

First Early Draft

Guidelines for Windows, Shutters, Storefronts and Window Protection

Windows

Windows are character-defining features and a significant architectural element of every historic building in Key West. Historically most of residential and mixed-use frame vernacular buildings built before 1945 had double sash true divided windows in a variety of designs, like 6 over 6, 2 over 2, 3 over one, and 1 over 1. Casement wood windows were also used but less commonly. Many commercial and institutional buildings built prior to 1945 had steel double sash, casement, or projecting windows. In the 1945 new window types, particularly metal and or glass jealousies and awning windows were manufactured making their accessibility a popular option for new construction and replacements of old windows. Location of a window and its impact to the overall elevation in the building are significant elements that are taking into consideration while analyzing the appropriate solution for a window matter.

[Include illustrations of type of windows]

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards are formulated under four pillars: identify and retain, protect, and preserve, repair, and replace when repairs are not a feasible option. However potential future impact of natural hazards on our island aggravates the loss, damage, or destruction of historic buildings. In an effort to mitigate the vulnerability of historic windows and the visual impact of window protections HARC has developed these guidelines to assist our citizens in making an appropriate decision pertaining to windows in their buildings. The goal must be to minimize any adverse impacts to the historic character of a building and the district to the extent possible in adapting the building to be more resilient.

HARC encourages the retention and restoration of historic windows and their components, including historic glazing, frames, hoodmolds, weights, sashes, muntins and any decorative elements. The more historic fabric a building can retain the more accurate information it can yield. Continuous maintenance shall include making the window weathertight by re-caulking, replacing deteriorated elements to match and painting.

A. Guidelines for window replacements:

1. Historic windows on buildings individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places shall be retain and preserved. If replacement is requested an assessment of the conditions of the windows will be required. If the window has lost more than 55% of its historic fabric a replacement will be considered if the new unit replicates the existing

window, including design, dimension, and material. Impact resistant windows matching dimensions, design and materials are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass or Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Muntin grids that match the same material of the window are required in the exterior of the glass if the design includes such grid.

2. Historic stain glass windows must be maintained, preserved, and restored and all efforts shall be made to protect them from deterioration. Replacement of any components must match existing in design and materials. Elements used for any reinforcement must match profile and color of existing to match and blend.

Suggestion: Add language that allows permanently installed glazed storm windows to be installed on the exterior side of stained glass for hurricane protection. Design of storm windows to be approve by the architectural review commission.

3. Replacement windows on principal elevations or elevations visible from the streets of frame vernacular, brick or concrete buildings that were built before 1945 shall match windows of the same period of the building, including design, dimensions, and materials. Impact resistant windows matching dimensions, design and materials are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). For buildings where original windows were steel, aluminum windows are acceptable replacements as long as the details, including munting profiles and revere match period units. Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Muntin grids that match the same material of the window are required in the exterior of the glass if the design includes such grid.
4. Replacement windows on secondary elevations of frame vernacular, brick or concrete buildings that were built before 1945 shall match windows of the same period of the building, including design, dimensions, but materials can be either wood, metal, or clad. Impact resistant windows matching dimensions and design are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). For buildings where original windows were steel, aluminum windows are acceptable replacements as long as the details, including munting profiles and revere match period units. Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Muntin grids that match the same material of the window are required in the exterior of the glass if the design includes such grid.

Suggestion: Eliminate guideline #4 and alter Guideline #3 as follows:

3. Replacement windows on ~~principal elevations or elevations visible from the streets~~ of frame vernacular, brick or concrete buildings that were built before 1945 shall match windows of the same period of the building, including design, dimensions, and materials. Impact resistant windows matching dimensions, design and materials are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). For buildings where original windows were steel, aluminum windows are acceptable replacements as long as the details, including muntin profiles and revere match period units. Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Muntin grids that match the same material of the window are required in the exterior of the glass if the design includes such grid.

Alternate window materials that do not match the historic window composition will be considered for replacement windows on secondary elevations of frame vernacular, brick or concrete buildings that were built before 1945 when economic hardship can be established. When economic hardship is established the replacement windows shall match windows of the same period of the building, including design and dimensions, but materials can be either wood, metal, or clad.

1. Replacement windows on frame vernacular, brick or concrete buildings that were built on or after 1945 can be of different type, particularly buildings with jalousie and awning windows. Impact resistant windows, either wood, metal, or clad, matching dimensions, are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Flat or interior muntins between glass exposed to the exterior is not allowed on elevations visible from the street. Window reveal and position in the fenestration must match existing.
2. Replacement windows in buildings and additions within the historic district and built under a Florida Building Code must meet current Code and efforts shall be made to use window units which their design be harmonious with adjacent historic buildings, particularly on visible elevations from a public right-of-way.
3. The use of a window that is visually incompatible to the historic appearance of the building or that obscure, damage or destroy character-defining features of a contributing or historic building is not allowed.

B. Changes to fenestrations:

1. Alteration of original window fenestrations on contributing or historic buildings is not allowed, unless the historic architectural review commission finds that the alteration will not adversely impact character defining elevations of a building. This also applies to alteration of a historic window fenestration to install a door. Restoring original location and dimensions of fenestrations is highly advised.

Suggestion: Make clear that this guideline is specifically referencing location and size. Also add language addressing the insertion of new fenestration at non-historic locations (where fenestration did not exist) Perhaps edit as follows:

1. Alteration of the location or size of original window fenestrations on contributing or historic buildings is not allowed, unless the historic architectural review commission finds that the alteration will not adversely impact character defining elevations of a building. This also applies to alteration of a historic window fenestration to install a door. Restoring original location and dimensions of fenestrations is highly advised.

The 'addition' of fenestration at non-historic locations on contributing or historic buildings is not allowed, unless the historic architectural review commission finds that the alteration will not adversely impact character defining elevations of a building.

2. For a contributing or historic building with a new use requires emergency escape and rescue openings it is appropriate that such changes in fenestration dimensions be done in secondary elevations non-visible from the right-of-way.

Suggestion: Add that architectural review commission approval is required for the proposed modifications. Often changes in use are more 'occupancy intensive' and the emergency egress requirements will be more significant than enlarged window openings:

2. For a contributing or historic building where a new use requires emergency escape and rescue openings ~~it is appropriate that~~ such changes in fenestration dimensions and / or locations shall be done on secondary elevations not visible from the right-of-way. All proposed alterations to accommodate emergency egress shall require historic architectural review commission approval.

3. The insertion of new floors or furred-down ceilings which cut across the glazed areas of windows and the exterior form and appearance of a window is changed on a contributing or historic building is not allowed.

4. Changes in window fenestrations on non-contributing or non-historic buildings shall be made in a manner that will not visually detract from any street.

Suggestion / Comment: It may be prudent to add a guideline that addresses energy efficiency concerns. In large part the guidelines above resolve this issue by allowing the installation of modern windows to replace existing windows. Also, over the past 5-7 years several manufacturers have made significant strides in bringing energy efficient, impact rated, and design pressure compliant wood windows and doors to the South Florida market. The result of this progress makes much of the recommended guideline modifications possible.

With that said, some applicants may utilize energy efficiency arguments to avoid the requirements of the above guidelines, specifically material composition. The current price of wood windows is in excess of their aluminum counterparts; that is likely to change over time with the addition of more competition in the market. This price difference may incentivize applicants to demonstrate incremental improvement in energy efficiency for one material over another to argue for a less expensive product that at the same time is not appropriate for installation in certain structures (i.e. not compliant with the above guideline recommendations). A guideline that requires the submission of specifications and whole building energy calculations demonstrating a substantial increase in energy efficiency over a 'baseline' would help limit this scenario.

Although guidelines should not require the selection of more expensive products when less expensive products are available, the character and significance of historic structures should also play a part in the approval process regarding design modifications to significant architectural elements such as fenestration.

Shutters

Storefronts

Storefronts are character-defining features of a commercial building. Historic storefronts must be preserved as they are part of the sense of place in the historic district commercial corridors. Of significance, if a building is internally sub divided with different operational businesses, the totality of the frontage elevation reading shall be kept as one.

Window Protection

DRAFT