



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, August 23, 2016

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

5:35 PM

Roll Call

Absent 1 - Chairman Green

Present 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Moody

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Approval of Agenda

A motion was made by Mr. Bert Bender, seconded by Ms. Lori Thompson, that the be Approved on the Consent Agenda. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

Approval of Minutes

1 July 26, 2016 (Regular)

A motion was made by Mr. Bert Bender, seconded by Ms. Letisia Powell, that the Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

HARC Planner's Report

Ms. Torregrosa was out ill, but Ms. Perkins let the Commissioners know that the Planning Board approved the ordinance for staff to approve small non historic demolition and projects, and it will now go forward to the City Commission.

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Mr. Ramsingh updated the Commissioners on the property at 616 Eaton.

Old Business

- 2 Replace existing carport- **#1421 Catherine Street- Meridian Engineering (H16-03-0042)**

Denied as it does not meet the HARC Guidelines on page 39, regarding demolition.

A motion was made by Mr. Bert Bender that the Action Item be Denied. The motion failed as there was no second.

- 3 Demolition of carport- **#1421 Catherine Street- Meridian Engineering (H16-03-0042)**

It was a split vote, the motion failed.

A motion was made by Ms. Thompson, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 3 - Mr. Bender, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 3 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, and Ms. Thompson

- 4 Demolition of existing house and shed- **#512 Amelia Street- Felix Pradas (H16-01-0022)**

There was an original motion to deny based on the HARC guidelines listed on page 39 regarding Demolitions by Mr. Bender and seconded by Ms. Powell. The motion failed from a split vote. The motion to approve also failed as it ended in a split vote.

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Mr. Moody, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 3 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Powell, and Ms. Thompson

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 3 - Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

- 5** Partial demolition of rear of house. Demolition of dilapidated accessory structure- **#1116 Varela Street- Affiliated Design and Construction (H16-03-0051)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

- 6** After the fact application. Paint commercial building blue color - **#922 Truman Avenue-Falby Builders (H16-01-0713)**

The client did not show up to the meeting, and Ms. Perkins notified the Commissioners that there was a Code Case on the property. The Commission chose to deny the "after the fact" application.

A motion was made by Mr. Moody, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Item be Denied. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

New Business

- 7** New side and rear addition. New outdoor pavilion. New deck, pool and fence- **#713 Galveston Lane- Guillermo Orozco (H16-03-0054)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

- 8** Demolition of side wall and rear addition- **#713 Galveston Lane- Guillermo Orozco (H16-03-0054)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Items be Postponed for 1 month. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

9 New roof deck on rear side of house- **#908 Packer Street- Michael Lepine (16-03-0055)**

The original vote failed, as it was a vote to approve and had a split vote.

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Postponed until the Full Board is present. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

10 Renovations to existing house. New rear addition. New fences and pool with water feature- **#1117 South Street- Anthony Sarno (H16-03-0056)**

A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, and Mr. Moody

11 Demolition of rear addition- **#1117 South Street- Anthony Sarno (H16-03-0056)**

A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, and Mr. Moody

12 Demolition of non-historic west side addition with no build-back. Patch historic structure where addition is removed- **#616 Eaton Street- William P. Horn (H16-03-0058)**

A motion was made by Ms. Thompson, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 2 - Mr. Bender, and Vice Chair McChesney

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 4 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, and Mr. Moody

13 Build new side addition to main house- **#1212 Margaret Street-
Artibus Design (H16-03-0059)**

The original motion to deny, ended in a split vote, so the motion failed.

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 2 - Mr. Bender, and Ms. Powell

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 4 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

14 Demolition of carport- **#1212 Margaret Street- Artibus Design
(H16-03-0059)**

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

15 Elevate and relocate existing house in same lot. New addition on rear-side of house. New foundations, ADA ramp and new wood front porch- **#209 Olivia Street- K2M/ Habitat for Humanity (H16-03-0060)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

16 Demolition of side additions and concrete front porch- **#209 Olivia Street- K2M/ Habitat for Humanity (H16-03-0060)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

17 New accessory structure on side- **#1007 A United Street- Bender and Associates (H16-03-0061)**

A motion was made by Mr. Moody, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Approved, with a motion to amend the fence and have Planning Department approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Mr. Bender

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 5 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

18 Demolition of existing shed- **#1007 A United Street- Bender and Associates (H16-03-0061)**

A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Mr. Moody, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Ms. Thompson

Recuse: 1 - Mr. Bender

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 4 - Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

19 New swimming pool and spa on side yard- **#1021 Washington Street- Evan Bell/ Richard Milelli (H16-03-0063)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Mr. Moody, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

20 New two-story frame house attached to portion of existing cbs one story structure. New pool, decks and fences- **#822 Sawyers Lane- William Shepler (H16-03-0064)**

A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, and Mr. Moody

21 Partial demolition of cbs structure- **822 Sawyers Lane- William Shepler (H16-03-0064)**

A motion was made by Ms. Powell, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Vice Chair McChesney

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, and Mr. Moody

22 Construction of 6 feet tall picket fence on front yard to enclose dumpster- **#1222 White Street- Liz Carpentry (H16-01-1042)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Powell, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Chairman Green

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Ms. Powell, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Mr. Moody

Comments from Commissioners

Adjournment