



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

To: Jim Scholl, City Manager

From: Enid Torregrosa, Historic Preservation Planner

Through: Donald L. Craig, AICP, Interim Planning Director

Subject: Response to Request for Proposals (RFP) #007-11
Key West Historic Resource Survey 2011
Evaluation Committee Top Three (3) Proposals

ACTION STATEMENT:

Purpose of this resolution is to request approval by the City Commission for the following:

- Accept the ranking of the Top Three (3) Proposals by the Evaluation Committee:
 1. Panamerican Consultants, Inc.
 2. GAI Consultants, Inc.
 3. New South Associates, Inc.
- Authorizing the Evaluation Committee to negotiate a contract with the highest ranked proposer, **Panamerican Consultants, Inc.** In the event the Evaluation Committee is unsuccessful in negotiating a contract with the highest ranked proposal, authorizing the Evaluation Committee to negotiate a contract with the second highest ranked proposer, **GAI Consultants, Inc.**, and, in the event the Evaluation Committee is unsuccessful in negotiating a contract with the second highest ranked proposer, authorizing the Evaluation Committee to negotiate a contract with the third highest ranked proposer, **New South Associates, Inc.**
- If the Evaluation Committee is unsuccessful in negotiating an acceptable contract with any of the three (3) highest ranked proposers the Evaluation Committee will cease discussions with all proposers and report back to the City Commission.

If an acceptable agreement/contract is reached with one of the top three (3) ranked forms, authorizing the City Manager to execute the resulting agreement/contract, subject to City Attorney review.

BACKGROUND: The City of Key West was awarded by the Historic Preservation Division of the Florida Department of State with a matching grant of \$50,000 to perform and update the Key West Historic Survey. The City has budgeted for Fiscal Year 2010-11 \$50,000 as matching fund.

The grant agreement between the City of Key West and the Historic Preservation Division of the Florida Department of State was approved by Resolutions No. 10-304 and

No. 11-102 in the total project amount of \$100,000. The agreement stipulated the City solicit for proposals under competitive process. On March 27, 2011 the City advertised the Request for Proposal (RFP) #007-11- Historic Resource Survey 2011. The City received six proposals. An evaluation/ranking committee was appointed and the six proposals were evaluated, scored and ranked. The ranking committee met at a publicly advertised meeting on April 25, 2011, and reconvened on May 9, 2011 for final evaluation.

The City of Key West Comprehensive Plan stipulates the identification and protection of resources of archaeological, historical and architectural significance by documenting the resources, maintaining a historic survey and updating a database with future survey updates. The Historic Resources Survey is one of the main references for the Historic Architectural Review Commission when reviewing a Certificate of Appropriateness application. The Survey is also the main resource for updating current data and for including existing structures that meet the criteria to be listed as historic and contributing resources.

PURPOSE AND JUSTIFICATION:

On March 27, 2011 a Request for Proposal (RFP) #007-11- Historic Resource Survey 2011 was advertised. In response to the City's request, six proposals were received at the City Clerk's office:

1. RJ Heisenbottle Architects
2199 Ponce de Leon Boulevard
Suite 400
Coral Gables, Florida 33134
2. Carlos Rojas and Chris Liddle- Key West Preservation Architects
540 White Street
Key West, Florida 33040
3. New South Associates, Inc.
6150 East Ponce de Leon Avenue
St. Mountain, Georgia 30083
4. Panamerican Consultants, Inc.
5337 North Socrum Loop Road
Suite 144
Lakeland, Florida 33809
5. GAI Consultants, Inc.
618 E. South Street
Suite 700
Orlando, Florida 32801

6. Janus Research
2500 S Miami Avenue
Miami, Florida 33129

An evaluating/ ranking committee was appointed and met on April 25, 2011 and May 9, 2011. Both public meetings were advertised. The ranking committee members were:

1. Mr. Donald L. Craig- Interim Planning Director
2. Mr. Doug Bradshaw- Senior Project Manager
3. Mr. Rudy Molinet- Historic Architectural Review Commission Chairman
4. Mrs. Enid Torregrosa- Historic Preservation Planner

The ranking committee scored and ranked the respondents proposals by using the Evaluation Committee Ranking Form that was part of the Request for Proposal (RFP) #007-11. The results of the scores of the top three (3) proposals are provided in ranked order:

1. Panamerican Consultants, Inc.
2. GAI Consultants, Inc.
3. New South Associates, Inc.

The Request for Proposal (RFP) #007-11 stated that each short listed respondent may be required to make an approximately ten minute presentation to the City Commission.

City Staff is requesting City Commission approval of the ranking and authorization for the City Manager to negotiate and enter into a contract with the highest ranked firm.

OPTIONS:

Option 1. Approve the Resolution.

City Commission could approve committee score and ranking of the proposals for the execution of the Key West Historic Resource Survey 2011; authorize the City Manager to negotiate and enter into a contract with the highest ranked proposal, Panamerican Consultants, Inc, execute all required documents and authorize the expenditure of funds for the project. Approval will allow the City of Key West to utilize grant funds from the Florida Department of State for the execution of the survey.

Option 2. Not approve the Resolution and review the three highest rated responses.

City Commission could elect not to approve the ranking committee score and ranking of the proposals and review and hear presentations (if desired) of the three highest rated response, make a selection and authorize City Manager to negotiate and enter into an agreement/contract with the City Commission highest ranked firm.

Option 3. Not approve the Resolution.

City Commission could elect to reject all proposals. Failure to contract with a consultant firm will not allow the City to execute the Key West Historic survey. The project will be subject to withdrawal of the State grant.

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

The City has allocated and budgeted for the Fiscal Year 2010-11 the \$50,000 required to match the Florida Department of State grant of \$50,000.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Option 1, **Approval of the Resolution.**

CONSULTING RANKING FORM
KEY WEST HISTORIC RESOURCE SURVEY 2011 PROJECT
RFP #007-11
FINAL SCORE AND RANKING- EVALUATING/RANKING COMMITTEE
May 9, 2011

Ranking Criteria	points	RJ Heisenbottle				Carlos Rojas/ Chris Liddle				New South Associates				Panamerican Consultants				GAI Consultants				Janus Research			
		DC	DB	RM	ET	DC	DB	RM	ET	DC	DB	RM	ET	DC	DB	RM	ET	DC	DB	RM	ET	DC	DB	RM	ET
Past performance	20	15	19	16	16	10	10	10	15	19	17	18	18	19	18	15	18	15	19	20	19	15	18	15	18
Approach	10	7	8	7	8	8	8	7	8	9	9	5	7	10	8	8	9	7	9	10	10	8	8	8	10
Firm experience	25	14	23	24	24	12	20	20	21	22	23	18	24	24	22	20	24	19	23	24	24	15	23	22	24
Cost proposal	25	20	21	18	16	16	20	15	21	22	22	20	22	24	25	22	23	15	23	24	24	17	24	20	20
Familiarity with KW	10	5	5	7	7	8	9	8	10	9	8	7	9	9	6	7	9	7	7	8	9	8	9	7	9
Sub Total	90	61	76	72	71	54	67	60	75	81	79	68	80	86	79	72	83	63	81	86	86	63	82	72	81
References	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8	8	8	8	8	9	8	6	8	8	8	9	8	6	4	6
Total Score (individual)	100	61	76	72	71	54	67	60	75	89	87	76	88	94	88	80	89	71	89	94	95	71	88	76	87
Total Score (group)		280				256				340				351				349				322			
Cost Proposal		\$91,100				\$100,000				\$99,805				\$90,674.16				\$97,509				\$94,698			
Ranking		5				6				3				1				2				4			

Ranking Committee members:

DC- Mr. Donald L. Craig- Interim Planning Director

DB- Mr. Doug Bradshaw- Senior Project Manager

RM- Mr. Rudy Molinet- Historic Architectural Review Commission Chairman

ET- Mrs. Enid Torregrosa- Historic Preservation Planner