

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

February 08, 2012

DRAFT

Page 1 of 7

Call Meeting To Order	
Chairman Rudy Molinet called the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission (HARC) Meeting of February 08, 2012 to order at 5:30 pm at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510 Greene Street, Key West.	
Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag	
Roll Call	
	Commissioners present include: Donna Bosold, Theo Glorie, Margaret Gutierrez, Daniel Metzler, Michael Miller, Vice Chairman Bryan Green, and Chairman Rudy Molinet. Also, present from City staff: Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, IT Ian Willis, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett. Margaret Gutierrez arrived at 5:45 pm.
Approval of Agenda	
	Chairman Rudy Molinet inquired as to any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa stated that the minutes for January 11, 2012 and January 25, 2012 were not ready for review prior to the meeting therefore action should be postponed. Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the Agenda be Approved with the postponement of the item #1 and item #2. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
Approval of Minutes	
1	January 11, 2011 Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be Postponed . The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
2	January 25, 2011 Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be Postponed . The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
	Prior to the HARC Planner's Report Chairman Rudy Molinet presented George Galvin and Carlos Rojas commendation plaques for the past service on the HARC Board.
HARC Planner's Report	
	Ms. Torregrosa reported: 1. Pleased to report that we have been awarded a grant by the State Historic Preservation Office to hold a Historic Preservation Forum in Key West on May 10 th through May 11 th . Each Commissioner was given a copy of the Forum's agenda. Ms. Torregrosa covered the highlights of the two-day event. This Forum is being held in May as recognition of Historic Preservation Month. 2. Staff has been working on developing a new process for handling HARC application. Ms. Bennett has been busy developing this process and the needed

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
February 08, 2012

DRAFT

Page 2 of 7

	<p>tracking procedures. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this new process will help us be able to track the HARC applications and supply varied statistics. The plan is to give monthly updates to the HARC Commission.</p> <p>Mr. Molinet inquired if Mr. Ramsingh had anything to report. Mr. Ramsingh responded that he gave each of the Commissioners a copy of the final draft of the revision to the Demolition Ordinance 102-217. The Commissioners questioned some of the wording in the revision. Mr. Ramsingh stated that the wording is by design and that the changes are to allow one reading for demolition of any non-historic and non-contributing structure.</p>
	New Business
3	<p>Remove metal v-crimp panels from front side of roof and replace with metal shingles. Leave metal v-crimp on remaining of roof- Code Compliance case- #1312 Reynolds Street- Brian and Kimberly Blanchette (H12-01-125)</p> <p>Brian Blanchette presented the project. Mr. Blanchette stated since his filed this application he has been approved for some assistance and therefore he would like to postpone this application until he can re-apply for a Hardship Application for the Commission's review. Mr. Blanchette stated that he could not afford to repair the roof using a historic roofing material, which is why he used the v-crimp. Mr. Blanchette stated that he would be unable to attend the next meeting but would try to have someone represent him and agreed to have the items reviewed in his absence at the next HARC meeting.</p> <p>Public Comments: There were no public comments.</p> <p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa had no comments.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners discussed with the attorney that since the applicant wishes to re-submit a Hardship Application it would be appropriate to review the Hardship Application along with this application.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Ms. Margaret Gutierrez, that the item be Postponed. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 7 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
4	<p>Demolition of laundry facility with no built back- Code Compliance case-#407 Whitehead Street- Estate of Paula Newhouse/ Kimberly Blanchette personal rep (H12-01-141)</p> <p>Brian Blanchette presented the project. Mr. Blanchette stated the laundry room has been in existence for many years but was built without setbacks and therefore they would like to demolish it.</p> <p>Public Comments: There were no public comments.</p>

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
February 08, 2012

DRAFT

Page 3 of 7

	<p>Staff Report:</p> <p>Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is a structure that was built without HARC approvals or building permits. Ms. Torregrosa added that the main house was built circa 1874 and that the frame vernacular structure is listed as a contributing resource in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the applicant submitted an after the fact application for the construction of the structure which was denied by the Commission on October 11, 2011. Ms. Torregrosa stated that in order to comply with the notice of violation that Code Compliance issued, the owners are requesting the demolition of the structure with no built back. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that this is the first reading.</p> <p>Commission Discussion:</p> <p>The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p>Actions/Motions:</p> <p>A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 7 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
5	<p>After the fact demolition of exterior stairs from previous Certificate of Occupancy in 1998- Code Compliance case- #2 Scheppens Lane- William P. Horn (H12-01-151)</p> <p>Bill Horn presented the project. Mr. Horn supplied a history of the project and remained to answer any questions.</p> <p>Public Comments:</p> <p>There were no public comments.</p> <p>Staff Report:</p> <p>Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the first reading for an after the fact demolition of an exterior stair. The stair was designed as part of plans that were approved by HARC in 1997 under a Certificate of Appropriateness # H10-97-3579. Ms. Torregrosa added that a Certificate of Occupancy for the work that was approved by HARC was issued in August 10, 1998. At some point, and without any HARC approval or building permits, the stair was removed and a new stair was built attached to the exterior south wall. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this application has been submitted in order to correct and legalize the demolition of the stair that was built during 1997-1998. Ms. Torregrosa added that this is part of a Settlement Agreement between the owners of the property and the city regarding after the fact work that was done to the property almost two years ago; including, among other things, the after the fact demolition of a historic gable roof and its restitution. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the house located on #2 Scheppens Lane is listed as a contributing resource, built circa 1915. The house is a one-story frame vernacular structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this structure is part of the Equator Resort complex located on 818 Fleming Street. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the complex includes 1 Scheppens Lane, 818 Fleming Street, and 816 Fleming Street. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that if approved this will require a second reading.</p> <p>Commission Discussion:</p> <p>The only question from the Commissioners was when the work would be completed at the site. Mr. Ramsingh responded that everything concerning this site is outlined in the</p>

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
February 08, 2012

DRAFT

Page 4 of 7

	<p>Code Case agreement.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Michael Miller, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 7 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
6a	<p>Renovate existing structure to restore its original design at front of property. New back two-story addition. Elevate new and existing structures above base flood elevation- #914 James Street- Seatech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-157)</p> <p>Owen Trepanier and Paul Sims presented the project. Mr. Trepanier supplied a history of the property. Mr. Trepanier stated this proposal is an effort to restore the structure to its original design. Mr. Trepanier added that this plan will elevate the structure above base flood elevation and create an off-street parking space. Mr. Trepanier concluded stating that this structure is currently unsound.</p> <p>Public Comments: There were no public comments.</p> <p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the application indicated the restoration of a non-contributing one-story house and for a new attached back addition that will be visible from the street since it will be a two-storey structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the house is not listed in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff does not agree with the applicant that they are proposing a renovation of the existing structure to <i>restore its original design at the front portion of the house</i>. Ms. Torregrosa stated that if such undertaking takes place, an “L” shape wrap porch will be part of the new proposal, as well as a 3 bay front porch. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans include a new two bay front porch with gingerbread railings and brackets. Ms. Torregrosa added that a two-story addition is proposed on the back portion of the house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this new building will be taller and almost 2.60 larger in footprint of what will be left of the existing house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the house to the east side is a non-historic 2-story frame structure and to the west a one story structure. Ms. Torregrosa added that the building sits across the City Parking Garage and the majority of the structures abutting the back yard are two stories.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners discussed that this plan is a much improved from the existing and discussed the mass and scale of the project.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be Approved with the condition that the gingerbread not be used. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet No: 1 - Ms. Gutierrez</p>
6b	<p>Demolition of front of existing house and demolition of existing non conforming rear attached structure- #914 James Street- Seatech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-157)</p>

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
February 08, 2012

DRAFT

Page 5 of 7

	<p>In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 6a.</p> <p>Actions/Motions:</p> <p>A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote:</p> <p>Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p> <p>No: 1 - Ms. Gutierrez</p>
7	<p>Paint house, exterior walls white, shutters and doors dark green to match historic sample, porch ceiling light aqua to match historic sample and porch floor grey- #522 Grinnell Street- Walter Gezari (H12-01-169)</p> <p>Alberto Cruz presented the project stating that he expected to have colors.</p> <p>Public Comments:</p> <p>There were no public comments.</p> <p>Staff Report:</p> <p>Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this for the review of color scheme for a house that is undergoing extensive rehabilitation. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building is listed as a contributing resource in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the house is a two-story frame vernacular structure and was built circa 1889. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff included the review of this request in the agenda because the proposed deep green color for the porch ceilings. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff visited the property on November 11, 2011 and found the contractor painting the porch ceilings. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff explained to the contractor that they never secured approval from HARC regarding the color scheme. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff met with the owner of the house on January 12, 2012. Ms. Torregrosa added that the owner explained that he wanted to use the original colors that the house used to have and provided a piece of the porch ceiling and a piece of a shutter. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's opinion that the proposed colors, with the exception of the deep green are appropriate to the house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that due to the prominent wrap around porches, which will be duplicated on the back of the house, it is staff's opinion that the proposed color will be too contrasting with the rest of the proposed color scheme, therefore will overshadow the historic quality and character this building possesses.</p> <p>Commission Discussion:</p> <p>The Commissioners discussed the history and use of colors in Key West. The Commissioners agreed they that the proposed porch ceiling color is too dark and overpowering for the historic house.</p> <p>Actions/Motions:</p> <p>A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be Approved with the condition that the porch ceilings be painted with one of the three approved colors that are included in the HARC Guidelines. The motion Passed by the following vote:</p> <p>Yes: 7 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
8	<p>Install two signs on columns to be located on the pier at the end of Margaret Street for</p>

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

February 08, 2012

DRAFT

Page 6 of 7

the Dry Tortugas Ferry and the Historic Seaport Interpretive Center housed in the historic Thompson Fish House - **#231 Margaret Street – FMH Builders, Inc. (H12-01-123)**

Frank Herrera presented the project. Mr. Herrera stated that the owners of Historic Tours of America propose the installation of signs to attract the public to the new Historic Seaport Interpretive Center.

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Brendon Cunningham presented his staff report. Mr. Cunningham stated that this for the approval of an entry feature to consist of two columns with two signs. Mr. Cunningham stated that they will identify the location of the Dry Tortugas Ferry and the associated Historic Seaport Interpretive Center. Mr. Cunningham stated that the interpretive center is located in the historic Thompson Fish House on the pier at the end of Margaret Street past the Turtle Kraals. Mr. Cunningham stated that the proposed plans include the installation of two 6" by 6" posts that will serve as structural supports for the signs. Mr. Cunningham added that the new posts will be attached to the existing pier. Mr. Cunningham stated that the proposed signage is designed to be twelve feet from the finished floor of the pier for proper clearance for trucks and service vehicles.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners requested to be shown on the site plan where the sign is proposed to be erected. The Commissioners discussed their concerns as to the size of the sign and colors being proposed. The Commissioners discussed their concerns about the application was not signed by the City's representative and therefore should not be heard.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Ms. Donna Bosold, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be **Postponed**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 7 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

Commissioners Comments

Mr. Metzler asked if the Signage Workshop been scheduled. Ms. Torregrosa stated that she is planning for sometime in March.

Mr. Metzler also asked for a status update on Virginia Street Landscaping. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Virginia Street Landscaping is scheduled for the February 21st meeting.

Mr. Miller suggested that we use a two-step process in that sign ordinances be researched and be able to present the findings to the workshop attendees. Mr. Miller stated he feels we will be able to get more accomplished if we have something to share with the participants.

Mr. Miller and Donna Bosold offered to assist with the Sign Workshop.

Mr. Green suggested taking a survey of the existing signage on Duval.

Adjournment

**Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
February 08, 2012**

DRAFT

Page 7 of 7

	<p>Actions/Motions:</p> <p>A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the meeting be Adjourned. The motion Passed by a unanimous vote.</p> <p>Meeting adjourned at 7:36 pm.</p>
--	---

Submitted by,

Jo Bennett

**Administrative Coordinator
Planning Department**