

City of Key West, FL

City Hall 1300 White Street Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, June 24, 2025 5:00 PM City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3811 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

FOR VISUAL PRESENTATIONS: For City Commission meetings the City Clerk's Office will need a copy of all presentations for the agenda at least 7 days before the meeting.

Call Meeting to Order - 5:00 P.M.

Roll Call

Absent 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Present 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations,

Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Approval of Agenda

The agenda was unanimously approved including the request to withdraw Items 6 & 7.

Administering the Oath by the Clerk of the Commission

Approval of Minutes

1 May 27, 2025

> Attachments: **Minutes**

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Moody, to approve the Minutes. The motion passed by unanimous vote.

HARC Planner's Report

City Attorney's Report

Old Business

Two new carports at front and side of property over existing parking spaces - 1218 Duval Street - Moshe Gvili (C2025-0005)

Attachments: *Large Item* 1218 Duval Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Denied based on cited Guidelines, specifically Guideline 5 (page 40) and Guideline 10 (38-k). The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Second Reading - Demolition of historic one-story wood-frame residential structure, decks, walkways, and pool - 1222 Seminary Street - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0036)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 1222 Seminary Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

New ticket booth and reconfiguration of existing brick pathway at the site of the Hemingway House, individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places - 907
Whitehead Street - Nautilus Drafting & Design Services (C2025-0037)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 907 Whitehead Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Green, that the Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Demolition of existing ticket booth at the site of the

3

2

Hemingway House, individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places - 907 Whitehead Street - Nautilus Drafting & Design Services (C2025-0037)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 907 Whitehead Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Green, that the Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Request to Withdraw by Applicant - Elevation of existing historic two-story wood-frame residence about 3'9", new addition on north and east sides, vertical extension of roofline for increased ceiling height, new foundation, new porch stairs, and site improvements - 309 William Street - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0040)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 309 William Street

This item was withdrawn by staff upon agenda approval.

Request to Withdraw by Applicant - Demolition of existing non-historic rear shed structures and partial demolition of historic structure to accommodate new addition - 309 William Street - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0040)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 309 William Street - Demolition

This item was withdrawn by staff upon agenda approval.

New cottage, cabana with open sides and louvered wall, decks, pool, and site improvements - 903 Frances Street - Bob Hulec (C2025-0042)

Attachments: *Large Item* 903 Frances Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Nations, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

6

7

9

Replacement of existing metal shingles with 5V-crimp metal roofing on historic structure - **402 South Street - Hugh J. Morgan (C2025-0049)**

Attachments: *Large Item* 402 South Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Nations, to approve the use of 5 v-crimp on the side exposed to the water and staff approval for metal shingles on the elevation facing South Street. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

New Business

10

11

Opening of a section of the front elevation for new storefront to match existing and enclosure of breezeway on historic structure. Renovations to interior of bank to accommodate new restaurant - 510 Southard Street - Juan Carlos Pernas (C2025-0053)

Attachments: *Large Item* 510 Southard Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved. Any new signage shall require staff review and approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Partial demolition of front elevation to accommodate storefront and removal of gate in breezeway. Demolition of interior walls and floor - 510 Southard Street - Juan Carlos Pernas (C2025-0053)

Attachments: *Large Item* 510 Southard Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Perez, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

12

Renovations to two-story non-historic structure. New one-story addition on south elevation and site improvements - 114 Admirals Lane - M. Stratton Architecture (C2025-0054)

Attachments: *Large Item* 114 Admirals Lane

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Demolition of one-story non-historic bump out at south elevation - 114 Admirals Lane - M. Stratton Architecture (C2025-0054)

Attachments: *Large Item* 114 Admirals Lane - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Renovations to historic house. New one-story rear addition. Reconstruction of wooden stairs and second story deck, new pool, and site improvements - 916 Simonton Street - Serge Mashtakov, PE (C2025-0055)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 916 Simonton Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Osborn, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Demolition of historic one-story frame additions. Demolition of existing front balcony, wooden staircase, existing cistern

13

14

in rear, and concrete walkways - 916 Simonton Street - Serge Mashtakov, PE (C2025-0055)

Attachments: *Large Item* 916 Simonton Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Perez, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

New covered porch at rear and side of historic house - 707 Simonton Street - Robert L Delaune Architect, p.a. (C2025-0056)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 707 Simonton Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Osborn, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved with the condition that if it is necessary to demolish the existing wood picket fence on the south elevation shielding the view of the rear porch from the right-of-way, that a new wood fence is built to match the previous in kind. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Demolition of existing non-historic rear deck, covered porch, and outdoor shower. Removal of existing 6' fence - 707 Simonton Street - Robert L Delaune Architect, p.a. (C2025-0056)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 707 Simonton Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Renovations to historic one-story house. New accessory structure, new covered entry porch on west elevation, new decking, new one-story addition on north elevation, and site

16

improvements - 417 Elizabeth Street Rear - William Rowan (C2025-0057)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 417 Elizabeth Street rear

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Perez, that the Item be Postponed to July 22, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Partial demolition of covered Florida room on south elevation to extend gable roof, removal of deck in north elevation, partial demolition of walls in north elevation to accommodate new addition, and demolition of existing pool

- 417 Elizabeth Street Rear - William Rowan (C2025-0057)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 417 Elizabeth Street rear - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Postponed to July 22, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Renovations to historic house. New addition on north elevation behind screen porch, new pool, new cabana, new addition at rear, and site improvements - 812 Carsten Lane - Alex Sainato (C2025-0058)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 812 Carsten Lane

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Perez, to only approve the new addition on north elevation behind screen porch, addition at rear, and window option number one (1). The applicant must submit separate plans for the proposed pool and cabana. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

19

21

Partial demolition of existing front wall behind screened porch and rear wall to accommodate additions, removal of rear concrete slabs - 812 Carsten Lane - Alex Sainato (C2025-0058)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 812 Carsten Lane - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Perez, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

New Fort Zachary Taylor visitor center and site improvements - 601 Howard England Way - Bender & Associates Architects (C2025-0059)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 601 Howard England Way

A motion was made by Chairman Burkee, seconded by Commissioner Moody, to nominate Commissioner Green as Acting Chairman for this Item. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Burkee and Commissioner Perez recused themselves from Items 22 & 23 and left the dais.

A motion was made by Commissioner Osborn, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item by Approved. The motion carried by the following vote.

Recuse: 2 - Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 4 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, and

Commissioner Osborn

Demolition of existing non-historic one-story restroom structure. Removal of wood ramp and concrete walkways -601 Howard England Way - Bender & Associates Architects (C2025-0059)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 601 Howard England Way - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item by Approved. The motion carried by the following vote.

22

Recuse: 2 - Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 4 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, and

Commissioner Osborn

After the fact - Renovations to contributing structure. Enclosure and extension of <u>existing</u> rear/side second story porch and extension of rear first floor. <u>New</u> full width two-story open porch in rear. Addition of hip roof over second story covered porch - **1301 Whitehead Street - Peter Janker (C2025-0061)**

Attachments: *Large Item* 1301 Whitehead Street

Chairman Burkee and Commissioner Perez returned to the dais.

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the after the fact renovations to only the main structure be Approved, reserving for later staff approval of materials, railings, lattice and balusters. Further, the proposed two-story garage was not included as part of this application and must be submitted as a separate proposal at a later date. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Commissioner Osborn

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 5 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

After the fact - Partial demolition of rear section of first floor and second story covered porch - 1301 Whitehead Street - Peter Janker (C2025-0061)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 1301 Whitehead Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 6 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

New two-story single-family residence, one and a half story accessory structure, pool, and site improvements - **704**

24

Russell Lane - Bert Bender, Architect (C2025-0062)

Attachments: *Large Item* 704 Russell Lane

A motion was made by Chairman Burkee, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, to nominate Commissioner Green as Acting Chairman for this Item. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Burkee recused himself from the Item and left the dais.

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Postponed to July 22, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Chairman Burkee

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 5 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations,

Commissioner Osborn, and Commissioner Perez

Demolition of non-historic carport and brick paving - 704 Russell Lane - Bert Bender, Architect (C2025-0062)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 704 Russell Lane - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Postponed to July 22, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 1 - Chairman Burkee

Absent: 1 - Commissioner Oropeza

Yes: 5 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations,

Commissioner Osborn, and Commissioner Perez

Chairman Burkee returned to the dais.

Public Comments

Commissioner Comments

Adjournment - 8:37 P.M.