

Historic Preservation Planner

Recommendations for Public Policy on City actions or proposals involving or affecting city owned properties under HARC jurisdiction.

Background

In the past years, HARC has seen an increase in public participation in matters pertaining to historic preservation. Factors that staff finds that have contributed to this shift are:

1. A transparent process that takes into consideration public input in all aspects of the historic preservation process, from proposed projects to revisions of regulations.
2. A professional and collegiate HARC Commission that is trustworthy, disciplined on the principles of the HARC guidelines and current regulations, and that approaches applicants with respect and willingness to assist in their requests.
3. More involved non-profit organizations that have under their goals the preservation and protection of Key West Heritage like Key West Art and Historical Society, Historic Florida Keys Foundation, Key West Maritime Historical Society, and Old Island Restoration Foundation, among others.

The community interest in historic preservation issues is palpable through public meetings, social media, and gatherings. Citizens are requesting from the City that they perform, deliver, and to be accountable for obeying and abiding by their own Ordinances and regulations. The established culture within the city is to assume HARC's responsibility is only to review "HARC Applications". The involvement of HARC staff or its appointed members in decision-making, planning, at early design stages for proposed developments, new proposed uses and their effect on a property, or request for proposals for city owned properties under HARC jurisdiction has been almost non-existent in the past ten years. HARC involvement and the assurance of transparent processes through all stages of any proposal, including new uses for a property for any City owned asset must be a priority for the City. Furthermore, when proposals need to be reviewed and approved by different Boards or Commissions, many requirements or recommendations can be in conflict with specific regulations of a particular advisory agency or committee.

The recommendations that are proposed in this document are based on my tenure in the City, my almost 28 years of professional experience in the field of historic preservation, and the current regulations that dictates policy specific to the preservation, protection and promotion of our island's unique historic heritage.

Context

1. A proposed project for a city owned property may require review, approvals, or input from up to seven Boards, Committees, or Commissions. Some Boards may share responsibilities, like the preservation of the historic character of the Key West Bight or Bahama Village, but many times regulations may create conflicts between two or more Boards.
2. The City's Comprehensive Plan and the Certified Local Government Agreement of 1991 signed between the City and the Florida State Historic Preservation Officer demands public participation in historic preservation and in initiatives through public meetings, community workshops, and special events.
3. The City as property owners must comply with all regulations and procedures, as any other property owner in Key West. Having the responsibility of creating and implementing policy does not, and should not, grant special privileges.
4. The City invest hundreds of hours in human resources and fiscal resources on projects that, at the end, cannot be approved by a specific Board as designed, or are thrown away as the plans are no longer a priority for the City.
5. The City publishes requests for proposals, requests for qualifications, and letters of intent for city owned properties under HARC jurisdiction without any prior consultation with HARC. Furthermore, ranking committees to review submitted proposals do not include any HARC member or staff, which can and has recently led to proposals coming forward which are not in accordance with HARC Guidelines or the Secretary of the Interior's regulations.

6. The City's Vision is:

Key West has a beautiful natural environment with a vibrant culture, **interesting historical architecture**, active neighborhoods, and community-wide interests **that are supported by involved residents** from all walks of life, **and a responsible and responsive government**.

7. The City's Mission is:

Our mission **is to protect our** natural and **built environment and honor our local heritage and cultural identity with citizens** actively engaged in the life of our neighborhoods and community. **Together** we shall promote ongoing redevelopment of a sustainable economy, quality of life, and modern city infrastructure. Our government shall act on behalf of the long-term, generational interests of residents and visitors of Key West.

Recommendations

The following are the Historic Preservation Planner recommendations for public policy pertaining to properties owned by the city under HARC jurisdiction.

1. New legislation under Chapter 102 shall require that any proposed alteration, new use, demolition, or new construction on City's owned properties be submitted to HARC staff during early stages of planning, design, requests for intent or request for proposals. HARC staff recommendations, including the participation of HARC members, shall be given weight during the decision-making and planning/ design process.
2. Public participation is paramount to achieve the City's Vision and Mission. Proposals on City owned properties must be transparent and shall, where appropriate, take into consideration public input through key steps of its development.
3. We highly advise the creation of joint public workshops between proponent Boards and Committees and regulatory Boards and Commissions on projected developments, changes and new uses that might have an adverse effect on city owned properties. This will allow public participation at an early stage of a proposed development or change of use, will promote a dialogue between Boards and the public on their regulations and charter, and

will generate specific guidelines, “*do & don’ts*”, as well as detailed requirements for proposal documents.

4. City staff must recognize that HARC and their staff is an agency created by the City’s Charter, and that their responsibilities and authority is the preservation of the character and appearance of the historic and architectural heritage, which is a broader obligation than merely approving or denying plans.

5. HARC acknowledges that ultimately the City Commission must make the final decision as to which new use, new tenants or scope of work be acceptable and will be the body deciding on any conflict between rental income or potentially lower value though preferred alternative bid.

As part of these recommendations, we are submitting a list of all properties owned by the City under HARC jurisdiction.

PROPERTIES OWNED BY THE CITY THAT REQUIRES HARC STAFF/ HARC COMMISSION INVOLVEMENT IN FIRST STAGES OF ANY PROPOSAL

| ADDRESS | BUILDING/ SITE NAME | COMMENTS | CLASSIFICATION | RELEVANT BOARD OR REVIEW ^{1, 2, 3} |
|---|---|--|--|--|
| 100 Angela Street 709 Fort Street 101 Geraldine Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Historic Diesel Plant | Under contract with KWAHS. Brick vernacular | Contributing | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 525 Angela Street 616 Simonton Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Old Town Fire Station and bathrooms facilities • Parking | Fire Station built in 2014- City recognizes site under 616 Simonton- Fire Station 2 | Non-historic | HARC |
| 800 Caroline Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bo's Fish Wagon • Parking and bathrooms | Extends to Bight public bathrooms and parking/ gasoline tank sand refusal facilities. | Non-historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 901 Caroline Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flagler Station Museum | Serves as Conch Tour Train Station | Non-historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 907 Caroline Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Piano Shop | Reinforced Concrete Structure, built 1955 | Historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 908 Caroline Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Buses Parking Lot | No structure on site | N/A | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 250 Catherine Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nelson English Park | No Structure on site | N/A | BVRAC, PRAB, HARC, CRA |
| 304 Catherine Street 300 Catherine Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Martin Luther King Memorial Center • Willie Ward Park | Public Pool and facilities – Park parcel under 300 Block of Louisa Street. Built in 1957 | Contributing | BVRAC, PRAB, HARC, CRA |
| 5210 College Road | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Historic Botanical Garden | Toppino Chapel, Mid-Century Modern built 1950 | Historical Garden is Contributing – Chapel is Historic | HARC |
| 2 Duval Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Glass Boat site and Fury ticket booth | | Non-historic | HARC |

PROPERTIES OWNED BY THE CITY THAT REQUIRES HARC STAFF/ HARC COMMISSION INVOLVEMENT IN FIRST STAGES OF ANY PROPOSAL

| ADDRESS | BUILDING/SITE NAME | COMMENTS | CLASSIFICATION | RELEVANT BOARD OR REVIEW ^{1, 2, 3} |
|--|--|---|--------------------------------|--|
| 1405 Duval Street | • South Beach Café and beach | | Non-historic | PRAB, HARC |
| 830 Emma Street 111Olivia Street | • Frederick Douglass Community Center and Gym | Douglass Gym is historic- City recognizes site under 111 Olivia Street- Gym built 1957 | Gym- Contributing | BVRAC, HARC, CRA |
| 727 Fort Street | • Band Room | Masonry vernacular structure, built ca. 1948 | Contributing | BVRAC, HARC, CRA |
| 918 Fort Street | • Parking at Front Street Parking and green space towards the west side of the Diesel Plant | No structures on site | N/A | BVRAC, TWAB, PRAB, HARC, CRA |
| 291 Front | • Clinton Square | Civil War obelisk erected - circa 1866 | Contributing | HARC |
| 301 Front Street | • Key West Art Center | Frame vernacular structure, built ca. 1906 | Contributing | HARC |
| 700 Block Front Street End | • Harbor Master and Pilot Offices- A&B Lobster Sign | Frame structure A&B Sign | Non-Historic Sign- Historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 801 Galveston Lane | • Bill Butler Park | No structure on site, non-compliant fence approved by City Planner and not HARC Planner in 2014. | N/A | PRAB, HARC |
| 613-631 Greene Street 201 William Street | • Conch Republic Restaurant • Parking Lot • Thompson & O'Neal Ice Plant | | Non-Historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 201 Grinnell Street 100 Grinnell Street | • Ferry Terminal and Parking | | Non-Historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 300 Grinnell Street | • Park and Ride | | Non-Historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 1024 Grinnell Street | • Old Fire Station No 3- Museum | Masonry vernacular built 1907- City's Local Register List recognizes the building under 1026 address. | Contributing | HARC |

PROPERTIES OWNED BY THE CITY THAT REQUIRES HARC STAFF/ HARC COMMISSION INVOLVEMENT IN FIRST STAGES OF ANY PROPOSAL

| ADDRESS | BUILDING/SITE NAME | COMMENTS | CLASSIFICATION | RELEVANT BOARD OR REVIEW ^{1, 2, 3} |
|--|---|--|--|--|
| Lazy Way Lane 203 Elizabeth Street 202 William 205 Elizabeth | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jimmy Buffet’s recording studio • Frame wood shops • Schooner Warf restaurant | Masonry vernacular 1955 Frame vernacular Masonry vernacular, old fish house | Historic Non-Contributing Historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 200 Block Margaret Street 120 Margaret Street 231 Margaret Street 200 Margaret Street 1 Land End Village | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Thompson Fish House, Turtle Kraals, Cannery and Dock C | Frame vernacular, Pier Concrete/ wood, Kraals concrete. | Complex is individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places | KWB, HARC has jurisdiction also in the interior alteration of buildings, CRA |
| 200 Block Margaret Street 208 Margaret Street 231 Margaret Street 241 Margaret Street 251 Margaret Street 261 Margaret Street 274 Margaret Street End of Margaret Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mac’s Sea Garden Shop • Half Shell Raw Bar • Key West Bait & Tackle Shop • Discovery Shop • Fish Market and Restroom • Lost Reef and Dive Shop • Local Color Shop | Also includes the Coffee Queen building, board walk, docks, and Parking lot. Gasoline tanks, refuse structures, and Bight public bathrooms are also included under this address. | Non-Historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| 701 Margaret Street 701 Passover Lane | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Key West Cemetery • Sexton’s Office | Key West Cemetery circa 1847. In 2005 the 19 acres Cemetery was listed as a Florida Heritage Landmark by the Florida Department of State. | Cemetery-Historic Contributing Sexton’s office- Non-Historic | HARC- Sexton’s Office |
| 721 Poorhouse Lane | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Parking | No Structures | N/A | HARC |
| 21 Quay Road | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Truman Waterfront Park • Parking • Navy Building 1286 | Amphitheater and bathrooms are not-historic | Building 1286 Mess Hall- Historic Park- Non-Historic | TWAB, PRAB, HARC, CRA |
| 398 South Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Historic Cable House | Moved to Key West by Henry Flagler in 1917 | Historic | HARC |

PROPERTIES OWNED BY THE CITY THAT REQUIRES HARC STAFF/ HARC COMMISSION INVOLVEMENT IN FIRST STAGES OF ANY PROPOSAL

| ADDRESS | BUILDING/SITE NAME | COMMENTS | CLASSIFICATION | RELEVANT BOARD OR REVIEW ^{1, 2, 3} |
|--|---|---|---|--|
| 0 Simonton Street 5 Simonton Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Simonton Street Beach • Lagerheads Restaurant | Parking lot | Non-Historic | HARC |
| 1310 Truman Avenue 1313 Virginia Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bay View Park- Monuments • Pro Shop • Recreational Center • Press Box | Confederate Memorial- 1924 Jose Marti Memorial- 1936 Civil War New York Soldiers that died in Key West from Yellow Fever Gold Star Mothers Memorial - 1953 | Park and memorials listed are Historic | PRAB, HARC |
| 401 Wall Street 402 Wall Street 420 Wall Street 1 Mallory Square 1 Whitehead Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mallory Square • Waterfront Playhouse • Casa Cayo Hueso Restaurant and Cistern • Cable House East • Cable House West • Hospitality House • Historic Tift Ice Plant • Bathrooms | All buildings listed are historic Playhouse- Contributing circa 1879 Restaurant – Contributing circa 1889 Cisterns – Historic Cable House East- Contributing 1921 Cable House West- Historic 1930 Hospitality House- Contributing circa 1886 Tift Ice Plant- Contributing circa 1879 | Buildings are Historic Square and bathrooms are Not-Historic | HARC |
| 713 White Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peary Court Cemetery | Biennial reports to the National Park Service are required from the under the transfer of land agreement. HARC Staff redacts and send the report. First interment dates 1835 | Cemetery is Historic | HARC, FLSHPO, NPS |
| 1300 White Street 1020 United Street 1300 United Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • City Hall • Gym • SOS Kitchen | Glynn Archer School current City Hall- Contributing 1923-1927 Gym- Contributing 1927 | City Hall and Gym Historic SOS Kitchen- Historic altered | HARC |
| 1 Whitehead Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Key West Aquarium • Conch Tour Train Depot • Shipwreck Museum • Shops | Aquarium – Contributing 1933 | Only aquarium is Historic | HARC |

PROPERTIES OWNED BY THE CITY THAT REQUIRES HARC STAFF/ HARC COMMISSION INVOLVEMENT IN FIRST STAGES OF ANY PROPOSAL

| ADDRESS | BUILDING/SITE NAME | COMMENTS | CLASSIFICATION | RELEVANT BOARD OR REVIEW ^{1, 2, 3} |
|---|---|---|-------------------------|---|
| South End of Whitehead Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Southernmost Point buoy • Rev. Bishop Sculpture | Site is historic but sculpture and buoy are not | Historic site | HARC |
| 201 William Street | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Key West Ports Offices and Waterfront Building | Building built circa 1970 | Non-Historic | KWB, HARC, CRA |
| Pocket Parks/ Keys Energy 600 Block Grinnell Street 600 Block Louisa Street - Gato Park | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sculpture- Grinnell Street • House facade and cigar sculpture- Gato Park | | Non-Historic structures | PRAB & Key's Energy, HARC |
| All alterations of public Right-Of-Ways within the historic zoning districts. | | | | HARC |
| Pump Stations at 0 Simonton, 600 Block Greene, 200 Block Amelia Streets. | | | | HARC |
| All alterations of structures and sites under easement with the City within the historic zoning districts. | | | | CC- for easement approval, HARC |

BVRAC- Bahama Village Redevelopment Advisory Committee

CC- City Commission

CRA- Caroline Street Corridor and Bahama Village Community Redevelopment Area

FLSHPO- Florida State Historic Preservation Office- Department of State Division of Historical Resources

HARC- Historic Architectural Review Commission

KWB- Key West Bight Management District Board

NPS- National Park Service

PRAB- Parks and Recreation Advisory Board

1- Any proposed Development Plan, either Major or Minor, proposed changes to previously approved easements, proposed non-habitable height variances, shall be reviewed and approved by **City Commission or City Commission acting as the Board of Adjustments.**

2- Any proposed Development Plan, proposed projects that require variances from LDR's or conditional use, shall be reviewed and approved by **Planning Board.**

3- Any proposal that requires tree removal or that will impact regulated trees shall be reviewed and approved by **Tree Commission.**

Prepared March 8, 2019 Enid Torregrosa