

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation
Results Summary

Bidder	Average Reviewer Score	
Veridian	82.75	1st
Engineered Coating Solutions	82.48	2nd
Engineered Spray Solutions	67.83	3rd
National Water Main Cleaning Company	67.43	
Restoration & Protective Services	65.24	
Shenandoah	48.68	
Paints & Coatings, Inc.	46.07	

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

		Respondant				Respondant				
		National Water Main Cleaning Company				Engineered Coating Solutions				
		Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	
Evaluation Criteria		Reviewer Scores				Reviewer Scores				
Possible Points		Reviewer Scores				Reviewer Scores				
1	<p>Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm’s relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar costal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40	25	30	37	30	39	35	39	40
2	<p>Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15	10	12	13	14	14	13	14	15
3	<p>Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City’s goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15	10	9	14	14	15	13	14	15
4	<p>Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor’s Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30	12.9	12.9	12.9	12.9	16.0	16.0	16.0	16.0
Total		100	57.9	63.9	76.9	70.9	84.0	77.0	83.0	86.0
			Reviewers' Average 67.4				Reviewers' Average 82.5			

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

		Respondant	Restoration & Protective Services				Shenandoah			
			Reviewer	Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G
Evaluation Criteria		Possible Points	Reviewer Scores				Reviewer Scores			
1	<p>Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm’s relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar costal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40	30	36	37	20	20	33	36	9
2	<p>Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15	10	14	13	4	10	13	13	3
3	<p>Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City’s goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15	10	14	14	4	10	12	13	3
4	<p>Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor’s Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30	13.7	13.7	13.7	13.7	4.9	4.9	4.9	4.9
Total		100	63.7	77.7	77.7	41.7	44.9	62.9	66.9	19.9
			Reviewers' Average 65.2				Reviewers' Average 48.7			

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

		Respondant	Engineered Spray Solutions				Paints & Coatings, Inc.			
		Reviewer	Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R	Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R
Evaluation Criteria		Possible Points	Reviewer Scores				Reviewer Scores			
1	<p>Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm’s relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar costal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40	35	32	36	17	5	31	39	10
2	<p>Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15	12	10	7	5	5	10	7	3
3	<p>Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City’s goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15	14	10	13	5	0	11	0	3
4	<p>Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor’s Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30	18.8	18.8	18.8	18.8	15.1	15.1	15.1	15.1
Total		100	79.8	70.8	74.8	45.8	25.1	67.1	61.1	31.1
			Reviewers' Average 67.8				Reviewers' Average 46.1			

RFP 26-004 General Services for Manhole & Concrete Rehabilitation

		Respondant	Veridian			
		Reviewer	Sean Mc	Melissa F	Steve G	Sandy R
Evaluation Criteria		Possible Points	Reviewer Scores			
1	<p>Experience and Capability: Contractor will be evaluated on the firm’s relevant experience and past performance in manhole and concrete rehabilitation projects – particularly within the City of Key West, Monroe County, or similar costal/marine environments. Evaluations will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Successful completion of similar rehabilitation or lining projects. •Demonstrated understanding of local conditions (groundwater intrusion, corrosion, confined spaces). •References and record of quality, safety, and timely performance. 	40	38	34	35	16
2	<p>Team and Staffing Qualifications: Contractors will be evaluated on the qualifications, certifications, and experience of key personnel (Project Manager, Site Supervisor, Field Technicians, Safety Officers). Points will be awarded for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Experience on similar projects. •Confined-space and concrete rehabilitation certifications. •Demonstrated organizational capacity to support project delivery. 	15	14	13	13	5
3	<p>Work Plan and Technical Approach: Assessment of Contractor(s) understanding of the scope of work and the methods proposed to achieve the City’s goals. Evaluation will consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Clarity and feasibility of the proposed work plan. •Quality assurance and inspection methods. •Equipment, materials, and rehabilitation techniques proposed. •Safety and environmental protection measures. 	15	12	14	12	5
4	<p>Cost / Price: Evaluation of reasonableness and competitiveness of the proposed price. Points will be awarded using the following formula such as: Score = (Lowest Proposal/Contractor’s Price) * 30 to normalize cost against other proposals.</p>	30	30.0	30.0	30.0	30.0
Total		100	94.0	91.0	90.0	56.0
			Reviewers' Average 82.8			

Forms

X = Submitted

-- = Not Submitted

Required Forms

- Bid Form / Unit Price Schedule
- Anti-Kickback Affidavit
- Public Entity Crimes Form
- City of Key West Indemnification Form
- Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit
- Cone of Silence Affidavit
- Non-Collusion Affidavit
- Local Contractor Certification
- City of Key West E-Verify Affidavit
- Noncoercive Conduct Affidavit
- Scrutinized Companies Certification

Submitted Docs Relative to each Criteria Block

National Water Main Cleaning Company	Engineered Coating Solutions	Restoration & Protective Services	Shenandoah	Engineered Spray Solutions	Paints & Coatings, Inc	Veridian
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
NA	NA	NA	--	NA	NA	NA
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X

1 Experience and Capability

- Listed Relevant Experience
- Submitted References (Minimum of 3)

X	X	X	X	X	--	X
X	X	X	X	X	X	X

2 Team & Staffing Qualifications

- Staff Resumes (required) (do staff have So FL XP?)
- CSE and other Certifications

X	--	--	--	--	--	--
X	X	X	X	X	--	X

3 Work Plan and Technical Approach

- Written Work Plan/approach/procedure
- Equipment List (not specifically required)

X	X	X	X	X	--	X
X	X	X	X	X	--	X

General Bid Submittal Requirements

- Resubmitted Entire Proposal (VH's M&M rider)
- Acknowledged 2 (two) Addenda
- COI (not required at time of Bid Submittal)
- Florida State License (Required)

--	--	--	--	--	X	--
X	X	X	X	X	X	X
X	X	X	--	--	--	X
CUC1226418	CGC1532642	CGC1528084	CGC1524099	CGC1519214	--	CFC1430544

**Manhole Rehabilitation and Spalling Repair
RFP 26-002**

				National Water Main Cleaning Company		Engineered Coating Solutions		Restoration & Protective Services		Shenandoah		Engineered Spray Solutions		Paints & Coatings, Inc		Veridian	
Item #	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost	Unit Cost	Total Cost
1	Performance and Payment bonds																
A	Performance and Payment Bonds	1	Per \$1,000	\$7.00	\$7,000.00	\$18.80	\$18,800.00	\$40.00	\$40.00	\$24,600.63	\$24,600.63	\$0.00	\$0.00		\$1,000.00	\$20.00	\$6,739.00
2	Mobilization/Demobilization																
A	Mobilization/Demobilization (In no case shall the amount bid for this item exceed five (5) percent (%) of the Total Base Bid. This item shall include MOT, General & Supplementary Conditions, Certified AutoCAD as Built's)	1	LS	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$98,402.50	\$98,402.50	\$8,000.00	\$8,000.00		\$1,000.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00
3	Manhole & Structures Coating																
A	Epoxy Resin Based Coating 48" Diameter 1/4" Minimum Thickness	180	VF	\$610.00	\$109,800.00	\$600.00	\$108,000.00	\$969.00	\$174,420.00	\$335.00	\$60,300.00	\$240.00	\$43,200.00	\$625.00	\$112,500.00	\$305.00	\$54,900.00
B	Epoxy Resin Based Coating 60" Diameter 1/4" Minimum Thickness	60	VF	\$770.00	\$46,200.00	\$750.00	\$45,000.00	\$1,209.00	\$72,540.00	\$415.00	\$24,900.00	\$260.00	\$15,600.00	\$775.00	\$46,500.00	\$395.00	\$23,700.00
C	Structure Epoxy Resin Based Coating 1/4" Minimum Thickness	1000	SF	\$45.00	\$45,000.00	\$50.00	\$50,000.00	\$49.00	\$49,000.00	\$31.00	\$31,000.00	\$35.00	\$35,000.00	\$50.00	\$50,000.00	\$32.00	\$32,000.00
D	125 MIL Variance (1/8")	200	SF	\$36.00	\$7,200.00	\$15.00	\$3,000.00	\$49.00	\$9,800.00	\$19.00	\$3,800.00	\$10.00	\$2,000.00	\$40.00	\$8,000.00	\$9.00	\$1,800.00
4	Manhole & Structures Repair																
A	Removal of Existing Manhole or Wetwell Lining System (Excluding T-Lock or Similar Liner)	200	SF	\$110.00	\$22,000.00	\$15.00	\$3,000.00	\$13.00	\$2,600.00	\$40.00	\$8,000.00	\$9.00	\$1,800.00	\$15.00	\$3,000.00	\$10.00	\$2,000.00
B	Removal of Existing Manhole or Wetwell T-Lock or Similar Lining System	800	SF	\$16.21	\$12,968.00	\$22.00	\$17,600.00	\$15.00	\$12,000.00	\$30.00	\$24,000.00	\$35.00	\$28,000.00	\$15.00	\$12,000.00	\$20.00	\$16,000.00
C	Patching & Profiling - Cementitious Grout Only	3000	SF	\$22.00	\$66,000.00	\$20.00	\$60,000.00	\$11.00	\$33,000.00	\$135.00	\$405,000.00	\$12.00	\$36,000.00	\$25.00	\$75,000.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
D	Infiltration Control - Cementitious or Chemical Grout	600	GAL	\$95.00	\$57,000.00	\$100.00	\$60,000.00	\$150.00	\$90,000.00	\$96.00	\$57,600.00	\$125.00	\$75,000.00	\$150.00	\$90,000.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
E	Bonding Compound	120	GAL	\$25.00	\$3,000.00	\$75.00	\$9,000.00	\$20.00	\$2,400.00	\$75.00	\$9,000.00	\$1.00	\$120.00	\$5.00	\$600.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
F	Bench and Invert Channel Repair	100	LF	\$22.61	\$2,261.00	\$200.00	\$20,000.00	\$200.00	\$20,000.00	\$150.00	\$15,000.00	\$100.00	\$10,000.00	\$400.00	\$40,000.00	\$135.00	\$13,500.00
G	Chimney Repairs	100	VF	\$391.00	\$39,100.00	\$175.00	\$17,500.00	\$50.00	\$5,000.00	\$175.00	\$17,500.00	\$50.00	\$5,000.00	\$250.00	\$25,000.00	\$75.00	\$7,500.00
5	Cleaning, Televising, Assessment																
A	Cleaning Manholes / Structures	40	EA	\$225.00	\$9,000.00	\$250.00	\$10,000.00	\$250.00	\$10,000.00	\$375.00	\$15,000.00	\$10.00	\$400.00	\$250.00	\$10,000.00	\$25.00	\$1,000.00
B	Televising / Photographs / Inspection Report	40	EA	\$50.00	\$2,000.00	\$250.00	\$10,000.00	\$100.00	\$4,000.00	\$50.00	\$2,000.00	\$100.00	\$4,000.00	\$100.00	\$4,000.00	\$25.00	\$1,000.00
6	Ancillary Services																
A	Bypass Pumping - 4"	5	Day	\$25.00	\$125.00	\$850.00	\$4,250.00	\$1,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$250.00	\$1,250.00	\$3,000.00	\$15,000.00
B	Bypass Pumping - 6"	5	Day	\$50.00	\$250.00	\$1,100.00	\$5,500.00	\$1,200.00	\$6,000.00	\$750.00	\$3,750.00	\$3,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$350.00	\$1,750.00	\$4,000.00	\$20,000.00
C	Bypass Pumping - 8"	5	Day	\$300.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$1,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$450.00	\$2,250.00	\$5,500.00	\$27,500.00
D	Vac-Truck	40	Hr	\$250.00	\$10,000.00	\$350.00	\$14,000.00	\$400.00	\$16,000.00	\$300.00	\$12,000.00	\$300.00	\$12,000.00	\$250.00	\$10,000.00	\$475.00	\$19,000.00
E	Maintenance of Traffic - City	5	EA	\$25.00	\$125.00	\$2,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$2,500.00	\$12,500.00	\$1,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$500.00	\$2,500.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
F	Maintenance of Traffic - FDOT	1	EA	\$125.00	\$125.00	\$4,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
7	Concrete Spalling Repair																
A	Slab Repair: Spalling/Surface Patching	400	SF	\$60.00	\$24,000.00	\$45.00	\$18,000.00	\$30.00	\$12,000.00	\$135.00	\$54,000.00	\$12.00	\$4,800.00	\$50.00	\$20,000.00	\$11.00	\$4,400.00
B	Slab Repair: Spalling/Surface Patching w/Reinforcement Steel	200	SF	\$70.00	\$14,000.00	\$75.00	\$15,000.00	\$60.00	\$12,000.00	\$440.50	\$88,100.00	\$25.00	\$5,000.00	\$50.00	\$10,000.00	\$20.00	\$4,000.00
C	Vertical or Overhead Concrete Repair: Cracks	1000	LF	\$56.00	\$56,000.00	\$45.00	\$45,000.00	\$25.00	\$25,000.00	\$220.25	\$220,250.00	\$125.00	\$125,000.00	\$50.00	\$50,000.00	\$14.00	\$14,000.00
D	Vertical or Overhead Concrete Repair: Surface Patching (Depth<1")	1000	SF	\$85.00	\$85,000.00	\$35.00	\$35,000.00	\$25.00	\$25,000.00	\$220.25	\$220,250.00	\$20.00	\$20,000.00	\$50.00	\$50,000.00	\$30.00	\$30,000.00
E	Vertical or Overhead Concrete Repair: Spalling/Surface Patching (1"<Depth<3")	300	SF	\$165.00	\$49,500.00	\$65.00	\$19,500.00	\$30.00	\$9,000.00	\$330.00	\$99,000.00	\$30.00	\$9,000.00	\$60.00	\$18,000.00	\$60.00	\$18,000.00
F	Vertical or Overhead Concrete Repair: Spalling/Surface Patching w/Reinforcement Steel (3"<Depth<6")	200	SF	\$400.00	\$80,000.00	\$95.00	\$19,000.00	\$80.00	\$16,000.00	\$440.50	\$88,100.00	\$40.00	\$8,000.00	\$75.00	\$15,000.00	\$120.00	\$24,000.00
G	Concrete Repair: Tie Holes	100	EA	\$65.00	\$6,500.00	\$30.00	\$3,000.00	\$20.00	\$2,000.00	\$620.00	\$62,000.00	\$50.00	\$5,000.00	\$100.00	\$10,000.00	\$15.00	\$1,500.00
H	Joint Repair	50	LF	\$90.00	\$4,500.00	\$65.00	\$3,250.00	\$100.00	\$5,000.00	\$1,680.00	\$84,000.00	\$125.00	\$6,250.00	\$50.00	\$2,500.00	\$25.00	\$1,250.00
I	Joint Sealant: Remove & Replace	200	LF	\$135.00	\$27,000.00	\$25.00	\$5,000.00	\$400.00	\$80,000.00	\$1,680.00	\$336,000.00	\$175.00	\$35,000.00	\$50.00	\$10,000.00	\$12.00	\$2,400.00

Total Stated in Bid	797,154	645,400	740,300	1,968,050	547,670	684,350	343,689
Verified Calculated Total	797,154	645,400	750,300	2,091,053	547,670	684,350	343,689
Difference (if any)			+ \$10,000.00	+ \$123,003.13			