



THE CITY OF KEY WEST

Post Office Box 1409 Key West, FL 33041-1409 (305) 809-3700

**CULTURAL RESOURCES ASSESSMENT FOR BAHAMA VILLAGE CONNECTIVITY PROJECT
RFQ No. 18-003
EVALUATION PANEL RANKING MEETING
11:00 AM – 11:30 AM
SEPTEMBER 19, 2018**

Meeting Minutes

Location: Room 216, City Hall, 1300 White Street, Key West, FL

Subject: Qualifications Scoring and Recommendation

Attendees:

Members - Steve McAlearney, Kelly Crowe, Carolyn Sheldon, Kelly Perkins

Others: Jim Bouquet - Moderator

- I. Introduction: Ranking Committee members were introduced.
- II. Public Comment Period: No members of the public attended the publicly advertised meeting.
- III. Selection Committee – Each ranker presented raw scores by Selection Criteria for each firm. Scores were tabulated by the Moderator and average total calculated. As indicated on the attached Evaluation Proposal Ranking Sheet, rankings were as follows:

AECOM	82.75
Edwards-Pitman Environmental, Inc.	79.5
S&ME, Inc.	74.25



THE CITY OF KEY WEST

Post Office Box 1409 Key West, FL 33041-1409 (305) 809-3700

IV. Panel Discussion

Panel discussion focused selection of either AECOM or Edward-Pitman Environmental, Inc. (Pitman). In 2004, AECOM (then URS) prepared the Key West Historic Resource Survey report. Ms. Perkins, a selection committee member and City Historic Architectural Review Commission (HARC) staff member, indicated that the report “has not aged well”, questioning experience of field personnel and the quality of collected data. However, other committee members believed AECOM’s experience with Florida DOT would benefit the City.

Committee members did appreciate advantages of a smaller firm such as Pitman, particularly on the relatively limited geographic scope of the Key West project. A noted advantage was that Pitman focuses on NEPA/cultural assessment work, whereas the other two firms were larger conglomerates offering a wide range of non-cultural assessment related services.

Ultimately the selection committee agreed not to modify rankings and recommend the Key West City Commission enter into contract and fee negotiations with AECOM. The Negotiations team will demand reassurance from AECOM that only fully qualified personnel will be assigned to the project and internal peer review conducted before submitting deliverables to the City. The team will include a member City HARC staff familiar with the previous AECOM report.

Attachments: Evaluation Proposal Ranking Summary
 Raw Selection Committee Ranking Sheets
 Selection Committee Conflict of Interest Form - signed