



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final - Final

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, December 15, 2015

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Absent 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Present 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Approval of Agenda

When asked by Chair Bryan Green, Ms. Enid Torregrosa stated that prior to the meeting, items 5a and 5b were requested to be postponed by applicant. A motion was made by Mr. Bert Bender, seconded by Vice Chair Richard McChesney, that the agenda be approved as amended by Ms. Torregrosa. The motion carried by the unanimous Voice Vote

Approval of Minutes

1 November 16, 2015 Minutes

Attachments: [November 16, 2015 Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Richard McChesney, seconded by Mr. Richard Logan, that the Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by an unanimous vote except for Ms. Letisia Powell and Mr. Bert Bender who abstained due to not being present at the November 16, 2015 meeting.

HARC Planner's Report

2 November 2015 Monthly HARC Applications Listing

Attachments: [November 2015 HARC Applications Listing](#)

Received and Filed

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Old Business

- 3** Demolition of one-story rear addition - **#723 Olivia Street - Meridian Engineering (H15-01-1216) - Second Reading**

Attachments: [723 Olivia Street - Demolition - Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Abstained: 1 - Ms. Powell

- 4** Demolition of front porch elements and partial demolition of side wall- **#216 Eneas Lane- Gary Burchfield/ Artibus Design (H15-01-1667) - Second Reading**

Attachments: [216 Eneas Lane - Demolition - Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Abstained: 1 - Ms. Powell

New Business

- 5a** Relocation, elevation of historic house and modification to footers. New side and rear additions. New accessory structure. New pool and site work including partial site regrading- **#1301 Whitehead Street - Thomas E. Pope (H15-01-1528)**

Attachments: [1301 Whitehead Street - Request to Postpone by Applicant](#)
[1301 Whitehead Street- Design](#)

The item was Postponed at the request of the applicant during Agenda setting.

5b Demolition of rear additions. Demolition of shed-#**1301 Whitehead Street - Thomas E. Pope (H15-01-1528)**

Attachments: [1301 Whitehead Street - Request to Postpone by Applicant](#)
 [1301 Whitehead Street- Demolition](#)

The item was Postponed at the request of the applicant during Agenda setting.

6a Relocation and rehabilitation of eyebrow house and new rear addition.
New pool and site improvements- #**818 Sawyers Lane- William Shepler/ Meridian Engineers (H15-01-1540)**

Attachments: [818 Sawyers Lane - Design](#)
 [Public Comment - Sawyers Lane as of December 15, 2015](#)
 [Public Comment - Sawyers Lane as of December 14, 2015](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Name Address

Jeff Alden 308 Margaret Street
Barbara Bowers 320 William Street
Jonathan Kent 4 Gecko Lane
Mark Langley 310 Margaret Street
Robert Cautilli 818-822 Sawyer Lane - Owner
Bryan McKendry 80 Palm Drive - Contractor

Following a presentation by the applicant and a discussion with the Commissioners, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

6b New two-story frame structure. New pool and site improvements- #**822 Sawyers Lane- William Shepler/ Meridian Engineers (H15-01-1541)**

Attachments: [822 Sawyers Lane - Design](#)
 [Public Comment - Sawyers Lane as of December 15, 2015](#)
 [Public Comment - Sawyers Lane as of December 14, 2015](#)

Following a presentation by the applicant and a discussion with the Commissioners, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

6c Demolition of back portion of house- **#818 Sawyers Lane- William Shepler/ Meridian Engineers (H15-01-1540)**

Attachments: [818 Sawyers Lane - Demolition](#)
 [Public Comment - Sawyers Lane as of December 15, 2015](#)
 [Public Comment - Sawyers Lane as of December 14, 2015](#)

Following a presentation by the applicant and a discussion with the Commissioners, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

6d Demolition of one-story structure-**#822 Sawyers Lane/ #310 and 314 Margaret Street- William Shepler/ Meridian Engineers (H15-01-1541)**

Attachments: [822 Sawyers Lane - Demolition](#)
 [Public Comment - Sawyers Lane as of December 15, 2015](#)
 [Public Comment - Sawyers Lane as of December 14, 2015](#)

Following a presentation by the applicant and a discussion with the Commissioners, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

7a New one and a half-story frame accessory structure at rear of property - **#1024-1026 Thomas Street - William P. Horn (H15-01-1677)**

Attachments: [1024-1026 Thomas Street - Design](#)

Following a presentation by the applicant and a discussion with the Commissioners, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Ms. Thompson

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

7b Demolition of existing carport - **#1024-1026 Thomas Street - William P. Horn (H15-01-1677)**

Attachments: [1024-1026 Thomas Street - Demolition](#)

Following a presentation by the applicant and a discussion with the Commissioners, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Ms. Thompson

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

8 Demolition of existing kiosk on front yard - **#804 Whitehead Street - FMH Builders (H15-01-1777)**

Attachments: [804 Whitehead Street - Demolition.pdf](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

9 New 4' tall wood louvered fence on front yard - **#711 Ashe Street - Rob Delaune (H15-01-1782)**

Attachments: [711 Ashe Street - Fence](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved for the location of the fence only and with the condition that the picket fence application be submitted and approved by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

10a Renovations to historic building and new one-story frame addition on rear - **#830-832 Johnson Lane - Thomas E. Pope (H15-01-1785)**

Attachments: [830-832 Johnson Lane - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

10b Demolition of rear addition - **#830-832 Johnson Lane - Thomas E. Pope (H15-01-1785)**

Attachments: [830-832 Johnson Lane - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

11a Renovations to historic house including reconstruction of full front wood porch over piers. Replacement of non-historic windows. New addition on rear and new rear cover porch - **#828 Elizabeth Street - Peter Pike (H15-01-1798)**

Attachments: [828 Elizabeth Street- Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

11b Partial demolition of rear portion of house. Demolition of exterior concrete staircase. Demolition of front porch floor and enclosure - **#828 Elizabeth Street - Peter Pike (H15-01-1798)**

Attachments: [828 Elizabeth Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

12a Restoration of existing eyebrow house. New rear addition. New guest house with underneath carport. New pool and site work - **#1109 Fleming Street - Michael Miller (H15-01-1811)**

Attachments: [1109 Fleming Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

12b

Demolition of rear addition - **#1109 Fleming Street - Michael Miller (H15-01-1811)**

Attachments: [1109 Fleming Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

13a

Restoration of existing masonry building. New addition with second floor mezzanine storage. Front canopy and signage are not part of this application - **#420-422 Appelrouth Lane - Bender and Associates (H15-01-1812)**

Attachments: [420-422 Appelrouth Lane - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Mr. Bender

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 5 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

13b

Demolition of existing frame structures - **#420-422 Appelrouth Lane - Bender and Associates (H15-01-1812)**

Attachments: [420-422 Appelrouth Lane - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Mr. Bender

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 5 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

14a

Renovation of existing house, including replacement of windows, doors, and skylights. New rear addition and site improvements - **#732 Poorhouse Lane - K2M Design (H15-01-1813)**

Attachments: [732 Poorhouse Lane - Design](#)

Meeting went into Recess

Meeting Reconvened

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Chairman Green

Recuse: 1 - Mr. Bender

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 4 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, and Vice Chair McChesney

14b

Demolition of non-historic rear addition - **#732 Poorhouse Lane - K2M Design (H15-01-1813)**

Attachments: [732 Poorhouse Lane - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Mr. Bender

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 5 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

15

Renovations to existing house including changes in fenestrations. One-story frame addition on northeast side - **#1021 Washington Street - Michael Ingram (H15-01-1814)**

Attachments: [1021 Washington Street](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

16

New two-story single family modular house. New fences, pool, decks and pavers - **#1119 Simonton Street - Will Shepler/ Meridian Engineers (H15-01-1816)**

Attachments: [1119 Simonton Street](#)

Following a presentation by the applicant and a discussion with the Commissioners, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

17a

Renovations to existing house. New front façade configuration. New side addition and expansion of rear addition. New roof configuration on rear and site improvements - **#1209 Knowles Lane - McIntyre Construction (H15-01-1817)**

Attachments: [1209 Knowles Lane - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

17b

Demolition of side addition and rear roof. Removal of enclosure at front façade. Demolition of carport - **#1209 Knowles Lane - McIntyre Construction (H15-01-1817)**

Attachments: [1209 Knowles Lane - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Hinkle

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Comments from Commissioners

Adjournment