

Scoring Sheet/Ranking Form

City of Key West
RFP 23-003 Independent Auditing Services



Selection Committee Meeting
Tuesday, November 28, 2023 11:00 AM
City Hall – City Manager Conference Room, Room 216

FINAL RANKING

Selection Committee

- Commissioner Kaufman** 1
- Tina Boan** 2
- Lisa Knowles** 3

Name of Project: RFP23-003 Independent Auditing Services

| SELECTION CRITERIA | POINTS ALLOWED | CliftonLarsonAllen LLP | | | Keefe McCollugh | | | Marcum LLP | | | Mauldin & Jenkins | | |
|--|----------------|------------------------|----|----|-----------------|-----|-----|------------|----|----|-------------------|----|----|
| | | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Firm Experience and Personnel | 40 | 28 | 39 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 34 | 39 | 40 | 34 | 40 | 40 |
| Audit/Technical Approach | 30 | 11 | 29 | 24 | 30 | 30 | 30 | 11 | 29 | 25 | 6 | 30 | 28 |
| Past Performance - References | 20 | 18 | 20 | 18 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 18 | 20 | 19 | 18 | 20 | 19 |
| Proposed Price for Work to Be Accomplished | 10 | 5 | 8 | 7 | 8 | 10 | 10 | 5 | 9 | 7 | 5 | 9 | 7 |
| Total Points | 100 | 62 | 96 | 89 | 98 | 100 | 100 | 68 | 97 | 91 | 63 | 99 | 94 |

| | | | | |
|-----------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| Total Score Group | 247 | 298 | 256 | 256 |
| Total Possible Score | 300 | 300 | 300 | 300 |
| Final Scoring Percent | 82% | 99% | 85% | 85% |

Scoring Sheet/Ranking Form

City of Key West
RFP 23-003 Independent Auditing Services



Selection Committee Meeting
Tuesday, November 28, 2023 11:00 AM
City Hall – City Manager Conference Room, Room 216

SCORE SHEET

Name of Evaluator: **Commissioner Sam Kaufman**

Name of Project: **RFP23-003 Independent Auditing Services**

| SELECTION CRITERIA | POINTS ALLOWED | POINTS EARNED | | | |
|--|----------------|----------------------------|--------------------|------------------|----------------------|
| | | CliftonLarson Allen LLP | Keefe McCollugh | Marcum LLP | Mauldin & Jenkins |
| Firm Experience and Personnel | 40 | 28 | 40 | 34 | 34 |
| Audit/Technical Approach | 30 | 28 11 | 30 | 28 11 | 28 6 |
| Past Performance - References | 20 | 18 | 20 | 18 | 18 |
| Proposed Price for Work to Be Accomplished | 10 | 5 | 8 | 5 | 5 |
| Total Points | 100 | 62 | 98 | 68 | 63 |

Signature



Scoring Sheet/Ranking Form

City of Key West
RFP 23-003 Independent Auditing Services



Selection Committee Meeting
Tuesday, November 28, 2023 11:00 AM
City Hall – City Manager Conference Room, Room 216

SCORE SHEET

Name of Evaluator: Tina Boan

Name of Project: RFP23-003 Independent Auditing Services

| SELECTION CRITERIA | POINTS ALLOWED | POINTS EARNED | | | |
|--|----------------|----------------------------|--------------------|------------|----------------------|
| | | CliftonLarson Allen LLP | Keefe McCollugh | Marcum LLP | Mauldin & Jenkins |
| Firm Experience and Personnel | 40 | 39 | 40 | 39 | 40 |
| Audit/Technical Approach | 30 | 29 | 30 | 29 | 30 |
| Past Performance - References | 20 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 20 |
| Proposed Price for Work to Be Accomplished | 10 | 8 | 10 | 9 | 9 |
| Total Points | 100 | 96 | 100 | 97 | 99 |

Signature

Scoring Sheet/Ranking Form

City of Key West
RFP 23-003 Independent Auditing Services



Selection Committee Meeting
Tuesday, November 28, 2023 11:00 AM
City Hall – City Manager Conference Room, Room 216

SCORE SHEET

Name of Evaluator: Lisa Knowles

Name of Project: RFP23-003 Independent Auditing Services

| SELECTION CRITERIA | POINTS ALLOWED | POINTS EARNED | | | |
|--|----------------|----------------------------|--------------------|------------|----------------------|
| | | CliftonLarson Allen LLP | Keefe McCollugh | Marcum LLP | Mauldin & Jenkins |
| Firm Experience and Personnel | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 | 40 |
| Audit/Technical Approach | 30 | 24 | 30 | 25 | 28 |
| Past Performance - References | 20 | 18 | 20 | 19 | 19 |
| Proposed Price for Work to Be Accomplished | 10 | 7 | 10 | 7 | 7 |
| Total Points | 100 | 89 | 100 | 91 | 94 |

Signature

Lisa Knowles