



# City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall  
510 Greene Street  
Key West FL 33040

## Action Minutes - Final - Final

### Historic Architectural Review Commission

---

Tuesday, January 26, 2016

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

---

**ADA Assistance:** It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

#### Call Meeting To Order

#### Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

#### Roll Call

**Present** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

#### Approval of Agenda

*When asked by Chair Bryan Green, Ms. Enid Torregrosa stated that prior to the meeting items 9a and 9b were requested by Staff to Postpone and prior to the meeting items 14a and 14b were requested to be Postponed by the applicant. The agenda was approved by an unanimous voice vote as amended by Ms. Torregrosa. The motion carried by the unanimous Voice Vote*

#### Approval of Minutes

1 December 15, 2015 HARC Meeting Minutes

**Attachments:** [December 15, 2015 HARC Meeting Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Janet Hinkle, seconded by Ms. Lori Thompson, that the Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by an unanimous voice vote.

#### HARC Planner's Report

2 December 2015 HARC Applications List..Title

**Attachments:** [December 2015 HARC Applications List](#)

Received and Filed

#### Assistant City Attorney's Report

## Old Business

- 3** Partial demolition of rear portion of house. Demolition of exterior concrete staircase. Demolition of front porch floor and enclosure - **#828 Elizabeth Street - Peter Pike (H15-01-1798) - Second Reading**
- Attachments:** [828 Elizabeth Street - Demolition \(Second Reading\)](#)
- A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green
- 4** Demolition of existing frame structures - **#420-422 Appelrouth Lane - Bender and Associates (H15-01-1812) - Second Reading**
- Attachments:** [420-422 Appelrouth Lane - Demolition \(Second Reading\)](#)
- A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Recuse:** 1 - Mr. Bender
- Yes:** 6 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green
- 5** New two-story single family modular house. New fences, pool, decks and pavers - **#1119 Simonton Street - Will Shepler/ Meridian Engineers (H15-01-1816)**
- Attachments:** [1119 Simonton Street](#)  
[December 12, 2015 Meeting Documents - 1119 Simonton Street](#)
- A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- No:** 1 - Mr. Bender
- Recuse:** 1 - Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 6** Renovations to existing house. New front façade configuration. New side addition and expansion of rear addition. New roof configuration on rear and site improvements - **#1209 Knowles Lane - McIntyre Construction (H15-01-1817) - Second Reading**
- Attachments:** [1209 Knowles Lane - Demolition \(Second Reading\)](#)
- A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action**

Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

## New Business

7a

Renovations to two-story house, including windows, shutters, doors, siding, roof, and site work. New exterior staircase - **#616 Elizabeth Street - Matthew Stratton (H15-01-1795)**

**Attachments:** [616 Elizabeth Street - Design](#)

**A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that the propane tank be relocated. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

7b

Demolition of exterior staircase - **#616 Elizabeth Street - Matthew Stratton (H15-01-1795)**

**Attachments:** [616 Elizabeth Street - Demolition](#)

**A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

8

New cart with signage - **#12 Duval Street - Trepanier and Associates/ William Shepler (H15-01-1835)**

**Attachments:** [12 Duval Street](#)

**Following a discussion with the applicant, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Recuse:** 1 - Ms. Thompson

**Yes:** 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

9a

New pool and site work - **#313 Truman Avenue - Pike Architects/McIntyre Construction (H15-01-1900)**

**Attachments:** [313 Truman Avenue - Postponed by Staff](#)

**During Agenda setting the item was Postponed.**

9b

Demolition of frame shed - **#313 Truman Avenue - Pike Architects/McIntyre Construction (H15-01-1900)**

**Attachments:** [313 Truman Avenue - Postponed by Staff](#)

During Agenda setting the item was Postponed.

10

New two-story frame building on vacant lot with attached carport and new cistern - **#515 Angela Street - Thomas E. Pope (H15-01-1922)**

Attachments: [515 Angela Street](#)

**A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

11a

New two-story frame structure and site work - **#1404 Whalton Street - Thomas E. Pope (H15-01-1924)**

Attachments: [1404 Whalton Street - Design](#)

**PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

**Paula Carbonell - 1016 South Street**

**A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

11b

Partial demolition of historic wall - **#1404 Whalton Street - Thomas E. Pope (H15-01-1924)**

Attachments: [1404 Whalton Street - Second Reading](#)

**A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that the materials to be retained on-site to be re-used in the landscape. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

12a

New addition to rear of contributing house and site improvements - **#820 Olivia Street - Michael Ingram (H16-03-0001)**

Attachments: [820 Olivia Street - Design](#)

**A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

12b

Demolition of non-historic addition and shed - **#820 Olivia Street - Michael Ingram (H16-03-0001)**

Attachments: [820 Olivia Street - Demolition](#)

**A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

**13a**

New two-story frame building. Site work - **#1105 Washington Street - A2O Architecture (H16-01-0007)**

**Attachments:** [1105 Washington Street - Design](#)

**A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

**13b**

Demolition of historic, non-contributing cbs structure - **#1105 Washington Street - A2O Architecture (H16-01-0007)**

**Attachments:** [1105 Washington Street - Second Reading](#)

**A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

**14a**

Renovations to house, new one-story addition and new dormers, and site work - **#1212 Margaret Street - Anthony Architecture (H16-01-0013)**

**Attachments:** [Request to Postpone by Applicant](#)

[1212 Maragaret Street - Design](#)

**During Agenda setting the item was Postponed.**

**14b**

Partial demolition of main roof. Demolition of carport - **#1212 Margaret Street - Anthony Architecture (H16-01-0013)**

**Attachments:** [Request to Postpone by Applicant](#)

[1212 Maragaret Street - Demolition](#)

**During Agenda setting the item was Postponed.**

**15**

Changes to the Ordinance and HARC Guidelines for Signage

**Attachments:** [Proposed Changes to the Land Development Regulations](#)

[FINAL Signage Guidelines](#)

*Meeting went into Recess*

*Meeting Reconvened*

**A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved to move to the Planning Board. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

16

### Changes to the HARC Guidelines for New Construction

**Attachments:** [Changes to Guidelines for New Construction - January 23, 2016 Meeting](#)  
[Public Comments - Changes to HARC Guidelines for New Construction as of January 26, 2016](#)  
[Public Comments - Changes to HARC Guidelines for New Construction as of January 25, 2016](#)  
[Public Comments - Changes to HARC Guidelines for New Construction as of January 22, 2016](#)

**PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

Dana Day - 416 Elizabeth  
Marcela Gregory - 37 Palm Drive  
Eric Detwiler - 617 Fleming Street  
Mark Jacob - 601 Fleming Street

Following a lengthy discussion, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Postponed to the February 23, 2016 HARC Meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

17

### Changes to the HARC Guidelines for Additions

**Attachments:** [Guidelines for Additions FINAL Draft 20160119 - January 23, 2016 Meeting](#)

Following a lengthy discussion, a motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Postponed to the February 23, 2016 HARC Meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 7 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

## Comments from Commissioners

## Adjournment

8:30pm