RESOLUTION NO. 15-162

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF KEY WEST, FLORIDA, APPROVING THE STAFF RANKING OF FINANCIAL CONSULTANTS IN RESPONSE TO THE CITY'S REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS (RFQ) 15-002, AND AUTHORIZING STAFF TO NEGOTIATE CONTRACTS WITH THE THREE TOP-RANKED FIRMS IN SUBSTANTIAL CONFORMANCE WITH THE RFQ DOCUMENTS, FOR A TERM OF THREE YEARS WITH UP TO TWO ONE-YEAR OPTIONS, UPON ADVICE AND CONSENT OF THE CITY ATTORNEY; PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE

WHEREAS, the City issued RFQ 15-002 for Financial Consulting Services, to which five firms responded by the bid opening on April 2, 2015; and

WHEREAS, a ranking committee composed of city staff convened on April 23, at a properly noticed public meeting, to review the five (5) responses to the RFQ, and determined that three (3) firms are particularly qualified, and the City wishes to engage each one on a Task Order basis;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF KEY WEST, FLORIDA, AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1: That the top three responses in response to RFQ No. 15-002, for Financial Consulting Services are hereby ranked by staff, and approved by the City Commission as follows:

(1) Arcadis U.S., Inc.

(2) Black and Veatch

(3) CDM Smith

Section 2: That the City Manager is hereby authorized to negotiate and execute contracts on a task-order basis with each of the three top-ranked companies for a term of three years, with two one-year options, upon advice and consent of the City Attorney.

Section 3: That this Resolution shall go into effect immediately upon its passage and adoption and authentication by the signature of the Presiding Officer and the Clerk of the Commission.

Passed and adopted by the City Commission at a meeting held this 5th day of May, 2015.

Authenticated by the Presiding Officer and Clerk of the Commission on 6th day of May, 2015.

Filed with the Clerk on May 6, 2015.

Mayor Craig Cates	Yes
Vice Mayor Mark Rossi	Yes
Commissioner Teri Johnston	Yes
Commissioner Clayton Lopez	Yes
Commissioner Billy Wardlow	Yes
Commissioner Jimmy Weekley	Absent
Commissioner Tony Yaniz	Yes

Craig Cates
CRAIG CATES, MAYOR

ATTEST:
Cheryl Smith
CHERYL SMITH, CITY CLERK

THE CITY OF KEY WEST
Post Office Box 1409 Key West, FL 33041-1409 (305) 809-3700

MEMORANDUM

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

TO: Jim Scholl, City Manager

FROM: John Paul Castro, Utilities Director

CC: Greg Veliz, Asst. City Manager – Operations
Sarah Spurlock, Asst. City Manager – Administration

DATE: April 17, 2015

RE: **Approval of Staff Ranking of Financial Consultants Responding to RFQ 15-002 and Authorization for the City Manager to Negotiate and Execute Contracts**

ACTION STATEMENT:
This resolution will approve staff ranking of firms responding to RFQ 15-002: Financial Consulting Services; authorizing staff to negotiate contracts; authorizing the City Manager to enter into contracts with the selected firms.

BACKGROUND:
The City has a need for financial consulting firms to assist staff as we create our rate models for utility budgets in wastewater, stormwater, and solid waste. These firms help staff analyze rates, revenues, capital expenditures, budgetary planning, along with other tasks. They also assist with the utility budget presentations to the City Commission.

As the City has multiple projects of all sizes and disciplines simultaneously, it typically contracts with multiple consultants to handle the workload.

PURPOSE AND JUSTIFICATION:
City staff advertised a request for qualifications that had a bid opening on April 2. Staff has reviewed the responses for RFQ 15-002 from the following firms:

- Arcadis U.S., Inc
- Black and Veatch
- CDM Smith
- Raftelis Financial Consultants, Inc.
- Willdan Financial Services

The ranking committee consisted of city staff Michael Turner, Thaddeus Cohen, Karen Olsen, Elizabeth Ignaffo, and Marilyn Wilbarger which convened as advertised on April 23rd in public session at the City Clerk's conference room. The final rankings are as follows:

Company Rankings for RFQ #15-002 Financial Consultants

Ranking of Proposers

	Sewer/Stormwater			Solid Waste	
1	**Arcadis**	284	*1*	**Arcadis**	282
2	**Black and Veatch**	282	*2*	**CDM Smith**	281
3	**Willdan**	259	*3*	**Willdan**	259
4	**Raftelis**	226	*4*		

City staff ranked the firm's proposals on a 200 point scale for Stormwater/Wastewater, a 200 point scale for solid waste, and a 300 point scale for additional services, including capital financing support and special rate determination.

Staff has historically requested separate proposals for waste/stormwater and solid waste. The RFQ was split to allow firms who are more specialized to submit proposals on either discipline without submitting for both.

City staff is requesting City Commission approval of the evaluation ranking and authorization for the City Manager to negotiate and enter into a contract with the three (3) highest ranked firms. If negotiations fail to result in a contract, all proposals will be rejected and a new RFQ will be advertised.

Consultant contracts will be based on hourly rates and reimbursables as negotiated by the City Manager. Financial services will be awarded on a task order basis, pursuant to City ordinance purchasing guidelines.

OPTIONS / ADVANTAGES / DISADVANTAGES:

1. The City Commission can approve city staff ranking and authorize the City Manager to negotiate and execute contracts, based on rates of pay and reimbursable expenses to the three (3) highest ranked firms, which include Arcadis U.S., Inc, Black and Veatch, and CDM Smith. City staff will engage financial consultants on a task order basis. Arcadis U.S., Inc. has the ability to complete rate studies for solid waste, stormwater, and waste water. Both Black & Veatch and CDM Smith ranked highest in their respective disciplines giving the City the best option in each, should Arcadis U.S., Inc. be unavailable or should the City decide to split the work load.

2. The City Commission can approve city staff ranking and authorize the City Manager to negotiate and execute contracts based on rates of pay and reimbursable expenses to Arcadis U.S., Inc. and Willdan Financial Services as both companies scored within the top 3 in both sections of the RFQ. Black & Veatch would become the third highest ranking overall. This option gives the City two firms that can cover the three rate study disciplines, but eliminates CDM Smith who greatly outscored Willdan in the Solid Waste section of the RFQ evaluation.

3. The City Commission could disapprove staff ranking for the financial consultant RFQ. This would leave the City without financial consultants on contract. All services in need would have to be

formally advertised for each individual task. This creates large lead times for staff and is very costly.

FINANCIAL IMPACT:
There is no financial impact of approving any of the options listed above. Contracts will be executed after the resolution is passed and services requested on a task order basis.

RECOMMENDATION:
Staff recommends the City Commission choose option 1, approving the evaluation team ranking from city staff and allowing the City Manager to negotiate and execute contracts for financial services with Arcadis U.S., Inc, Black & Veatch, and CDM Smith. These three companies ranked far higher than the other firms in the two sections of the RFQ.

Firm Name Arcadis

Response Check List

	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Mandatory Submittals					
Anti-Kickback Affidavit	x	x	x	x	x
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit	x	x	x	x	x
Cone of Silence Affidavit	x	x	x	x	x
Public Entity Crimes Certification	x	x	x	x	x
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)	x	x	x	x	x
Company Information	x	x	x	x	x
Methodology and Approach	x	x	x	x	x
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants	x	x	x	x	x
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References	x	x	x	x	x
Correct Project Title	x	x	x	x	x
	x	x	x	x	x
Proposal Accepted as Responsive	x	x	x	x	x

	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	50	50	50	45	50
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	40	40	35	40
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	40	40	25	40	40
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	40	40	40	35	40
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	20	20	30
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience		190	195	175	175	200

	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	50	45	50	45	45
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	35	40	35	40
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	40	35	40	40	40
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	40	35	40	35	40
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	20	20	30
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience		190	175	190	175	195

	Points					
Additional Services Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300						
Capital Financing Support	0-100	100	95	0	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	0	95	0	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	100	95	0	0	0
Sub Total for Additional Services		200	285			

Score for Stormwater/Wastewater	190	175	175	175	200
Score for Solid Waste	190	175	190	175	195
Additional Services	200	285	0	0	0
Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services	390	460	175	175	200
Solid Waste + Additional Services	390	460	190	175	195

Avg 284 storm/sewer
282 solid waste

Firm Name Black + Veatch

Response Check List

	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Mandatory Submittals					
Anti-Kickback Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Cone of Silence Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Public Entity Crimes Certification	X	X	X	X	X
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)	X	X	X	X	X
Company Information	X	X	X	X	X
Methodology and Approach	X	X	X	X	X
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants	X	X	X	X	X
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References	X	X	X	X	X
Correct Project Title	X	X	X	X	X
	X	X	X	X	X
Proposal Accepted as Responsive	X	X	X	X	X

	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	50	45	45	40	50
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	35	30	35	35
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	30	35	30	40	35
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	40	35	40	35	35
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	25	20	30
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience		180	175	170	170	185

	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50					
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40					
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40					
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40					
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30					
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience						

	Points					
Additional Services Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300						
Capital Financing Support	0-100	100	90	50	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	0	0	50	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	100	90	50	0	0
Sub Total for Additional Services		200	180	150		

Score for Stormwater/Wastewater	180	175	170	170	185
Score for Solid Waste					
Additional Services	200	180	150	0	0
Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services	380	355	320	170	185
Solid Waste + Additional Services					

Avg Storm/Sewer 282

Firm Name CDM Smith

Response Check List

	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Mandatory Submittals					
Anti-Kickback Affidavit	x	x	x	x	x
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit	x	x	x	x	x
Cone of Silence Affidavit	x	x	x	x	x
Public Entity Crimes Certification	x	x	x	x	x
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)	x	x	x	x	x
Company Information	x	x	x	x	x
Methodology and Approach	x	x	x	x	x
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants	x	x	x	x	x
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References	x	x	x	x	x
Correct Project Title	x	x	x	x	x
	x	x	x	x	x
Proposal Accepted as Responsive	x	x	x	x	x

	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50					
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40					
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40					
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40					
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30					
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience						

	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	50	50	50	45	50
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	40	40	35	40
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	40	40	40	40	40
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	40	40	40	35	40
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	25	20	30
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience		190	195	195	175	200
Additional Services Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300	**Points**					
Capital Financing Support	0-100	100	0	50	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	100	0	50	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	100	0	50	0	0
Sub Total for Additional Services		300		150		

Score for Stormwater/Wastewater					
Score for Solid Waste	190	195	195	175	200
Additional Services	300	0	150	0	0
Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services					
Solid Waste + Additional Services	490	195	345	175	200

Avg Solid Waste 281

Firm Name Raffeli's

Response Check List

		Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Mandatory Submittals						
Anti-Kickback Affidavit		x	x	x	x	x
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit		x	x	x	x	x
Cone of Silence Affidavit		x	x	x	x	x
Public Entity Crimes Certification		x	x	x	x	x
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)		x	x	x	x	x
Company Information		x	x	x	x	x
Methodology and Approach		x	x	x	x	x
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants		x	x	x	x	x
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References		x	x	x	x	x
Correct Project Title		x	x	x	x	x
		x	x	x	x	x
Proposal Accepted as Responsive		x	x	x	x	x
	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	45	40	50	45	40
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	35	40	35	35
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	35	30	30	40	35
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	30	30	40	35	35
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	20	20	30
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience		170	160	180	175	175
	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50					
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40					
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40					
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40					
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30					
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience						
Additional Services Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300	**Points**					
Capital Financing Support	0-100	50	85	0	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	0	0	0	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	50	85	0	0	0
Sub Total for Additional Services		100	170	0	0	0
Score for Stormwater/Wastewater		170	160	180	175	175
Score for Solid Waste						
Additional Services		100	170	0	0	0
Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services		270	330	180	175	175
Solid Waste + Additional Services						

Avg Storm/Sewer 226

Firm Name Willdan

Response Check List

		Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Mandatory Submittals						
Anti-Kickback Affidavit		x	x	x	x	x
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit		x	x	x	x	x
Cone of Silence Affidavit		x	x	x	x	x
Public Entity Crimes Certification		x	x	x	x	x
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)		x	x	x	x	x
Company Information		x	x	x	x	x
Methodology and Approach		x	x	x	x	x
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants		x	x	x	x	x
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References		x	x	x	x	x
Correct Project Title		x	x	x	x	x
		x	x	x	x	x
Proposal Accepted as Responsive		x	x	x	x	x
	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	45	46	45	40	40
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	35	35	40	30	30
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	35	30	35	40	30
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	35	30	40	35	30
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	25	20	30
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience		170	160	185	165	160
	Points					
Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)						
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	45	40	50	40	35
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	35	35	40	30	30
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	35	35	35	40	30
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	30	30	40	35	30
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	25	20	30
Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience		165	165	190	165	155
Additional Services Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300	**Points**					
Capital Financing Support	0-100	75	70	50	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	0	0	50	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	50	90	50	0	0
Sub Total for Additional Services		125	160	150	0	0
Score for Stormwater/Wastewater		170	160	185	165	160
Score for Solid Waste		165	165	190	165	155
Additional Services		125	160	150	0	0
Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services		295	320	335	165	160
Solid Waste + Additional Services		290	325	340	165	155

Avg 259 Storm/Sewer
259 Solid Waste

INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

To: John Paul Castro, Utilities Director

CC: Elizabeth Ignoffo, Permit Engineer
Sue Snider, Purchasing

From: Cheri Smith, City Clerk Cheri Smith/sph

Date: April 2, 2015

Subject: **FINANCIAL CONSULTING SERVICES TO SUPPORT THE CITY'S SOLID WASTE SYSTEM, WASTEWATER SYSTEM, STORMWATER SYSTEM, MARINAS AND ECONOMIC CONSULTING; RFQ 15-002**

The following bids were opened Thursday, April 2, 2015 at 3:00 p.m. in response to the above referenced project.

1. Arcadis U.S. Inc.
   8201 Peters Road, Suite 3400
   Plantation, FL 33324

2. Black & Veatch
   1300 Concord Terrace, Suite 120
   Sunrise, FL 33323

3. CDM Smith, Inc.
   1715 North Westshore Boulevard, Suite 875
   Tampa, FL 33607

4. Raftelis Financial Consultants, Inc.
   950 S. Winter Park Drive, Suite 240
   Casselberry, FL 32707

5. Willdan Financial Services
   200 South Orange Avenue, Suite 1550
   Orlando, FL 32801

CS/sph
RFQ 15-002 Financial Consulting Services Solid Waste, Wastewater, Stormwater Systems