Page 1 of 9

	Meeting To Order
	Chairman Bryan Green acting as Chairman called the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission
(HAR	C) Meeting of September 25, 2012 to order at 5:30 pm at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510
Greer	ne Street, Key West.
Dlade	ge of Allegiance to the Flag
Pleag	ge of Allegiance to the Flag
Roll	
	Commissioners present include: Donna Bosold, Theo Glorie, Maggie Gutierrez, Michael Miller, and
	Vice Chairman Bryan Green.
	Commissioners absent: Daniel Metzler and Chairman Rudy Molinet.
	Also, present from City staff: Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh arrived at 5:45pm, Historic
	Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett.
	Perseveration Planner Linu Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett.
Appr	roval of Agenda
	Vice Chairman Green acting as Chairman inquired as to any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa
	stated that item #1 (the August 15 th Minutes) were not ready for review and needs to be postponed,
	that items #6 and #7 were postponed by Staff due to needing additional information and items
	#11a and #11b were withdrawn by the applicant.
	Mr. Glorie asked to add comments concerning problems with signage at Key West Bight. Chairman
	Green suggested that those comments be placed at the end of the agenda following the scheduled
	items.
	Actions (Motions)
	Actions/Motions:
	A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the
	Agenda with changes as noted by Ms. Torregrosa be Approved. The motion Passed by a
	unanimous voice vote.
Appr	oval of Minutes
1	August 15, 2012
	The item was postponed .
2	September 11, 2012
Z	September 11, 2012
	•
	Actions/Motions:
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be
	Actions/Motions:
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
HAR	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be
HAR	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
HAR	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote. C Planner's Report Ms. Torregrosa thanked everyone for helping while she was on vacation. Ms. Torregrosa stated she
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote. C Planner's Report Ms. Torregrosa thanked everyone for helping while she was on vacation. Ms. Torregrosa stated she had nothing to report.
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote. C Planner's Report Ms. Torregrosa thanked everyone for helping while she was on vacation. Ms. Torregrosa stated she had nothing to report. Stant City Attorney's Report
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote. C Planner's Report Ms. Torregrosa thanked everyone for helping while she was on vacation. Ms. Torregrosa stated she had nothing to report.
Assis	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote. C Planner's Report Ms. Torregrosa thanked everyone for helping while she was on vacation. Ms. Torregrosa stated she had nothing to report. Stant City Attorney's Report Mr. Green stated that he would wait for Mr. Ramsingh's report once he arrives.
Assis Old B	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote. C Planner's Report Ms. Torregrosa thanked everyone for helping while she was on vacation. Ms. Torregrosa stated she had nothing to report. stant City Attorney's Report Mr. Green stated that he would wait for Mr. Ramsingh's report once he arrives. Business
Assis	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the minutes be Approved. The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote. C Planner's Report Ms. Torregrosa thanked everyone for helping while she was on vacation. Ms. Torregrosa stated she had nothing to report. Stant City Attorney's Report Mr. Green stated that he would wait for Mr. Ramsingh's report once he arrives.

Page **2** of **9**

	installing vi and compa proposed w	nyl clad windows in red it to the propo indows look just lil	the wooden structure. bsed windows. Mr. Sch	er detailed the reasons why he is proposing Mr. Schroeder described the current windows proeder stated that it is his opinion that the ow yet it has the impact window rating. Mr. Commissioners.
	Public Con There were	nments: no public comment	s.	
	Torregrosa	grosa stated that	as reviewing the Guidel	rginia Street is listed as contributing. Ms. ines and the proposal Staff finds the proposal
	Bryan Gree	on Discussion: n asked Ms. Torreg ilding is listed as co		us of the structure. Ms. Torregrosa responded
		e inquired if there on page 29 and 30.		ng to windows. Mr. Green pointed out the
	precedence windows ar only here a Mr. Schroe	. Mr. Miller asked and shutters. Mr. Sch bout six (6) months	the applicant why he wan roeder responded it wa a year. Mr. Schroeder	by approving this application would set a bad as proposing impact windows rather than wood s a matter of convenience since the owners are stated that shutters are costly. Mr. Miller drew the metal panels, which are not as costly as
	Den	otion was made by ied based on pag wing vote:	e 29 and 30 Guideline	onded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be s #1 and #3. The motion Passed by the rrez, Mr. Miller, Chairman Green
		1es. 5 - Ms. B0s0	ild, MI. Glotte, MS. Gutle	
4a	Constructio 1364)	n of 2 two-story st	ructures - #722 Carol	ine Street- Meridian Engineering (H12-01-
	have removes stated that	ved the Widow's W they have received	alk and moved the rear	that at the suggestion of the Commission they structure within the setbacks. Mr. Milelli also property owner to remove the back structure. commissioners.
	Public Con	nments:		
	eMail	Tom Theisen	314 Peacon Lane	Part of the published package.
	eMail	Cheryl Bradley	321 Peacon Lane	Part of the published package.
	eMail	Jane Finstad	307 Peacon Lane	Part of the published package.
	eMail Meeting	Barbara Pullem Robert Spencer	325 Peacon Lane 724 Caroline Street	Part of the published package. Spoke against the project. Mr. Spencer
	meeting	Kobert Spencel		stated that there is currently a property dispute between the two properties.

Page **3** of **9**

	Staff Report:
	Design: Enid Torregrosa presented the Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this Staff report is for the construction of two new structures, one two-story structure will replace a one-story non-contributing house, and a second two-story structure will replace a cottage located on the back of the lot. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the location of the front structure does not meet the 10-foot setback requirement and would require a variance.
	Demolition: Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is for the demolition request for the demolition of two (2) structures, the existing main structure is listed as non-contributing, and the cottage is not listed in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition, as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations.
	Commission Discussion: Mr. Green asked for clarification on the set back issue. Mr. Milelli stated that he was recently notified that there is a 10-foot front setback requirement instead of a 5-foot setback. Mr. Milelli stated that he plans to move the front structure back to meet the 10-foot setback, which would preclude the need for a variance. Following a discussion of the survey and the potential property line issue as well as the front setback issue, the Commissioners decided it would be best to postpone the discussion until the plans are updated to address the front setback issue and to give the applicant more time to address the side property line dispute with the neighbor.
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be Postponed . The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
4b	Demolition of 1 one-story non-historic existing structure on the back of the property - #722 Caroline Street- Meridian Engineering (H12-01-1364)
	In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 4a. Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the
	item be Postponed . The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
4c	Demolition of 1 one-story non-historic existing structure on the back of the property - #722 Caroline Street- Meridian Engineering (H12-01-1364)
	In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 4a.
	Actions/Motions:
	A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be Postponed . The motion Passed by a unanimous voice vote.
New	Business
5	Caroline Street Improvement Project (Streetscape, Landscape, Street Improvements) – Caroline Street – City of Key West (H12-01-1520)
	Chairman Green reminded the audience and the Commissioners that they are not to discuss the parking issues or the bicycle lane since those issues are not HARC related. HARC is to protect and

Page 4 of 9

enhance the Historic District.

Allen Perez and Elizabeth Newland presented the project. Mr. Perez reviewed the history of the project and outlined the proposed approach for the improvement of Caroline Street. Mr. Perez stated that the intersections are designed to promote traffic calming. Mr. Perez explained the project also includes enhanced landscaping, streetscape, as well as storm water handling improvements. Ms. Newland presented a before and after review of the landscaping proposal for the project. Ms. Newland explained that the power lines are issues for trees. Ms. Newland stated that all native vegetation would be used. Lighting, trash receptacles, an aluminum picket fence along the Parking Lot and bicycle racks were also reviewed. Mr. Perez and Ms. Newland remained to respond to questions from the Commissioners.

Public Comments:

Mr. Green explained that Commissioners have all the comments that were submitted prior to the meeting and that those comments would not be read during the meeting since they are already part of the record.

	-		
eMail	Bill O'Conner	804 Caroline	Opposed
eMail	Julie Brown	301 Grinnell #304	In Favor
eMail	Shelley McInnis	806 Caroline	Opposed
eMail	Humberto Garrido	818 Caroline	Opposed
eMail	David Symons	718 Caroline	Opposed
eMail	Darryl Fohrman	322 Elizabeth	Opposed
eMail	Jody Smith Williams	1217 White	In Favor
Meeting	Bill Lewis	704 Caroline	Opposed
Meeting	Jack Anderson	800 Caroline	Opposed
Meeting	Tom Tiesen	314 Peacon Lane	In Favor
Meeting	Bill O'Conner	804 Caroline	Ask that his eMailed comments to be
_			read into the record.

Staff Report:

Don Craig presented the Staff report. Mr. Craig began stating that he is speaking for both the Planning Department and for HARC. Mr. Craig reminded the Commissioners that they are charged with looking at the hardscape and the streetscape. Mr. Craig stated that the project is larger than just the hardscape and the streetscape but also addresses both the storm water drainage problems and the implement policies and guidelines addressed within the Comprehensive Plan. Mr. Craig stated that the way the bicyclist use the street have also been reviewed. Mr. Craig stated that this plan balances the competing interest. Mr. Craig stated that this plan includes means that are designed to slow down the traffic.

Commission Discussion:

Bryan Green asked for clarification as to just how much of Caroline Street is included in the project. Mr. Perez responded stating that the project runs along Caroline from Grinnell to Elizabeth. Mr. Green inquired as to why they were stopping at Elizabeth. Mr. Perez responded stating that was a City determination but he thinks it has to do with funding. Mr. Green inquired as to clarification that all parking would be moved from the Bight side of the street to the Eaton Street side of the street. Mr. Perez responded "yes". Mr. Green asked what would happen to the cycle lane when it gets to Elizabeth Street. Mr. Perez responded that it would end at Elizabeth Street and then would have to be picked up as part of a future City project. Mr. Green asked that the reason this design was chosen is due to not having enough width in the area to allow for 2-way traffic, a bicycle lane and parking. Mr. Perez responded "yes" and explained an alternative.

Michael Miller asked about the width of the sidewalk. Mr. Perez stated that the extra wide sidewalk

Page **5** of **9**

	was a request from some of the businesses. Mr. Miller stated that the width of the sidewalk is important to the design.
	Theo Glorie inquired as to the new entrance from Caroline Street to the City Parking Lot. Mr. Perez responded "yes".
	Donna Bosold inquired as to how many parking spaces are being lost. Mr. Perez responded about 35 on the North (Bight) side of the road. Ms. Bosold inquired as to the existing sidewalk width on the Eaton Street. Mr. Perez stated that he was not sure but he thinks it is currently 4' or 5'.
	Mr. Green and Mr. Miller inquired about the lights as to the type, the brightness and if the overhead lights will be removed. Ms. Newland responded that the lights being used are the same as the ones on Duval Street, that they expectation is to achieve a 1' candle along the corridor but that is still being researched and that the plan is to remove the existing overhead lights.
	Theo Glorie asked if anyone has contacted Keys Energy about relocating the wiring below ground. Mr. Perez stated that Keys Energy has been contacted and that is still being discussed.
	Bryan Green asked for a comparison of the width of Caroline Street verse that of Flagler Avenue. Mr. Perez responded Flagler 2-lane section with parking on both sides but no bike lane is 40' to 50' wide. Mr. Green asked Ms. Newland concerning the planter sizes. Ms. Newland responded that the size of the planting area gives the plants a better chance to thrive.
	Mr. Miller stated that there is an overlap of the urban and architectural designs. Mr. Miller stated that he questioned just one bicycle lane on a two-way street. Mr. Miller also inquired about the current utilization of the parking lots. Don Craig responded that the parking lots are currently being underutilized and that the new approach to the lot from Caroline is expected to improve the access for that lot. Mr. Craig stated that 2 bicycle lanes cannot be accommodated with the new landscaping even smaller landscaping.
	Donna Bosold stated that she is impressed with the design. Ms. Bosold stated that after living in the area she understands the need for parking and asked if anything was being addressed to help the people in the area. Mr. Craig responded outlining several parking options. Mr. Craig also stated that the parking spaces in front of the residences will be made Residential and tied to the residences.
	Maggie Gutierrez inquired as to the actual width requirement for the sidewalks. Mr. Craig responded that a 4' minimum to accommodate ADA is required but that it is thought that 8' would be best in this area.
	Theo Glorie requested that his fellow merchants along Caroline Street that they do research to see what a successful shopping street looks like and that it does not include parking along the street.
	Bryan Green stated that he too likes the design but he does understand the parking issues.
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Ms. Donna Bosold, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Michael Miller, Chairman Green
6	Grade vacant lot, install fence, parking lot slab, and ADA bathroom construction - #629 Duval
	Street – JDS of North America (H12-01-1469)
	This item was postponed by Staff prior to the meeting due to needing additional

Page **6** of **9**

	information.
7	Vending booth construction - #629 Duval Street – Trepanier & Associates (H12-01-1530)
	This item was postponed by Staff prior to the meeting due to needing additional information.
8	Replace 3 fixed store front windows with operable windows - #300 Front Street – Carlos Rojas
0	(H12-01-1491)
	Carlos Rojas presented the project. Mr. Rojas described the proposal, which is to replace 3 fixed store windows with operable windows for an existing ice cream and cookie shop. Mr. Rojas stated that the owner wants to open the windows and doors in an effort to "go green" when the weather permits. Mr. Rojas remained to respond to the Commissioners questions.
	Public Comments: There were no public comments.
	Staff Report:
	Enid Torregrosa presented the Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa began by stating that a similar proposal was denied by the Commission based on page 29 – 30-5, page 46 1 st paragraph (Not in character with the surrounding). Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Commission's denial was appealed to the Special Magistrate and was upheld.
	Commission Discussion: Bryan Green asked Mr. Rojas why would he think that this would be approved when it is the same proposal as what was denied before. Mr. Rojas responded that he did not attend the last proposal meeting and that this approach includes all the windows, which would give a balanced design of the storefront.
	Theo Glorie stated that he is in support of the project and that he thinks we need to support the merchants be allowed to get more involved with the customers as they walk down the street.
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Michael Miller, that the item be Approved. The motion Failed by the following vote: Yes: 2 – Mr. Glorie, Michael Miller No: 3 – Ms. Bosold, Ms. Gutierrez, Vice Chairman Green
	A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be Denied based on page 29-4, page 38a-5, and page 46-1. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 3 – Ms. Bosold, Ms. Gutierrez, Vice Chairman Green No: 2 – Mr. Glorie, Michael Miller
9a	Replace all windows with wood double hung true divided lights. Replace all doors with wood doors. Add new rear balcony. Repair front porch - #630 Elizabeth Street – Thomas Kelly (H12-01-1525)
	Tom Kelly presented the project. Mr. Kelly gave some history for the structure. Mr. Kelly stated that now that the building has been sold and will be retained as a duplex. Mr. Kelly stated that the new owner wants to restore the old structure. Mr. Kelly outlined some of the plans for the restoration. Mr. Kelly remained to respond to questions from the Commissioners.

Page **7** of **9**

	Public Comments: There were no public comments.
	Staff Report: Design:
	Enid Torregrosa presented the Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa began by stating that the building is listed as contributing. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Commission approved a proposal for restoration back in 2010.
	Demolition: Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition of the portion of the rear addition, as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations.
	Commission Discussion: Michael Miller stated that he disagrees with Staff but he thinks that removing the shed on the back on the Angela Street side of the structure is a mistake. Mr. Miller stated that he thinks this is a very defining feature for the structure. Mr. Miller suggested flipping the design. Mr. Kelly responded that he did not have a problem flipping the scheme as requested by Mr. Miller.
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Ms. Donna Bosold, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be Approved with condition that the applicant brings the plans to Staff for approval once the bathroom is re-located. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Michael Miller, Vice Chairman Green
9b	Remove portion of rear addition - #630 Elizabeth Street – Thomas Kelly (H12-01-1525)
	In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 9a.
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Ms. Donna Bosold, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Michael Miller, Vice Chairman Green
10	Install new windows, storefront, & doors. Install new v-crimp metal awning. Repair parapet - #1200-1206-1212 White Street – Thomas Kelly (H12-01-1527)
	Tom Kelly presented the project. Mr. Kelly gave some history for the structure. Mr. Kelly stated that these buildings are in poor condition. Mr. Kelly stated the new owner wants to bring some uniformity to the buildings by installing new windows and doors and installing a new v-crimp metal awning along the entire storefront and side.
	Public Comments: There were no public comments.
	Staff Report: Design: Enid Torregrosa presented the Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa began by stating that the corner building
	is listed as contributing. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposal is within the Guidelines and that her only concern is the proposed windows on the 2 nd floor windows.

Page **8** of **9**

	Commission Discussion: Donna Bosold asked if a color has been chosen for the awning. Mr. Kelly responded that it would remain the metal color.
	Bryan Green stated that he is excited to see this building being brought back into life and thinks it is a move in the correct direction for White Street.
	Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be Approved. The motion Passed by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Michael Miller, Vice Chairman Green
11a	Construct new two-story wood frame rear addition - #1118 Curry Lane – SeaTech of the Florida Keys (H12-01-1529)
	This item was Withdrawn by the applicant prior to the meeting.
11b	Remove existing rear addition - #1118 Curry Lane – SeaTech of the Florida Keys (H12-01- 1529)
	This item was Withdrawn by the applicant prior to the meeting.
12a	Renovation of existing cottage with one and a half story addition at rear #608 William Street – Thomas Pope (H12-01-1531)
	Tom Pope presented the project. Mr. Pope began by stating that the owners of 730 Southard have purchased this house to use as a guesthouse. Mr. Pope stated that the properties will have a unified title. Mr. Pope reviewed the proposed changes to the property.
	Public Comments: There were no public comments.
	Staff Report:
	Design: Enid Torregrosa presented the Staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the proposed plans are within the Guidelines.
	Demolition: Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition of the non-historic rear addition, as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that this will require only one reading for demolition.
	Commission Discussion: Bryan Green asked if the unity of title has been completed. Mr. Pope responded that it has.
	Michael Miller asked why Ms. Torregrosa stated that only one reading for demolition. Ms. Torregrosa reminded Mr. Miller about the change in the Ordinance that allows one reading for non-historic structures' demolition. Mr. Miller asked Mr. Pope about the Southside stoop as to if a variance was going to be necessary. Mr. Pope responded that the stoop is less than 34" therefore, it will not require a variance. Mr. Pope reviewed the site plan with Mr. Miller explaining the entrances and exits.

DRAFT Page 9 of 9

Mr. Ramsingh suggested that the Commission impose a condition of approval that the Unity of Title be verified and approved by the City Attorney's Office. Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the item be **Approved** with the condition that the unity of title has been reviewed and approved by the City Attorney's office. The motion **Passed** by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Michael Miller, Vice Chairman Green 12b Demolition of non-historic rear porch and side bathroom additions - #608 William Street -Thomas Pope (H12-01-1531) In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 12a. Actions/Motions: A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Michael Miller, Vice Chairman Green Assistant City Attorney's Report Mr. Ramsingh stated he had nothing to report. **Comments from Commissioners** Mr. Glorie reminded Mr. Green that they were to listen to some concerns about signage at the Key West Bight. Following a discussion with the Assistant City Attorney, it was decided that the Commission should not interfere in this matter. There were no additional comments from the Commissioners. Adjournment **Actions/Motions:** A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the meeting be **Adjourned**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous vote. Meeting adjourned at **7:52 pm.**

Submitted by,

Sennett

Administrative Coordinator Planning Department