

**THE CITY OF KEY WEST
Replacement of Tarpon Pier**

Bid Comparison - September 2012

		CENTRAL MARINE	EBSARY CONSTRUCTION	SHORELINE FOUNDATION	MARINE CONTRACTING GROUP	D. HIGGINS	M & J CONSTRUCTION	OTAK GROUP
Item Description	Quantity	Cost	Cost	Cost	Cost	Cost	Cost	Cost
Base Bid								
Mobilization, staging, and demobilization	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$100,000.00	\$115,000.00	\$100,114.81	\$50,000.00	\$144,000.00	\$171,600.00	\$92,996.00
Dismantle, relocate, and temporarily store King Fish Finger Piers	10	\$900 each	\$2,500 each	\$1,417.26 each	\$500 each	\$,635 each	\$5,605 each	\$1,260 each
		\$9,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$14,172.60	\$5,000.00	\$26,350.00	\$56,050.00	\$12,596.00
Reassemble Kingfish finger piers at end of project	10	\$900 each	\$3,300 each	\$1,770.49 each	\$500 each	\$1,055 each	\$5,121.20 each	\$1,125 each
		\$9,000.00	\$33,000.00	\$17,704.90	\$5,000.00	\$10,550.00	\$51,212.00	\$11,253.00
Demolition of existing wood and concrete Tarpon Pier	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$80,024.00	\$145,000.00	\$43,293.38	\$116,163.00	\$151,041.00	\$223,492.00	\$590,807.00
Furnish and install main floating access pier (12'w x 40'l)	480 SF	\$40.16 per SF	\$56 per SF	\$77.13 per SF	\$80 per SF	\$36.50 per SF	\$76.70 per SF	\$134 per SF
		\$19,277.00	\$26,880.00	\$37,022.40	\$38,400.00	\$17,520.00	\$36,816.00	\$64,430.00
Furnish and install main floating pier (10'w by 359'l)	3,590 SF	\$39.38 per SF	\$52 per SF	\$59.02 per SF	\$80 per SF	\$40 per SF	\$76.70 per SF	\$116 per SF
		\$141,374.00	\$186,680.00	\$211,881.80	\$287,200.00	\$143,600.00	\$275,353.00	\$414,937.00
Furnish and install finger piers at end (4'wx35'l)	280 SF	\$44.80 per SF	\$75 per SF	\$38.71 per SF	\$75 per SF	\$52 per SF	\$76.70 per SF	\$188 per SF
		\$12,544.00	\$21,000.00	\$10,838.80	\$21,000.00	\$14,560.00	\$21,476.00	\$52,737.00
Furnish and install piles 1-10 (18" dia)	10	\$7,069 each	\$7,700 each	\$6,065.13 each	\$7,000 each	\$8,900 each	\$11,151 each	\$8,594 each
		\$70,690.00	\$77,000.00	\$60,651.30	\$70,000.00	\$89,000.00	\$111,510.00	\$85,944.00
Furnish and install piles 11-14 (24" dia)	4	\$5,486 each	\$7,700 each	\$8,300.16 each	\$8,173 each	\$8,500 each	\$34,356 each	\$8,464 each
		\$21,944.00	\$30,800.00	\$33,200.64	\$32,692.00	\$34,000.00	\$137,824.00	\$33,857.00
Pile collars	14	\$366 each	\$975 each	\$211.94 each	\$450 each	\$640 each	\$300 each	\$1,172 each
		\$5,124.00	\$13,650.00	\$2,967.16	\$6,300.00	\$8,960.00	\$4,212.60	\$16,413.00
Furnish and install aluminum access ramp (5'wx30'l)	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$5,413.00	\$12,200.00	\$9,458.22	\$8,345.00	\$8,200.00	\$11,643.06	\$21,108.00
Furnish and install accessories (Cleats: main pier/tee)	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$0.00	\$8,670.00	\$10,808.94	\$3,570.00	\$5,508.00	\$7,221.60	\$12,196.00
Electrical system per HSA plans and specifications	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$36,960.00	\$185,000.00	\$191,469.64	\$214,445.00	\$151,000.00	\$57,843.60	\$181,907.00
Potable water system per HSA plans and specifications	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$73,800.00	\$40,200.00	\$96,639.35	\$31,845.00	\$77,200.00	\$52,720.04	\$177,632.00
Sewer system per HSA plans and specifications	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$0.00	\$39,500.00	\$68,664.97	\$31,845.00	\$54,200.00	\$57,584.00	\$126,397.00
Fire system per HSA plans and specifications	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$0.00	\$33,500.00	\$85,831.21	\$27,445.00	\$68,400.00	\$49,560.00	\$148,701.00
As-builts, product information, and warrenty certificate binder	1	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum	Lump Sum
		\$6,144.00	\$8,150.00	\$19,807.20	\$6,000.00	\$11,900.00	\$5,310.00	\$17,689.00
IPE decking for main pier	4,350 SF	\$0 per SF	\$9 per SF	\$14.13 per SF	\$10 per SF	\$15 per SF	\$29,50 per SF	\$13 per SF
		\$0.00	\$39,150.00	\$61,465.50	\$43,500.00	\$65,250.00	\$128,325.00	\$57,859.00
Total Base Bid		\$591,294.00	\$1,040,380.00	\$1,075,992.82	\$998,750.00	\$1,081,239.00	\$1,459,752.90	\$2,119,459.00

**THE CITY OF KEY WEST
Replacement of Tarpon Pier**

Bid Comparison Continued - September 2012

		CENTRAL MARINE	EBARY CONSTRUCTION	SHORELINE FOUNDATION	MARINE CONTRACTING GROUP	D. HIGGINS	M & J CONSTRUCTION	OTAK GROUP
Item Description	Quantity	Cost	Cost	Cost	Cost	Cost	Cost	Cost
Alternate Bid Item 1 (Finger Piers)								
Furnish and install finger piers (4'wx25'I) 20 total	2,000 SF	\$58.63 per SF	\$54 per SF	\$62.30 per SF	\$75 per SF	\$56 per SF	\$53.10 per SF	\$86 per SF
		\$117,260.00	\$108,000.00	\$124,600.00	\$150,000.00	\$112,000.00	\$106,200.00	\$171,671.00
Remove and dispose of existing outboard piles (sheet 7/9)	18	\$2,268 each	\$1,006 each	\$1,169.04 each	\$750 each	\$500 each	\$354 each	\$1,380 each
		\$40,824.00	\$18,108.00	\$21,042.72	\$13,500.00	\$9,000.00	\$6,372.00	\$24,841.00
Deduct cost for piles 11-14 (24" dia) in base bid	4	(\$0 each)	(\$7,000 each)	(\$5,086.49 each)	(\$5,430 each)	(\$8,500 each)	(\$11,151 each)	(\$367 each)
		\$0.00	-\$28,000.00	-\$20,345.96	-\$21,720.00	-\$34,000.00	\$44,604.00	-\$1,469.00
Piles 11-35 (18" dia)	25	\$7,069 each	\$4,850 each	\$5,285.91 each	\$7,000 each	\$8,700 each	\$9,676 each	\$6,145 each
		\$176,725.00	\$121,250.00	\$132,147.75	\$175,000.00	\$217,500.00	\$241,900.00	\$153,616.00
Pile collars (additional)	21	\$366 each	\$625 each	\$517.58 each	\$450 each	\$840 each	\$277.30 each	\$874 each
		\$7,686.00	\$13,125.00	\$10,869.18	\$9,450.00	\$17,640.00	\$5,823.30	\$18,362.00
Furnish and install accessories (Cleats: finger piers)	120	\$41 each	\$50 each	\$105.97 each	\$35 each	\$41 each	\$47.20 each	\$111 each
		\$4,920.00	\$6,000.00	\$12,716.40	\$4,200.00	\$4,920.00	\$5,664.00	\$13,348.00
IPE decking for finger piers	2,000 SF	\$0 per SF	\$9 per SF	\$14.13 per SF	\$10 per SF	\$15 per SF	\$29.50 per SF	\$15 per SF
		\$0.00	\$18,000.00	\$28,260.00	\$20,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$59,000.00	\$29,659.00
Subtotal Alternate Bid Item 1 (Finger Piers)		\$347,415.00	\$256,483.00	\$309,290.09	\$350,430.00	\$357,060.00	\$469,563.30	\$410,028.00
Alternate Bid Item 2 (Work under Addendum 1)								
Addendum 1 replacement of bracing Wahoo and Kingfish Piers	92	\$75 each	\$1,355 each	\$1,310.95 each	\$2,010 each	\$1,725 each	\$354 each	\$540 each
		\$6,900.00	\$124,660.00	\$120,607.40	\$184,920.00	\$158,700.00	\$32,568.00	\$49,716.00
Total Base Bid plus Alternative Bid Item 1 and 2		\$945,609.00	\$1,421,523.00	\$1,505,890.31	\$1,534,100.00	\$1,596,999.00	\$1,961,884.20	\$2,579,203.00
Alternate Bid Item 3 (Composite Decking)								
Furnish composite decking (main pier)	4,350 SF	\$0 per SF	\$1.20 per SF	\$1.41 per SF	\$1.00 per SF	\$0 per SF	\$29.50 per SF	\$0 per SF
		\$0.00	\$5,220.00	\$6,133.50	\$4,350.00	\$0.00	\$128,325.00	\$0.00
Furnish composite decking (finger piers)	2,000 SF	\$0 per SF	\$1.20 per SF	\$1.41 per SF	\$1.00 per SF	\$0 per SF	\$29.50 per SF	\$0 per SF
		\$0.00	\$2,400.00	\$2,820.00	\$2,000.00	\$0.00	\$59,000.00	\$0.00
Subtotal Alternate Bid Item 3: Indicate as an Additive or Deductive		\$0.00	\$7,620.00	\$8,953.50	\$6,350.00	\$0.00	\$187,325.00	\$0.00
Total Base Bid plus Alternate Bid Items 1, 2, and 3 (including 3 as an additive)		\$945,609.00	\$1,429,143.00	\$1,514,843.81	\$1,540,450.00	\$1,596,999.00	\$2,149,209.20	\$2,579,203.00