

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 1 of 13

## Call Meeting To Order

Chairman Bryan Green called the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission (HARC) Meeting of **May 22, 2012** to order at **6:30 pm** at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510 Greene Street, Key West.

## Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

## Roll Call

Commissioners present include: Theo Glorie, Maggie Gutierrez, Daniel Metzler, and Vice Chairman Bryan Green acting as Chairman.

Commissioners absence include: Donna Bosold, Michael Miller, and Rudy Molinet.

Also, present from City Staff: Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, IT Ian Willis, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett.

## Approval of Agenda

Chairman Bryan Green inquired as to any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa responded that the review of the minutes needs to be postponed and that item # was Staff Approved following additional requested information.

### Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the Agenda with no changes be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous voice vote.

## Approval of Minutes

### 1 May 09, 2012

### Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the Minutes be **Postponed**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous voice vote.

## HARC Planner's Report

Ms. Torregrosa mentioned that close to 900 applications have been received so far this year. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Draft Survey has been received. Ms. Torregrosa added that she would be reviewing it and preparing a report.

## Assistant City Attorney's Report

Mr. Ramsingh stated that an appeal for the Harborside Project has been filed. Mr. Ramsingh added that he will be reviewing the paperwork and will report at the next meeting.

## Old Business

### 2 Install one sign on columns to be located on the pier at the end of Margaret Street for the Fort Jefferson Museum and the Historic Seaport Interpretive Center housed in the historic Thompson Fish House - **#231 Margaret Street – City of Key West/ FMH Builders, Inc. (H12-01-123)**

Marilyn Wilbarger presented the project on behalf of the City. Ms. Wilbarger stated that what is being present this time is a scaled down version of the previous proposal. Ms. Wilbarger stated that the sign is an effort to support the new Dry Tortugas museum by attracting tourist to the end of the pier. Ms. Wilbarger concluded stating that this sign is very important to the success of the new museum.

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 2 of 13

## Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

## Staff Report:

Virginia Haller presented her Staff report. Ms. Haller stated that the applicant has addressed the concerns expressed by the Commission at the last meeting. Ms. Haller stated that it is Staff's belief that the newly proposed design reduces the visual impact of the sign on the surrounding area. Ms. Haller concluded stating that the proposed construction is appropriate in design and location to the historic Thompson Fish House.

## Commission Discussion:

Theo Glorie stated that the sign still appears the same size as the one presented at the last meeting. Ms. Wilbarger responded stating that the width and height of the sign is to accommodate the fuel trucks, which at time need to access the fuel docks. Mr. Glorie asked Ms. Wilbarger if she does not expect all the other tenants at the Bight to want similar signs. Ms. Wilbarger stated that this sign is special since it is for a not for profit organization and that no ticket sales take place in the museum. Mr. Glorie stated that he does not get why this sign needs to be located on the dock.

Maggie Gutierrez stated that she agrees with the Staff Report and that she believes that the scaled down version is a better approach.

Daniel Metzler stated he would have liked to see something less solid but this scaled down version is better than the one proposed in the past. Ms. Wilbarger stated that a more open sign would result in a one sided sign which is why they did not go with that approach.

Bryan Green stated that the museum is a valuable asset for the Key West Bight area. Mr. Green added that he does not think the sign will block anything else in the area and that he supports the proposal.

## Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 3 – Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green

No: 1 - Mr. Glorie

**3a**

New two story house and new fence-**#914 James Street – Seatech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-345)**

Bill Horn and Patrick Wright presented the project. Mr. Horn reviewed the two (2) proposed options. Mr. Wright discussed the mass and scale of the project in relation to the other buildings in the neighborhood. Mr. Horn and Mr. Wright remained to respond to questions from the Commission

## Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

## Staff Report:

### Design:

Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is a request for the construction of a new two-story house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the plans propose the demolition of a one story non-contributing house. Ms. Torregrosa reminded the Commission that on February 8, 2012 the Commission approved the design of the "restoration" of the historic portion of the house and a new two-story addition. Ms. Torregrosa added that on March 28 a new application was

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 3 of 13

postponed by the Commission for the demolition of the entire house and the new construction of a two-story structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated that on May 9, revised plans were submitted and the project was, again, postponed. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that both proposals are inconsistent with many of the guidelines for new construction. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that although the building will be setback from the sidewalk approximately 13', due to the proposed side main gable roof it will be perceived taller than the non historic house on the east side. The main façade of the East side house is also setback from the sidewalk, but approximately 15'. Ms. Torregrosa added that the scale of the proposed house will not be in keeping to the scale and massing of the existing historic houses on that urban block. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that most of the historic urban context on this part in town has been lost but what is still left as historic should be protected. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that, although the applicant had tried to lower the main façade's scale by incorporating hip roofs, the massing and scale of the entire house is not appropriate when reviewing what still standing as historic fabric.

### **Demolition:**

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that what will be left of the historic part of the house once demolition takes place will be the West side of the house and the roof. Ms. Torregrosa stated although the historic part of the house is not irrevocably compromise by extreme deterioration it has been altered through time and there is not much left of the historic fabric.

### **Commission Discussion:**

Theo Glorie stated that he thinks this is what the Commission has asked for at the previous meetings.

Maggie Gutierrez stated that she agrees with Staff Report. Ms. Gutierrez stated that she is very familiar with the area and that she cannot support a two-story structure at this site.

Daniel Metzler stated that he would agree to option B.

Bryan Green stated that he cannot support the application due to the mass and scale of the structure in relation to the neighborhood.

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Ms. Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Denied** based on paragraph 4 page 38a and 38b. The motion **Failed** due to a lack of a second.

A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the items option B be **Approved**. The motion **Failed** by the following vote:

Yes: 2 – Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler

No: 2 – Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Green

A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Postponed**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green

**3b** Demolition of entire house- -#914 James Street - Seatech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-345)

In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 3a.

### **Actions/Motions:**

A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Postponed**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 4 of 13

Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green

<b>4</b>	<p>Demolition of rear roof and demolition of above ground swimming pool- <b>#319 Grinnell Street- Michael Skoglund (H12-01-601)- Second reading</b></p> <p>Michael Skoglund stated that he did not have anything to add to the presentation from the previous meeting.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that Staff understands that the Commission can consider the request for demolitions since they are consistent with Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa reminded the applicant that the approval for the design was conditioned upon detailed elevations showing how much more the existing house will be elevated in relation to its actual elevation.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
----------	--

<b>5</b>	<p>Major Development Plan- Demolition of existing building- <b>#223 Elizabeth Street- Pritam Singh (H12-01-685) Second reading</b></p> <p>Pritam Singh was present for the project but had nothing to add.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, as stated in Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that the building in question is not historic nor can be deemed contributing in a near future.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
----------	---

## New Business

<b>6a</b>	New entryway. New 4 feet tall front picket fence and replace existing doors and windows- <b>#325</b>
-----------	--

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 5 of 13

	<p><b>Julia Street- J.D.S. of North America Inc. (H12-01-676)</b></p> <p>Joel Dos Santos presented the project. Mr. Desandos stated that the project is to renovate the front of the property and the demolition of part of a canopy that partially sits on City property. Mr. Desandos remained to respond to any questions.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b></p> <p><b>Design:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the improvements project for the existing front façade, including the partial demolition that was built on City's right-of-way. Ms. Torregrosa added that the building located on #325 Julia Street is not listed as a contributing resource. Ms. Torregrosa state that the structure was built as a mortuary according to the 1962 Sanborn maps. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new owners will convert the building into a single-family residence. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff recommended that doors and side lites must be wood and that new windows should be aluminum in color. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that it is Staff's opinion that by making the changes recommended in this Staff report the project will be consistent with the guidelines.</p> <p><b>Demolition:</b> Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed demolition will be for a structure that is not historic and will not be considered contributing in a near future. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that if the demolition is approved a second reading will be requested.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be <b>Approved</b> with conditions clear aluminum, clear glazing and a timber door. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<b>6b</b>	<p>Partial demolition of entry canopy- <b>#325 Julia Street- J.D.S. of North America Inc. (H12-01-676)</b></p> <p>In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 6a.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<b>7</b>	<p>Removal of aluminum canopy and concrete columns that encroaches city's right-of-way approximately 4.18'-<b>#325 Julia Street- City of Key West (H12-01-744)</b></p> <p>Jim Scholl was present for the project.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b></p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 6 of 13

	<p>There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the City's matching application for the item 6b. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that if the demolition is approved a second reading will be requested.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<b>8</b>	<p>Renovations of structure, including new roof and façade- <b>#404 Southard Street- Rick Milelli/ Meridian Eng. (H12-01-718)</b></p> <p>The applicant was not present therefore; the item was tabled until later in the meeting.</p>
<b>9</b>	<p>Removal of non permitted roof trusses- After the Fact- <b>#525 Frances Street- Karl Haffenreffer (H12-01-769)</b></p> <p>Karl Haffenreffer presented the project. Mr. Haffenreffer stated that this is for the removal of some trusses, which were installed by a carpenter without a permit.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the application is for the removal of roof trusses that were installed over an existing flat roof of a non-historic ancillary structure located on the back of a historic house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that a code officer put a stop work order in the property. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for removal of the trusses as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that if the demolition is approved a second reading will be requested.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<b>10</b>	<p>Modification of previously approved plans. Construct second addition- <b>#907-909 Emma Street- Carlos Rojas (H12-01-770)</b></p> <p>The applicant was not present therefore; the item was tabled until later in the meeting.</p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 7 of 13

**11** Major Development Plan Revisions- New three bay Fire Station with second story living quarters and site development for public use- **#525 Angela Street- City of Key West/ Michael B. Ingram (H12-01-776)**

Bryan Green inquired exactly what is being voted on the building or the site where the building will sit. Ms. Torregrosa stated that just the building is to be reviewed not the location of the building on the site or the landscaping.

Anthony Sarno presented the project. Mr. Sarno covered the highlights of the project. Mr. Sarno stated that the packet has a site plan but only the building and the building materials are to be reviewed. Mr. Sarno stated that the proposed location of the building will allow the existing Fire Station building to remain while the new building is under construction. Mr. Sarno stated the revised plans include public restrooms and waiting areas for private and public transportation on the West and South façades of the building. Mr. ??? reviewed the proposed materials for the new structure. Mr. Sarno remained to respond to any questions.

**Public Comments:**

Richard Tallmdage	1700 Jamaica Drive	Stated he loves the proposed new Fire Station but spoke against the physical placement of the Fire Station on the lot. Mr. Tallmdage distributed a proposed alternative site plan drawn by Michael Miller.
Margaret Romero	1615 Washington Street	Reminded the Commission that the City Commission has already approved the plans. Ms. Romero spoke for approval.
City Commissioner Billy Wardlow	1410 South Roosevelt	Spoke in favor of the project – stating it is long over due. Mr. Wardlow explained why the proposed location of the new Fire Station was chosen.

**Staff Report:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is for a new fire station that will be located facing Simonton Street and will replace the existing station. Ms. Torregrosa stated that on September 22, 2009 the Commission approved a Major Development Plan for a new City Hall, Fire Station and parking garage for #525 Angela Street site. Ms. Torregrosa stated that on July 12, 2011 a Building permit was issued to demolish City Hall Annex building, one of three proposed demolitions under the Major Development Plan. Ms. Torregrosa stated that since the approval of the plans City Commission had made changes in the location of the New City Hall but has directed Staff towards the construction of a new Fire Station. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the actual two-story CBS structure that houses the Fire Station is a sick building and was approved for demolition, as part of the master plan. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new revised plans for the Fire Station will be a freestanding structure that will include dormitories on its second floor. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the proposed plans comply with the guidelines of new construction. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the proposed design for the new fire station will not have an adverse effect in the historic urban fabric. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed building is sensible to the historic urban context. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the design proposes adequate heights, proportions, massing, and scale that are in keeping with its site. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that if approved, the project will require Planning Board and City Commission review.



# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 8 of 13

## Commission Discussion:

Bryan Green reminded the Commissioners that the building is being reviewed not the location on the site. Mr. Green asked if there was anything in the packet that would cover the review of safety issues for the placement at other locations on the property.

Daniel Metzler stated that he has a problem with the locating the building in the middle of the site.

Theo Glorie asked if the applicant would think about moving the building closer to the Southern Bell Building. Mr. Sarno responded that due to safety reasons and flexibility the building is located in the middle of the property. Mr. Glorie stated that he likes the building design but strongly disagrees with the placement of the building.

Mr. Ramsingh reminded the Commission that the are to only vote on the review of the documents in the package not the proposed plan submitted by the public.

Maggie Gutierrez stated that she agrees with the Staff report as far as the building design but would also like to see the supporting documentation for the safety issues for other locations of the building on the site.

## Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the item be **Postponed**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green

**12**

Paint exterior walls, window trims, and doors. New canvas awning- **#926 Simonton Street- Len Johnson (H12-01-805)**

Len and Daniel Johnson presented the project. Mr. Johnson stated that they are requesting to paint their restaurant's (Better Than Sex) future new home. Ms. Johnson reviewed the background of the colors they have chosen for the exterior of the building.

## Public Comments:

Brenda Duley	1109 Fleming	Spoke in favor of the project.
Bobby Bernreuter	529 Truman Avenue	Spoke in favor and explained that he is the nearest neighbor.
Omar Garcia	1204 17 <sup>th</sup> Terrace	Spoke in favor of the project.

## Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is a request to paint exterior walls with a dark red color and window and roof trims in brown color. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the application also includes the removal of the existing metal awning and its replacement with a canvas one. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building located on 926 Simonton Street was listed as a contributing resource in the 2004 survey and was built in 1950. Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to the applicant the proposed colors are part of their brand name. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff explained to the applicant that according to the guidelines for colors the Bahama Village buildings can exhibit deeper and brighter colors. Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to page 35 of the guidelines exterior trims are traditionally white or off white and exterior body of buildings are white, pastels, light gray, beige, or buff. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that the metal awning is a character-defining feature of the entryway and as such, if needed to be replaced,



# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 9 of 13

	<p>should be with a similar one in order to comply with guideline 1 for awnings, page 31. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff included this item in the agenda because, if approved, it may create a precedent in the historic district. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands the applicant desire but the proposed colors on this location are not appropriate to the building or to the historic district.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> Theo Glorie stated that at first he was not sure about allowing the building to be painted but after hearing the applicant presentations is now in favor of the project.</p> <p>Daniel Metzler suggested that the applicant may want to paint 10'x10' paint out to insure the color is what they expect.</p> <p>Maggie Gutierrez stated that she too is struggling with the application but is leaning to approve.</p> <p>Bryan Green stated that he too came to the meeting leaning toward denying the application but his mind set has changed toward approval as he listened to the presentation and remembered the demise of Fast Buck Freddie's.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<b>13a</b>	<p>Restoration of historic building. New wood front porch with new gingerbread railings. Paint walls white- <b>#828 Thomas Street- William P. Horn (H12-01-791)</b></p> <p>Bill Horn presented the project. Mr. Horn explained that this is a Habitat For Humanity project and that the Housing Authority is also assisting with this project. Mr. Horn stated the house is in dire need of restoration. Mr. Horn covered the project details with the Commission. Mr. Horn explained the reasons for requesting the gingerbread railing cutouts which is to honor the musician who lived in the house.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> <b>Design:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff reviewed the proposed plans and understands that they comply with all the guidelines related to window replacements and additions and alterations. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the project requires two readings for the proposed demolition of the front porch, which requires the Commission review. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff also decided to include the item in the agenda since the applicant is proposing wood gingerbread railings that will have trumpets cutouts, in honor to the musician. Ms. Torregrosa added that his family still lives in the house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that the proposed railings will fail on this particular guideline, but by the other hand, many cutouts and gingerbread in buildings in the historic district depict specific interests of their inhabitants; sailing motifs, violins, or the house with gingerbread men. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that the structure is in need of maintenance and this project will bring back the integrity and character of this historic house.</p> <p><b>Demolition:</b> Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to the circa 1965 photo of the Property Appraiser's records, the porch did not have concrete railings. Ms. Torregrosa added that moreover concrete floor on porches</p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 10 of 13

	<p>was not the traditional material found on a circa 1921 frame vernacular house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that if the demolition is approved a second reading will be requested.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> Daniel Metzler brought to the Commission's attention that he is the incoming president for Habitat for Humanity. It was determined that Mr. Metzler would not have any financial to gain from the project.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<b>13b</b>	<p>Demolition of concrete front porch- <b>#828 Thomas Street- William P. Horn (H12-01-791)</b></p> <p>In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 13a.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<b>14</b>	<p>Replace roof with standing seam roof. Replace windows, a/c units and wall repairs- <b>#1010 Windsor Lane Renewal center and Chapel- V Rev. John Baker/ Annalise Mannix (H12-01-800)</b></p> <p>Following additional documentation submitted the application and discussion with the applicant, Staff approved the application prior to the meeting.</p>
<b>15a</b>	<p>New wood front porch. Replace existing windows and doors. Replace existing siding and new wood framed awning and wood steps- <b>#525 Grinnell Street- Seatech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-807)</b></p> <p>Patrick Wright presented the project. Mr. Wright stated that he does not have a formal representation letter. Mr. Wright stated that the formal representation letter can be supplied the next morning. The Commission agreed to hear the item with the understanding that the representation letter would be delivered to Staff the next day. Mr. Wright explained the project plans. Mr. Wright stated that they are requesting to replace the miss matched batten boards with lap siding.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> <b>Design:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building is listed as a contributing resource. Ms. Torregrosa added that the frame vernacular structure was built circa 1928. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff reviewed the submitted plans and understands that the proposed plans are consistent with the guidelines for window and door replacements, shutters and additions and alterations. Ms. Torregrosa added that nevertheless the application includes the replacement of board and batten that can be found on the back portion of the house with wood lap siding, which will be contradictory to the exterior siding stated in page 24; replacement siding on contributing structures must match the original siding. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's</p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 11 of 13

	<p>opinion that the proposed plans are consistent with the guidelines, with the exception of the proposed new lap siding instead of board and batten. Staff understands that the existing board and batten is in good shape. Ms. Torregrosa added that replacement windows must be wood true divided lite units. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that if approved the project must secure an easement since the building encroaches city right-of-way.</p> <p><b>Demolition:</b> Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed demolition will be for a non-historic concrete porch that does not contribute to the historic character of the house. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that if the demolition is approved a second reading will be requested.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> Daniel Metzler asked Ms. Torregrosa if the proposed front door is appropriate and if the proposed awning was within the guidelines. Ms. Torregrosa responded that they are appropriate and within the guidelines.</p> <p>Maggie Gutierrez asked the applicant why they were asking to replace the batten boards. Mr. Wright responded that it was the replacement was requested in order to make all the siding consistent.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<p><b>15b</b></p>	<p>Demolition of concrete front porch-<b>#525 Grinnell Street- Seatech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-807)</b></p> <p>In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 15a.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<p><b>8</b></p>	<p>Renovations of structure, including new roof and façade- <b>#404 Southard Street- Rick Milelli/ Meridian Eng. (H12-01-718)</b></p> <p>Rick Milelli presented the project. Mr. Milelli explained the project, which will involve renovations to the existing structure and the removal of a canvas roof and replacing it with a permanent wood gable roof. Mr. Milelli outlined the proposed project's activities for the site. Mr. Milelli explained the renovations will allow for better utilization of the area.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the renovations of an existing structure, including the removal of a canvas roof and its replacement with a permanent wood gable roof. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the plans also include new front and side facades. The plans also include renovations to an existing front façade to the building located on the West side. Ms. Torregrosa added that according to the 1962 Sanborn map the building that was located on the</p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 12 of 13

	<p>site was had a rectangular footprint and was a concrete structure with steel joists. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the proposed new roof will be more appropriate than the existing one. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new proposed facades, although not traditional, will have no adverse effect on the surrounding urban fabric. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed concept tends to emulate the Green Parrot concept, which is a building listed as a contributing resource. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that Staff understands that the introduction of a canopy on the front façade will help lowering the height at the pedestrian level.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> Theo Glorie asked if this would make one big Green Parrot. Mr. Milelli stated that no this is a separate building and will be a separate business.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 4 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green</p>
<b>10</b>	<p>Modification of previously approved plans. Construct second addition- <b>#907-909 Emma Street-Carlos Rojas (H12-01-770)</b></p> <p>Carlos Rojas presented the project. Mr. Rojas stated that this is a revision to a previously approved project. Mr. Rojas stated that he has taken over the project from a previous architect. Mr. Rojas stated that his effort was focused on trying to accomplish the needs of the owner yet making the project smaller in scale to lessen the impact on the neighbors. Mr. Rojas remained to respond to questions from the Commission.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is for the revision of a previously approved detached addition on the back portion of the lot where the main structure is a one-story frame vernacular contributing structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the historic house was built circa 1920. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the revisions include attaching a two story new structure (Phase 2 on the site plans) to a back attached addition. Ms. Torregrosa added that the latest approval in February 8, 2011 was for the back attached addition to the historic house as well as a new gazebo and swimming pool. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans include the reduction in height of the previously approved two-story structure from 29'-8" to 23'-9". The new scheme proposes a three sawtooth two story attached addition, in which just the northernmost sawtooth will be visible from the street. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that although the design lowers the height of the back portion of the building, the massing of this new additional attached structure will be detrimental to the historic portion of the house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to guidelines, 3 and 4 additions should be constructed with scale and height appropriate to the original one story historic building and its design should be compatible with the characteristics of the original structure. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that this attached addition will enlarge the scale of the original historic structure and a detached structure will be more appropriate to the historic building.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> Daniel Metzler asked what was the original structure. Mr. Rojas and Ms. Torregrosa directed Mr. Metzler to the proper set of plans in the package to review the original structure.</p> <p>Theo Glorie inquired if the windows and doors were approved by HARC. Ms. Torregrosa responded</p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

May 22, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 13 of 13

	<p>that they were on the original approval.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 3 – Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler No: 1 – Mr. Green</p>
<b>Commissioners Comments</b>	
	<p>Mr. Metzler mentioned the discussion and the handout from the Historic Forum concerning storm windows and asked if there was, any storm windows are appropriated the Historic District here. Ms. Torregrosa responded that wood windows are the traditional material for windows in Key West.</p> <p>Mr. Glorie asked where we stand on the Sign Workshop. Ms. Torregrosa stated Mr. Miller has the document that Mr. Green prepared and that she expects to have something prepared to discuss at the next meeting.</p>
<b>Adjournment</b>	
	<p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the meeting be <b>Adjourned</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by a unanimous vote.</p> <p>Meeting adjourned at <b>7:50 pm</b>.</p>

Submitted by,

*Jo Bennett*

Administrative Coordinator  
Planning Department