

Additional Information

Karen DeMaria

From: Brian Olson <olsondraftingservices@hotmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, September 7, 2023 11:39 PM
To: Karen DeMaria
Cc: wrowan@gmail.com; keywestmarineassistance@yahoo.com; najagirard@yahoo.com
Subject: [EXTERNAL] 630 Eaton Street Tree Permit# T2023-0234

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.



9-6-2023

Good morning Karen,

I have attached a photo of the tree that is causing problems at 630 Eaton Street.

If this is needed, may it be added to the report for the tree commission meeting on the 12th?

Bill and I inspected the main structure and how the large tree in question appears to be damaging it. The root system of the tree has altered the grade beam and footer of the main structure. Specifically at the location of a main column supporting the deck at the second floor. The roots have pushed up the footing and in turn has lifted the floor framing creating voids and cracks in the deck above. Water intrusion is an issue as shown in the photo below with rotting at the ceiling. We recommend the removal of the tree because of the continued damage the root system will cause to the historic structure. If the tree in question is to be uprooted by mother nature, The damage to the main structure and other adjacent property that is easily in reach will be major.

If you have any questions, please let me know.

Warmly,
Brian





La Isla Tree Care Company
81001 Overseas Highway
Islamorada, FL 33036

Via e-mail to: office@laislatree.com

**RE: Proposal for Certified Arborist Support Services
630 Eaton St, Key West Monroe County, FL**

La Isla Tree Care Company:

Parobok Environmental, LLC (PE) is providing this report as a record of our assessment of one Spanish Lime (*Melicoccus bijugatus*) on the above referenced property. This assessment was conducted by an International Society of Arboriculture Certified Arborist in general accordance with the ANSI A300 Standards for Tree Risk Assessment and associated Best Management Practices (BMP) companion book.

Recommendations

The Spanish Lime is in poor condition due to decay, cracks in the canopy, and cavities with insect signs. Due to the tree's health and location, this tree is recommended for removal.

A Level II Tree Risk Assessment was performed and rates this tree as "High" risk. Due to the close proximity of the house and walkway, the above referenced tree presents a danger to both persons and property. Per Florida Statue 163.045, a local government may not require a notice, application, approval, permit, fee, or mitigation for the pruning, trimming, or removal of this tree.

It is recommended that the owner maintains a copy of this assessment on record to present to local government should the validity of the removal be questioned.

Limitations

The assessment performed on the trees described above was based on visual observations. No invasive procedures, measurements, or samples were taken. Should the owner desire more detail regarding this tree, a Level III Tree Risk Assessment is recommended.

Following is a general description of the condition of the Spanish Lime tree referenced above on the property, along with an assessment of the viability of the tree to remain based on location and condition.

Condition ratings are as follows:

Good - no major physical or health defects were observed that are anticipated to compromise the long-term health or viability of the tree.

Fair - physical and/or health defects were observed which may compromise the long-term health or viability of the tree, but are able to be corrected or managed to minimize their effects.

Poor - physical and/or health defects were observed which are anticipated to directly lead to the death or physical failure of the tree, and are not correctable through typical arboricultural practices.

Dead - tree either completely dead or effectively destroyed

Sincerely,
PAROBOK ENVIRONMENTAL, LLC

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Dan Parobok', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Daniel Parobok
ISA Certified Arborist FL-6801A
ISA Tree Risk Qualified

Tree No. 1: Spanish Lime (*Melicoccus bijugatus*) – 38" DBH. This tree is in **poor** condition. The tree has an actively failing major limb in the canopy that is recommended to be removed as soon as possible to mitigate risk. Overall, this tree has signs of prior wounding with some decay present. At the base of the crown of the tree, just below the limb juncture, a cavity with heartwood decay was observed. Signs of insects in the cavity were observed. This cavity with decay will likely affect the structural integrity of the tree crown. Cracks with flaking bark were observed at bends in three major limbs. The trunk of this tree is located within two feet of a building and less than a foot away from a walkway. The tree canopy covers a portion of the house and walkway. The tree appears to have been reduced by approximately fifty percent over the past five years. Further reduction of the canopy of this tree may affect the viability of the tree with minimal risk reduction. Further reduction pruning is not recommended at this time. Due to the tree's health and location, this tree is candidate for **removal**.



Decay on trunk



Cavity with decay



Cracking and peeling bark on major limb



Decay and cracking a limb junction



Tree Proximity to house



Overall view of the tree



Basic Tree Risk Assessment Form

Client Los Angeles tree care company Date 9-10-27 Time _____
 Address/Tree location 690 BAYVIEW ST Tree no. 1 Sheet 1 of 1
 Tree species Spanish lime dbh 32" Height 35' Crown spread dia. 25'
 Assessor(s) Daniel Pugh Tools used 1-10 ft Time frame 1 hr

Target Assessment

Target number	Target description	Target protection	Target zone			Occupancy rate 1 - rare 2 - occasional 3 - frequent 4 - constant	Practical to move target?	Restriction practical?
			Target within drip line	Target within 1x Ht.	Target within 1.5x Ht.			
1	Residential building	none	X			3	no	no
2	walkway	none	X			2	no	no
3								
4								

Site Factors

History of failures unknown Topography Flat ☒ Slope ☐ % Aspect _____
 Site changes None ☒ Grade change ☐ Site clearing ☐ Changed soil hydrology ☐ Root cuts ☐ Describe _____
 Soil conditions Limited volume ☒ Saturated ☐ Shallow ☐ Compacted ☐ Pavement over roots ☒ % Describe brick walkway
 Prevailing wind direction SE Common weather Strong winds ☒ Ice ☐ Snow ☐ Heavy rain ☐ Describe _____

Tree Health and Species Profile

Vigor Low ☐ Normal ☒ High ☐ Foliage None (seasonal) ☐ None (dead) ☐ Normal 70 % Chlorotic 30 % Necrotic 0 %
 Pests/Biotic signs observed in canopy Abiotic N/A
 Species failure profile Branches ☒ Trunk ☐ Roots ☐ Describe weak attachment

Load Factors

Wind exposure Protected ☐ Partial ☒ Full ☐ Wind funneling ☐ Relative crown size Small ☒ Medium ☐ Large ☐
 Crown density Sparse ☐ Normal ☒ Dense ☐ Interior branches Few ☐ Normal ☒ Dense ☐ Vines/Mistletoe/Moss ☐
 Recent or expected change in load factors recent reduction pine adjacent

Tree Defects and Conditions Affecting the Likelihood of Failure

— Crown and Branches —

Unbalanced crown ☐ LCR 30 %
 Dead twigs/branches ☐ % overall _____ Max. dia. _____
 Broken/Hangers Number _____ Max. dia. _____
 Over-extended branches ☐
 Pruning history
 Crown cleaned ☐ Thinned ☐ Raised ☐
 Reduced ☒ Topped ☐ Lion-tailed ☐
 Flush cuts ☐ Other _____

Cracks ☒ Lightning damage ☐
 Codominant ☐ Included bark ☒
 Weak attachments ☒ Cavity/Nest hole 10 % circ.
 Previous branch failures ☐ Similar branches present ☐
 Dead/Missing bark ☒ Cankers/Galls/Burls ☐ Sapwood damage/decay ☒
 Conks ☐ Heartwood decay ☒
 Response growth old response growth noted

crown junction to trunk Condition(s) of concern major limb w/ cracks

Part Size 30" dia Fall Distance 35'

Load on defect N/A ☐ Minor ☐ Moderate ☐ Significant ☒
 Likelihood of failure Improbable ☐ Possible ☐ Probable ☒ Imminent ☐

Part Size 12" dia limb Fall Distance 30'

Load on defect N/A ☐ Minor ☐ Moderate ☒ Significant ☐
 Likelihood of failure Improbable ☐ Possible ☐ Probable ☐ Imminent ☒

— Trunk —

Dead/Missing bark ☐ Abnormal bark texture/color ☐
 Codominant stems ☐ Included bark ☐ Cracks ☐
 Sapwood damage/decay ☐ Cankers/Galls/Burls ☐ Sap ooze ☐
 Lightning damage ☐ Heartwood decay ☐ Conks/Mushrooms ☐
 Cavity/Nest hole _____ % circ. Depth _____ Poor taper ☐
 Lean _____° Corrected? _____

Response growth _____

Condition(s) of concern _____

Part Size _____ Fall Distance _____

Load on defect N/A ☐ Minor ☐ Moderate ☐ Significant ☐

Likelihood of failure Improbable ☐ Possible ☐ Probable ☐ Imminent ☐

— Roots and Root Collar —

Collar buried/Not visible ☐ Depth _____ Stem girdling ☐
 Dead ☐ Decay ☐ Conks/Mushrooms ☐
 Ooze ☐ Cavity ☐ % circ. _____
 Cracks ☐ Cut/Damaged roots ☐ Distance from trunk _____
 Root plate lifting ☐ Soil weakness ☐

Response growth _____

Condition(s) of concern _____

Part Size _____ Fall Distance _____

Load on defect N/A ☐ Minor ☐ Moderate ☐ Significant ☐

Likelihood of failure Improbable ☐ Possible ☐ Probable ☐ Imminent ☐

[illegible]

Likelihood of Failure	Likelihood of Impact			
	Very low	Low	Medium	High
Imminent	Unlikely	Somewhat likely	Likely	Very likely
Probable	Unlikely	Unlikely	Somewhat likely	Likely
Possible	Unlikely	Unlikely	Unlikely	Somewhat likely
Improbable	Unlikely	Unlikely	Unlikely	Unlikely

Likelihood of Failure & Impact	Consequences of Failure			
	Negligible	Minor	Significant	Severe
Very likely	Low	Moderate	High	Extreme
Likely	Low	Moderate	High	High
Somewhat likely	Low	Low	Moderate	Moderate
Unlikely	Low	Low	Low	Low

Investigation options

1. Remove cracked Linb ASAP. Removal reduces risk from that Linb <u>only</u>	Residual risk <u>none / High</u>
2.	Residual risk
3.	Residual risk
4.	Residual risk

Overall residual risk ☐ None ☐ Low ☐ Moderate ☒ High ☐ Extreme

Inspection limitations ☒None ☐Visibility ☐Access ☐Vines ☐Root collar buried Describe

Paul A. Meador

Paul A. Meador

Certified ISA Arborist: FL-6341A

An inspection of the Spanish Lane specimen tree revealed more than five serious defects. Unfortunately, restoration trimming is not a viable option.

I recommend this tree be removed; for safety reasons: ie targets, insurance, termite (city statute 110.259) and dying condition of tree canopy's structure! The present damage is such, that this tree is very dangerous. In addition, the termite treatments were unsuccessful.

Defects observed: massive trunk wounds, (exploding bark, poor aspect ratio, crossing limbs, and decay,

8/10-2023 *PM*

PAUL A. MEADOR

ISA CERTIFIED ARBORIST FL 6341-A

ISA CERTIFIED ARBORIST ASSESSMENT OF SPANISH LIME TREE AT 630 EATON STREET

In August of 2020, there was an inspection of this Spanish Lime tree at 630 Eaton.

Because it prevented a clear and present danger then, an ISA document per FL St 163.045 was issued on 8/31/2020. The homeowners were advised the tree should be removed in 2020.

The limb structure presented problems, there was crown dieoff, signs of disease, and insects.

The tree trunk and roots were dangerously close to the historical home and the canopy had overtaken the roof and deck. These limbs had to be trimmed to meet insurance requirements, and also to prevent dangerous conditions to people and property in high winds. The tree had no canopy in the lower 40% of the trunk which might have allowed a further height reduction.

In 2020, this tree showed signs of termite infestation at the base of the trunk. The bark was falling off in areas throughout the tree. The assessment then was that the tree would NOT make it through a hurricane intact. It is a stand-alone tree in an open area with the canopy extending well beyond the rooflines. The targets should the limbs or trunk fail were: people, vehicles, utilities, homes, and property. None of these targets are acceptable risks within the ISA Risk Assessment.

Nor can any of the tree problems be mitigated to a risk "BELOW MODERATE", which is the ISA standard for determining whether a tree should be removed. Below moderate is LOW.

LOW RISK means tree or tree parts failure in a storm or flood is unlikely, and the consequences of failure is a bruise or scratch, damage to lawn or landscape, or minor disruption of traffic on a low traffic neighborhood street.

The tree at 630 Eaton fails every area of the ISA Risk and Assessment rules, and is deemed an imminent threat.

The probability of failure in 2020 was high. The probability of failure now is imminent. The tree is dying. Bark is falling off. The termite damage is extensive and cannot be undone. The tree is likely riddled with tunnels and hollow limbs and trunk.

City code 110.259 requires treatment or removal. Treatment is not an option for this dying tree. Removal is now the only option.

This determination is based on annual evaluations documenting the trees decline for over 3 years, and using the following 2017 ISA Risk and Assessment rules and recommendations.



TARZAN TREE CARE, INC.
22976 BLUEGILL LANE
CUDJOE KEY FL 33042
305-304-9303

ISA CERTIFIED ARBORIST
PAUL A. MEADOR
FL 6341 A

PROPERTY OWNER DOCUMENTATION

Pursuant to House Bill Ch.2019-155 Property Owner Bill Of Rights and Florida Statute 163.045: Action may be taken on any tree located on private property to eliminate a danger to persons or property if documented by an ISA Certified Arborist or Florida licensed landscape architect.

The

Spanish Lime

tree species

located on private property at:

630 Eaton St. Key West
address

was deemed to pose a danger by ISA Certified Arborist Paul A. Meador FL 6341A

8/31-2020

date

Signed: Paul A. Meador FL-6341A Paul A. Meador

****NOTES:**