



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final - Final Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, September 29, 2015

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Present 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Approval of Agenda

Ms. Torregrosa stated that prior to the meeting, the applicant had requested to postpone item #4a and item #4b. A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the agenda be approved as amended by Ms. Torregrosa. The motion carried by the unanimous Roll Call Vote.

Approval of Minutes

1 August 25, 2015 Minutes

Attachments: [August 25, 2015 Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the approval of the Minutes be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

HARC Planner's Report

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Old Business

2 Demolition of rear additions of contributing house - **#616 Eaton Street - William Horn Architects (H15-01-0842) Second Reading**

Attachments: [616 Eaton Street - Demolition Second Reading](#)
[Public Comments - September 29, 2015](#)
[Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Bert Bender - 410 Angela Street
Dana Dey - 416 Elizabeth Street

Assistant City Attorney Mr. Ron Ramsingh suggested that due to the project approval for 616 Eaton Street being under potential appeal, item #2 (Second Reading for demolition at 616 Eaton Street) be postponed indefinitely until the appellate process has run its course or at least postpone until the October Meeting.

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion Failed for lack of sccond.

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 3 - Ms. Hinkle, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Yes: 4 - Mr. Glorie, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, and Ms. Thompson

3 Partial demolition of historic fence - **#1402 Whalton Street - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-1014) - Second Reading**

Attachments: [1402 Whalton Street- Demolition Second Reading](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

4a New rear addition and renovations to existing house. New pool, deck and fences - **#732 Poorhouse Lane - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-0841)**

Attachments: [Postponement Requested by Applicant](#)
[732 Poorhouse Lane - Design](#)
[Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)
[Public Comments - September 24, 2015](#)
[August 25, 2015 Meeting - 732 Poorhouse Lane - Design](#)
[August 25, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments](#)

During agenda setting, a motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Vice

Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

4b

Demolition of front concrete porch and back additions. Demolition of shed structure - **#732 Poorhouse Lane - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-0841)**

Attachments: [Postponement Requested by Applicant.pdf](#)
[732 Poorhouse Lane - Demolition](#)
[Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)
[Public Comments - September 24, 2015](#)
[August 25, 2015 Meeting - 732 Poorhouse Lane - Demolition](#)
[August 25, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments](#)

During agenda setting, a motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Items be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

New Business

5

New sculpture at Keys Energy Building for Arts in Public Places - **#1001 James Street -Key's Energy, Julio Torrado/Daniel Siefert (H15-01-1346)**

Attachments: [1001 James Street - New Sculpture](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

6

One-story rear addition to contributing house - **#907-909 Emma Street - Will Shepler (H15-01-0821)**

Attachments: [907-909 Emma Street](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Ms. Thompson

Yes: 6 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

7

Modification to previously approved plans: move west wall over 3' 4" and raise roof on new addition 2' 4" - **#1404 Olivia Street - Chris Liddle**

(H15-01-1016)

Attachments: [1404 Olivia Street - Modification](#)
 [HARC VARIANCE Approval 81 2015](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:
Bruce Kjjos - 2111 Staples Avenue
Rick Boettger - 1402 Olivia Street #1
Cynthia Edwards - 1402 Olivia Street #1

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

8 Install 16 aluminum impact windows in contributing house - **#806 Elizabeth Street Rear - Phyllis M. Allen (H15-01-1314)**

Attachments: [806 Elizabeth Street Rear](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

9a New wood exterior staircase - **#611 Fleming Street - FMH Builders Inc. (H15-01-1311)**

Attachments: [611 Fleming Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

9b Demolition of exterior wood staircase - **#611 Fleming Street - FMH Builders Inc. (H15-01-1311)**

Attachments: [611 Fleming Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Thompson, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

10a New wood exterior staircase - **#524 Elizabeth Street - FMH Builders Inc. (H15-01-1313)**

Attachments: [524 Elizabeth Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

10b

Demolition of exterior wood staircase - **#524 Elizabeth Street - FMH Builders Inc. (H15-01-1313)**

Attachments: [524 Elizabeth Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

11a

New rear addition and rear gable roof on contributing building - **#1200 Florida Street - Perez Engineering & Development (H15-01-1358)**

Attachments: [1200 Florida Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

11b

Demolition of rear roof on addition - **#1200 Florida Street - Perez Engineering & Development (H15-01-1358)**

Attachments: [1200 Florida Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

12a

Renovations and new roof configuration to eyebrow house. New deck - **#525 Olivia Street - Perez Engineering & Development (H15-01-1359)**

Attachments: [525 Olivia Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Items be Denied based on the Land Development Regulations, Articles V, U.S Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and Article VI- Design Guidelines in Key West Historic District, particularly the following standards and guidelines; Sec. 102-217 (2) and (3), Sec. 102-218 (a)(1) and (2), (b)(1), (2), (3), and (4), and (c), Sec. 102-125 (1-9) and Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically Standards 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 9, and 10 on pages 16-23 of the Historic Architectural Guidelines; Guidelines for Additions, Alterations and New Construction of the Historic Architectural Guidelines (pages 36-38a)

specifically guidelines for 1 through 8 for Additions and Alterations of pages 36- 37 and guideline 4 of New Construction on page 38a; Guidelines for Decorative Elements and Details of the Historic Architectural Guidelines (page 24), specifically guideline 1; Guidelines for Roofing of the Historic Architectural Guidelines (page 26), specifically guideline 4; Guidelines for Windows of the Historic Architectural Guidelines (pages 29-30), specifically guidelines 3 and 10; Guidelines for Entrances, Porches, and Doors of the Historic Architectural Guidelines (pages 32-33), specifically guidelines 3, 4, and 7; and Guidelines for Demolitions and Relocations of the Historic Architectural Guidelines (page 39), specifically guideline 1.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

12b

Partial demolition of main roof of historic eyebrow house and of rear roof of historic addition. Demolition of exterior staircase - **#525 Olivia Street - Perez Engineering & Development (H15-01-1359)**

Attachments: [525 Olivia Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the Action Items be Denied based on the Denial of the Design The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

13a

Renovations and one-story addition to eyebrow house. Site work - **#845 Galveston Lane - Michael B. Ingram (H15-01-1370)**

Attachments: [845 Galveston Lane - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that the side bump-out be removed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

13b

Demolition of rear lean-to addition on contributing house - **#845 Galveston Lane - Michael B. Ingram (H15-01-1370)**

Attachments: [845 Galveston Lane - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

14a

Renovations to contributing house - **#1116 Packer Street - Perez Engineering & Development (H15-01-1376)**

Attachments: [1116 Packer Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that the windows on the left side be changed to three (3) separate windows. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

14b

Demolition of two shed structures in backyard - **#1116 Packer Street - Perez Engineering & Development (H15-01-1376)**

Attachments: [1116 Packer Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Miller, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

15

New mixed-use commercial structure and single-family residence - **#1028/1030 Truman Avenue - Joel Cognevich (H15-01-1378)**

Attachments: [1028-1030 Truman Avenue](#)
 [Public Comments - September 29, 2015](#)
 [Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Comments from Commissioners

**** Discussion of increasing staff's ability to approve minor demolitions. ****

Adjournment

8:55 pm