SPC/TriData	443-829-8113
Dave Outway	Keywest resident	305 295 8261
Douglas Tisdale	CARE Ambulance	334-850-2636
MARGARET ROMERO	C.I.ZON	

## Attachment 2

### Subsidy/Charge Ratio Comparison

Bidder	Stipend	Charges per Call (Transport)
American Medical Response (AMR)	\$625,000 +3.5% annually	\$701.96/\$13.91 per mile/supplies
American Ambulance	Plan 1 - \$674,436 Plan 2 - \$413,275 +3% annually	ALS - \$875 BLS - \$675 + \$11.45 per mile
Vanguard	\$300 per uninsured transport \$200,000 annual cap <sup>1</sup>	ALS - \$900 BLS - \$725 + \$13.25 per mile
Lifestar Response	\$0	ALS1 - \$700 ALS2 - \$950 BLS - \$560
Paramedics Plus	\$0 - \$700K	ALS1 - \$1,900 - \$2,650 ALS 2 - \$2,000 - \$2,750 BLS - \$1,550 - \$2,300 + \$40.00 per mile/\$65 for oxygen

<sup>1</sup> Changed from \$300,000 by the vendor during the public deliberation. Vendor claimed it was an error.

Ranking Criteria	Points Allowed			Lifestar			American Medical Response			American Ambulance			Paramedics Plus							
	Finigan	Cohen	Iacona	Averette	Oatway	Finigan	Cohen	Iacona	Averette	Oatway	Finigan	Cohen	Iacona	Averette	Oatway					
Approach to Systems Design	20	18	17	18	20	19	18	18	20	12	18	16	18	20	12	18	19	18	18	16
Clinical & Employment Practices	20	18	14	16	18	20	19	19	18	20	18	15	18	19	12	18	19	20	18	19
Financial Capabilities/Sadministrative & Reporting Practices	25	23	22	16	25	25	10	16	23	12	20	14	20	22	12	14	0	11	10	15
Past Experience of Provider & Key Personnel	25	22	22	18	22	25	23	24	25	25	17	20	23	21	22	23	25	25	20	25
References	10	10	10	8	10	10	8	9	10	10	10	7	10	10	10	10	8.5	8	10	10
Total Score (individual)	100	91	81.5	76	95	99	88	85	96	79	83	72	89	92	68	83	71.5	82	76	85
Total Score (group)				442.5				426					404					397.5		
Total Possible Score				500				500					500					500		
%				89%				85%					81%					80%		
				Lifestar				American Medical					American Ambulance					Paramedics Plus		

Ranking Criteria	Points Allowed			Vanguard		
	Finigan	Cohen	Iacona	Averette	Oatway	Oatway
Approach to Systems Design	20	15	15	19	10	8
Clinical & Employment Practices	20	17	17	18	18	12
Financial Capabilities/Sadministrative & Reporting Practices	25	20	17.5	22	18	8
Past Experience of Provider & Key Personnel	25	20	19	22	18	9
References	10	10	10	8	10	10
Total Score (individual)	100	82	78.5	89	74	47
Total Score (group)				370.5		
Total Possible Score				500		
%				74%		
				Vanguard		