

Second Draft -November 19, 2021

Guidelines for Windows, Storefronts, Architectural Shutters and Window Protection

Windows

Windows are character-defining features and a significant architectural element of every historic building in Key West. Historically most of residential and mixed-use frame vernacular buildings built before 1945 had double sash true divided windows in a variety of designs, like 6 over 6, 2 over 2, 3 over one, and 1 over 1. Casement wood windows were also used but less commonly. Many commercial and institutional buildings built prior to 1945 had steel double sash, casement, or projecting windows. In the 1945 new window types, particularly metal and or glass jealousies and awning windows were manufactured making their accessibility a popular option for new construction and replacements of old windows. Location of a window and its impact to the overall elevation in the building are significant elements that are taking into consideration while analyzing the appropriate solution for a window matter.

[Include illustrations of type of windows]

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards are formulated under four pillars: identify and retain, protect, and preserve, repair, and replace when repairs are not a feasible option. However potential future impact of natural hazards on our island aggravates the loss, damage, or destruction of historic buildings. In an effort to mitigate the vulnerability of historic windows and the visual impact of window protections HARC has developed these guidelines to assist our citizens in making an appropriate decision pertaining to windows in their buildings. The goal must be to minimize any adverse impacts to the historic character of a building and the district to the extent possible in adapting the building to be more resilient.

HARC encourages the retention and restoration of historic windows and their components, including historic glazing, frames, hoodmolds, weights, sashes, muntins and any decorative elements. The more historic fabric a building can retain the more accurate information it can yield. Continuous maintenance shall include making the window weathertight by re-caulking, replacing deteriorated elements to match and painting.

A. Guidelines for window and transom window replacements:

_____ Underline text is new text added from version presented in October. (In the case of architectural shutters and window protections current guidelines were added and underlined words are recommendations)

1. Historic windows on buildings individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places shall be retained and preserved. If replacement is requested an assessment of the conditions of the windows will be required. If the window has lost more than 55% of its historic fabric a replacement will be considered if the new unit replicates the existing window, including design, dimension, and material. Impact resistant windows matching dimensions, design and materials are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass or Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Muntin grids that match the same material of the window are required in the exterior of the glass if the design includes such grid.
2. Historic stain glass windows must be maintained, preserved, and restored and all efforts shall be made to protect them from deterioration. Replacement of any components must match existing in design and materials. Elements used for any reinforcement must match profile and color of existing to match and blend.
3. Replacement windows on principal elevations or elevations visible from the streets of frame vernacular, brick or concrete buildings that were built before 1945 shall match windows of the same period of the building, including design, dimensions, and materials. Impact resistant windows matching dimensions, design and materials are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). For buildings where original windows were steel, aluminum windows are acceptable replacements as long as the details, including muntin profiles and reverse match period units. Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Muntin grids that match the same material of the window are required in the exterior of the glass if the design includes such grid.
4. Replacement windows on secondary elevations of frame vernacular, brick or concrete buildings that were built before 1945 shall match windows of the same period of the building, including design, dimensions, but materials can be either wood, metal, or clad. Impact resistant windows matching dimensions and design are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). For buildings where original windows were steel, aluminum windows are acceptable replacements as long as the details, including muntin profiles and reverse match period units. Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Muntin grids that match the same material of the window are required in the exterior of the glass if the design includes such grid.

_____ Underline text is new text added from version presented in October. (In the case of architectural shutters and window protections current guidelines were added and underlined words are recommendations)

5. Replacement windows on frame vernacular, brick or concrete buildings that were built on or after 1945 can be of different type, particularly buildings with jalousie and awning windows. Impact resistant windows, either wood, metal, or clad, matching dimensions, are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance). Tinted or colored glass is not allowed. Flat or interior muntins between glass exposed to the exterior is not allowed on elevations visible from the street. Window reveal and position in the fenestration must match existing.
6. Replacement windows in buildings and additions within the historic district and built under a Florida Building Code must meet current Code and efforts shall be made to use window units which their design be harmonious with adjacent historic buildings, particularly on visible elevations from a public right-of-way.
7. The use of a window that is visually incompatible to the historic appearance of the building or that obscure, damage or destroy character-defining features of a contributing or historic building is not allowed.

B. Changes to fenestrations:

1. Alteration of original window fenestrations on contributing or historic buildings is not allowed, unless the historic architectural review commission finds that the alteration will not adversely impact character defining elevations of a building. This also applies to alteration of a historic window fenestration to install a door. Restoring original location and dimensions of fenestrations is highly advised.
2. For a contributing or historic building with a new use requires emergency escape and rescue openings it is appropriate that such changes in fenestration dimensions be done in secondary elevations non-visible from the right-of-way.
3. The insertion of new floors or furred-down ceilings which cut across the glazed areas of windows and the exterior form and appearance of a window is changed on a contributing or historic building is not allowed.
4. Changes in window fenestrations on non-contributing or non-historic buildings shall be made in a manner that will not visually detract from any street.

_____ Underline text is new text added from version presented in October. (In the case of architectural shutters and window protections current guidelines were added and underlined words are recommendations)

C. Window retrofitting

Existing windows, whether historic or not, can benefit of different available options to increase their efficiency and function without damaging the character of a building. The use of storm panels, insulating shades, interior insulation panels, and drapes are some of current available alternatives that can alleviate energy gain without the need of replacing existing windows.

Window films with minimum tint, low-e and no mirror finish can be another alternative to consider for existing windows. New technologies, like ceramic windows films that do not change drastically the color of an existing window glass can also be considered. In all cases a sample of the product applied to the existing glass will be required as well as technical data available for the product.

When special circumstances require opacity on a window, like a specific use of a building or space, and no alternative options listed in the first paragraph of window retrofitting section can be met, the applicant must present a sample of the proposed alternative and reasons of why other solutions cannot be met. These cases will be evaluated on their own merit by the commissioners.

Storefronts

Storefronts are character-defining features of a commercial building. Storefronts are large, glazed areas on the ground floor and were intended to provide visual and access to potential patrons. Traditional and historic storefronts in Key West are comprised of architectural elements such as bulkheads or solid panels at the base of the display window, recessed entrances, transom windows above the display window, columns, and lintels. Historic storefronts must be preserved as they are part of the sense of place in the historic district commercial corridors. Of significance, if a building is internally sub divided with different operational businesses, the totality of the frontage elevation reading shall be kept as one. <https://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/11-storefronts.htm>

1. Replacement storefronts of buildings built on or before 1949 shall match the original storefront including design, dimensions, and any frame detail must match material and profile. Impact resistant storefronts matching dimensions, design and frame details and materials are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance).

_____ Underline text is new text added from version presented in October. (In the case of architectural shutters and window protections current guidelines were added and underlined words are recommendations)

2. Replacement storefronts of buildings built after 1949 can be of different design, and dimensions, as long as the new design does not adversely alter rhythm and patterns found in immediately adjacent historic buildings. Impact resistant storefronts are an acceptable solution as replacements and must have clear glass, can have double glass or insulated glass with Low-E (minimum XX Visual Light Transmittance).
3. The use of films with minimum tint, low-e and no mirror finish can be an alternative solution to retrofit storefronts for energy efficiency. New technologies, like ceramic windows films that do not change drastically the color of an existing window glass can also be considered. In all cases a sample of the product applied to the existing glass will be required as well as technical data available for the product.

Guidelines for Architectural Shutters

Architectural shutters are character-defining features of the historic buildings in Key West. The term *architectural shutters* refer to rigid window treatments that hinge on the sides or the top of a window or door. Architectural shutters may be operable or fixed and are often used today as a way to enhance the appearance of a building. Historically, shutters were used for protection, privacy, light control, ventilation, and, in some instances, in place of fenestration.

Buildings in Key West traditionally had operable louvered or solid board shutters, while some commercial or institutional buildings had steel shutters. The most common architectural shutter types in Key West are louvered, solid board, and Bahama shutters. Louvered, solid board, and steel shutters have been used in Key West since the late 1800s, while Bahama shutters have been used since the early 1900s.

[Include photos of shutter types]

1. Historic shutters should be retained, repaired, and preserved whenever possible.
2. If existing historic shutters are too deteriorated to repair, they should be replaced on an in-kind basis with functional shutters of similar design made of ~~rot-resistant woods such as cedar, cypress, or pressure-treated pine~~ materials that are appropriate to the age of the structure. in proportion to the design of the window openings. Replacement shutters should be designed to fit the proportions of the window openings. The design of

_____ Underline text is new text added from version presented in October. (In the case of architectural shutters and window protections current guidelines were added and underlined words are recommendations)

replacement shutters should be based on physical evidence of original shutters or photographic documentation of the specific building or buildings of a similar style.

- ~~3. The design of replacement shutters should be based on physical evidence of original shutters or photographic documentation of the specific building or buildings of a similar style.~~
- ~~4. Replacement shutters should be designed to fit the proportions of the window openings.~~
3. New shutters proposed on buildings that have no existing shutters should be of an appropriate design and material to the architecture and age of the building.
4. Aluminum or composite shutters that are appropriate to the architecture and age of a building and which do not stand out in the surrounding context may be allowed on some non-contributing structures and in new construction where appropriate.
5. Non-operable shutters are discouraged. Proposals that include non-operable shutters will be considered on a case-by-case basis.

Guidelines for Window Protections and Storm Shutters

Since architectural shutters are mostly utilized today for aesthetic purposes, homeowners need alternatives to ensure their fenestration is protected, especially during storm season. Storm shutters and other window protections differ from architectural shutters in that their purpose is to safeguard and not necessarily to provide aesthetic value. There are several window protection and storm shutter options available today, but not all are appropriate forms of mitigation in the historic district due to their visual and physical impact.

Elements to be considered when choosing a window protection system include visibility, impact on historical integrity, product approvals/ratings, ease of installation/use, cost, and availability. Below are the guidelines for acceptable window protections and storm shutters for buildings within the Key West Historic District and buildings outside the Historic District that are considered contributing. As new storm protection products are made available, staff may make considerations for certain products not listed below, though they may be subject to Historic Architectural Review Commission review and approval.

[Include photos of hurricane shutter types]

_____ Underline text is new text added from version presented in October. (In the case of architectural shutters and window protections current guidelines were added and underlined words are recommendations)

City of Key West's Historic Architectural Review Commission_ proposed changes to windows guidelines

1. In addition to traditional shutters, removable hurricane and storm panels that are stored when not in use during a storm are an allowed ~~and preferred~~ alternative for ensuring the safety of historic structures. These panels are usually made of metal or clear polycarbonate. Tracks for removable shutters ~~should~~ must be painted to match the existing surface paint colors. These shutters are only permitted for use when a tropical storm or hurricane advisory is in effect or when there is a threat of a significant weather or climate event.
2. Hurricane fabric, also known as wind abatement screening, is an allowed and lightweight alternative to hurricane panels. The fabric can be easily folded and shall be stored when not in use during a storm. The anchors used to fasten the fabric over the fenestration must be the same color as the existing surface paint colors. These shutters are only permitted for use when a tropical storm or hurricane advisory is in effect or when there is a threat of a significant weather or climate event.
3. Roll-down and accordion hurricane shutters may be allowed on new commercial structures and may be appropriate on other types of buildings when ~~reasonably concealed~~ not visible from public streets or lanes. These shutters will be considered on a case-by-case basis. ~~Aluminum shutters may also be allowed on some non-contributing structures and in new construction where appropriate.~~
4. ~~The use of laminated impact resistant glass, wind resistant films, glass or Plexiglas, which does not alter the appearance of windows on the exterior, is allowed.~~ Storm windows and sheets of polycarbonate, acrylic, laminated glass, plate glass, or tempered glass that do not alter the appearance of windows on the exterior may be installed over window openings as a means of protection in some cases. Materials and details should be selected so as to minimize visual impact on the historic structure. Glass sheeting is a preferred option to plastic sheeting, as it will not bow, haze, or yellow, and laminated glass provides additional impact resistance. Protective glazing must be properly ventilated to prevent a buildup of heat and condensation.
5. HARC does not regulate the use of plywood panels as a means of protection during a storm. However, these shutters can only be used when a tropical storm or hurricane advisory is in effect, when there is a threat of a significant weather or climate event, or only temporarily when there is a need for protection during construction or a window has been broken. Check the Department of Business and Professional Regulation (DBPR) website to find plywood fasteners with product approvals/ratings.

_____ Underline text is new text added from version presented in October. (In the case of architectural shutters and window protections current guidelines were added and underlined words are recommendations)