

**THE CITY OF KEY WEST
PLANNING BOARD
Staff Report**



To: Chair and Planning Board members

From: Patrick Wright, Senior Planner

Through: Thaddeus Cohen, Planning Director

Meeting Date: February 23, 2017

Agenda Item: **Final Determination of Award for Year 4 Building Permit Allocation System (BPAS) Applications pursuant to Section 108-997 of the Land Development Regulations of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Key West, Florida**

Request: Approval of the final rankings of Year 4 (July 1, 2016 – June 30, 2017) BPAS applications for award of 29 market-rate units, 22 affordable housing units and the consideration of 10 transient units.

Background:

BPAS Year 4 covers the application cycle between July 1, 2016 and June 30, 2017. The total available units for Year 4 are 46 market-rate units of which 10 may be transient, and 45 affordable units. The City received five (5) BPAS applications requesting a total of 22 affordable housing units, 29 market-rate units and 17.2 transient equivalent single family units (ESFUs) units.

The Year 4 BPAS applications are summarized in the following table:

YEAR 4 BPAS APPLICATIONS					
	3900 S. Roosevelt Blvd.	3800 N. Roosevelt	801 Eisenhower Drive	1421 First Street	2312-2318 N. Roosevelt
Existing / Recognized Units	336	10	0	0	0
New Market Rate (ESFU)	28	0	0	1	0
New Affordable (ESFU)	12	0	0	0	10
New Transient (ESFU)	0	8.6	8.6	0	0
Total Units (non-ESFU)	376	20	10	1	10
Zoning	HDR	CG	CG	CL	CG
Max Density (du/acre)	22	16	16	16	16
Land Area (SF)	745,312	82,867	31,175	5,050	31,680
Land Area (AC)	17.1100	1.9023	0.7156	0.1159	0.7272
Proposed Density (du/acre)	21.9716	10.5110	13.9696	8.6248	13.7475

Analysis:

Staff evaluated, scored and ranked the final BPAS applications according to prerequisites and criteria outlined in City Code Section 108-997(b) and (c). The resulting scores and final rankings are attached. Staff evaluation of the final applications is summarized in score review sheets, which are included at the beginning of each attached application package.

Pursuant to City Code Section 108-995, 46 market-rate units are available for Year 4 (July 1, 2016 – June 30, 2017) of the BPAS. The following market-rate projects are recommended for award:

YEAR 4 MARKET-RATE BPAS APPLICATIONS RECOMMENDED FOR AWARD						
Rank	Project	Units Requested	ESFU Factor	ESFUs Requested	Major/Minor Renovation	Score
1	3900 SOUTH ROOSEVELT	28	28.00	28	Major	85
2	1421 1 st STREET	1	1.00	1	Major	20
Total		29	29.00	29		

Pursuant to City Code Section 108-995, 45 affordable units were available for Year 4 (July 1, 2016 – June 30, 2017) of the BPAS. The following affordable projects are recommended for award:

YEAR 4 AFFORDABLE BPAS APPLICATIONS RECOMMENDED FOR AWARD						
Rank	Project	Units Requested	ESFU Factor	ESFUs Requested	Major/Minor Renovation	Score
1	3900 SOUTH ROOSEVELT	12	12.00	12	Major	85
2	2312-2318 NORTH ROOSEVELT	10	10.00	10.00	Major	20
Total		22	22.00	22.00		

Pursuant to City Code Section 108-995, a maximum of 46 market rate units are available of which 10 may be transient for Year 4 (July 1, 2016 – June 30, 2017) of the BPAS. The following projects requested transient units:

YEAR 4 TRANSIENT BPAS APPLICATIONS REQUESTED						
Rank	Project	Units Requested	ESFU Factor	ESFUs Requested	Major/Minor Renovation	Score
1	3800 NORTH ROOSEVELT	10	0.86	8.6	Major	110
2	801 EISENHOWER DRIVE	10	0.86	8.6	Major	75
Total		20	0.86	17.2		

This brings the total Year 4 request to 22 affordable units, 29 market rate units and 20 transient units.

Year 4 is the first year in which transient units are made available through BPAS. Section 108-995 Table 2.0 says in part “...*Maximum of 46 market rate units, of which a maximum of ten (10) units may be transient*”.

It is staff’s understanding that the focus and direction of the City Commission in reference to the available BPAS allocations is for permanent and affordable housing units.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning Department, based on the criteria established by the Comprehensive Plan and the Land Development Regulations, recommends to the Planning Board **APPROVAL** of the final Year 4 BPAS rankings, the award of 22 affordable and 29 market-rate units.

Regarding the 10 transient units that are available, the Planning Department recommends the following options:

OPTION 1: Allocate 0 transient units.

OPTION 2: Allocate 10 transient units to 3800 North Roosevelt Boulevard.

KEY WEST BUILDING PERMIT ALLOCATION SYSTEM (BPAS)
YEAR 4 FINAL RANKINGS

YEAR 4 MARKET-RATE/TRANSIENTR BPAS APPLICATIONS

PROJECTS	Units Requested				CRITERIA FOR 1 OR 2 UNITS:												TOTAL BPAS POINTS: CLAIMED		TOTAL BPAS POINTS: VERIFIED							
	Units Requested	Equivalent Single-Family Unit (ESFU)	Total ESFUs	Major/Minor Renovation	Building 1.5' higher than BFE (+5)	Providing addtl affordable housing (+10)	GBC Upgrade 1 (+30)	GBC Upgrade 2 (+40)	AIPP / Tree Fund (+60)	LEED Architect (+10)	Electric Car Charging (+5)	Non-roof SRI of at least 29 (+10)	Roofing materials SRI 29 (+5)	Vegetated Roof 50% (+15)	Building 1.5' higher than BFE (+5)	Providing addtl affordable housing (+5)	GBC Upgrade 1 (+30)	GBC Upgrade 2 (+40)	AIPP / Tree Fund (+60)	LEED Architect (+10)	Electric Car Charging (+5)	Non-roof SRI of at least 29 (+10)	Open Space / On-site Recreational (+10)	Vegetated Roof 50% (+15)	TOTAL BPAS POINTS: CLAIMED	TOTAL BPAS POINTS: VERIFIED
3800 NORTH ROOSEVELT	10	10.00	8.60	Major											60	10	10	5	10	10					110	110
3900 SOUTH ROOSEVELT	28	28.00	28.00	Major											5	30			10	10	5	10	10		85	85
801 EISENHOWER DRIVE	10	10.00	8.60	Major											5	5	40		10	10	5	10	10		95	75
1421 1ST STREET	1	1.00	1.00	Major											5										20	20
TOTAL REQUESTED:			46.2						10		5															

YEAR 4 AFFORDABLE BPAS APPLICATIONS

AFFORDABLE PROJECTS	Units Requested				CRITERIA FOR 1 OR 2 UNITS:												TOTAL BPAS POINTS: CLAIMED		TOTAL BPAS POINTS: VERIFIED							
	Units Requested	Equivalent Single-Family Unit (ESFU)	Total ESFUs	Major/Minor Renovation	Building 1.5' higher than BFE (+5)	Providing addtl affordable housing (+10)	GBC Upgrade 1 (+30)	GBC Upgrade 2 (+40)	AIPP / Tree Fund (+60)	LEED Architect (+10)	Electric Car Charging (+5)	Non-roof SRI of at least 29 (+10)	Roofing materials SRI 29 (+5)	Vegetated Roof 50% (+15)	Building 1.5' higher than BFE (+5)	Providing addtl affordable housing (+5)	GBC Upgrade 1 (+30)	GBC Upgrade 2 (+40)	AIPP / Tree Fund (+60)	LEED Architect (+10)	Electric Car Charging (+5)	Non-roof SRI of at least 29 (+10)	Open Space / On-site Recreational (+10)	Vegetated Roof 50% (+15)	TOTAL BPAS POINTS: CLAIMED	TOTAL BPAS POINTS: VERIFIED
3900 SOUTH ROOSEVELT	28	28.00	28.00	Major											5	30			10	10	5	10	10		85	85
2312-2318 N. ROOSEVELT	10	10.00	10	Major											5	5			10						20	20
TOTAL REQUESTED:			38																							

NOTES:

YEAR 4 MARKET-RATE UNITS AVAILABLE: 46

YEAR 4 AFFORDABLE UNITS AVAILABLE: 45

YEAR 4 AFFORDABLE UNITS AVAILABLE: 10

In case of tie scores and insufficient available units, a drawing of lots will determine the awardee.

BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 4 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: Greg Oropeza for Wreckers

Site Address: 3800 N Roosevelt (Wreckers)

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 10 Transient Units

Prerequisite Development Type: Major Construction

General Planning Comments

--

Prerequisites: Major Construction/Renovation.

A)	Baseline green building certification required Staff comment: VERIFIED: 210 points for FGBC Platinum
B)	First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation Staff comment: VERIFIED: Plans show first floor above crawl space: BFE + 2'
C)	Rainwater catchment system required Staff comment: VERIFIED: Plans show 3 cisterns totaling 8,975 gallons to cover the 8,785 sq ft for all three buildings.

Point System: Three or more units

<i>Criteria (Points)</i>	<i>Applicant</i>	<i>Staff</i>
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Plans show first floor above crawl space: BFE + 2'	5	5
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+5) Staff comment:		
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 1 —Silver (+30) Staff comment:		
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40) Staff comment:		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 3— Platinum (+60) Staff comment: VERIFIED: LEED for Homes Platinum	60	60
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$5,000 or more (+10) Staff comment: ALLOWED: Although not mentioned in the Solutions Statement, it is deemed sufficient to rely on the BPAS Certification Form which certifies the score sheet, claiming 10 points for this item.	10	10
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Certificate for Bill Horn & Ric Lightner	10	10
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Shown on plans.	5	5
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Noted in Solutions Statement.	10	10
10. Additional on-site open space or on-site recreational facilities (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Pool	10	10
11. Buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area (+15) Staff comment:		
Total:	110	110

BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 4 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: Oceanwalk

Site Address: 3900 South Roosevelt

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 28 Market Rate and 12 Affordable Units

Prerequisite Development Type: Major Construction

General Planning Comments

--

Prerequisites: Major Construction/Renovation.

<p>A) Baseline green building certification required Staff comment: VERIFIED: FGBC Score Card = Silver</p>
<p>B) First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation Staff comment: VERIFIED. 10.2” in AE8 zone.</p>
<p>C) Rainwater catchment system required Staff comment: ALLOWED: Landscape plan notes two 12,096 gallon cisterns, which was sufficient for the Oceanwalk site plans in the 2014 BPAS cycle. As the plans did not state roof area, future development plans shall verify that the actual square footage area of the roof is equal to the volume in gallons of the cisterns.</p>

Point System: Three or more units

Criteria (Points)	Applicant	Staff
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: 2.2 over BFE	5	5
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 1—Silver (+30) Staff comment: VERIFIED: FGBC Score Card = 151 pts = Silver	30	30
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$5,000 or more (+10) Staff comment: ALLOWED: Although not mentioned in the Solutions Statement, it is deemed sufficient to rely on the BPAS Certification Form which certifies the score sheet, claiming 10 points for this item.	10	10
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Certificate for Scott Maloney	10	10
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: EV chargers shown on plans	5	5
9. Using light colored, high reflectivity materials for all non-roof/areas with a Solar Reflectance Index (SRI) of at least 29 (+10) Staff comment: ALLOWED: Although not noted in Solutions Statement or Plans, FGBC spreadsheet indicates a minimum of 80% of at least 29 SRI. Future development plans shall specify 100% light colored	10	10
10. Additional on-site open space or on-site recreational facilities (+10) Staff comment: Verified: Open Space – 50.2%	10	10
Total:	85	85

BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 4 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: Trepanier & Associates for Old Town Trolley Tours

Site Address: 801 Eisenhower

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 10 Transient Units

Development Type: Major Construction

General Planning Comments

Original application was turned in with a certified BPAS Estimated Score Sheet of zero points.

Prerequisites: Major Construction/Renovation.

A) Baseline green building certification required

Staff comment: VERIFIED: LEED for Hospitality, Gold

B) First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation

Staff comment: VERIFIED: AE7 flood zone, first habitable floor is at 8.5'

C) Rainwater catchment system required:

Staff comment: ALLOWED: Solutions Statement mentions at least 1,000-gallon cistern, which is not in disagreement with the actual volume required to meet the prerequisite. As the plans did not state roof area, future development plans shall verify that the actual square footage area of the roof is equal to the volume in gallons of the cisterns.

Point System: Three or more units

<i>Criteria (Points)</i>	<i>Applicant</i>	<i>Staff</i>
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: NOT VERIFIED: Plans and "proposed elevation certificate" specify first habitable floor at 8.5 which is exactly 1.5' above BFE, not higher than.	5	0
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+5) Staff comment: NOT VERIFIED: Transient units are not affordable.	5	0
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 1 —Silver (+30) Staff comment:		
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40) Staff comment: VERIFIED: LEED for Hospitality, qualifies Gold	40	40
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 3— Platinum (+60) Staff comment:		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$5,000 or more (+10) Staff comment: ALLOWED: Although not mentioned in the Solutions Statement, it is deemed sufficient to rely on the BPAS Certification Form which certifies the score sheet, claiming 10 points for this item.	10	10
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Will Shepler	10	10
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Mentioned in Solutions Statement and shown on plan.	5	5
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10) Staff comment: NOT VERIFIED: Neither Solutions Statement, Plans nor LEED score sheet mentions this line item.	10	0
10. Additional on-site open space or on-site recreational facilities (+10) Staff comment: ALLOWED: Although Solutions Statement does not mention this item, Plans show a communal deck area between the residences and the docks, which qualify as on-site recreational facilities.	10	10
11. Buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area (+15) Staff comment:		
Total:	95	75

**BLANK TEMPLATES
BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 4 APPLICATIONS**

Applicant: Pike Architects

Site Address: 2312-2318 N Roosevelt Blvd (Banner Tire)

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: 10 Affordable Unit(s)

Prerequisite Development Type: Major Construction

General Planning Comments

--

Prerequisites: Major Construction/Renovation.

<p>A) Baseline green building certification required Staff comment: ALLOWED: Although score sheet was not filled out, Solutions Statement and score card state that the project will achieve a minimum of 40 points to obtain FGBC baseline.</p>
<p>B) First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation Staff comment: VERIFIED: Habitable space is on second floor over restaurant.</p>
<p>C) Rainwater catchment system required Staff comment: VERIFIED: 100% of roof area mentioned in Solutions Statement</p>

Point System: Three or more units

<u>Criteria (Points)</u>	<u>Applicant</u>	<u>Staff</u>
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Habitable space is above restaurant.	5	5
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: All affordable units	5	5
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 1 —Silver (+30) Staff comment:		
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40) Staff comment:		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 3— Platinum (+60) Staff comment:		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$5,000 or more (+10) Staff comment: ALLOWED: Although not mentioned in the Solutions Statement, it is deemed sufficient to rely on the BPAS Certification Form which certifies the score sheet, claiming 10 points for this item.	10	10
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment:		
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5) Staff comment:		
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10) Staff comment:		
10. Additional on-site open space or on-site recreational facilities (+10) Staff comment:		
11. Buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area (+15) Staff comment:		
Total:	20	20

BPAS STAFF REVIEW: YEAR 4 APPLICATIONS

Applicant: Owen Trepanier

Site Address: 1421 First Street

Number and Type of Unit(s) Requested: _1_Market-Rate & __ Affordable Unit(s)

Prerequisite Development Type: Major Construction

General Planning Comments

VERIFIED

Prerequisites: Major Construction/Renovation.

A) Baseline green building certification required Staff comment: VERIFIED, Silver actually met, but unclaimed.
B) First habitable floor 1.5 feet above required base flood elevation Staff comment: VERIFIED: Home is over parking.
C) Rainwater catchment system required Staff comment: VERIFIED. 1,200 Gallon Cistern noted on plans.

Point System: One or two units.

Criteria (Points)	Applicant	Staff
1. Building more than 1.5' higher than the base flood elevation (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Home is over parking.	5	5
2. Voluntarily providing affordable housing units (+10) Staff comment:		
3. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Silver (+30) Staff comment: VERIFIED via Score Sheet, but not claimed.	0	(30)
4. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2 — Gold (+40) Staff comment:		
5. Achieving Green Building Certification Upgrade 2— Platinum (+60) Staff comment:		
6. Voluntary contributions to AIPP or tree fund of \$1,000 or more (+10) Staff comment:		
7. Design by a LEED accredited architect (+10) Staff comment: VERIFIED	10	10
8. Electrical high-voltage conduit for electric car charging station (+5) Staff comment:		
9. Non-roof areas with minimum 29 solar reflectance index (SRI) (+10) Staff comment:		
10. Roofing materials with solar reflectance index (SRI) of at least 29 (+5) Staff comment: VERIFIED: Plans show roof with SRI of 32.	5	5
11. Designing the buildings with a vegetated roof of at least 50% of the roof area. (+15) Staff comment:		
Total:	20	20