



City of Key West, FL

Old City Hall
510 Greene Street
Key West FL 33040

Action Minutes - Final Historic Architectural Review Commission

Tuesday, April 28, 2015

5:30 PM

Old City Hall

ADA Assistance: It is the policy of the City of Key West to comply with all requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). Please call the TTY number at 305-809-1000 or the ADA Coordinator at 305-809-3731 at least five business days in advance for sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or materials in accessible format.

Call Meeting To Order

Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag

Roll Call

Absent 1 - Mr. Logan

Present 6 - Mr. Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

Approval of Agenda

Approval of Minutes

1 March 24, 2015 Minutes

Attachments: [March 24, 2015 HARC Minutes](#)
[March 24, 2015 HARC Corrected Minutes](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Minutes be Approved with the correction to item #6 (Mr. Glorie voted "yes"). The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

HARC Planner's Report and Introduction of New Planning Director

Assistant City Attorney's Report

Old Business

- 2** Application for a floor sign - **#300 Front Street #3 - Julie Cruchet (H15-01-184)**

Attachments: [300 Front - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Mr. Green, that the Action Item be Denied based based on the Land Development Regulations and Article VI- Design Guidelines in Key West Historic District, particularly Guideline 6, page 49. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 2 - Ms. Hinkle, and Ms. Thompson

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 4 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Mr. McChesney, and Chairman Miller

New Business

- 3a** New storage shed - **#210 Truman Street - Richard Dostal (H15-01-0288)**

Attachments: [210 Truman - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Mr. Green, that the Action Item be Approved with the condition that shed eaves will be lowered to match the height of the house's existing eaves.. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

- 3b** Demolition of wood shed - **#210 Truman Street - Richard Dostal (H15-01-0288)**

Attachments: [210 Truman - Demo](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Green, seconded by Vice Chair Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

4a New parking lot - **#608 Petronia Street - Michael Ingram (H15-01-0322)**

Attachments: [608 Petronia - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Mr. Green, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

4b Demolition of a contributing, but heavily altered building - **#608 Petronia Street - Michael Ingram (H15-01-0322)**

Attachments: [608 Petronia - Demo](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Mr. Green, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

5 **After-the-Fact** - One pole sign, one menu board, and a continuous decorative band - **#821 Duval Street - Fran Gonzon (H15-01-0344)**

Attachments: [821 Duval - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Green, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Denied based on the Land Development Regulations and Article VI- Design Guidelines in Key West Historic District, particularly Section 114-104 of the Land Development Regulations: Restriction on number of signs permitted and the HARC Guidelines page 49 specifically guidelines 2, 6, 9, and 11 of page 49. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

6a New pre-fabricated shed in rear of property - **#921 Center Street - McKendry Builders (H15-01-0349)**

Attachments: [921 Center - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. McChesney, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

6b

Demolition of shed - **#921 Center Street - McKendry Builders (H15-01-0349)**

Attachments: [921 Center - Demo](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

7

One wall sign with halo effect and one hanging sign - **#511 Duval Street - Southernmost Signs (H15-01-0402)**

Attachments: [511 Duval - Design](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Green, seconded by Vice Chair Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

8a

New rear addition on non-contributing building - **#1212 Olivia Street - Tom Pope (H15-01-0403)**

Attachments: [1212 Olivia - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Mr. McChesney, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

8b

Demolition of rear addition on non-contributing building - **#1212 Olivia Street - Tom Pope (H15-01-0403)**

Attachments: [1212 Olivia - Demo](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

- 9** New elevated addition to non-contributing building - **#1205 Von Phister Street - Gary the Carpenter (H15-01-0411)**

Attachments: [1205 Von Phister - Design](#)

At the request of the applicant, a motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Vice Chair Glorie, that the Action Item be Postponed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

- 10a** New addition on contributing house - **#1233 South Street - Glenn Anderson (H15-01-0408)**

Attachments: [1233 South - Design](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Hinkle, seconded by Vice Chair Glorie, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

- 10b** Demolition of rear patio, carport, and shed - **#1233 South Street - Glenn Anderson (H15-01-0408)**

Attachments: [1233 South - Demo](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Ms. Hinkle, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

- 11** **After-the-Fact** - Remove and replace novelty siding on contributing house - **#711 Galveston Lane - Wayne Garcia Building Contractor (H15-01-0421)**

Attachments: [711 Galveston](#)

A motion was made by Mr. Green, seconded by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Vice Chair Glorie

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 5 - Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

12

Application to relocate contributing house and one-story frame structure;
add pool and rear deck - **#1021 Washington Street - Donna
Bosold/Barry Barroso (H15-01-0461)**

Attachments: [1021 Washington - Design](#)
 [Additions to Homestead](#)
 ['50s Tax Map](#)

PUBLIC COMMENTS - Speaking in support of the project:

Doug Mayberry
Sabrina Acevedo
Ann Reynolds

PUBLIC COMMENTS - Neighbors speaking against the project:

Robert Arman
Gary Thomas
Art Grizzell
Paula Carbonell

Following a lengthy discussion, a motion was made by Mr. Green, seconded by Vice Chair Glorie, that the Action Item did not contain sufficient modifications to be heard following the previous denial. The motion carried by the following vote:

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 6 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, Ms. Thompson, and Chairman Miller

13

Enclosure of non-historic front porch on contributing building - **#1209
Margaret Street - Meridian Engineering (H15-01-0462)**

Attachments: [1209 Margaret - Design](#)

A motion was made by Ms. Thompson, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion failed do to the lack of a second.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Mr. Green, that the Action Item be Denied based on the Land Development Regulations and Article VI- Design Guidelines in Key West Historic District, particularly Guideline 1, page 32 . The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Ms. Thompson

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 5 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, Mr. McChesney, and Chairman Miller

14

Three wall signs with halo effect on non-historic building - **#101 Duval Street - Icon Identity Solutions (H15-01-0469)**

Attachments: [101 Duval - Design](#)

A motion was made by Vice Chair Glorie, seconded by Mr. Green, that the Action Item be Approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

No: 1 - Ms. Thompson

Recuse: 1 - Mr. McChesney

Absent: 1 - Mr. Logan

Yes: 4 - Vice Chair Glorie, Mr. Green, Ms. Hinkle, and Chairman Miller

Comments from Commissioners

Adjournment