

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

Sean McCoy / City of Key West / Principal Engineer, Utilities

Respondant

		National Water Main Cleaning Company				
		Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Reserved
		Reviewer Scores				
Evaluation Criteria		Reviewer Scores				
Reviewer	Possible Points	Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Reserved
1	<p>Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm's relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar coastal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. • Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). • References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40				
2	<p>Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience on similar projects. • Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. • Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15				
3	<p>Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City's goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. • Quality assurance and inspection methods. • Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. • Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15				
4	<p>Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor's Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30				
Total		100				
		12.9	12.9	12.9	12.9	12.9
Reviewers' Average		12.9				

No Conc Rehab XP
No Mention of Local/Conc.
70 Pages of Product Submittal

No Conc Rehab

10

Vague Work Plan
No VEH/OTH Conc Plan
Start w/ Camera Inspect of Line?
No started for

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

Sean McCoy / City of Key West / Principal Engineer, Utilities

Respondant

		Engineered Coating Solutions				
		Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Reserved
		Reviewer Scores				
Evaluation Criteria		Possible Points				
1	<p>Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm's relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects - particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar coastal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. <p>Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	40	39			
2	<p>Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City's goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. <p>Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor's Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	15	14	No Resumes		
3		15	14 15		Best Ops Plan	
4		30	16.0	16.0	16.0	16.0
Total		100	16.0	16.0	16.0	16.0
		Reviewers' Average		16		

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

Sean McCoy / City of Key West / Principal Engineer, Utilities

Respondant

Restoration & Protective Services

		Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Reserved	Reserved
		Reviewer Scores					
Evaluation Criteria		Possible Points	Reviewer Scores				
1	<p>Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm's relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar coastal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40	30	Bid Form Total was 90k Less than 2 Line Items No specific Vert & GH listed or discussed			
2	<p>Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15	10	No Records No Vert & GH			
3	<p>Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City's goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15	10	Not? Vague WP No teching? QA/QC			
4	<p>Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor's Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30	13.7	13.7	13.7	13.7	13.7
Total		100	13.7	13.7	13.7	13.7	13.7
		Reviewers' Average 13.7					

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

Sean McCoy / City of Key West / Principal Engineer, Utilities

Respondant

Shenandoah

Evaluation Criteria	Possible Points	Reviewer Scores				
		Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Reserved
<p>1 Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm's relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar coastal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40	20				
<p>2 Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15	10				
<p>3 Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City's goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15	10				
<p>4 Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor's Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30	4.9	4.9	4.9	4.9	
Total	100	4.9	4.9	4.9	4.9	4.9

Reviewers' Average **4.93**

Listed AP is not appropriate w/ Pricing in Bid Form
Bid Form total was \$123,003.13 below Σ Line Items.
No Specific team Listed MS4 Certs.
Boach & Inport Repair but no mention of bypass pumps.
Lists Bypass Equip. though.

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

Sean McCoy / City of Key West / Principal Engineer, Utilities

Respondant

		Engineered Spray Solutions				
		Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Reserved
		Reviewer	Reviewer Scores			
Evaluation Criteria		Possible Points				
1	<p>Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm's relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar coastal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. <p>Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	40	37	35		
2	<p>Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City's goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. <p>Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as:</p> <p>Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor's Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	15	14			
4		30	18.8	18.8	18.8	18.8
Total		100	18.8	18.8	18.8	18.8

Reviewers' Average **18.8**

Applicable XP enclosure
Local Office Long way away
No Mention of Local Conditions
Clunky Submittal - 2 Copies Bid Form
No Cover, lot, etc.
No Resumes
No Dedicated Personnel
2nd Best Work Plan

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

Sean McCoy / City of Key West / Principal Engineer, Utilities

Respondant Paints & Coatings, Inc.

Evaluation Criteria	Possible Points	Reviewer Scores			
		Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R
<p>1 Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm's relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar coastal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40	5			
<p>2 Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15	5			
<p>3 Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City's goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15	0			
<p>4 Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor's Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30	15.1	15.1	15.1	15.1
Total	100	15.1	15.1	15.1	15.1

Reviewers' Average **15.1**

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

Sean McCoy / City of Key West / Principal Engineer, Utilities

Respondant

Veridian

Evaluation Criteria	Possible Points	Reviewer Scores				
		Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Reserved
<p>1 Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm's relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar coastal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40	38	Well Put together Proposal			
<p>2 Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15	14	Recognizes Reference to Main Office, Promises "Rapid Move to Key West"	Dedicated P.M. & Safety Officer		
<p>3 Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City's goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15	12	Outsources Bypass & Vocc			
<p>4 Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor's Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30	30.0	30.0	30.0	30.0	
Total	100	30.0	30.0	30.0	30.0	30.0
		Reviewers' Average 30				