

**THE CITY OF KEY WEST
PLANNING BOARD
Staff Report**



To: Chair and Planning Board members

From: Patrick Wright, Planner II

Through: Thaddeus Cohen, Planning Director

Meeting Date: March 17, 2016

Agenda Item: **Final Determination of Award for Year 3 Building Permit Allocation System (BPAS) Applications pursuant to Section 108-997 of the Land Development Regulations of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Key West, Florida**

Request: Approval of the final rankings of Year 3 (July 1, 2015 – June 30, 2016) BPAS applications for award of 7 market-rate and 14.72 affordable housing units.

Background:

During the first three years of BPAS, 60% of the units must be affordable. BPAS Year 2 awards were 31 market rate units and 44.1 affordable units. In Year 2 there was an advance award of 8.46 units from the Year 3 BPAS.

BPAS Year 3 covers the application cycle between July 1, 2015 and June 30, 2016. The total available units for Year 3 are 36 market-rate units, and 46.54 affordable units. The Year 3 application final closing date was September 30, 2015. The City received six (6) BPAS applications requesting a total of 14.72 affordable housing equivalent single family units (ESFUs) and 7 market-rate units.

The Year 3 BPAS applications are summarized in the following table:

YEAR 3 BPAS APPLICATIONS						
	725 Duval Street	2 Go Lane	2303 Linda Avenue	2700-2706 Flagler Ave.	Poinciana Gardens	1412 Johnson Street
Existing / Recognized Units	0	0	0	29	50	1
New Market Rate (ESFU)	5	1	1	0	0	0
New Affordable (ESFU)	2	0	1	.8	10.8	.78
Total Units (non-ESFU)	7	1	2	2.9	158	2
Zoning	HRCC-1	SF	SF	SF	MDR	SF
Max Density (du/acre)	22	8	8	8	16	8
Land Area (SF)	10,892	4,484	7,048	3,773,642	41,702,638	7,040
Land Area (AC)	0.25004	0.1029	0.10656	86.63	957.3	.1616
Proposed Density (du/acre)	27.991	9.7138	0.1617	FAR Based	FAR Based	12.371

Analysis:

Staff evaluated, scored and ranked the final BPAS applications according to prerequisites and criteria outlined in City Code Section 108-997(b) and (c). The resulting scores and final rankings are attached. Staff evaluation of the final applications is summarized in score review sheets, which are included at the beginning of each attached application package.

Pursuant to City Code Section 108-995, 36 market-rate units are available for Year 3 (July 1, 2015 – June 30, 2016) of the BPAS. The following market-rate projects are recommended for award:

YEAR 3 MARKET-RATE BPAS APPLICATIONS RECOMMENDED FOR AWARD						
Rank	Project	Units Requested	ESFU Factor	ESFUs Requested	Major/Minor Renovation	Score
1	725 DUVAL STREET	5	5.00	5	Major	55
2	2 GO LANE	1	1.00	1	Minor	50
3	2303 LINDA AVE.	1	1.00	1	Major	25
Total		7	7.00	7		

Pursuant to City Code Section 108-995, 39.1 affordable units were available for Year 3 (July 1, 2015 – June 30, 2016) of the BPAS. The following affordable projects are recommended for award:

YEAR 3 AFFORDABLE BPAS APPLICATIONS RECOMMENDED FOR AWARD						
Rank	Project	Units Requested	ESFU Factor	ESFUs Requested	Major/Minor Renovation	Score
1	2700-2706 FLAGLER AVE.	8	.10	.8	Major	60
2	725 DUVAL STREET	2	.78	1.56	Major	55
3	1412 JOHNSON STREET	1	.78	.78	Minor	50
4	POINCIANA GARDENS	108	.10	10.8	Major	25
5	2303 LINDA AVENUE	1	.78	.78	Major	25
Total		120	14.72	14.72		

This brings the total Year 3 request to 14.72 affordable units and 7 market rate units.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning Department, based on the criteria established by the Comprehensive Plan and the Land Development Regulations, recommends to the Planning Board **APPROVAL** of the final Year 3 BPAS rankings, the award of 14.72 affordable and 7 market-rate units.

BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 3 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: Bert Bender: June Klausing

Site Address: 1412 Johnson

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 1 affordable accessory unit

General Planning Comments

Missing in Application Package
#2 = Solutions Statement Part (a) is not included.

Prerequisite Development Type: Minor Renovation

Prerequisites: Minor Renovation.

Demonstrate water and energy use 15% below the Florida Building Code using recognized energy and water rating standards.

Staff comment: VERIFIED

Point System: One or two non-transient units.

<u>Criteria (Points)</u>	<u>Applicant</u>	<u>Staff</u>
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment:		
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+10) Staff comment:	10	0
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Silver (+30) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Scoresheet ranks gold.	30	30
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40) Staff comment:		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2— Platinum (+60) Staff comment:		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$1,000 or more (+10) Staff comment:		
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED.	10	10
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5) Staff comment:		
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10) Staff comment:		
10. Roofing materials with solar reflectance index (SRI) of at least 29 (+5) Staff comment:		
11. Designing the buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area. (+15) Staff comment:		
Total:	50	40

BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 3 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: KW Housing Authority

Site Address: Poinciana Plaza

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 108 Nursing Home Units

General Planning Comments

Memo from Progressive dated September 28, 2015 is not an appropriate Solutions Statement. Revisit Application item D = #2 a and b, and #11 (Exhibit E)

Also: Love the meditation garden. Please include an ADA accessible Community Garden when you go forward for the Major Development Plan.

Prerequisite Development Type: Major Construction

Prerequisites: Major Construction/Renovation.

A) Baseline green building certification required

Staff comment: VERIFIED. Gold level on score sheet.

B) First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation

Staff comment: VERIFIED.

C) Rainwater catchment system required

Staff comment: VERIFIED. 30,000 gallons cited on map.

Point System: Three or more non-transient units

<i>Criteria (Points)</i>	<i>Applicant</i>	<i>Staff</i>
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment:	0	0
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED. All 108 units are deemed affordable	5	5
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 1 —Silver (+30)		
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40)		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 3— Platinum (+60)		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$5,000 or more (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED. AIPP	10	10
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment:	0	0
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5)		
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10)		
10. Additional on-site open space or on-site recreational facilities (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED.	10	10
11. Buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area (+15)		
Total:	25	25

BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 3 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: **Trepanier for 725 Duval** **Site Address:** 725 Duval

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 5 Market-Rate & 2 Affordable Unit(s)

General Planning Comments

--

Prerequisite Development Type: Major Construction/Renovation

A) Baseline green building certification required Staff comment: VERIFIED. Provided FGBC Score sheet indicates a Silver rating.
B) First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation Staff comment: VERIFIED. In X Zone and is finished floor of habitable space is on second floor.
C) Rainwater catchment system required Staff comment: VERIFIED: 5,500 square feet = 5,500 gallons.

Point System: Three or more non-transient units

<u>Criteria (Points)</u>	<u>Applicant</u>	<u>Staff</u>
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED. On second floor in X Zone	5	5
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+5)		
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 1 —Silver (+30) Staff comment: VERIFIED. Provided FGBC Score sheet indicates a Silver rating.	30	30
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40)		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 3— Platinum (+60)		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$5,000 or more (+10)		
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Certificate provided.	10	10
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5)		
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED.	10	10
10. Additional on-site open space or on-site recreational facilities (+10) Staff comment: NOT VERIFIED. If site is non-compliant for open space, then the extra supplied is still below code. Providing an extra 540 square feet when the entire property is still 3,255 square feet below code doesn't fit the intention of this category.	10	0
11. Buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area (+15)		
Total:	65	55

BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 3 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: Bill Horn for Arch Diocese of Miami (Catholic Charities) **Site Address:** 2700-2706 Flagler

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 8 Affordable Unit(s)

General Planning Comments

--

Prerequisites: Major Construction/Renovation.

A) Baseline green building certification required
Staff comment: VERIFIED: Solutions Statement and Score sheet indicate a Silver Certification level.

B) First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation
Staff comment: VERIFIED: Solutions Statement and Plans indicate first floor elevation of this AE8 zone will be at least 9.75' in an AE8

C) Rainwater catchment system required
Staff comment: VERIFIED: Solutions Statement states that Building F = 3,224 gallons & Building G = 2,314 gallons.

Point System: Three or more non-transient units

<u>Criteria (Points)</u>	<u>Applicant</u>	<u>Staff</u>
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Plans show first finished floor elevation to be at 9.75' in an AE8 zone.	5	5
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: All nursing units to be deed restricted affordable.	5	5
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 1 —Silver (+30) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Solutions Statement and Score sheet indicate a Silver Certification level.	30	30
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40)		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 3— Platinum (+60)		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$5,000 or more (+10)		
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED	10	10
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5)		
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10)		
10. Additional on-site open space or on-site recreational facilities (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED: 53.5% proposed versus 35% required.	10	10
11. Buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area (+15)		
Total:	60	60

**BLANK TEMPLATES
BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 3 APPLICATIONS**

Applicant: Jeff Grene for Bruce Van Allen

Site Address: 2303 Linda Ave

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: _1_ Market-Rate & _1_ Affordable Unit(s)

General Planning Comments

None.

Prerequisites: Major Construction/Renovation.

A) Baseline green building certification required

Staff comment: VERIFIED: FGBC Score card reflects Bronze rating.

B) First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation

Staff comment: VERIFIED: Solutions Statement says 4' above BFE in an AE8 zone.

C) Rainwater catchment system required

Staff comment: VERIFIED: Two 1,000 gallon cisterns are shown on the Site Plans.

Point System: One or two non-transient units.

Criteria (Points)	Applicant	Staff
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Solutions Statement says 4' above BFE in an AE8 zone, Site plans show 4'3" above BFE.	5	5
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+10)		
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Silver (+30)		
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40)		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2— Platinum (+60)		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$1,000 or more (+10)		
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10)		
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Electric car charging is mentioned in Solutions Statement and shown on Site Plans.	5	5
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED:	10	10
10. Roofing materials with solar reflectance index (SRI) of at least 29 (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: SRI of 94 is shown on the Site Plans for the roof areas.	5	5
11. Designing the buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area. (+15)		
Total:	25	25

BLANK TEMPLATES
BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 3 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: Oropeza for William Arnold, Jr

Site Address: 2 Go Lane

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 1 Market-Rate

General Planning Comments

The general description is confusing. They are applying for one market, but also note they want another market and two accessories?

Prerequisites: Minor Renovation.

Demonstrate water and energy use 15% below the Florida Building Code using recognized energy and water rating standards.

Staff comment: VERIFIED. Achieving FGBC Gold will far surpass a 15% reduction.

Point System: One or two non-transient units.

<i>Criteria (Points)</i>	<i>Applicant</i>	<i>Staff</i>
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED. Writing on Site Plan is tiny, but it looks like BFE is 8' and First finished floor is at least 14'	5	5
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+10)		
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Silver (+30) VERIFIED: FGBC Score sheet reflects Gold.	30	30
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40) Staff comment:		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2— Platinum (+60)		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$1,000 or more (+10) Staff comment:		
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Certificate provided	10	10
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Shown on Site Plan.	5	5
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10) Staff comment:		
10. Roofing materials with solar reflectance index (SRI) of at least 29 (+5)		
11. Designing the buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area. (+15)		
Total:	50	50