

Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

July 10, 2012 – 914 James Street exert

Approved – July 24, 2012

Page 1 of 2

4a	New two story house and new fence- #914 James Street - Seatech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-345)
	<p>Owen Trepannier presented the project. Mr. Trepannier stated he appreciated the Commission's time and had nothing additional to report following all the previous presentations. Mr. Trepannier remained to respond to any questions.</p> <p>Public Comments: There were no public comments.</p> <p>Staff Report: Design: Enid Torregrosa presented her Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is a request for the construction of a new two-story house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the plans propose the demolition of a one story non-contributing house. Ms. Torregrosa reminded the Commission that on February 8, 2012 the Commission approved the design of the "restoration" of the historic portion of the house and a new two-story addition. Ms. Torregrosa added that on March 28 a new application was postponed by the Commission for the demolition of the entire house and the new construction of a two-story structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated that on May 9, revised plans were submitted and the project was, again, postponed. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that proposal B is inconsistent with many of the guidelines for new construction. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that although the building will be setback from the sidewalk approximately 13', due to the proposed side main gable roof it will be perceived taller than the non historic house on the east side. The main façade of the East side house is also setback from the sidewalk, but approximately 15'. Ms. Torregrosa added that the scale of the proposed house would not be in keeping to the scale and massing of the existing historic houses on that urban block. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that most of the historic urban context on this part in town has been lost but what is still left as historic should be protected. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that, although the applicant had tried to lower the main façade's scale by incorporating hip roofs, the massing and scale of the entire house is not appropriate when reviewing what still standing as historic fabric.</p> <p>Demolition: Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that what will be left of the historic part of the house once demolition takes place will be the West side of the house and the roof. Ms. Torregrosa stated although the historic part of the house is not irrevocably compromise by extreme deterioration it has been altered through time and there is not much left of the historic fabric.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: Michael Miller asked what was the color rendering he is currently looking at. Ms. Torregrosa stated that what he is looking at is that is the approved plans. Mr. Miller asked Mr. Trepannier what was wrong with that plan. Mr. Trepannier stated that the owner decided that he would prefer a completely new structure.</p> <p>Bryan Green asked Mr. Trepannier why the applicant did not submit the requested street perspective drawings that the Commissioners requested at the last two meetings. Mr. Trepannier stated that the owner did not think the additional drawings would help get the project approved.</p> <p>Maggie Gutierrez will not be able to support anything two-story at the site.</p> <p>Rudy Molinet stated that he thinks the Commissioners have been very clear about what would acceptable for the area.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item</p>

Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

July 10, 2012 – 914 James Street exert

Approved – July 24, 2012

Page 2 of 2

	be Denied . The motion Passed based on Guideline VI page 38a-4 and page 38a-5 by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet No: 2 – Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller
4b	Demolition of entire house- -#914 James Street - Seatech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-345)
	In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 4a. Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be Denied based on the fact that the design was not approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 7 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet