

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 1 of 14

Call Meeting To Order

Chairman Rudy Molinet called the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission (HARC) Meeting of November 09, 2011 to order at **6:00 pm** at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510 Greene Street, Key West.

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Commissioners present include Carlos Rojas, Barbara Bowers, Daniel Metzler, Vice Chairman Bryan Green, and Chairman Rudy Molinet.

Also, present from City staff: Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, IT Director Patti McLaughlin, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett.

Approval of Agenda

Chairman Rudy Molinet inquired as to any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa stated there were no changes.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the Agenda with no changes be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous voice vote.

Approval of Minutes

1 October 26, 2011

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the Minutes be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous voice vote.

Old Business

2 William Weech American Legion Post 168. the American Legion, Inc. - Proposed nomination to the National Register of Historic Places- **#803 Emma Street- Millicent Lunette Weech**

Ms. Millicent Weech who has been the driving force behind the work to request the building be placed on the National Register stated that during the HARC Workshop it was discussed that due to the building being in disrepair it would be better to request the building be placed on the City's contributing resource list and then once repairs are in place the application for the National Register could be re-submitted. Ms. Weech thanked the HARC commission for their help and understanding of the importance of the building.

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated the building located at #803 Emma Street is a two story reinforce concrete and block structure that was built in 1952. The Executive Committee of the William Weech American Legion Post 168

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 2 of 14

authorized the nomination. The building was built 50 years ago.

The building was first recorded in the 1976 Historic Survey as was classified as non-contributing. In the 1983 Survey was also classified as non-contributing. In the 1998 and 2004 Surveys the building was not included as a contributing resource. The building was already 50 years old in 2002.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that according to the city database there are no outstanding building permits for this property. However a Certificate of Appropriateness, #11-01-93, for the Restoration of the building was approved by this Commission on July 13, 2010. The Planning Board approved the necessary variances for the project on November 10, 2010.

Ms. Torregrosa continued by stating that Key West has two historic districts listed in the National Register of Historic Places, Key West Historic District (boundaries revised in 1983) and the US Naval Station, which is still under military domain. Twelve structures are individually listed as well as two objects, Japanese Midget Submarine and the Western Union Schooner. The USCG Cutter Ingham is listed as a National Landmark, the highest rank a building, site or object can receive from the Secretary of the Interior.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the building at 803 Emma Street be added to the City's contributing resource list. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

- 3** Demolition of part of rear wall to create a temporary 8' by 8' opening for removal of interior material, infill with concrete blocks and install a new single service door- **#211 Duval Street- Donald Laukka- William Horn (H11-01-1363) -Second Reading**

Bill Horn presented the project stating that he did not have anything to add from the last meeting and the application. Mr. Horn remained available to respond to the Commissioners questions.

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this staff report is for the second reading of an after the fact partial demolition of a back wall. The building located on #211 Duval Street is not listed in the surveys. The partial demolition was done in order to remove interior material. A previous Certificate of Appropriateness was approved for the remodeling of the front façade. On October 26, 2011 the Commission approved the after the fact demolition since the building is not historic.

Ms. Torregrosa stated this is an after the fact application therefore staff does not make recommendations.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 3 of 14

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

New Business

4 2012 HARC Public Meetings Schedule

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa stated this is proposed schedule for 2012. Ms. Torregrosa noted that the proposed schedule has only one (1) meeting scheduled for December 2012 and all other months have two (2) meetings per month. 2011 was the first time we scheduled only one meeting in December.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous voice vote.

5a Repairs of two stories wrap porch, including frame, columns and deck boards. New wood stoops and steps for the back side of the house - #1017 Eaton Street – David Knoll (H11-01-1409)

David Knoll presented the project. Mr. Knoll stated this is a Habitat for Humanity project and that the historic residence at 1017 Eaton Street has suffered extensive structural damage, most notably the upper level balconies and the columns and framing supporting them as well as the decking. Besides the damage being due to the ravages of time, the columns themselves have rotted at their bases due to water damage caused by the concrete masonry piers and concrete bases that were added to the columns in the recent past. Mr. Knoll stated that the project is necessary to meet the health, safety and welfare requirements of the Florida Building Code. Mr. Knoll added that the structural framing of the balconies will require extensive repair, augmentation or addition to make them safe and usable by the elderly owner.

Public Comments:

Mr. Richard Spada of 1015 Eaton Street, the next door neighbor, spoke strongly in favor of the project.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this staff report is for the review of the repairs of the two story wood wrap porch including structural elements such as beam and columns as well as new wood stoops and steps for the north east first floor side of the house. The building located on #1017 Eaton Street is listed in the surveys as a contributing resource. The two story frame vernacular house was built c. 1906. The structure has a singular wrap porch with gingerbread railings on the second floor and has aluminum siding. At some point the first floor porch was altered; concrete block bases

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 4 of 14

were built around the posts and decorative concrete blocks were installed as railings. Concrete tile resembling marble, known in Key West as *Cuban tiles*, was also installed. The house presents decay of structural members; the wooden second floor porch also presents serious decay due to water damage.

This proposed project is under the auspice of Habitat for Humanity "A *brush with kindness*" program. The existing columns are regular wood posts with chamfered corners. At this point in the project there is not a final assessment of the structural integrity of each existing column. New wooden steps will be built on the northeast side of the house to give access to the grounds.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans are consistent with the guidelines. Understanding that at this point there is not enough documentation as to the extent of the structural integrity of the existing columns, it is staff's belief that plans showing which columns will need to be replaced must be submitted for final approval. All new replaced elements will be made of wood. Staff understands that the proposed wood steps on the northeast side of the house will not have any effect on the historic site.

Commission Discussion:

Chairman Molinet inquired if Commissioner Metzler would need to recuse himself since he is the Vice President of Habitat for Humanity. Mr. Ramsingh asked Mr. Metzler if he received any pay for his position with Habitat for Humanity. Mr. Metzler stated "no – volunteer position". Mr. Ramsingh asked Mr. Metzler if he felt he could be fair and impartial in hearing the proposal. Mr. Metzler stated "yes". With those questions and answers it was decided Mr. Metzler could participate in the discussion and decisions for the item.

Mr. Metzler inquired as to how long it is going to take. Mr. Knoll stated that once the construction documents are submitted to the City it is expected to take a month to a month and a half to complete.

Mr. Molinet inquired who would be doing the work – volunteers or a general contractor? Mr. Knoll responded "both".

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved** with the stipulation that Mr. Knoll supply a plan of what columns will be replaced as soon as the exploratory demolition is completed.

The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

- 5b** Removal of concrete column bases and concrete block railings on first floor porch. Removal of back side wood deck- **#1017 Eaton Street – David Knoll (H11-01-1409)**

David Knoll presented the project. Mr. Knoll stated this is for the demolition portion of the project which was just discussed. Mr. Knoll added that this is to remove a non historic concrete block elements of the first floor and the removal of a non historic deck on the back side of the house. The goal is to make the house safe and usable by the elderly owner.

Public Comments:

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 5 of 14

Mr. Richard Spada of 1015 Eaton Street, the next door neighbor, spoke strongly in favor of the project.

There were no additional public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is for a demolition request of non-historic concrete block architectural elements on the first floor wrap porch and the removal of a non historic deck on the back side of the house. The building located on #1017 Eaton Street is listed in the surveys as a contributing resource. The two story frame vernacular house was built c. 1906. The structure has a singular wrap porch with gingerbread railings on the second floor. The house has aluminum siding. At some point the first floor porch was altered; concrete block bases were built around the posts and decorative concrete blocks were installed as railings. Concrete tile resembling marble, known in Key West as *Cuban tiles*, was also installed. The house presents decay of structural members; the wooden second floor porch also presents serious decay due to water damage. This proposed project is under the auspice of Habitat for Humanity *A brush with kindness* program. After the removal of the non-historical concrete elements it is proposed to study the state of decay of all columns in order to make a determination of how compromise the structural support is and how many columns will need to be replaced. The existing columns are regular wood posts with chamfered corners.

It is staff's belief that the existing concrete block bases of the columns as well as the decorative concrete blocks used as railings on the first floor are not historic and detracts from the historic character of the house. The existing deck located on the north east side of the house is also a non-historic element that, if removed, will not have any effect on the house. Staff understands that this request can be considered by the Commission since the elements that are proposed to be demolished are not historic and do not contribute to the historic integrity of the house. Staff understands that plans showing which columns will need to be replaced must be submitted for final approval. If approved, this request will required a second reading for demolition.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved** with the stipulation that Mr. Knoll supply a plan of what columns will be replaced as soon as the exploratory demolition is completed. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

- 6** Restore all exterior doors and door frames to original appearance. Replace un-repairable doors with five or six horizontal panel doors as per cut sheets - **#812 Southard Street – Old Harris School- Phil Tannura, LLC (H11-01-1411)**

Phil Tannura presented the proposed project. Mr. Tannura explained that the goal of the project is to make it look like it did when it was first built. Mr. Tannura remained available to answer questions. Mr. Tannura added that it has been a challenge to find old photos of the building.

Mr. Tannura responded to Ms. Torregrosa's question about the original color of the doors

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 6 of 14

that the paint chip he supplied with the application was a strip of paint he peeled from back of one of the doors. That color is what he proposes to use for the restoration.

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this staff report is for the review of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration of 14 wood solid doors and the replacement of 7 doors. The Harris School, located on #812 Southard Street is listed in the surveys as a contributing resource. The two story masonry structure was built in 1912. The building is a unique structure in Old Town and has been abandoned for years. Many windows and doors are missing, exposing the building to water damage and vandals to its interior.

The proposed request also includes the restoration of the doorframes and transom frames as well. A light gray color chip was included in the application but Ms. Torregrosa stated she had been unable to verify that to be the correct original color of the doors.

It is staff's belief that the proposed plan for the restoration of 14 solid wood doors and the new seven pair of wood doors is necessary to protect the integrity of this unique building. Staff understands that the proposed plan is consistent with the guidelines.

Commission Discussion:

Ms. Bowers asked if the doors would be solid or have window in some. Mr. Tannura stated that the doors that have what appear to be windows were a change made after the fact and that his plan is to have all the doors appear in the original state without any windows.

Mr. Molinet inquired as to what Mr. Tannura's plans are for transoms replacements. Mr. Tannura responded that his plan is to try to replace the transoms as they were when the building was built but it is costly. Mr. Tannura added he is trying to find salvage parts to replace the transoms which are not repairable. Mr. Tannura stated again that there has been a challenge to find photos of the building when it was new.

Mr. Metzler inquired if Ms. Torregrosa was alright with the paint color supplied by the applicant. Ms. Torregrosa stated that she was not aware that the paint had been peeled from the door and that knowing that now she approved of the color.

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

7a Renovations and additions to Caroline's Restaurant - #310 Duval Street/ #429 Caroline Street- William P. Horn (H11-01-1440)

Bill Horn came to the dais to present the proposed project. Mr. Horn explained the goal of project is to simply trying to clean up the property and improve the appearance while improving the conditions of the buildings. Mr. Horn stated that none of the work is

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 7 of 14

being done on the main historic house, only the back portion of the non-historic structures is involved in the project.

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this is for the addition of a new kitchen on the back of an existing accessory structure (existing one floor interior dining), a new 6' picket fence to enclose the service yard and a new bar addition. The main house in the site is listed in the National Register of Historic Places. The Porter Mansion is a fine example of Second Empire architectural style. The three story historic house was built in 1858. Mature and old trees can be observed in the area.

Ms. Torregrosa explained that the proposed plans are for the improvement of existing facilities that were built in 1989. The actual site consists of six structures and kiosks. Ms. Torregrosa added that all the structures are one story, with the exception of the old garage that was converted into a one and a half story at some point in time. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the plans include a new kitchen addition to be attached to an existing non historic structure. The new addition will be rectangular in footprint and lower than the existing one story structure.

Ms. Torregrosa added that the proposed addition to the bar structure is 10' by 8' in footprint and will have a gable roof. An existing exhaust hood that is visible from the street will be removed. Ms. Torregrosa stated that a covered dining structure located to the north side of the bar will also be remodeled and an exhaust hood will also be removed.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff understanding that the proposed additions and site improvements are in keeping with the character of the site. The proposed plans will not have any effect on the main house which is individually listed in the national Register of Historic Places. Ms. Torregrosa added that the project, as presented, will not require any variances if approved. Staff understands that the proposed design is consistent with the guidelines. Ms. Torregrosa stated that if approved staff recommends that the applicant coordinates with the Landscape division due to the existence of old trees in the site.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved** with the stipulation that the applicant coordinate with the Tree Commission concerning the trees. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

7b Demolition of non-historic additions - #310 Duval Street/ #429 Caroline Street William P. Horn (H11-01-1440)

Bill Horn stated that there was not much for him to add concerning the proposed project.

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 8 of 14

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this is for the demolition of five non historic structures; two of these structures are attached sheds. The main house in the site is listed in the National Register of Historic Places. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Porter Mansion is a fine example of Second Empire architectural style. Ms. Torregrosa added the three story historic house was built in 1858. The proposed plans include the demolition of non-historic structures that were built in 1989, when the back side of the property, facing Duval Street, was developed for commercial purposes. Ms. Torregrosa stated that staff over imposed the footprint of the house and its ancillary structures from the 1962 Sanborn map. Ms. Torregrosa added it is evident that the two accessory structures that are depicted in the Sanborn maps have been altered through time. Ms. Torregrosa stated that nevertheless the proposed demolitions will not compromise any historic fabric of the building or its historic accessory structures.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed demolitions can be considered by the Commission since the structures proposed to be demolished are not historic nor they will contribute to the character of the main house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the request will not have any effect on the historic house. Finally, Ms. Torregrosa stated that if approved this request will require a second reading for demolition.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the item be **Approved** with the stipulation that the applicant coordinate with the Tree Commission concerning the trees. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

8a Renovate building for office use and new addition with ramp- #313 Margaret Street Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-1445)

Michael Ingram presented the proposed project. Mr. Ingram started with a history of past uses for the building and the modifications over the years. The intent of this project is to restore the existing building and the replacement of the back wall which has some structural issues. Mr. Ingram added that the proposal also includes a new building on the side of the existing structure. Mr. Ingram stated that plans also include work on an old metal shed along James Street as part of phase two (2) of the project.

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this is for a new building on the side of a non-contributing structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated the building located on #313 Margaret Street is not listed in the surveys. The one story reinforce concrete structure was built in 1954 and is one of the few utilitarian concrete structures in the area that still stand. Ms. Torregrosa added that on the site there is a metal box shed, rectangular in footprint which is not depicted in the Sanborn maps. The site is on a

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 9 of 14

corner lot on Margaret and James Streets.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans include the rehabilitation of the main building. A one story frame structure will be added to the north side of the building and a flat roof with a sky lite will connect both buildings. Ms. Torregrosa added that under the new roof a ramp will give access to both structures. The proposed new building will have galvanized corrugated siding and will be lower in height than the main building and will be setback from Margaret Street.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff understanding that the proposed plans are in keeping with the character of the site. The actual building is on an AE-7 FEMA zone, which will require that, by building the proposed improvements, the structure must comply with the elevation requirements. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this design proposes a ramp in order to raise the floors inside of the building. Due to this new design the entrance to the building will be on the back side. The new proposed opening on the back wall will create a main entrance character. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new proposed building will resemble the existing metal shed that has been in the site for many years, while creating new space necessary for the new business. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed design is sensible to the character of this modern industrial building. Ms. Torregrosa added that the project, as presented, will not require any variances if approved. Ms. Torregrosa stated that staff understands that the proposed design is consistent with the guidelines.

Commission Discussion:

Mr. Green stated he was pleased with the proposed project and remembered the building as Caterpillar building many years ago.

Mr. Molinet inquired if there was a sign application included. Mr. Ingram replied that no sign application has been submitted as yet.

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Daniel Metzler, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

8b Demolition of rear wall to be structurally replaced with new openings-#313 Margaret Street Michael B. Ingram (H11-01-1445)

Michael Ingram presented the proposed project. Mr. Ingram stated that he didn't have anything to add from his previous discussion of this property but would be glad to answer any questions.

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this for the first reading for the proposed demolition of a back reinforce concrete wall of a historic building. Ms. Torregrosa stated the building located on #313 Margaret Street is not listed in the surveys. Ms. Torregrosa added that the one story reinforce concrete structure was built in 1954 and is one of the few utilitarian concrete structures in the area that still

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 10 of 14

stand. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the request for the demolition is due to existing structural conditions. The plans also include the removal of a metal box shed located on the north side of the site. The metal box is not depicted in the Sanborn maps.

Ms. Torregrosa stated it is staff understanding that although the main building is historic there is visual evidence that the existing back wall presents decay signs. Ms. Torregrosa added that this building was built with reinforced concrete and the existing visible cracks are evidence of rebar decay due to corrosion. Once reinforced concrete present this situation the odds that structural steel rebars are corroded is high. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed metal box shed cannot be considered a historic or significant element to its surrounding context. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Commission can consider this application since the proposed plans includes the construction of a new wall, although with different fenestrations. Ms. Torregrosa added that if this request is approved a second reading will be required.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

Due to the applicant for item #9 not being present it was decided to postpone the item to later in the meeting.

10 Replacement of existing window graphics and new 13 proposed signs. - #12 Duval Street- CVS Pharmacy – RRW Architects/ Raymond Martinez-Jose Gordillo (H11-01-1447)

Raymond Martinez presented the proposed signage project.

Public Comments:

There were no public comments.

Staff Report:

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this to replace existing photos located on the back of the interior gondolas facing the windows and their replacement with 13 new photos of historic buildings and sites of Key West with and overlay of a standard graphic. Over the graphics letters containing words like CVS, beverage, beer & wine, food, photo, beauty, health and baby. The Building is not listed in the surveys and is located on a corner lot. Ms. Torregrosa stated the applicant will retain three (3) existing signs, a hanging sign located on Duval Street and two (2) corner signs, one (1) facing Duval and Front Streets, and one (1) facing Duval and Wall Streets.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that staff understands the desire of the applicant not to leave the back of the gondolas exposed to the storefronts. Nevertheless overlaying a photo with a standard pattern and having letters over it will constitute a sign, according to the guidelines. Ms. Torregrosa stated it is staff's belief that the proposed design exceeds the maximum signs allowed on a corner lot; therefore it is inconsistent with the guidelines. Ms. Torregrosa added that staff had met with the applicant in several occasions and has explained the guidelines as well as the City Ordinances regarding signage in the historic district.

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 11 of 14

Commission Discussion:

Mr. Green stated that page 49 of the Guidelines uses the word "must" verse using "should be" thus it makes it appear as a slam dunk for a denial. Mr. Green asked Mr. Ramsingh is there a way that they can allow the project since so many other shops in the area have not adhered to the Guidelines. Mr. Ramsingh responded that the Guidelines are clear but are just that - guidelines. Mr. Ramsingh continued that the Commission can review and make decisions on projects before them on a case by case basis.

Mr. Molinet asked that Jim Young, the manager of Code Compliance, be invited to the next HARC meeting to discuss the signage issues.

The Commissioners discussed the appearance of the proposed signage and how it might be changed to improve the appearance and make it easier to approve and more "tasteful".

The Commissioners discussed that signage would be a good candidate for a Workshop in order to get input and discuss the existing Guidelines in an effort to improve the Guidelines.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, that the item be **Approved**. The motion **failed** due to a lack of a second.

A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler, seconded by Mr. Rudy Molinet (who passed the gavel to Mr. Green), that the item be **Denied**. The motion was **Withdrawn** when it was suggested that the item be postponed to allow the applicant to do some more work with the staff

A motion was made by Mr. Rudy Molinet, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the item be **Postponed**. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mr. Rojas, Mr. Metzler, Ms. Bowers, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet

9 Additions and renovations of three existing cottages. New swimming pool - #1124-1126 Margaret Street – Michael Miller (H11-01-1446)

The applicant was not present to present the proposed project. The Commission moved the item to the end of the agenda to give the applicant time to arrive but following all the discussion of all the items the applicant was still not present. It was decided that since there was someone signed up to speak that the project would be reviewed.

Public Comments:

Joyce Drake of 1122 Margaret Street drew the Commission's attention to the application. Ms. Drake pointed out that the box for trees was not checked and in her opinion it should have been since she knows that a couple of trees are mentioned on the plans. Ms. Drake's main concern is a Gumbo Limbo that had been to the Tree Commission in the past and the application for removal of the tree was denied. Ms. Drake came forward to show the Commissioners using the plans the location of the tree in question.

There were no additional public comments.

Staff Report:

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 12 of 14

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated this is for renovations and additions to three (3) structures and the construction of a swimming pool on the back of the lot. Ms. Torregrosa added that the complex consists of three (3) one (1) story frame structures; two (2) of these buildings, #1124 and #1126 Margaret Street are listed in the surveys as contributing resources. Both houses were built c. 1930. Ms. Torregrosa stated the building located behind #1124 Margaret is not a historic structure. Ms. Torregrosa added that the site has old and large trees.

Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed plans include the rehabilitation of the three (3) houses. Ms. Torregrosa added that for #1124 Margaret (unit 2) the front porch will be restored and a small addition on the back is proposed to add living room area. A wood deck and a pergola will be added on the back of the building as well as a shed for laundry and storage use. Ms. Torregrosa stated the addition will have a gable roof that will be an extension of the existing one. Ms. Torregrosa stated that for #1126 Margaret Street (unit 1) the plans include the restoration of the front porch, an attached addition on the back to expand the living room area and a new porch will be added on the back. Ms. Torregrosa stated that for the building located on the back of the lot (unit 3) a new side porch is proposed. Ms. Torregrosa added that new fences are proposed.

It is staff understanding that the proposed renovation and new additions are in keeping with the historic buildings and its surroundings. The proposed additions will have an appropriate scale and massing in relationship to the existing buildings. The project, as presented, will not require any variances if approved. The proposed swimming pool will be located on the back of the side and will not be visible from the street. Staff understands that the proposed design is consistent with the guidelines. Staff recommends that the applicant coordinates with the landscape division due to the existence of old trees in the site.

Commission Discussion:

Mr. Rojas stated that this is a much needed project in order to preserve contributing resources.

Following a discussion concerning the application, it was decided that Chairman Molinet would check the tree box on the application along with sign and dating that change.

Mr. Metzler stated his concern for hearing the item without the applicant present.

The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Daniel Metzler to **Postpone** the item. Mr. Metzler withdrew his motion in order to hear the public input from the person who was waiting.

A motion was made by Mr. Carlos Rojas, seconded by Ms. Barbara Bowers, that the item be **Approved** with the stipulation that the applicant coordinate with the Tree Commission concerning the trees. The motion **Passed** by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Mr. Rojas, Ms. Bowers, Chairman Molinet
No: 2 - Mr. Metzler, Mr. Green

HARC Planner's Report

Ms. Torregrosa reported:

Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission

November 09, 2011

DRAFT

Page 13 of 14

1. The HARC Lottery for the new seven (7) member Commission will be held at the November 15th City Commission Meeting.
2. The Solar Collectors Ordinance will be presented at a Special Planning Board Meeting on November 16.
3. The City has been awarded a grant to present a forum to educate the public about all aspects of historical preservation. The expectation is to invite other Keys Historic groups to join the forum. The forum needs to be held no later than July 2012. Plans are to try to hold the forum in March 2012.

Commissioners Comments

Mr. Molinet requested that the HARC Planner's Report be moved to earlier in the agenda for future meetings.

Mr. Molinet suggested that with the HARC Lottery taking place to add new members to the Commission that a training session be held for all members to attend in order to bring everyone up to speed quickly.

Mr. Molinet also announced that instead of electing a new Commission Chair in December he decided it would be best to postpone the election until the new members are selected and on board.

The Commissioners asked Ms. Torregrosa to research what it would take to have Continuing Education Units (CEUs) for the forum to encourage attendance.

Mr. Molinet inquired of Mr. Ramsingh what the status was on the United Street property. Mr. Ramsingh stated that at the Code Compliance hearing the United Street property received a continuance until December. The expectation is that they will submit another application to HARC in the near future.

Mr. Metzler asked Mr. Ramsingh for a status update on 1312 Reynolds. Mr. Ramsingh responded that it is scheduled for the Code Compliance hearing on November 16th. Mr. Metzler asked Mr. Ramsingh what can be done and is being done to find out who the contractors are that are doing work without the proper approvals. There as a discussion concerning The Commissioners requested Mr. Jim Young, the manager of Code Compliance, to attend the next HARC meeting to discuss what Code Compliance is doing and/or what can be done in the future to locate and punish contractors who are doing work without proper approvals.

Mr. Green stated that in memory of Nils Muench, he is compelled to mention the building on the corner of Olivia and Watson continues to decay and fall down. This contributing resource is in danger of demolition by neglect. It is time we do something to prevent this from occurring to this structure and others around town. It was decided a monthly Nils Muench Building at Risk discussion with potential solutions and recommendations needs to take place starting with this building. Mr. Green is to give the address to Ms. Torregrosa to add to the next meeting's agenda.

Adjournment

Actions/Motions:

A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Carlos Rojas, that the meeting be **Adjourned**. The motion **Passed** by a unanimous vote.

Meeting adjourned at **8:13 pm**.

**Minutes of the Key West Historical Architectural Review Commission
November 09, 2011**

DRAFT

Page 14 of 14

Submitted by,

Jo Bennett

**Administrative Coordinator
Planning Department**