



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, June 28, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

Call to Order
Pledge of Allegiance
Roll Call

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, Bryan Green and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

Approval of Agenda

Enid Torregrosa stated that Item 11 has been withdrawn.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes **1 May 24, 2011**

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Action Items

Old Business

- 2** Replacement of four front porch columns. Demolition and replacement of front porch deck and part of front porch roof- Code Compliance case- **#522 Grinnell Street- Keys Contracting Services Inc. (H11-01-387)- Second reading**

The applicant was not present.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 3 Demolition of non historic side porch and new addition on same location-#1227 South Street- Michael Miller (H11-01-650) - Second reading**

Michael Miller presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 4 Demolition of non historic attendant parking booth. No new built back- #402 Wall Street- City of Key West (H11-01-693)- Second reading**

The applicant was not present.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 5 Demolition of non historic attendant parking booth. No new built back- #800 Block Caroline Street- City of Key West (H11-01-694)**

City of Key West Parking Manager John Wilkins presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench asked the applicant if the architect working on the bight enhancement project could use the booth.

John Wilkins stated that the booth would go through the normal city process concerning surplus equipment.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

New Business

- 6 Wall mural designed by Eric Anfinson, will be painted by kids from Just 4 Kids Art Center- **#101 Geraldine Street- addition- Just 4 Kids Art Center- Genevieve Canizares (H11-01-414)**

Genevieve Canizares presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 7 Installation of metal fence 6' and 5' height and gate arbor in front yard- **#1230 Washington Street- Raymond Warakomski (H11-01-699)**

Raymond Warakomski presented the project.

Public comment:

Francis Ford 1235 Washington Street

Barbara Webb 1216 Washington Street

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green stated that he had no issues with the proposed materials, but he did have an issue with the proposed fence height.

Carlos Rojas stated that he was not in support of approval

Nils Muench stated that the proposed project was not in compliance with the guidelines.

Bryan Green made a motion to deny based on the guidelines page 41 number 3; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

DENIED

8 New house, pool, fence and garage on vacant lot - #817 Waddell Avenue-Thomas E. Pope (H11-01-714)

Gavin Scarborough presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green stated that the new construction looked as if it were a faux historic building.

Carlos Rojas stated that the proposed project does not comply with the guidelines.

Daniel Metzler stated that he was not in support of the design.

Nils Muench stated that the guideline on page 38 number 5 justifies the proposed design.

Carlos Rojas asked the applicant why they chose the proposed design.

Gavin Scarborough stated that his clients wanted a conch style house.

Daniel Metzler cited page 52 of the guidelines concerning architecture design principles.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

9 Remove existing wood staircase and replace with metal. Landing and treads will be covered with wood-#224 Duval Street # 427 Caroline Street- Wade Ferrel (H11-01-738)

Wade Ferrel and Owen Trepanier present the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green asked the applicant if this staircase was the only access to the second and third floor bars.

Wade Ferrel stated that the staircase was secondary access.

Bryan Green asked the applicant how they could coordinate for ADA.

Wade Ferrel stated that the only option would be an elevator and that is not feasible with this building.

Carlos Rojas stated that he was in support of the project.

Daniel Metzler recommended the applicant use as much wood as possible.

Rudy Molinet stated that metal stairs are historical not allowed, he the asked what type of metal was being proposed.

Wade Ferrel stated they would be using steel.

Rudy Molinet recommended an antique looking finish on the steel.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the design with aluminum substructure, aluminum risers painted flat black, wood handrails, treads, and landings; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

10 Second story addition and demolition of shed on back of lot- #616 Petronia Street- Carlos Rojas (H11-01-791)

Carlos Rojas recused himself from the dais.

Carlos Rojas presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench stated that the proposed second story does not meet mass and scale.

Rudy Molinet clarified with the applicant that he was only seeking approval for the demolition of the shed.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition of the shed; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Rudy Molinet stated that the proposal is too massive for a lot of that size.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

- 11 Demolition of existing storage shed. Construction of pool, new deck and wood fence- #1110 Fleming Street- Guillermo Orozco (H11-01-798)**

WITHDRAWN

HARC Planner's Report

Enid Torregrosa stated that the HARC appeal for 1107 Grinnell Street would be heard at the Code Enforcement hearing on June 29, 2011. She added that the draft HARC ordinance amendments for membership and noticing were going to the special Planning Board meeting on June 29, 2011 at 6:30pm.

Ron Ramsingh stated that Victor Cushman filed an action in circuit court for a declaratory judgment on the white roof code violation issue on Emma Street.

Comments from Commissioners Adjournment

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

HARC June 28, 2011

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.

DRAFT