

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

December 28, 2011

DRAFT

Page 1 of 6

Call Meeting To Order	
Chairman Rudy Molinet called the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission (HARC) Meeting of December 28, 2011 to order at 6:00 pm at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510 Greene Street, Key West.	
Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag	
Roll Call	
	Commissioners present include: Donna Bosold, Theo Glorie, Daniel Metzler, Michael Miller, Vice Chairman Bryan Green, and Chairman Rudy Molinet. Also, present from City staff: Assistant City Attorney Larry Erskine, Historic Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, IT Mike Rivera, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett.
Approval of Agenda	
	Chairman Rudy Molinet inquired as to any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa stated that December 14 th minutes were not available for the Commissioners review. Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the Agenda with no changes be Approved . The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
Approval of Minutes	
1	December 14, 2011 Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the Minutes be Postponed . The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
HARC Planner's Report	
	Ms. Torregrosa stated that since this is a special meeting that she will withhold a detailed report until the next meeting. Ms. Torregrosa added that the City Commission has moved their second meeting scheduled for February 21 st to February 22 nd which conflicts with the HARC meeting scheduled for February 22 nd . Ms. Torregrosa suggested moving the HARC meeting to February 21 st and stated she would have it on the agenda for the next meeting for a vote.
Old Business	
2	Remove part of existing carport that encroaches Condominium Association property- #514 Emma Street- Denis Savoie-TAMPOA (H11-01-1557) Second reading Steve Porter presented the project. Mr. Porter stated he didn't have much to add since the last meeting. Public Comments: There were no public comments. Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the second

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
December 28, 2011

DRAFT

Page 2 of 6

	<p>reading for this project and that the Commission can consider the request since it is consistent with the LDRs.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
3	<p>Demolition of unpermitted temporary shed-#804 Eisenhower Drive-Sandra Henning (H11-01-1559) Second reading</p> <p>Roger Akers the owner presented the project. Mr. Akers stated he didn't have anything to add from the last meeting.</p> <p>Public Comments: There were no public comments.</p> <p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the second reading for this project and that the Commission can consider the request since it is consistent with the LDRs.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
4a	<p>Extend existing sawtooth roof 6' and construct new slope roof 3:12 Revised drawings with gable roof- #1108 Petronia Street- William Rowan (H11-01-1573)</p> <p>Patricia Gray the owner presented the project. Ms. Gray stated she did not like the revised design and would prefer the design presented at the previous meeting. Ms. Gray discussed her options for the project with the Commissioners. Following a discussion with the Chair and the Assistant City Attorney, Ms. Gray decided to have the Commissioners to vote on the new plans. Ms. Gray stated that she plans to bring the old plans back before the Commissioners at a future meeting and if those plans are denied then she would pursue the option to appeal that denial.</p> <p>Public Comments: There were no public comments.</p> <p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this structure is listed as a contributing resource in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to the owners the existing addition has a roof that does not have a proper slope for</p>

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
December 28, 2011

DRAFT

Page 3 of 6

	<p>drainage. Ms. Torregrosa stated that staff did not find approvals or building permits for that addition. Ms. Torregrosa added that it is staff's belief that the proposed revised design is more appropriate than the first proposal.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners had a lengthy discussion concerning the application with the applicant as noted above. The Commissioners discussed that they feel this new design is more appropriate than the one first proposed.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green seconded by Mr. Michael Miller, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
4b	<p>Demolish rear flat roof- #1108 Petronia Street- William Rowan (H11-01-1573)</p> <p>Patricia Gray the owner presented the project. Ms. Gray stated she did not have anything to add.</p> <p>Public Comments: There were no public comments.</p> <p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed roof to be demolished is part of a non historic addition that is attached to a historic sawtooth. Ms. Torregrosa added that the actual roof is lower than the sawtooth's gable roof. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed demolition is consistent with the LDRs. Ms. Torregrosa stated that if approved, a second reading will be required.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners had a short discussion concerning the potential that the applicant may return with the original design for review and how that action would impact this item.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be Approved with the understanding the demolition approval is tied to the approval of the revised plans of item 4a. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
5	<p>Partial demolition of existing house- #919 Southard Street-Robert M. Gurney (H11-01-1586) Second reading</p> <p>Mr. Gurney was not present but the Commissioners decided to hear the item in his absence.</p> <p>Public Comments: There were no public comments.</p>

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

December 28, 2011

DRAFT

Page 4 of 6

	<p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the second reading for this project and that the Commission can consider the request since it is consistent with the LDRs.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
6	<p>Removal from city right of way 6' high by 130 lineal feet of cbs wall- #1021 Watson Street- City Of Key West/ Jim Scholl (H11-01-1600) Second reading</p> <p>Doug Bradshaw presented the project. Mr. Bradshaw stated that he didn't have anything to add from the last meeting. Mr. Bradshaw added that this is a design build project during the discussion with the Commission.</p> <p>Public Comments: The following members of the public spoke:<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Sandra Downs – 22976 Bluegill Lane, Cudjoe Key</p> <p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the second reading for this project and that the Commission can consider the request since it is consistent with the LDRs.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners had a lengthy discussion concerning the project needing to be before HARC sooner. The Commissioners also discussed what other things may have been identified as encroaching on City property and shouldn't they have been identified sooner. The Commissioners also discuss if all the parking was really necessary.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
7	<p>Removal from city right of way 32" high by 43 lineal feet of cbs wall- #801 Virginia Street- City Of Key West/ Jim Scholl (H11-01-1601) Second reading</p> <p>Doug Bradshaw presented the project. Mr. Bradshaw stated that he didn't have anything to add from the last meeting or the last item.</p> <p>Public Comments: The following members of the public spoke:<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Sandra Downs – 22976 Bluegill Lane, Cudjoe Key</p> <p>Staff Report:</p>

**Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
December 28, 2011**

DRAFT

Page 5 of 6

	<p>Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the second reading for this project and that the Commission can consider the request since it is consistent with the LDRs.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners returned to their discussion concerning the project needing to be before HARC sooner and discussed the points Ms. Downs presented during her public input. Chairman Molinet reminded the Commissioners that there are charged with discussing only the architectural aspects of the projects not any legal aspects.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
8	<p>Removal from city right of way 48" high by 30 lineal feet of cbs wall- #1107 Virginia Street- City Of Key West/ Jim Scholl (H11-01-1602) Second reading</p> <p>Doug Bradshaw presented the project. Mr. Bradshaw stated that he didn't have anything to add.</p> <p>Public Comments: The following members of the public spoke:<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Sandra Downs – 22976 Bluegill Lane, Cudjoe Key</p> <p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the second reading for this project and that the Commission can consider the request since it is consistent with the LDRs.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners had no additional comments.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
New Business	
9	<p>New ADA compliant sidewalk on Virginia Street from Windsor Lane to Varela Street- City of Key West/ Doug Bradshaw (H11-01-1653)</p> <p>Doug Bradshaw, David Fernandez, and Don Craig presented the project explain the reasons for the project and the need for a timely approval. Mr. Craig assured the Commissioners that all future sidewalk improvement projects in Old Town will be presented to HARC.</p> <p>Public Comments: The following members of the public spoke:<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Sandra Downs – 22976 Bluegill Lane, Cudjoe Key</p>

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

December 28, 2011

DRAFT

Page 6 of 6

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Roger Moyle – 14 Birch Grove Rusholme, Manchester England Also: 911 Virginia Street <p>Staff Report: Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Commission has been reviewing applications for demolition requests of structures that are encroaching city's right-of-way which impede the construction of the proposed project. Ms. Torregrosa added that staff has been reviewing applications for relocations of existing wood picket fences. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the submitted plans include new sidewalks that will meet ADA requirements. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the affected areas will be the north side of Virginia Street from Windsor Lane to Varela Street. The City of Key West has been required by Federal Court to embark a project for the installation of sidewalks that meet ADA requirements. Ms. Torregrosa also stated that although the Historic District is listed in the National Register of Historic Places there are no exceptions to ADA compliance.</p> <p>Commission Discussion: The Commissioners had a lengthy discussion concerning the project needing to be before HARC sooner. The Commissioners also discuss if all the parking was really necessary. The Commissioners also discussed the lack of landscaping as a result of several trees being removed. The Commissioners requested a complete landscape plan be submitted for their review.</p> <p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Michael Miller, that the item be Approved with the condition that the Project return at the next meeting with a complete landscape plan which includes at least one additional bulb out per block. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Metzler, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet No: 1 – Mr. Glorie</p>
Commissioners Comments	
	<p>Mr. Molinet stated that he would like for everyone to think about changing the time of the meeting to an earlier time in order to help us get out at a reasonable hour.</p> <p>There were no additional Commissioner comments.</p>
Adjournment	
	<p>Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the meeting be Adjourned. The motion Passed by a unanimous vote.</p> <p>Meeting adjourned at 9:07 pm.</p>

Submitted by,

Jo Bennett

Administrative Coordinator
Planning Department