



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final - Final Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, July 28, 2015

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number at 800-955-8771 or 800-955-8770 (Voice) or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Absent 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Present 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

Approval of Agenda

Ms. Torregrosa requested to postpone item #14a and item #14b. A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the agenda be approved as amended by Ms. Torregrosa. The motion carried by the unanimous voice vote with the exception of Vice Chair McChesney who was absent.

Approval of Minutes

1 June 23, 2015 HARC Meeting Minutes

Attachments: [June 23, 2015 HARC Meeting Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Michael Miller, that the Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by an unanimous voice vote.

HARC Planner's Report

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Old Business

- 2** Installation of tile over concrete floor on front porch of contributing structure - **#421 Angela Street - One Call Construction (H15-01-0750)**

Attachments: [421 Angela Street](#)

Due to the applicant not being present, a motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Tabled to the end of the meeting. The motion carried by an unanimous voice vote.

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that 6"x6" Terra Cotta tile is to be used with the tile color, grout color and separation between the tiles to be approved by Staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

- 3** Proposed elevated rear deck over two sawtooth structures - **#818 Fleming Street - Carlos Rojas/Sunblock & Tile Inc (H15-01-0776)**

Attachments: [818 Fleming Street](#)
[818 Fleming Street - Public Comments](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Name	Address	Comments
Ginny Stones	221 Simonton	Spoke against the project

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Denied based on mass and scale specifically Guidelines 1, 3, 4 on page 37 and Guidelines 4 and 5 on page 38a. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

- 4a** Renovations to contributing house, including siding replacement, porch restoration, and elevating the house. Request to move the house towards the northwest side. New rear and side additions, and site work. - **#805 Shavers Lane - Thomas Pope (H15-01-0829)**

Attachments: [805 Shavers Lane - Design](#)
[805 Shavers Lane - Design presented on June 23, 2015](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

4b Demolition of rear addition and front porch. Partial demolition of south side walls. - **#805 Shavers Lane - Thomas Pope (H15-01-0829)**

Attachments: [805 Shavers Lane - Demolition Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

5a Renovations to contributing house. New rear addition. New two-story residence in rear of property. Site work - **#616 Eaton Street - William Horn Architects (H15-01-0842)**

Attachments: [616 Eaton Street - Design](#)
[616 Eaton - Public Comments](#)
[616 Eaton Street - Design presented on June 23, 2015](#)
[616 Eaton Street - Public Comments presented on June 23, 2015](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Name	Address	Comments
Eric Detwiler	617 Fleming	Spoke against the project
Dawn Szot	617 Fleming	Spoke against the project
Frank Kirwin	520 Southard	Spoke against the project
Chris Wylde		Spoke against the project

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Chairman Green

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 5 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, and Ms. Thompson

5b Demolition of rear additions of contributing house - **#616 Eaton Street - William Horn Architects (H15-01-0842)**

Attachments: [616 Eaton Street - Demolition Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

New Business

6 Two-story wood shed - **#801 Emma Street - Castro Construction (H15-01-0600)**

Attachments: [801 Emma Street](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Name	Address	Comments
Donna Windle	126C Perry Court	Spoke for the project

A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

7 Awning type covered storage structure made of metal tubes and canvas - **#724 Duval Street- Geslin Sails/ Joseph J. Schroeder (H15-01-0654)**

Attachments: [724 Duval Street](#)

Following a discussion concerning the project the applicant requested to postpone the item , a motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

8a Construction of new trellis - **#626 Grinnell Street - One Call Construction (H15-01-0958)**

Attachments: [626 Grinnell Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

8b Demolition of wood frame shed and wood trellis - **#626 Grinnell Street - One Call Construction (H15-01-0958)**

Attachments: [626 Grinnell Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

9a

Renovations to contributing house and new one-story attached addition - **#210 Olivia Street- David Knoll (H15-01-0980)**

Attachments: [210 Olivia Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

9b

Demolition of dilapidated carport and accessory structure - **#210 Olivia Street - David Knoll (H15-01-0980)**

Attachments: [210 Olivia Street - Demolition Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

10a

Request for consideration of non-contributing value - **#1000 Southard Street - Affiliated Design and Construction (H15-01-1012)**

Attachments: [1000 Southard Street - Request for Consideration](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Items be Denied based on Section 102-121 through section 102-125 of the Land Development Regulations. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 2 - Ms. Hinkle, and Mr. Logan

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 4 - Mr. Glorie, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

10b

Replacement of windows and doors with impact resistant units and installation of impact resistant skylight on rear - **#1000 Southard Street - Affiliated Design and Construction (H15-01-1012)**

Attachments: [1000 Southard Street - Windows, Doors, & Skylight](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that 2 over 2 windows are used instead of 1 over 1 windows. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Mr. Glorie

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

11a

Renovations and additions to historic main house. Elevate the main house 9" from actual elevation. New house and attached carport on back portion of lot. Swimming pool, site work and garden walls - **#1109 Fleming Street - Matthew Stratton (H15-01-1006)**

Attachments: [1109 Fleming Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that the rear structure's second floor ceiling height will be lowered to nine (9') feet in order to lower the height of the rear structure. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

11b

Demolition of non-historic rear guest house. Demolition of wall on main house - **#1109 Fleming Street - Matthew Stratton (H15-01-1006)**

Attachments: [1109 Fleming Street - Demolition Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

12

One-story addition - **#1107 Windsor Lane - William P. Horn (H15-01-1010)**

Attachments: [1107 Windsor Lane](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

- 13a** Renovations to non-contributing house including stabilization.
Reconstruction of existing back covered deck - **#904 Olivia Street - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-1013)**
- Attachments:** [904 Olivia Street - Design](#)
- A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Absent:** 1 - Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 13b** Demolition of back covered deck - **#904 Olivia Street - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-1013)**
- Attachments:** [904 Olivia Street - Demolition](#)
- A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Absent:** 1 - Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 14a** New house on vacant lot - **#1402 Whalton Street - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-1014)**
- Attachments:** [1402 Whalton Street - Design](#)
- Item #14a was postponed during agenda setting.**
- 14b** Partial demolition of historic fence - **#1402 Whalton Street - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-1014)**
- Item #14b was postponed during agenda setting.**
- 15** Revisions to previously approved plans for a new two and a half story frame structure - **#803-805 Olivia Street - William Shepler (H15-01-1021)**
- Attachments:** [803-805 Olivia Street](#)
- A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- No:** 1 - Mr. Glorie
- Absent:** 1 - Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 5 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

16

New two-story structure and site work on vacant lot - **#415 Grinnell Street - Matthew Stratton (H15-01-1070)**

Attachments: [415 Grinnell Street](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion Failed to be carried by the following vote:

No: 3 - Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

Absent: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 3 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, and Mr. Logan

Comments from Commissioners

****What options are available to HARC when addressing irreparable after the fact applications?**

Adjournment