



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final - Final Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, October 27, 2015

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Present 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Approval of Agenda

When asked by Chair Greene, Ms. Torregrosa stated that there were no changes to the agenda. A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the agenda be approved. The motion carried by the unanimous Voice Vote.

Approval of Minutes

1 August 25, 2015 Minutes

Attachments: [August 25, 2015 Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Janet Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Michael Miller, that the August 25, 2015 Meeting Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

2 September 29, 2015 Minutes

Attachments: [September 29, 2015 HARC Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Richard Logan, seconded by Vice Chair Richard McChesney, that the September 29, 2015 Meeting Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.

HARC Planner's Report

Attachments: [October 2015 HARC Applications Listing](#)

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Action Item

- 3 Increasing staff's ability to approve minor demolitions to expedite review process.

Attachments: [Increasing Staff Approval for Minor Demolitions](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Old Business

- 4a New rear addition and renovations to existing house. New pool, deck and fences - **#732 Poorhouse Lane - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-0841)**

Attachments: [732 Poorhouse Lane - Design](#)
[Public Comments - October 23, 2015](#)
[September 29, 2015 Meeting - 732 Poorhouse Lane - Design](#)
[September 29, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)
[September 29, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments - September 24, 2015](#)
[August 25, 2015 Meeting - 732 Poorhouse Lane - Design](#)
[August 25, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:
Amy Lynch - 822 Windsor Lane

A motion was made by Vice Chair McChesne, seconded by Ms. Lori Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved with Mr. Michael Miller requesting discussion. Following a discussion the motion was withdrawn.

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Vice Chair McChesney, that the Action Item be Denied based on the Land Development Regulations, Articles V, U.S Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and Article VI- Design Guidelines in Key West Historic District, particularly the following standards and guidelines; Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically Standards 6, 9, and 10 on pages 16-23 of the Historic Architectural Guidelines; Standard 6 - Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than be replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible,

materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.; Standard 9 - New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.; Standard 10 - New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.; Guidelines for dormers, specifically guideline 3 of page 27: 3. Dormer size must be in proportion to the building and its roof. Oversized or undersized dormers are inappropriate.; Guidelines for Windows of the Historic Architectural Guidelines (pages 29-30), specifically guideline 3; Replacement windows on contributing structures should be made to fit the original window opening without the use of blocking or infill. Such replacement windows, sills, muntins, sashes, surrounds and other window features should be of similar and compatible configuration, material, size, design, and placement as those of original windows.; Guidelines for Additions, Alterations and New Construction of the Historic Architectural Guidelines (pages 36-38a) specifically guidelines 3 and 4 for Additions and Alterations of pages 36- 37 and guidelines 4 and 5 of New Construction on page 38a; additions/ Alterations: 3. Addition design should be compatible with the characteristics of the original structure, neighboring buildings and streetscapes.

4. Additions should be constructed with a scale, height and mass that is appropriate to the original building and its neighbors.
New Construction: 4. Proportion, scale, and mass – massing, scale, and proportion shall be similar to that of existing historical buildings in the historical zone. No new construction shall be enlarged so that its proportions are out of scale with its surroundings. No new construction shall be more than two and a half stories. No structure shall outsize the majority of structures in the streetscape or historic zone.; and 5. Compatibility- Design must be compatible with Key West architectural characteristics in the historical zones. All new construction must be in keeping with the historic character in terms of size, scale, design, materials, color, and texture. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

4b

Demolition of front concrete porch and back additions. Demolition of shed structure - **#732 Poorhouse Lane - K2M Design Inc. (H15-01-0841)**

Attachments: [732 Poorhouse Lane - Demolition](#)
[Public Comments - October 23, 2015](#)
[September 29, 2015 Meeting - 732 Poorhouse Lane - Demolition](#)
[September 29, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments - September 28, 2015](#)
[September 29, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments - September 24, 2015](#)
[August 25, 2015 Meeting - 732 Poorhouse Lane - Demolition](#)
[August 25, 2015 Meeting - Public Comments](#)

Withdrawn by the applicant due to item #4a being Denied.

New Business

- 5a** Extend attic area over front porch and change style of handrail on new house- **#811 White Street- William Shepler (H15-01-1525)**
- Attachments:** [October 27, 2015 Meeting - 811 White Street - Design](#)
- At the request of the applicant, a motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes:** 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green
- 5b** Demolition of front gable on new house-**#811 White Street- William Shepler (H15-01-1525)**
- Attachments:** [October 27, 2015 Meeting - 811 White Street - Demolition](#)
- At the request of the applicant, a motion was made by Mr. Michael Miller, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the Action Items be Postponed. The motion passed by an unanimous vote.**
- 6a** Renovations to existing one -story building. New one-story addition in the rear yard. Change of roof configuration on rear portion of the house-**#1018 White Street- William P. Horn (H15-01-1530)**
- Attachments:** [1018 White Street - Design](#)
- A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes:** 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green
- 6b** Demolition of shed roof on rear portion of the house-**#1018 White Street- William P. Horn (H15-01-1530)**
- Attachments:** [1018 White Street - Demolition](#)
- A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:**
- Yes:** 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green
- 7** New single-family residence with 410 square feet attached garage on empty lot. Reconfiguration of existing gates and fences-**#415 Grinnell Street- Matthew Stratton (H15-01-1537)**

Attachments: [415 Grinnell Street - Design](#)
[Public Comments - October 27, 2015](#)
[Public Comments - October 26, 2015](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS:
Colleen Haverson - 412 Grinnell Street
Dana Dey - 416 Elizabeth Street

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Mr. Logan, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 3 - Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Green

Yes: 4 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, and Vice Chair McChesney

8a

New wood frame storage shed - **#1114 Packer Street- Flowers General Contractors (H15-01-1544)**

Attachments: [1114 Packer Street - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Miller, seconded by Mr. Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

8b

Demolition of existing sheds- **#1114 Packer Street- Flowers General Contractors (H15-01-1544)**

Attachments: [1114 Packer Street - Demolition](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Glorie, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Items be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mr. Glorie, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. Logan, Mr. Miller, Ms. Thompson, Vice Chair McChesney, and Chairman Green

Comments from Commissioners

Adjournment