



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West, FL 33040

Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, February 8, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

**Call to Order
Pledge of Allegiance
Roll Call**

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, Bryan Green and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation planner Enid Torregrosa, IT support Ian Willis, Recording Secretary Patrick Wright, and Senior Planner Brendon Cunningham.

Approval of Agenda

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried

Approval of Minutes

1 January 11, 2011

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the minutes: the motion was seconded by Bryan Green. Motion carried.

Action Items

Old Business

2 Two story addition on rear, revisions to approved plans- #907-909 Emma Street- Gary Burchfield (H11-01-004)

Gary Burchfield presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

3 New pergola on rear of property-#623 Fleming Street- Gary Burchfield (H11-01-005)

Gary Burchfield presented the project. Mr. Burchfield approached the dais and reviewed the plans with the commissioners.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa stated that there was no staff report, but the revisions suggested by the commissioners that the pergola be the size of the cistern have been made.

Rudy Molinet clarified with Ron Ramsingh that they were approving the correct plans with the pergola being the size of the cistern.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

4 New second story addition on rear- #1125 Von Phister Street- Seatech Inc. (H11-01-060)

Ryan Lachapelle presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

New Business.

5. Second story addition on rear-#416 White Street- Wayne Smith, William Rowan, Susan Atkins (H10-01-764)

Wayne Smith and Susan Atkins presented the project. A court reporter was present.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler for discussion.

Daniel Metzler asked the applicant if they would consider installing a tree or planting on the right side of the building.

Mr. Smith stated that they could put planting on that portion.

Bryan Green stated he was not in support of the project because of the orientation and visibility of the addition.

Mr. Smith approached the dais to show photographs to the commissioners.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Green.

APPROVED

6 New wood awning, new parapet wall and paint-Code Compliance Case- #115 Whitehead Street- One Call Construction (H11-01-082)

David Pouliot presented the project.

No public comment.

Brendon Cunningham presented his staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Daniel Metzler for discussion.

Rudy Molinet clarified the materials and the correct terminology of the awning structure.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

7 Modification to previously approved plans (H10-01-334) for demolition of back addition and replacement- #711 Bakers Lane- Benders and Associates Architects (H11-01-106)

David Salay presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

The applicant corrected a typo in the plans concerning the height of the west wall from 8ft to 6ft.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the demolition; the motion was seconded by Bryan Green.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

8 Demolish existing back addition - #504-506 Catherine Street- Carlos Rojas AIA (H11-01-107)

Carlos Rojas recused himself from the dais.

Carlos Rojas presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the demolition; the motion was seconded by Bryan Greene.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

9 New elevated deck and revision to façade- #313 Truman Avenue- Schroeder Builders (H11-01-108)

Carlos Rojas recused himself from the dais.

Joe Schroeder presented the project.

Public comment:

Carlos Rojas 816 South Street

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Mr. Schroeder approached the dais and reviewed and discussed the plans with the commissioners.

Nils Muench asked staff to elaborate on the concern of mass and scale.

Mrs. Torregrosa stated that the additional second floor deck was overlooking a one story structure.

Bryan Green stated that he was in support of approval.

Daniel Metzler stated that he was concerned with mass and scale, as well as resembling a carport.

Rudy Molinet asked the applicant what the surface beneath the deck was.

Mr. Schroeder stated that it would be brick and act as a driveway.

Bryan Green asked the applicant if they would be willing to reduce the size of the deck.

Mr. Schroeder stated they would reduce it 6ft wide rather than the proposed 10ft wide.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve with the 6ft deck depth reduction from the face of the building to Terry Lane; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler for discussion.

Nils Muench recommended that the item be postponed so that plans for the deck reduction could come back before the commission. Mr. Muench expressed concern over conditional approvals.

Ron Ramsingh clarified that this would not be a conditional approval, but a modification to an application.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Muench

APPROVED

**10 Replacement of existing front porch and construction of new addition along the front- #611 Grinnell Street
Unit 1- Anthony D. Sarno / MBI-K2M Architects (H11-01-110)**

Anthony Sarno presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve the demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Daniel Metzler asked the applicant how close the addition would be to the street.

Mr. Sarno explained that it was in line with the house and set back about 8ft.

Bryan Green made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Green and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Rojas

APPROVED

HARC Planner's Report

Enid Torregrosa presented her draft revision to the guidelines concerning color. She requested that the commissioners e-mail their comments about the revision directly to her. Mrs. Torregrosa then presented her draft revision to the guidelines concerning solar collectors and skylights.

Comments from Commissioners

Ron Ramsingh stated that 936 United Street was issued a code violation, but a hearing with the magistrate has not been scheduled yet.

Bryan Green asked staff when the container case on Simonton Street would come back before the commission.

Enid Torregrosa stated that she would be putting the container case on Simonton Street on the next agenda.

Adjournment

Bryan Green made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench

Adjourned at 4:20

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.