

Grant and Sandy Shumaker  
1306 Villa mill Ally  
Key West , Florida 33040  
Tel 712-490-8422

Dec 11, 2023

Chairman and Planning Board Members, Monroe County ,Key West  
Re: United 638 Development, 4 SF homes

We are homeowners to the adjacent property, south of the proposed development and we strongly oppose the proposed building plans for 638 United.

We have owned our Villa mill home since 2014. Unfortunately, we will be unable to attend the scheduled planning committee meeting scheduled for 12/12/23 at 5pm. Our interest in this meeting pertains specifically to 638 United and proposed plans for multi family homes in a historical residential area. After reviewing what limited information is available online and city ordinances we have a plethora of concerns that we would like to bring to your attention.

**It appears that the goal of this development is to cater solely to the non-transient market as opposed to a local residential development. Given such, it should require commercial approval and zoning.**

1. 2023 Florida Keys Area protection act states the following:
  - a. Protecting the value, efficiency , cost effectiveness, and amortized life of existing and proposed public investments including , but not limited to..
    - i. The florida keys aqueduct and water supplies
      - a. Concerns with proposed development is the miscalculation of Potable water supply and water use per day. Omitted were the pool water use, sprinklers, outside hoses, 22 plus residents, more than 17 bathrooms, washers, and other items. Average pool evaporation rate is .25 inch per day or possibly 2 inches in the keys, meaning a 33'ft x 18' pool would use more than 600 gallons per week given the Florida climate. Using Grace's water footprint calculator , personal water consumption including pool, washer , etc would be 1374 gallons day, with US average being 1802 gallons a day. A household of 5 would use 6875 gallons per day. 22 occupants would use well over 30,000 gallons of water per day. A professional analysis is strongly advised given the discrepancies in the proposal
  - b. Sewage collection, treatment, and disposal facilities

- i. With the substantial increase in potable water demand, the wastewater system will be over-taxed. Again professional analysis is recommended
  - ii. Solid waste treatment, collection and disposal facilities
    - 1. Solid waste calculations appear much lower than national average . Per EPA 4.9 lbs /day , per person, nearly twice as much as noted in proposal of 2.66lbs.
  - iii. Transportation facilities
    - 1. United was recently renovated, to meet traffic and suspected drainage needs. The traffic on United is abundant and fluent throughout the day and night. From what I can depict from plans, the sidewalk in front of 638 united would be removed in order to meet other regulatory guidelines in this building proposal. The sidewalk was recently refurbished along with United . It gets a great deal of pedestrian and bicycle traffic, arriving and departing old town during the day and evening hours. With these sidewalks removed, there would not be any viable option for this selected group other than using the roadway .
    - 2. The person trip generator appears very flawed, noting only 10 trips per day for all 4 residential homes, totalling 40 trips per day. This does not take into account to and from calculations, mode of transportation, peak times, etc. Clearly a professional analysis ,using ITE methods to identify a more accurate /traffic flow into United and villa mill alley.
    - 3. A traffic study of United should be submitted as well as road analysis of villa mill alley.
- c. Limiting the adverse impacts of public investments on the environmental resources of the Florida Keys
- i. The infrastructure in Key west is fragile and at the end of three extraordinarily old umbilical cords. Our water, electricity, and communication depends on plugging into the mainland. We are an island archipelago, with the Overseas highway creating a sense that our infrastructure is more stable than it actually is. When the infrastructure breaks, for whatever reason the entire island is impacted.
  - ii. Rogo (rate of growth ordinance ) is a tool used by Monroe county to slow and control growth in the Florida Keys. It allows time for local planning. It also gives the area time to implement evacuation and environmental protection standards in the keys given it is an area susceptible to high levels of tourism and growth. We trust that a ROGO tool analysis would be utilized prior to any planning committee approval.
  - iii. It is well known, the Florida Keys are greatly affected by the rising sea levels, , the rising tide is eating away at the habitat, the continual unprecedented growth of developmental areas will contribute to the loss of our ecosystem. There is a

reason why city ordinances are in place, to protect our environment , infrastructure, and ecosystem.

#### Other concerns regarding actual construction

1. Would like a biologist to perform a ground and soil analysis prior to and after demolition
2. Our home would be adjacent to the planned attached garages, which have a higher incidence of home fires and require particular building codes including fire resistant walls and other protective measures. We would expect an exterior fireproof wall adjacent to our home.
3. Downstream water pollution prevention measures from fertilizer and pesticides that would impact our health , our pet's health, and our property
4. ERP storm water analysis with land topography alteration to analyze the increase in stormwater runoff and assess impact on our property which is at a lower elevation. Also, contractors plans for a buffer strip, lack of buffer will significantly impact our property
5. Pool and deck compliant with set back requirements.
6. Land use classification clarification, 4 SF homes, but one home appears to be a multifamily home, as noted by the tree commissioner . Clear delineation of proposed land use per city ordinances. Regardless of their classification, the property is only 13,000+ sq ft, only allowing 2 residential homes per city ordinances.
  - a. SF single family residential requires 6,000 sq ft or ½ acre
  - b. HPRD historic planned redevelopment /development 1 acre
  - c. HMDR historic medium density residential requires 4000 sqft
  - d. HSMDR historical special medium density residential 5,000 sqft
  - e. HHDR historic high density residential 4,000sqft
7. Codes note all new buildings shall be constructed with a rainwater catchment system that will hold 300 gal of water, or the amount equivalent to 100% of new roof area in gallons, per new proposal it is not included.
8. Measures to prevent termite, bug, and rodent infestation during demolition.
9. Measures to prevent damage to our adjacent dwelling or property from the demolition process
10. County and State engineer to inspect garage entrance proposals and driveways that will impact Villa Mill. Villa Mill Alley is a narrow one way street, two vehicles can not drive parallel to one another without encroaching on a private drive. Commercial trucks make deliveries from United because they are either too tall and can not pass under a large olive tree, or the phone and electrical wires that are directly across from planned development and garage access.
11. . **The city identified Villa Mill as an Alley, the definition of an Alley , per Cambridge dictionary, is a narrow road or path between buildings.**
12. Country inspect for 45 degree rule which stipulates that any extension to rear , front, or side of property be set within a 45 degree line drawn from the nearest edge of neighboring windows.

13. Decision regarding landscape waiver and noncompliant buffer. The waiver makes zero sense when the proposed development does not comply with city ordinances for building. Recommendations for smaller construction should be considered before landscape waiver issued.
14. Code requires the planting of 64 plant units in 132.6 linear feet, current plans unable to accommodate the city landscape requirements. As noted, only 40 plant units instead of 64 to be planted directly adjacent to our property. We are requesting that you do not consider landscape waivers and required vegetation is planted per city ordinances and to obstruct our immediate view of their proposed 4 mf and sf homes.
  - a. Development plan does not incorporate over 70% of required native vegetation.
  - b. Code also requires 10ft wide landscape area, the proposed plan only consist of 5ft wide landscape area, which is not congruent with any of the landscaping around surrounding homes on villa mill, united, or elizabeth st.
  - c. Current landscaping plans state palms will account for 67 % total tree requirements, code specifically states palms shall not constitute more than 25% of the total tree requirements.
  - d. Plans indicate landscape strips will not be covered with living material and or mulch, No sod or grass is proposed. Gravel will be placed in non vegetative open space landscape strips, not compliant with code.
  - e. In order to comply with Florida Keys area protection act the following must be considered
    1. Establish land use management system that protects the natural environment of the florida Keys, the proposed development would violate the protection act on several levels including disrupting the natural environment
    2. Establish land use management system that conserves and promotes the community character of the florida keys. The proposed development would negatively alter this historical residential area of Key West.
    3. Protect the constitutional rights of nearby property owners
15. Updated Property survey for both 1306 Villa Mill and 638 United prior to demolition and construction.
16. Are onsite parking spaces in this proposal used for open space calculation?
17. Where will pool heaters and pumps be stored?
18. Where will trash receptacles be stored, will a large dumpster be required given the amount of waste products.

Lastly, We agree with the safe demolition of 638 United, as a matter of fact we considered the acquisition of 638 United in order to maintain the charm of our historical residential area.

We offer the board members an opportunity to stroll down Villa Milly Alley to enjoy the tranquil harmony, bountiful tropical landscaping, and historical homes that are well spaced with abundant privacy.

It is heartbreaking to know villa mill alleyn and surrounding areas will be destroyed if this development gets approved. Our privacy will be non-existent given the proposed height, the noise will be profound with 22 plus additional people in a small designated area.

We hope you take our concerns into consideration when making your recommendations for this unfavorable old town development.