



## City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall  
510 Greene Street  
Key West, FL 33040

# Meeting Minutes Historic Architectural Review Commission

---

Tuesday, July 12, 2011

3:00 PM

Old City Hall

---

**ADA Assistance:** If you are a person with a disability who needs special accommodations in order to participate in this proceeding, including requesting materials in accessible format, a sign language interpreter or other assistance (5 days advance notice required), or information on access available to individuals with disabilities, please contact the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3951 between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. If you are hearing or voice impaired, please call 305-809-1000.

### Call to Order Pledge of Allegiance Roll Call

Commissioners present included Daniel Metzler, Nils Muench, Carlos Rojas, and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also present from city staff Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Preservation Planner Enid Torregrosa, and Recording Secretary Patrick Wright.

### Approval of Agenda

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the agenda; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

### Approval of Minutes

1 June 14, 2011

Nils Muench requested that the language under the HARC Planner's Report change to: Nils Muench stated that he was not in favor of increasing the number of board members.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the minutes; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

### Action Items

- 2 New location for the HARC meeting of July 26, 2011- Habana Plaza Conference room, 3140 Flagler Avenue 3:00 PM.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the new location; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

### Old Business

- 3 New house, pool, fence and garage on vacant lot - #817 Waddell Avenue-Thomas E. Pope (H11-01-714)

Tom Pope presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve. Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Carlos Rojas stated that it was an inauthentic reproduction of a historic conch house.

Daniel Metzler stated that it was a narrow house on a wide lot with a side addition and he was not in support of it.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Muench.

POSTPONED

- 4 Remove existing wood staircase and replace with metal. Landing and treads will be covered with wood-  
**#224 Duval Street # 427 Caroline Street- Wade Ferrel (H11-01-738)- Second reading**

Mehdi Benkhatar presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 5 Second story addition and demolition of shed on back of lot- **#616 Petronia Street- Carlos Rojas (H11-01-791)**

Carlos Rojas recused himself from the dais.

Carlos Rojas presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve the second reading for demolition of the shed; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**New Business**

- 6** Demolition of existing storage shed. Construction of pool, new deck and wood fence- **#1110 Fleming Street- Guillermo Orozco (H11-01-798)**

Guillermo Orozco presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 7** Reconstruction of mid nineteen century kitchen and living quarters- **#205 Whitehead Street- RJ Heisenbottle Architects (H11-01-825)**

Richard Heisenbottle presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench stated that it is against the guidelines to construct a simulated historic structure.

Daniel Metzler stated that he was not in support of reconstructing a historic structure if the applicant is unsure of what the structure looked like originally.

Rudy Molinet asked the applicant how far the proposed kitchen is offset from the original location.

Richard Heisenbottle stated that it was 20' offset.

Nils Muench stated that they needed more data. He added that the applicant can not place a new building at an incorrect location and then refer to it as a slave quarters or a kitchen.

Enid Torregrosa stated that they did not have Sanborn maps from the mid nineteenth century to determine if slave quarters did exist. She added that the kitchen is not proposed in the same location as the building stood on the Sanborn maps and full evidence would be needed to allow for reconstruction of a slave quarters.

Richard Heisenbottle stated that they wanted to amend the application as to the effect that the proposed structures were not reconstruction; therefore they should not have to come under the Secretary of Interior's Standards.

Nils Muench made a motion to deny based on the page 16 numbers 1-5. The motion failed due to lack of a second.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: Commissioner Muench

POSTPONED

**8 Construction of three bay front porch- #1315 United Street- William Rowan (H11-01-832)**

William Rowan presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**9** Replace metal shingles with v-crimp. Economic Hardship request-**#810 Carsten Lane- Raymond Russell (H11-01-838)**

Raymond Russell presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**10** Attached addition to side of structure- **#803 Olivia Street- Michael Skoglund (H11-01-845)**

Michael Skoglund presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**11** Replace rear addition in same footprint. Replace T1-11 siding with hardiboard lap siding. New swimming pool and deck- **#409 Catherine Street- Annalise Mannix (H11-01-852)**

Annalise Mannix presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler for discussion.

Rudy Molinet stated that he was not in support because of page 40 guideline number 4.

Nils Muench stated that the commission should not disregard the guidelines.

Carlos Rojas stated that it is an undersized lot.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler and Rojas.

Nays: Commissioners Muench and Chairman Molinet.

Motion failed due to tie.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the design with the applicant's alterations of reducing the new proposed deck coming back at the second reading; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**12 Demolition of back shed and addition at rear- #617 Mickens Lane- Michael Skoglund (H11-01-855)**

Michael Skoglund presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas stated that he was in favor of the project.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Carlos Rojas for discussion.

Rudy Molinet stated that he was not in support and felt the addition was too large.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler and Rojas.

Nays: Commissioners Muench and Chairman Molinet.

Motion failed due to a tie.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Metzler, Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

- 13** Demolition of pool, laundry, shed and portion of back cottage. Demolition of front porch of 1214 Petronia. New addition to connect both houses. New covered porch on back. Replace windows and doors- ~~#1214-~~ **1216 Petronia Street- Dar Castillo, Affiliated Design and Constr. Mgrs. (H11-01-860)**

Daniel Metzler recused himself from the dais.

Dar Castillo presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas asked the applicant if they were amendable to lowering the roof.

The applicant stated they would be amendable to lowering the roof.

Rudy Molinet stated that he was in support of lowering the roof.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the design with the applicant bringing back plans at the second reading for demolition that showed the roof connector lowered 18"; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 14** Renovation of existing house, including new piers. Request to elevate the house 6". New pergola, shed and pool house. New swimming pool and deck. Additions under existing roof at rear and reroofing existing rear portion of house- **#618 Grinnell Street- Tony Lineberry (H11-01-863)**

Tony Lineberry presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded for discussion by Nils Muench.

Rudy Molinet echoed staff's concerns and suggested the applicant incorporate staff's comments. Carlos Rojas withdrew his motion to postpone; Nils Muench withdrew his second to postpone.

Carlos Rojas asked staff what the issue was in objection number 4 of the staff report.

Enid Torregrosa indicated that the issue was that the trellis was attached to the house.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve with the exceptions that the north side pergola be detached from the house, the shutters be wood rather than composite, and the windows be true divided light; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

- 15** New addition with breezeway connection and window replacement- **#1207 Pine Street- Matthew Stratton (H11-01-867)**

Matthew Stratton presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve. Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Daniel Metzler stated that the addition was too close to the front façade.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to postpone; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

POSTPONED

Carlos Rojas was excused at 5:34 pm.

**16** Replace existing rear portion with new two story- **#522 Grinnell Street- Seatech of the Florida Keys (H11-01-869)**

Mehdi Benkhatar presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the design incorporating staff's comments; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Nils Muench made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Metzler, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**17** Restoration of eyebrow house. Demolition of back portion and detached metal garage. New pool, deck and porch on accessory structure-**#1016 James Street- Michael Miller (H11-01-872)**

Chairman Molinet recused himself.

Michael Miller presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report.

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the design; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Rojas, and Chairman Metzler.

Nays: None

APPROVED

Carlos Rojas made a motion to approve the first reading for demolition; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Rojas, and Metzler.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**18 Mobile cart for food vending-#424 Greene Street-One Call Construction (H11-01-874)**

David Pouliot presented the project.

No public comment.

Enid Torregrosa reviewed the project.

Daniel Metzler made a motion to approve; the motion was seconded by Nils Muench.

The Chairman requested the clerk call the roll.

Yeas: Commissioners Muench, Metzler, and Chairman Molinet.

Nays: None

APPROVED

**HARC Planner's Report  
Comments from Commissioners  
Adjournment**

Nils Muench made a motion to adjourn; the motion was seconded by Daniel Metzler. Motion carried.

Interested parties may appear at the public meeting and be heard with respect to the proposed items. Copies of the applications are available from the City of Key West Planning Department located at 3140 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida, Monday through Friday between the hours of 8:00 am and 5:00 pm. Applications can also be viewed online at [www.keywestcity.com](http://www.keywestcity.com).

Anyone who may wish to appeal any decision made by the HARC Commission at this meeting will need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceeding is made which includes the testimony and evidence which the appeal will be based. Florida Statute 286.0105.

Please note that one or more City Commission members and/or Planning Board members may be present at this meeting.

