

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission August 23, 2011

DRAFT

Page 1 of 6

Call Meeting To Order

Chairman Rudy Molinet called the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission (HARC) Meeting of August 23, 2011 to order at **3:00 pm** at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510 Greene Street, Key West.

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Commissioners present include Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, Vice Chairman Bryan Green, and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Commissioner Daniel Metzler was absent with consent.

Also, present from City staff: Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, IT Technician Ian Willis, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett.

Approval of Agenda

Chairman Rudy Molinet inquired as to any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa stated items #1, #2a, #2b, and #9 are requested to postpone. The applicant withdrew items #5a and #5b.

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the Agenda changes be **Approved**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

Approval of Minutes

1 August 09, 2011

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the Minutes be **Postponed**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

Old Business

2a Addition at rear -

#617 Mickens Lane – Michael Skoglund (H11-01-855)

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

2b Demolition of back shed -

#617 Mickens Lane – Michael Skoglund (H11-01-855) – First reading

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

3 Remove existing seven front columns and replace.

#1420 White Street – Infinity Builders (H11-01-929) – First Reading

Mitch Sammis of Infinity Builders presented the project. Mr. Sammis provided the requested Engineer's letter, requested pictures, and other additional supporting information to show the total decay of the columns.

No public comment.

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

August 23, 2011

DRAFT

Page 2 of 6

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated staff understands that the existing columns need to be replaced due to state of deterioration. Staff understands that the plans submitted comply with the Guidelines.

The Commissioners discussed the application and were pleased with the additional documentation Mr. Sammis submitted.

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the design portion of the Item be **Passed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 4 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, Mr. Rojas, Chairman Molinet

A motion was made by Mr. Muench, seconded by Mr. Rojas, that the demolition portion of the Item be **Passed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 4 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, Mr. Rojas, Chairman Molinet

- 4** Add third story roof to existing third floor deck, extend floor porch floor over second floor porch, and add a small spa.

#817 Eaton Street – William Horn (H11-01-936)

Bill Horn presented the project along with the owner Christie Plyer.

Mr. Horn requested to come forward with the latest plans to explain the project. They have simplified the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated staff understands that the proposed roof over an existing roof deck will create a third floor. According to the guidelines, this new proposed roof will exceed the two and a half stories regulation for maximum height in the Historic District; the roof rafters of the proposed new roof will not rest on the top plate of the second story wall. (Definition of two and a half stories – page 76 and Guideline 3, page 38a.) Staff understands the problems the owner of this apartment has with water penetration; nevertheless, this approach to minimize water infiltration to the interior of the building is in conflict with the Guidelines. The proposed new roof is inconsistent with the Guidelines for Additions, Alterations, and New Construction.

Commissioners discussed the project. There was an extensive discussion of the two and a half story rule as it relates the project. The Commissioners invited the applicant to come forward to review other roof options, which would comply with the Guidelines. It was determined by the Commissioners that what the applicant has presented cannot be done under the new two and a half story Guidelines. The applicant inquired as if an awning would be acceptable. The Commissioners discussed an awning versus a roof. It was determined that an awning would require a new application. It was determined that it was the preference of the owner to withdraw the project rather than have it denied.

Withdrawn by the owner

**Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
August 23, 2011**

DRAFT

Page 3 of 6

- 5a** Second story addition -
#616 Petronia Street – Carlos Rojas (H11-01-791)

Withdrawn by the owner

- 5b** Demolition of part of existing roof to accommodate second floor -
#616 Petronia Street – Carlos Rojas (H11-01-791)

Withdrawn by the owner

- 6** Remodel two storefronts of existing noncontributing buildings and repaint.
#211A-211B Duval Street – L & M Associates – Donald W. Laukka (H11-01-950)

Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh asked Commissioner Rojas if he needed to recuse himself since he did so when the item was on the August 23, 2011 HARC Meeting Agenda. Commissioner Rojas stated he did not have a conflict of interest.

Bill Horn presented the project along with architect Donald Laukka.

Mr. Horn requested to come forward with the latest plans to explain the project. Mr. Horn explained that the project's renovations intent is to bring it back to looking like one building.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated staff understands the project complies with the Guidelines. This project unifies the façade back to the original building appearance. Staff expects a separate application for signage.

The Commissioners were pleased with the project.

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the Item be **Passed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 4 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, Mr. Rojas, Chairman Molinet

- 7** Installation of white aluminum roof over mobile home.
#813 Galveston Lane – AMS Inc. (H11-01-989)

Mark Moss the Construction Manager for Habitat for Humanity presented the project. Habitat for Humanity is acting as the General Contractor and AMS is the roofing contractor. This is part of the Habitat for Humanity's Repair Program. This is an effort to keep a senior homeowner in safe and affordable housing. Mr. Moss stated that he is aware of the white roof issue and is willing to paint the roof tinted gray.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated staff has discussed the project with Mr. Moss and the only concern is the white roof.

**Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
August 23, 2011**

DRAFT

Page 4 of 6

The Commissioners discussed the Guidelines as related to the white roof. The applicant restated they are willing to paint the roof. A discussion of the need for the additional roof as well as the potential for other means of waterproofing followed.

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the Item be passed as is with a white roof. The motion **Failed** by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 2 - Mr. Green, Mr. Rojas

No: 2 - Mr. Muench, Chairman Molinet

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the Item be **Passed** with the understanding the roof will be painted gray. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 3 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

No: 1 - Mr. Rojas

**9 Construction of new ticket kiosk to replace current vendor area –
#0 Duval Street – Antonio A. Osborn Jr. (H11-01-1073)**

A motion was made by Mr. Nils Muench, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

**10a Install new wood deck and wood fence. Install new sliding glass door for new deck access -
After the Fact
#727 Windsor Lane – Seatech of the Florida Keys (H11-01-1017)**

Brandon Ophlin from Seatech of the Florida Keys presented the project. The project is to build a wood deck and install a new fence. A sliding glass door was installed for access.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this is an After the Fact application for a non-contributing structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated on her report that they built a new wood deck and an eight (8') foot tall fence but the new plans include a six (6') foot tall fence. They have committed to remove the upper part of the fence in order to make the fence six (6') foot tall fence which complies with the Guidelines pages 40 and 41. Staff understands that the Guidelines for Decks pages 39 and 40 should be reviewed particularly Guideline #4 the Proportions of Decking Patio or Pool dimension should not exceed fifty (50%) percent of the total lot minus the building footprint. The Guidelines for fences pages 40 and 41 should be reviewed. Staff does not make recommendations on After the Fact applications.

The Commissioners had an extensive discussion concerning the fences but finally decided the fence on this application is within the Guidelines and the past non-complying fence will need to be addressed by Code Compliance. The Commissioners requested the applicant to agree on the record that the fence will be lowered to six (6') foot tall – which he did.

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the design portion of the Item be **Passed**. The motion carried by the

**Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
August 23, 2011**

DRAFT

Page 5 of 6

following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 4 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, Mr. Rojas, Chairman Molinet

10b Remove existing shed -

After the Fact

#727 Windsor Lane – Seatech of the Florida Keys (H11-01-1017)

Brandon Ophlin from Seatech of the Florida Keys presented the project. The shed was removed to accommodate the new wood deck.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated they partially demolished a non-historic shed. They left the roof and front wall of the shed. Staff understands that the Commission can consider the request for demolition since it is non-historic. Staff does not make recommendations on After the Fact applications.

The Commissioners had a brief discussion to clarify what had taken place.

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Nils Muench, that the demolition portion of the Item be **Passed**. The motion carried by the

following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 4 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Green, Mr. Rojas, Chairman Molinet

11a Renovate existing two-story structure. Construct new wood deck. Provide new set of stairs with covered landing. Replace existing windows. Repair damaged members -

#1009 Grinnell Street – Seatech of the Florida Keys (H11-01-1074)

The applicant requested to **postpone** the item.

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Nils Muench, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 4 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Rojas, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

11b Remove rear deteriorated portion of building -

#1009 Grinnell Street – Seatech of the Florida Keys (H11-01-1074)

The applicant requested to **postpone** the item.

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Nils Muench, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 4 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Rojas, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

12 Replace existing deck with new one. Replace two doors and remove outdoor shower fixtures. Repair portion of existing wood fence -

After the Fact

#721F Windsor Lane – Seatech of the Florida Keys (H11-01-1075)

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission August 23, 2011

DRAFT

Page 6 of 6

Brendon Olflin of Seatech presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this is an After the Fact application for a non-contributing structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated on her report that the fence that they replaced already was outside this owner's property but she had received a letter from the other property authorizing the fence. Staff understands that the Guidelines for Decks pages 39 and 40 should be reviewed particularly Guideline #4 the Proportions of Decking Patio or Pool dimension should not exceed fifty (50%) percent of the total lot minus the building footprint. The Guidelines for fences pages 40 and 41 should be reviewed. Approval of the project has been received from the Home Owners Association. Staff does not make recommendations on After the Fact applications.

Commissioners discussed the project. There was a discussion as to if a variance is needed due to lot coverage. Mr. Rojas reminded the Commissioners that variances are not the concern of this Commission.

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the Item be **Passed**. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Metzler

Yes: 4 - Mr. Muench, Mr. Rojas , Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

8 Removal of rear staircase on the right side of property. No build back – **After the Fact** **#805 Baptist Lane – Conquering Lion Construction (H11-01-1028)**

Item was postponed earlier in the agenda due to the applicant not being present.

Applicant was still not present at the end of the New Business.

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Nils Muench, that the Item be **Postponed**. The motion passed by a unanimous vote.

HARC Planner's Report

Introduction of Panamerican Consultants Inc., and the new Survey of Historic Resources Citywide.

Enid introduced Stacey Griffin from Panamerican Consultants Inc.

Following the presentation, the Commissioners discussed the presentation, made recommendations/suggestions, and next actions.

Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at **5:45 pm.**

Submitted by,
Jo Bennett
Administrative Coordinator
Planning Department