



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, April 26, 2016

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

5:30 PM

Roll Call

Absent 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney

Present 5 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Approval of Agenda

Approval of Minutes

1 March 22, 2016

A motion was made by Mr. Bert Bender, seconded by Ms. Janet Hinkle, that the Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

HARC Planners Report

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Old Business

- 2** Renovations to house, including new replacement wood windows, new front façade configuration, relocation of a/c over roof with guardrail, and site improvements - **#702 Pearl Street - David Knoll (H15-01-1665)**
- A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Items be Approved with the condition that the Air Conditioner be located to rearyard. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Absent:** 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 5 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 3** Partial demolition of side and rear additions with no build back - **#702 Pearl Street - David Knoll (H15-01-1665)**
- A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Absent:** 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 5 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green
- 4** Install new pool and deck. Relocate existing propane tank. No perimeter wall will be removed - **#313 Truman Avenue - McIntyre Construction (H15-01-1900)**
- A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Recuse:** 1 - Ms. Thompson
- Absent:** 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 4 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, and Chairman Green
- 5** Demolition of existing shed and removed side deck - **#313 Truman Avenue - McIntyre Construction (H15-01-1900)**
- A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Recuse:** 1 - Ms. Thompson
- Absent:** 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney
- Yes:** 4 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, and Chairman Green
- 6** New pool house and relocate pool equipment - **#1109 Virginia Street - Wayne Garcia (H16-01-0002)**
- A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Absent:** 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

7 Demolition of rear accessory structure - **#1109 Virginia Street - Wayne Garcia (H16-01-0002)**

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Bender, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

8 **WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT**

Renovations to contributing house. New second floor addition with front roof deck. New swimming pools and site improvements, including two off street parking spaces - **#1216 Margaret Street - Anthony Architecture (H16-03-0020)**

9 **WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT**

Partial demolition of roof. Demolition of rear sheds, rear addition, and side addition - **#1216 Margaret Street - Anthony Architecture (H16-03-0020)**

New Business

10 One neon wall sign and one wood hanging sign with copy "Gas Monkey Bar Grill" - **#217 Duval Street- Gary Burchfield (H16-01-253)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item for the hanging sign be approved and the Action Item for the Neon sign be denied, based on Guidelines 18 & 19 of page 50.

Absent: 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

11 Remove asphalt shingles and replace with metal v-crimp. Install modified bitumen roof on flat section- **#600 Eaton Street- Jones Fellowship Hall- Keys Roofing (H16-01-342)**

A motion was made by Ms. Thompson, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 2 - Mr. Bender, and Chairman Green

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 4 - Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Vice Chair McChesney

- 12** New sawtooth roof on rear and increase in height rear walls in order to accommodate the new roof- **#307 Truman Avenue- Tomca Kier Construction (H16-01-388)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

- 13** Demolition of rear shed roof and removal of rear canvas awning.
Demolition of non-historic shed- **#307 Truman Avenue- Tomca Kier Construction (H16-01-388)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 2 - Ms. Powell, and Vice Chair McChesney

Yes: 5 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

- 14** Request for a Certificate of Non-Contributing Value- **#6 Pinder Lane- Susan Cardenas (H16-01-473)Second Reading**

Vice Chairman McChesney arrived at the meeting at 6:53 pm -The said property is coming back to the May 24, 2016 for a second reading

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 15** Partial demolition of roof to accommodate proposed dormers- **#6 Pinder Lane- Susan Cardenas (H16-01-473) Second Reading**

coming back to the May 24, 2016 for a second reading

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesney, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 16** Replace rear shed roof with gable roof. Replace exterior board and batten siding with lap siding. Change of window configurations. Replacement of sliding doors- **#1310 Royal Street- Perez Engineering (H16-01-002)**

A motion was made that the Action Items be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 2 - Ms. Hinkle, and Ms. Thompson

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 4 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 17** Demolition of rear shed roof- **#1310 Royal Street- Perez Engineering (H16-01-002)**

A motion was made that the Action Items be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 2 - Ms. Hinkle, and Ms. Thompson

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 4 - Mr. Bender, Mr. Logan, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 18** Changes on rear of house including addition to second floor porch. New side staircase with deck. Changes of width of front porch stoop. New roof on rear portion of house- **#615 Angela Street- William Rowan (H16-03-016)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 19** Demolition of rear walls. Demolition of two existing staircases and partial demolition of rear roof- **#615 Angela Street- William Rowan (H16-03-016)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 20** New lanai with gable roof. Changes of window's configurations.
Addition of railings on roof decks. New mechanical equipment on roof-
#1415 Alberta Street - Robert Delaune (H16-03-019)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 21** Demolition of existing flat roof lanai. Demolition of shed- **#1415 Alberta Street - Robert Delaune (H16-03-019)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 22** Changes of front facades to two non-contributing buildings.
Replacement of windows, doors, and siding. Replace front entry roof.
Site improvements and new color scheme- **#1017 Windsor Lane- A2O Architecture (H16-03-025)**

A motion was made by Ms. Thompson, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 23** Demolition of front entry roof. Demolition of front wall/ fence.
Demolition of wood staircase and sheds- **#1017 Windsor Lane- A2O Architecture (H16-03-025)**

A motion was made by Ms. Thompson, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

- 24** Changes to fenestrations- **#608 Ashe Street- Anthony Sarno (H16-03-026)**

A motion was made by Mr. Logan, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair
McChesney, and Chairman Green

25 Demolition of existing side staircase- **#608 Ashe Street- Anthony Sarno (H16-03-026)**

A motion was made by Mr. Bender, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 6 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair
McChesney, and Chairman Green

26 New one-story wood frame accessory structure- **#715 Frances Street- William Shepler (H16-03-029)**

A motion was made that the Action Items be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 2 - Mr. Logan, and Ms. Thompson

Absent: 1 - Ms. Powell

Yes: 4 - Mr. Bender, Ms. Hinkle, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

27 New frame house. New swimming pool, deck, and fences. Shoring of an exterior wall - **#822 Sawyers Lane- William Shepler (H16-03-030)**

as requested by Applicant

Postponed

28 Demolition of one-story cbs structure- **#822 Sawyers Lane - William Shepler (H16-03-030)**

as requested by applicant

Postponed

Public Comments

Comments from Commisioners

Adjournment

9:00 PM