

ALDERMAN Planning Company

PO Box 55755, St. Petersburg, Florida 33732

Phone: 813-833-5161

Email: Aldermanplanning@gmail.com

Thomas Street II Residence

Project location: 914 Thomas Street
Key West, Florida

Date: July 19th, 2019

Historic Architectural Guidelines – City of Key West:

VII Historic Architectural Design Principles

Siting: Structures should be placed so that their siting is compatible with the zone's historical period as well as city codes.

Condition met: Historically the buildings are randomly sited on the surrounding properties on the interior of the block (see Sanborn Map 1962). The proposed design conforms to the existing development pattern. In scale the proposed residence creates a transition between the larger structures to the Northeast and the two smaller structures to the Southwest. The three structures abutting to the Northeast have larger footprints than the proposed residence and the two structures abutting to the south have smaller footprints. The orientation of the roof ridgeline of the proposed residence is also consistent with the existing development pattern; the majority of the building ridge lines surrounding the site run parallel with Thomas Street (see Exhibit E.1.2). The proposed residence meets the City's setback requirements.

Massing: The structure should be compatible with the existing massing patterns of buildings in its historic zone.

Condition met: The existing massing pattern is multiple story structures (2.5, 2 & 1.5 stories) to the Northeasterly & Northwesterly side of the project site and single story structures to Southeasterly & Southwesterly sides of the site (see Exhibits E.1.2 & E.1.4). The proposed residence is designed to create a transition between these massing groups; the proposed residence is two stories on the north towards the multi-story structures and one story on the south towards the one story structures.

Material: Materials used should be identical or similar in appearance to original fabric.

Condition met: The materials proposed for the exterior of the proposed residence will be similar in appearance to the historic buildings surrounding the project site (see elevations, sheet A.2.1).

Texture: Key West's historic buildings use a variety of materials including wood, brick, stone, concrete, steel & stucco. New buildings, which use materials of similar texture, are more compatible in historic zones.

Condition met: The materials selected for the proposed residence follow the description & illustration provided in the 'Historic Architectural Guidelines – City of Key West' for a Classic Revival Key West Eyebrow House (see Elevations, sheet A.2.1).

Roof Form: Most roofing in the historic residential zones consists of sloped gables or hipped roofs. Many commercial structures have flat roofing. New structures will be more compatible if the common roof forms of nearby properties are used in their design.

Condition met: The roof form for the proposed residence is sloped gable, which is the same roof form of every residence surrounding the project site except for the one flat roofed structure located to the west of the site.

Rhythm: The concept of Rhythm is the regular recurrence of related elements. In a building this is generally the recurrent alternating pattern of solids and voids (such as the relationship of wall space to windows and doors) experienced while passing by or through a building. By using a similar rhythmic pattern in a new building a more sympathetic relationship can be obtained.

Condition met: The proposed residence has a façade consisting of five equally spaced bays on the two story portion of the structure and a one story wing consisting on a 2/5 proportion of the two story structure with repeating window spacing.

Detailing: Design elements such as trim or railings, which are important to the historic appearance of a structure, should be retained or duplicated if deterioration makes retention impossible.

Condition met: The detailing utilized for the proposed residence follow the description & illustration provided in the 'Historic Architectural Guidelines – City of Key West' for a Classic Revival Key West Eyebrow House, however to keep in the spirit of the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation for new construction and differentiate new construction from historic properties the intensity of detail of the historic buildings has been omitted (see Elevations, sheet A.2.1).

Color: Color is an important factor in Key West architecture. Key West houses were usually painted in subtle colors, predominantly white, grey, and lightly hued pastels with contrasting trim & shutters. Color is an intrinsic quality of a building material such as brick or stone, as well as an applied coating such as paint. Historic research is often used to determine original paint colors for renovations.

Not applicable.

Staff Report

Consistency with Cited Guidelines:

Staff Report: It is staff's opinion that the proposed design does not meet most of the cited guidelines.

- A. The scale, form and massing of the proposed structure are incompatible with the immediate context. Staff feels that the proposal will overshadow the historic one-story house at 916 Thomas Street.

Response: The scale form & massing meet the Historic Architectural Design Principles set forth in the 'Historic Architectural Guidelines – City of Key West' (see conditions met for siting, massing and scale & proportion above). Additionally the historic structure that was previously located at 914 Thomas Street dwarfed the residence located at 916 Thomas Street (see Exhibit E.1.6). The proposed residence is both smaller in scale, mass and has a much lower eaves line as compared to the historic structure that was razed in 1973 (see Exhibit E.1.5).

- B. The proposed height of 27-feet 5-inches is taller than that of all immediately adjacent onestory structures.

Response: As noted in the 'Conditions met' for the siting, massing, and scale & proportion above, the proposed residence is designed to create a transition between the multi-story structures on two sides of the project site to the one story structures on the other two sides of the site. The two story portion of the proposed residence is taller than the residence located 916 Thomas Street, however the one story portion of the proposed residence is shorter than the 916 residence. Additionally, the former Historic Structure located at 914 Thomas Street was taller than the 916 residence and the proposed residence.

Adjacent properties: West: 1-two story, Northwest: 1-1.5 story, Northeast: 1-1.5 story, Southeast: 1-one story, Southwest: 2-one story.

- C. The proposed rear dormer has a width that is rather large in comparison to existing dormers in the area.

Response: The dormer on the proposed residence is a 19'-2" wide shed dormer located on the rear of the structure. The Adjacent residence to the Northeast has a 14' wide shed dormer facing the side lot line of our project site. The house located directly across the street at 917 Thomas Street has two 16' wide dormers facing the sides of its lot; both of which can be clearly seen from the street. The dormer on the proposed residence is not out of proportion to its exterior elevation and is not excessively large compared to dormers on homes in the immediate vicinity.

The location of the dormer will also be out of the public view from Thomas Street where similarly sized dormers are clearly visible.

- D. Pursuant to guideline 7, though the proposed structure is on a lot recessed from the street, the front of the structure still faces the street and the orientation of the structure is parallel to the lot lines. Proposed materials echo those used on historic structures and will appear similar in scale, proportion, texture and finish to those of adjacent historic buildings.

Response: Agreed

- E. Overall, staff feels the scale, form and massing of the proposed structure are too large for the existing context.

Response: The proposed residence was designed in accordance with the 'Historic Architectural Guidelines – City of Key West' with specific attention to the scale, form and massing as note by the 'Condition met' notations above.