

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Agenda Packet

August 31, 2010 – 3:00 p.m.

City Commission Chamber
Old City Hall, 510 Greene Street



Item 4

HARC Meeting Minutes – July 27, 2010

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Meeting Minutes

July 27, 2010 – 3:00 p.m.

City Hall- Habana Plaza

Conference Room, 3140 Flagler Avenue



The Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission held a public hearing on **Tuesday, July 27, 2010 at 3:00 p.m.**, in the Conference room City Hall- Habana Plaza located at 3140 Flagler Avenue.

1. **Roll Call** Board members present included Rudy Molinet, Carlos Rojas, and Chairman Peter Batty.
2. **Pledge of Allegiance**
3. **Approval of Agenda** Enid Torregrosa noted that Item 5a2 had requested to be postponed until the next meeting, and Item 5b1 has been withdrawn by the applicant.

Carlos Rojas stated that Item 5a1 would have to be postponed until the next meeting due to the fact that he is the applicant and there would not be a quorum if he recused himself.

4. **Approval of Minutes**
 - a. HARC Meeting Minutes – **June 8, 2010**
 - b. HARC Meeting Minutes - **June 22, 2010**

Rudy Molinet made a motion to approve the minutes; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas

5. **Items for Public Hearing**
 - a. **Old Business**
 1. Request for demolition of back portion and new construction – **#313 Truman Avenue – Applicant: Carlos Rojas, Architect (H10-01-77)** – Demolish non contributing second addition and replace with two story addition.

POSTPONED UNTIL NEXT MEETING

2. Request for demolition of non historic structures, new construction and restoration of historic house- **# 911 Watson Lane- Applicant: Matthew Stratton, Architect (H10-01-94)** – Demolish non-historic additions and accessory structures, including: enclosed L-shaped shed roof addition at NW corner of historic structure, covered side porch with shed roof along entire length of south elevation, gable roof addition on the north side of the building, a “pop-up” rooftop structure, a free standing pool house on north corner of property, a free standing 16’ by 24’ gable roof accessory structure at the rear of the property, and the in-ground concrete swimming pool. Restore front elevation include: replacement of french doors with pair of wood 6 over 6 double hung windows, replace front door with solid 4 panel wood door, and restore the gable louvered vent. Restore historic roofline over front 24’ (+/-) of structure, utilizing salvaged historic rafters from rear 12’ of structure. Install new Galvalume v-crimp roof at historic structure and porch. Patch and paint existing wood novelty siding, trim and rafter tails. Replace three existing doors at historic window opening locations on side elevations with new wood windows. Add 650 sq. ft. addition to south side of historic structure, 232 sq. ft. addition at rear of historic structure, and 1,000 sq. ft. addition at north side of historic structure. Add wood awning and porch at south elevation at existing door location. Tile existing concrete porch floor. Site improvements include a new lap pool, splash pool,

pool decking, 10' by 10' cabana and observation tower, a 4' tall curved concrete garden wall, 8' tall louvered garden walls, louvered panels and gates at existing carport, tiered 6'-12" concrete planters behind pool, wood picket fencing at side and rear yards, and brick paving for sidewalk and driveway.

POSTPONED UNTIL NEXT MEETING

3. Request to replace porch columns-# **936 United Street- Applicant: Wayne Garcia (H10-01-92)**- Repair porch and balconies. Replace wood columns as per plans submitted.

Carlos Rojas disclosed to the commission that on Friday July 16, 2010 at 8:00am he along with Enid Torregrosa and John Woodson had a meeting with the applicant and his attorney to discuss life safety issues and the columns on the project. He then stated that George Galvan also had a meeting directly after Carlos's meeting was finished.

Wayne Garcia represented the project. He stated that the only person qualified to design structural columns under the Florida Building Code is a registered professional engineer or a registered architect, therefore he personally can't design these columns. The current engineer insists on a six by six chamfered column. He added that the engineer wrote a letter to John Woodson noting the deteriorated condition of the porch. The first floor railing was not original, but is necessary to follow life safety codes.

Chief Building Official John Woodson stated that he urged the commission to not table this item due to safety issues.

Public comment: Kent Ducote

Enid Torregrosa stated that her staff report had not been updated since the last meeting. She reviewed the letter from the engineer and reviewed the application history of this project. She also reviewed the Residential Florida Building Code Section 101-2, and the Florida Existing Building code chapter 11 section 1101-0 as applied. She added that since this house is contributing there must be a compromise to retain its historic integrity.

John Woodson stated that there can not be a compromise because the engineer stated that it was unsafe.

Wayne Garcia said he could not divert from the plans the engineer had approved.

Carlos Rojas asked Mr. Woodson if section 502.3 of the building code applied.

John Woodson stated that he can not accept the plans unless they are sealed.

Ron Ramsingh stated that because this was an after the fact application, not all blame can be put upon the City.

Rudy Molinet clarified that the letter from the architect did not state specifically state that the six by six column is the only way to have the appropriate structural support. He cited the HARC guidelines from page 32 section 1, that the porch must be repaired with materials that replicate the original features.

Rudy Molinet made a motion to deny the application; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas for discussion.

Peter Batty stated that the safety issue should have been addressed before the original demolition.

Rudy Molinet asked if the structure is currently braced, Mr. Woodson confirmed it was braced. Mr. Molinet then added that the applicant and the engineer should consider the guidelines when designing a historical renovation.

Rudy Molinet Made a motion to deny based on page 32 sections 1; page 33 sections 3, 4, 5,7,15, and 16

Carlos Rojas added a friendly amendment to Mr. Molinet's motion, Florida Building Code for existing buildings Chapter 11 Sec. 1102-3 under section 502.3 for repairs in a historic building, replacement, or partial replacement of existing or missing features that match the original in configuration, height, size, and original methods of construction shall be permitted

Rudy Molinet accepted this amendment.

Carlos Rojas seconded the motion.

The Chairman requested the Clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Molinet, Rojas, and Chairman Batty

Nays: None

DENIED

b. New Business

1. Second floor addition and lanai at pool- **#710 Bakers Lane rear- Applicant: Michael Skoglund Architect (H10-01-97)**. Complete partial structure into two bedroom and two and a half bathroom unit with lanai at pool.

WITHDRAWN

2. Major Development Plan- Request to demolish non historic addition and exterior staircase and construction of new frame building, new exterior staircase, restoration of existing structures, new swimming pool and site improvements- **#802-804-806 and 808 Whitehead Street, #324 Petronia Street, #809-811 Terry Lane- Applicant: Michael B. Ingram- MBI-K2M Architecture (H10-01-101)**- #802-804 Whitehead- removal of single story addition and replace with 35'-0" by 30'-2" by 25'-7" high addition plus single story 30'-0" by 7'-7" addition on south elevation. Repairs of existing structure and painting. Existing sales pavilion to remain with addition of bathrooms on west end. Paint white. Existing cistern/bar to remain and reuse as walk in cooler, infill to be wood white lattice, Compressor equipment housed in louvered boxed area to eliminate visual clutter. #324 Petronia Street-Existing building to remain. Remove awning section on north elevation, replace with section to match side profile. Signage as shown, building to be painted. Remove stair at east side. Market place pavilion to remain, Petronia Street end to be enclosed. Remove deteriorated wood/ glass doors and leave open. Paint white. #808 Whitehead Street Repair and replace wood siding to match. Replace wood windows with Marvin wood true divided light units with smallest muntins. Replace one window with four panel wood door. Porch railings to be in filled with 2 by 2 balusters. Paint. This building will contain three units for living. New control pavilion painted white. Existing sales booth for HTA trolleys relocated from corner of Petronia

Street to Whitehead Street. Site improvements including refuse area, fences, new swimming pool with water feature, parking area and landscape.

Michael Ingram presented the project. He stated that they were proposing to remove retail carts, a stair case, a non-historic back addition on building A., and a bandstand in the center of the property.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that none of the structures being proposed for demolition were historic. The main historic structure was built in 1895, although the footprint and the wrap around porch have changed over the years. Staff recommends approval for the demolition.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the demolition; it was seconded by Rudy Molinet. Motion carried.

APPROVED

3. Open enclosed front porch, rebuild front façade and replace all windows- **#1503 South Street- Applicant: John Castro (H10-01-133)**. Create new front porch. Change all windows. Paint white.

John Castro presented the project. He stated that he proposed to bring back a front porch that was originally there and had been enclosed over the years. He added that he wants to add impact windows on the non-historic portion of the building, as well as removal of the aluminum jalousie.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that the original windows are operable, and the owners are keeping the original shutters. Staff recommends approval.

Rudy Molinet pointed out the fence is non-historic looking.

Rudy Molinet made a motion to approve the application; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

APPROVED

4. Remove dormer, reduce dormer in size and site improvements- Code Compliance Case- **#718 Bakers Lane- Applicant Thomas Kelly (H10-01-136)**. Pictures of code violation. Eliminate dormer, reduce dormer sizes. Proposed new deck and pool.

Thomas Kelly represented the project. He stated that they diminished some of the dormers and removed one, as well as dropping the roof line. He added that a deck and pool were proposed along with replacing a window with a door. He then showed plans to the commission.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated the house has been altered with a second floor addition. She added that this is an after the fact case, therefore she does not make a recommendation to the commission.

Peter Batty asked Mrs. Torregrosa if deemed the current proposed plans acceptable. Mrs. Torregrosa stated that the plans as submitted are acceptable.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the plans as submitted; it was seconded for discussion by Rudy Molinet.

Rudy Molinet asked Mr. Kelly to clarify what portion of the house previously existed.

Tomas Kelly stated that the footprint was the same.

Enid Torregrosa stated that there is a bump out on the back portion of the house that had previously received Building Department and HARC approval.

Motion carried.

APPROVED

5. Revision to previously approved plans- # **510 Elizabeth Street- Applicant: Thomas E. Pope Architect (H10-01- 174)**. Revisions to previously approved H09-08-28-981 including shed, pool and fencing.

Tom Pope represented the project. He stated that the biggest concern was a secondary portion of the house that is set back 20ft from the right-of-way. The side elevation had not changed sometimes, however the rear porch is going to have an extension of the main gable there by making the porch roof a shed roof. He added that they are extending the porch across the secondary addition on the back elevation.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed her staff report. She stated that scale and mass are sensitive in this area the building will be situated next to a lane and will have a picket fence 4 feet high in the front and corner and at approximately 36 feet from the front property line a six foot picket fence will be installed She added that there will be 2 over 2 windows instead of 6 over 6. Staff recommends approval for the plans proposed; however they will need to submit plans and a new application for the proposed shed.

Rudy Molinet made a motion to approve; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

APPROVED

6. Historic Preservation Planner's Report

Enid Torregrosa reviewed projects that were going before the special magistrate, she also reviewed HARC's position and duty under Federal and State regulations. She presented to the commission literature and specifications about a new product called Nansulate Translucent PT that can reduce thermal emissivity for metal roofs. The material is a clear coat. She ordered a gallon and added that she plans on testing a new sustainable coating for metal roofs.

7. Comments from Commissioners

Rudy Molinet asked staff for any new information concerning the temporary fence at the watermark property.

Enid Torregrosa stated that they had a meeting to discuss bringing their fence into compliance with HARC regulations and that in the future the application will be presented in front of the commission, therefore no further discussion will be appropriate for this issue.

8. Adjournment

Rudy Molinet made a motion to adjourn; it was seconded by Carlos Rojas. Motion carried.

Interested parties may appear at the public hearing(s) and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at www.keywestcity.com.

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

ADA ASSISTANCE: If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m., or information on access available to individuals with disabilities. To request materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), please call 305-809-1000 for assistance.

Please note that one or more City Commission and or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.

DRAFT