



THE CITY OF KEY WEST
3140 Flagler Ave Key West, FL 33040 (305) 809-3700

M
E
M
O
R
A
N
D
U
M

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

TO: Jim Scholl, City Manager

FROM: Janet Muccino, Project Manager

CC: David Fernandez, Asst. City Manager
Doug Bradshaw, Senior Project Manager

DATE: February 24, 2011

SUBJECT: Resolution approving the award and the City Manager's execution of the contract for the Smathers Beach Renourishment Project to Charley Toppino & Sons in the amount of \$743,573.50.

ACTION STATEMENT:

This Resolution will award the Smathers Beach Renourishment Project to Charley Toppino & Sons for the placement of up to 17,500 tons of sand in the amount of \$743,573.50, waive the minor deficiencies in the bids, and approve the City Manager to execute the contract.

BACKGROUND:

The City of Key West constructed Smathers Beach in the early 1960's by excavating rock out 500 feet on the waterside of the South Roosevelt Blvd Seawall and replacing with sand. The beach eroded over the years and by the 1980's it was mostly cap rock on the beach and large chunks of rocks in the water. The City and County spent over \$2 million in permitting and mitigation and finally obtained the renourishment permits in 1998. Renourishment occurred in 2000 with protective beach fill along 3,000 feet of the previously nourished Smathers Beach area. Funding for the renourishment came from the USACE, FDEP, TDC and City of Key West.

Smathers beach has continued to erode since the renourishment in 2000. The City has rebuilt the protective berms above mean high water (MHW) after most hurricane events but the beach below MHW has not been renourished and is eroding and rocky. The City has been actively working on a complete renourishment project for Smather's Beach.

As part of that project, the City issued ITB #11-008: Smathers Beach Renourishment. Three bids were received on January 31, 2011.

1. Charley Toppino & Sons (CTS), \$743,573.50;

Key to the Caribbean – Average yearly temperature 77° F.

2. American Earth Movers, \$767,000.00
3. D.N. Higgins, \$1,031,975.00.

The bid specified that the proposed sand by a bidder must be approved FDEP sand. CTS bid originally proposed Bahamian sand that is currently being reviewed by FDEP for approval on beaches in Florida and maybe approved within the next several months. However in order to not delay the project, CTS has agreed to use the current FDEP approved Ortona sand at the same bid price. American Earth Movers bid was initially considered nonresponsive as they failed to submit a sand sample with their bid. Staff did request and received a sand specification from American Earth Movers. They proposed using the same Ortona sand as CTS. Staff considers both of these deficiencies minor and neither provides any monetary advantage to either bidder. D.N. Higgins, the highest bid, was not within the proposed budget.

PURPOSE & JUSTIFICATION:

Maintenance and enhancement of the physical environment of Key West and its near shore waters is one of the city's seven strategic priorities. Periodic renourishment of Smathers Beach will extend the useful life and maintain the integrity of the beach. Locals and tourists alike will benefit from the renourishment of the beach.

OPTIONS:

Option # 1 Approve the award of the Smathers Beach Renourishment Project to Charley Toppino & Sons for the placement of up to 17,500 tons of sand in the amount of \$743,573.50, waive the minor deficiencies in the bids, and approve the City Manager to execute the contract.

The advantage to awarding the contract to CTS is that the contractor has done this work before and the price is within the budget.

Option # 2 The City Commission can choose not to move forward with the renourishment project. This is not recommended by staff. The beach is an important component of our tourism industry, home to not only swimmers, but weddings, water sports and sunbathers. The Key West beaches are promoted by the TDC and having a rocky beach and small beach is less than optimal. Smaller hotels, motels, guest house and inns all rely on beaches for guest recreation as they do not have their own beaches.

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

This year's budget for the renourishment project including construction, CEI and pre, during & post monitoring is \$903,200 (001-1906-519-4600, Project GR0701). Funding sources include the City of Key West - \$370,100, TDC - \$103,900, and DEP - \$429,200. With the construction bid at \$743,573.50 a balance of \$159,626.50 will remain for the first year of a three year required monitoring program. Monitoring will have to be budgeted in future budgets.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the award of the Smathers Beach Renourishment Project to Charley Toppino & Sons for the placement of up to 17,500 tons of sand in the amount of \$743,573.50, waive the minor deficiencies in the bids, and approve the City Manager to execute the contract.