

City of Key West, FL

City Hall 1300 White Street Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final

Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, May 27, 2025 5:00 PM City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number 1-800-955-8771 or for voice 1-800-955-8770 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3811 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

FOR VISUAL PRESENTATIONS: For City Commission meetings the City Clerk's Office will need a copy of all presentations for the agenda at least 7 days before the meeting.

Call Meeting to Order - 5:00 P.M.

Roll Call

Present 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations,
 Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and
 Chairman Burkee

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Approval of Agenda

The agenda was unanimously approved to include the proposed add-on item

Administering the Oath by the Clerk of the Commission

Approval of Minutes

1 April 22, 2025

<u>Attachments:</u> Minutes

A motion was made by Commissioner Green that the Minutes be Approved. The motion passed by unanimous vote.

HARC Planner's Report

City Attorney's Report

Old Business

2

Two new carports at front and side of property over existing parking spaces - 1218 Duval Street - Moshe Gvili (C2025-0005)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 1218 Duval Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Postponed to June 24, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and

Chairman Burkee

3

New diesel generator with pad and fence - 525 Southard Street - Kyle Kalwary (C2025-0025)

Attachments: *Large Item* 525 Southard Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Osborn, seconded by Commissioner Oropeza, that the Item be Approved with a condition that the applicant provide and maintain greenery on the front of the public facing side of the fence subject to Urban Forester's approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

4

Demolition of existing pad and fence structure. Removal of temporary generator - 525 Southard Street - Kyle Kalwary (C2025-0025)

<u>Attachments:</u> <u>*Large Item* 525 Southard Street - Demolition</u>

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Second Reading - Major Development Plan - Demolition of existing commercial buildings, parking lot, and pools - 1321-1325 Simonton Street & 625 South Street - Bender & Associates Architects (C2025-0032)

Attachments: *Large Item* 1321-1325 SimontonSt & 625 South - Demolition

Commissioner Perez and Chairman Burkee recused themselves for this Item and left the dais. Chairman Burkee passed the gavel to Vice Chair Oropeza.

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Nations, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Recuse: 2 - Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Yes: 5 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, and Commissioner Osborn

New Business

6

7

New single-family residence, pool, and site improvements - 1222 Seminary Street - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0036)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 1222 Seminary Street

Commissioner Perez and Chairman Burkee returned to the dais and Chairman Burkee took back the gavel.

A motion was made by Commissioner Osborn, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved with staff's recommendations for changes; particularly shingle siding, gable end decoration, and fence height must meet code from grade. Additionally, all changes subject to staff approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations,
Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and
Chairman Burkee

Demolition of historic one-story wood-frame residential structure, decks, walkways, and pool - 1222 Seminary Street - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0036)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 1222 Seminary Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

New ticket booth and reconfiguration of existing brick pathway - 907 Whitehead Street - Nautilus Drafting & Design Services (C2025-0037)

Attachments: *Large Item* 907 Whitehead Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Postponed to June 24, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations,
Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and
Chairman Burkee

9

Demolition of existing ticket booth - 907 Whitehead Street - Nautilus Drafting & Design Services (C2025-0037)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 907 Whitehead Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Osborn, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Postponed to June 24, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes:

 Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

10

New gable roof and raised floor within same footprint - 726.5 Passover Lane - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0038)

Attachments: *Large Item* 726.5 Passover Lane

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes:

 Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

11

Demolition of existing shed roof and partial demolition of north side of historic house - 726.5 Passover Lane - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0038)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 726.5 Passover Lane - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Elevation of existing historic two-story wood-frame residence about 3'9", new addition on north and east sides, vertical extension of roofline for increased ceiling height, new foundation, new porch stairs, and site improvements - 309 William Street - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0040)

Attachments: *Large Item* 309 William Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Osborn, seconded by Commissioner Oropeza, that the Item be Postponed to June 24, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Demolition of existing non-historic rear shed structures and partial demolition of historic structure to accommodate new addition - 309 William Street - Sandbar Design Studio, Inc (C2025-0040)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 309 William Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Oropeza, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Postponed to June 24, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

After the fact - New one-story accessory structure in same footprint at rear of property - **620 Dey Street - Richard J.**McChesney (C2025-0041)

Attachments: *Large Item* 620 Dey Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Approved subject to a reduction in top plate height not exceeding 9 feet and requiring final staff approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations,
Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and
Chairman Burkee

13

14

After the fact - Demolition of historic accessory structure in rear of property and removal of existing fence - 620 Dey Street - Richard J. McChesney (C2025-0041)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 620 Dey Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Osborn, seconded by Commissioner Moody, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

16

New cottage, cabana with open sides and louvered wall, decks, pool, and site improvements - 903 Frances Street - Bob Hulec (C2025-0042)

Attachments: *Large Item* 903 Frances Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Perez, that the Item be Postponed to June 24, 2025. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

17

New second story addition on south elevation of non-historic structure - 520 Emma Street - Serge Mashtakov, PE (C2025-0048)

Attachments: *Large Item* 520 Emma Street

A motion was made by Commissioner Oropeza, seconded by Commissioner Green, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

18

Demolition of existing non-historic second story porch - 520 Emma Street - Serge Mashtakov, PE (C2025-0048)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 520 Emma Street - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Moody, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Replacement of existing metal shingles with 5V-crimp metal roofing on historic structure - **402 South Street - Hugh J. Morgan (C2025-0049)**

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 402 South Street

Postponed to June 24, 2025.

20

After the fact - Bump out and staircase on north elevation - 1011 Windsor Lane - Jonathan Tavarez (C2025-0052)

Attachments: *Large Item* 1011 Windsor Lane

A motion was made by Commissioner Green, seconded by Commissioner Osborn, that the Item be Denied based on HARC Guidelines #32 and #32 (page 37J). The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

21

After the fact - Demolition of historic staircase on north elevation - 1011 Windsor Lane - Jonathan Tavarez (C2025-0052)

<u>Attachments:</u> *Large Item* 1011 Windsor Lane - Demolition

A motion was made by Commissioner Oropeza, seconded by Commissioner Green, that the after-the-fact demolition of the staircase be Approved with the addition of demolition of the appendage all of which needs to be completed and the permit closed within six (6) months. If not, the violation of the appendage will be referred to Code for the opening of a code case. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Commissioner Green, Commissioner Moody, Commissioner Nations, Commissioner Oropeza, Commissioner Osborn, Commissioner Perez, and Chairman Burkee

Public Comments

Commissioner Comments

Adjournment - 7:36 P.M.

FORM 8B MEMORANDUM OF VOTING CONFLICT FOR COUNTY, MUNICIPAL, AND OTHER LOCAL PUBLIC OFFICERS NAME OF BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY, OR COMMITTEE LAST NAME-FIRST NAME-MIDDLE NAME MAGE THE BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY OR COMMITTEE ON MAILING ADDRESS WHICH I SERVE IS A UNIT OF: CITY COUNTY OTHER LOCAL AGENCY COUNTY CITY NAME OF POLITICAL SUBDIVISION: DATE ON WHICH VOTE OCCURRED MY POSITION IS: **APPOINTIVE** ELECTIVE 5.27.25 WHO MUST FILE FORM 8B This form is for use by any person serving at the county, city, or other local level of government on an appointed or elected board, council, commission, authority, or committee. It applies equally to members of advisory and non-advisory bodies who are presented with a voting conflict of interest under Section 112.3143, Florida Statutes. Your responsibilities under the law when faced with voting on a measure in which you have a conflict of interest will vary greatly depending on whether you hold an elective or appointive position. For this reason, please pay close attention to the instructions on this form before completing the reverse side and filing the form. INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 112.3143, FLORIDA STATUTES A person holding elective or appointive county, municipal, or other local public office MUST ABSTAIN from voting on a measure which inures to his or her special private gain or loss. Each elected or appointed local officer also is prohibited from knowingly voting on a measure which inures to the special gain or loss of a principal (other than a government agency) by whom he or she is retained (including the parent organization or subsidiary of a corporate principal by which he or she is retained); to the special private gain or loss of a relative; or to the special private gain or loss of a business associate. Commissioners of community redevelopment agencies under Sec. 163.356 or 163.357, F.S., and officers of independent special tax districts elected on a one-acre, one-vote basis are not prohibited from voting in that For purposes of this law, a "relative" includes only the officer's father, mother, son, daughter, husband, wife, brother, sister, father-in-law, mother-in-law, son-in-law, and daughter-in-law. A "business associate" means any person or entity engaged in or carrying on a business enterprise with the officer as a partner, joint venturer, coowner of property, or corporate shareholder (where the shares of the corporation are not listed on any national or regional stock exchange). **ELECTED OFFICERS:** In addition to abstaining from voting in the situations described above, you must disclose the conflict: PRIOR TO THE VOTE BEING TAKEN by publicly stating to the assembly the nature of your interest in the measure on which you are abstaining from voting; and WITHIN 15 DAYS AFTER THE VOTE OCCURS by completing and filing this form with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who should incorporate the form in the minutes. APPOINTED OFFICERS:

IF YOU INTEND TO MAKE ANY ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION PRIOR TO THE MEETING AT WHICH THE VOTE WILL BE TAKEN:

Although you must abstain from voting in the situations described above, you otherwise may participate in these matters. However, you must disclose the nature of the conflict before making any attempt to influence the decision, whether orally or in writing and whether made

You must complete and file this form (before making any attempt to influence the decision) with the person responsible for recording the
minutes of the meeting, who will incorporate the form in the minutes. (Continued on other side)

by you or at your direction.

APPOINTED OFFICERS (continued)

- A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the agency.
- The form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed.

IF YOU MAKE NO ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION EXCEPT BY DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING:

- You must disclose orally the nature of your conflict in the measure before participating.
- You must complete the form and file it within 15 days after the vote occurs with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the
 meeting, who must incorporate the form in the minutes. A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the
 agency, and the form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed.

DISCLOSURE OF LOCAL OFFICER'S INTEREST				
1, HAVEN B. NOTE, hereby disclose that on 5,27	20 25			
(a) A measure came or will come before my agency which (check one)				
inured to my special private gain or loss;				
inured to the special gain or loss of my business associate,				
inured to the special gain or loss of my relative,				
inured to the special gain or loss of	, by			
whom I am retained; or				
inured to the special gain or loss of	, which			
is the parent organization or subsidiary of a principal which has retained me.				
(b) The measure before my agency and the nature of my conflicting interest in the measure is as follows:				
Andtitlet of Needy				
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
5 - 27. 25 Date Filed Signature				

NOTICE: UNDER PROVISIONS OF FLORIDA STATUTES §112.317, A FAILURE TO MAKE ANY REQUIRED DISCLOSURE CONSTITUTES GROUNDS FOR AND MAY BE PUNISHED BY ONE OR MORE OF THE FOLLOWING: IMPEACHMENT, REMOVAL OR SUSPENSION FROM OFFICE OR EMPLOYMENT, DEMOTION, REDUCTION IN SALARY, REPRIMAND, OR A CIVIL PENALTY NOT TO EXCEED \$10,000.

FORM 8B MEMORANDUM OF VOTING CONFLICT FOR COUNTY, MUNICIPAL, AND OTHER LOCAL PUBLIC OFFICERS NAME OF BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY, OR COMMITTEE LAST MAME-FIRST MAME-MIDDLE NAME HUON MOZE THE BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY OR COMMITTEE ON MAILING ADDRESS DR145 WHICH I SERVE IS A UNIT OF: CITY COUNTY OTHER LOCAL AGENCY CIT NAME OF POLITICAL SUBDIVISION: DATE ON WHICH YOTE OCCURRED MY POSITION IS: ☐ ELECTIVE **APPOINTIVE** WHO MUST FILE FORM 8B This form is for use by any person serving at the county, city, or other local level of government on an appointed or elected board, council, commission, authority, or committee. It applies equally to members of advisory and non-advisory bodies who are presented with a voting conflict of interest under Section 112.3143, Florida Statutes. Your responsibilities under the law when faced with voting on a measure in which you have a conflict of interest will vary greatly depending on whether you hold an elective or appointive position. For this reason, please pay close attention to the instructions on this form before completing the reverse side and filing the form. INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 112.3143, FLORIDA STATUTES A person holding elective or appointive county, municipal, or other local public office MUST ABSTAIN from voting on a measure which inures to his or her special private gain or loss. Each elected or appointed local officer also is prohibited from knowingly voting on a measure which inures to the special gain or loss of a principal (other than a government agency) by whom he or she is retained (including the parent organization or subsidiary of a corporate principal by which he or she is retained); to the special private gain or loss of a relative; or to the special private gain or loss of a business associate. Commissioners of community redevelopment agencies under Sec. 163.356 or 163.357, F.S., and officers of independent special tax districts elected on a one-acre, one-vote basis are not prohibited from voting in that capacity. For purposes of this law, a "relative" includes only the officer's father, mother, son, daughter, husband, wife, brother, sister, father-in-law, mother-in-law, son-in-law, and daughter-in-law. A "business associate" means any person or entity engaged in or carrying on a business enterprise with the officer as a partner, joint venturer, coowner of property, or corporate shareholder (where the shares of the corporation are not listed on any national or regional stock exchange). **ELECTED OFFICERS:** In addition to abstaining from voting in the situations described above, you must disclose the conflict: PRIOR TO THE VOTE BEING TAKEN by publicly stating to the assembly the nature of your interest in the measure on which you are abstaining from voting; and WITHIN 15 DAYS AFTER THE VOTE OCCURS by completing and filing this form with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who should incorporate the form in the minutes. **APPOINTED OFFICERS:** Although you must abstain from voting in the situations described above, you otherwise may participate in these matters. However, you

You must complete and file this form (before making any attempt to influence the decision) with the person responsible for recording the
minutes of the meeting, who will incorporate the form in the minutes. (Continued on other side)

must disclose the nature of the conflict before making any attempt to influence the decision, whether orally or in writing and whether made

IF YOU INTEND TO MAKE ANY ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION PRIOR TO THE MEETING AT WHICH THE VOTE WILL BE

by you or at your direction.

TAKEN:

APPOINTED OFFICERS (continued)

- A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the agency.
- The form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed.

IF YOU MAKE NO ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION EXCEPT BY DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING:

- You must disclose orally the nature of your conflict in the measure before participating.
- You must complete the form and file it within 15 days after the vote occurs with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the
 meeting, who must incorporate the form in the minutes. A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the
 agency, and the form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed.

DISCLOSURE OF LOCAL OFFICER'S INTEREST					
I, Augu E. Palaz , hereby disclose the	at on	May	27,	_ 20 Z 5:	
(a) A measure came or will come before my agency which (check one)		,			
$\overline{\chi}$ inured to my special private gain or loss;					
inured to the special gain or loss of my business associate,					
inured to the special gain or loss of my relative,					
inured to the special gain or loss of				by	
whom I am retained; or					
inured to the special gain or loss of				, which	
is the parent organization or subsidiary of a principal which has re	tained me.				
(b) The measure before my agency and the nature of my conflicting inter	est in the measure is a	s follows:			
ITOM 5, 1321-1325 SIMONTON STE	DOT \$ 625	South	STROST		
#10.1 0) 1.701 1.71 0 11.1	•				
	111	//			
5/27/24	NUL	5/	_		
Date Filed	Signature	/			

NOTICE: UNDER PROVISIONS OF FLORIDA STATUTES §112.317, A FAILURE TO MAKE ANY REQUIRED DISCLOSURE CONSTITUTES GROUNDS FOR AND MAY BE PUNISHED BY ONE OR MORE OF THE FOLLOWING: IMPEACHMENT, REMOVAL OR SUSPENSION FROM OFFICE OR EMPLOYMENT, DEMOTION, REDUCTION IN SALARY, REPRIMAND, OR A CIVIL PENALTY NOT TO EXCEED \$10,000.