

RESOLUTION NO. 15-162

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF KEY WEST, FLORIDA, APPROVING THE STAFF RANKING OF FINANCIAL CONSULTANTS IN RESPONSE TO THE CITY'S REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS (RFQ) 15-002, AND AUTHORIZING STAFF TO NEGOTIATE CONTRACTS WITH THE THREE TOP-RANKED FIRMS IN SUBSTANTIAL CONFORMANCE WITH THE RFQ DOCUMENTS, FOR A TERM OF THREE YEARS WITH UP TO TWO ONE-YEAR OPTIONS, UPON ADVICE AND CONSENT OF THE CITY ATTORNEY; PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE

WHEREAS, the City issued RFQ 15-002 for Financial Consulting Services, to which five firms responded by the bid opening on April 2, 2015; and

WHEREAS, a ranking committee composed of city staff convened on April 23, at a properly noticed public meeting, to review the five (5) responses to the RFQ, and determined that three (3) firms are particularly qualified, and the City wishes to engage each one on a Task Order basis;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF KEY WEST, FLORIDA, AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1: That the top three responses in response to RFQ No. 15-002, for Financial Consulting Services are hereby ranked by staff, and approved by the City Commission as follows:

- (1) Arcadis U.S., Inc.
- (2) Black and Veatch
- (3) CDM Smith

Section 2: That the City Manager is hereby authorized to negotiate and execute contracts on a task-order basis with each of the three top-ranked companies for a term of three years, with two one-year options, upon advice and consent of the City Attorney.

Section 3: That this Resolution shall go into effect immediately upon its passage and adoption and authentication by the signature of the Presiding Officer and the Clerk of the Commission.

Passed and adopted by the City Commission at a meeting held this 5th day of May, 2015.


Authenticated by the Presiding Officer and Clerk of the Commission on 6th day of May, 2015.

Filed with the Clerk on May 6, 2015.

Mayor Craig Cates	<u>Yes</u>
Vice Mayor Mark Rossi	<u>Yes</u>
Commissioner Teri Johnston	<u>Yes</u>
Commissioner Clayton Lopez	<u>Yes</u>
Commissioner Billy Wardlow	<u>Yes</u>
Commissioner Jimmy Weekley	<u>Absent</u>
Commissioner Tony Yaniz	<u>Yes</u>

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
CRAIG CATES, MAYOR

ATTEST:

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
CHERYL SMITH, CITY CLERK





THE CITY OF KEY WEST

Post Office Box 1409 Key West, FL 33041-1409 (305) 809-3700

M  
E  
M  
O  
R  
A  
N  
D  
U  
M

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

**TO:** Jim Scholl, City Manager

**FROM:** John Paul Castro, Utilities Director

**CC:** Greg Veliz, Asst. City Manager – Operations  
Sarah Spurlock, Asst. City Manager – Administration

**DATE:** April 17, 2015

**RE:** **Approval of Staff Ranking of Financial Consultants Responding to RFQ 15-002 and Authorization for the City Manager to Negotiate and Execute Contracts**

### ACTION STATEMENT:

This resolution will approve staff ranking of firms responding to RFQ 15-002: Financial Consulting Services; authorizing staff to negotiate contracts; authorizing the City Manager to enter into contracts with the selected firms.

### BACKGROUND:

The City has a need for financial consulting firms to assist staff as we create our rate models for utility budgets in wastewater, stormwater, and solid waste. These firms help staff analyze rates, revenues, capital expenditures, budgetary planning, along with other tasks. They also assist with the utility budget presentations to the City Commission.

As the City has multiple projects of all sizes and disciplines simultaneously, it typically contracts with multiple consultants to handle the workload.

### PURPOSE AND JUSTIFICATION:

City staff advertised a request for qualifications that had a bid opening on April 2. Staff has reviewed the responses for RFQ 15-002 from the following firms:

- Arcadis U.S., Inc
- Black and Veatch
- CDM Smith
- Raftelis Financial Consultants, Inc.
- Willdan Financial Services



The ranking committee consisted of city staff Michael Turner, Thaddeus Cohen, Karen Olsen, Elizabeth Ignaffo, and Marilyn Wilbarger which convened as advertised on April 23<sup>rd</sup> in public session at the City Clerk's conference room. The final rankings are as follows:

**Company Rankings for RFQ #15-002 Financial Consultants**

		Ranking of Proposers			
		Sewer/Stormwater			Solid Waste
1	<b>Arcadis</b>	284	1	<b>Arcadis</b>	282
2	<b>Black and Veatch</b>	282	2	<b>CDM Smith</b>	281
3	<b>Willdan</b>	259	3	<b>Willdan</b>	259
4	<b>Raftelis</b>	226	4		

City staff ranked the firm's proposals on a 200 point scale for Stormwater/Wastewater, a 200 point scale for solid waste, and a 300 point scale for additional services, including capital financing support and special rate determination.

Staff has historically requested separate proposals for waste/stormwater and solid waste. The RFQ was split to allow firms who are more specialized to submit proposals on either discipline without submitting for both.

City staff is requesting City Commission approval of the evaluation ranking and authorization for the City Manager to negotiate and enter into a contract with the three (3) highest ranked firms. If negotiations fail to result in a contract, all proposals will be rejected and a new RFQ will be advertised.

Consultant contracts will be based on hourly rates and reimbursables as negotiated by the City Manager. Financial services will be awarded on a task order basis, pursuant to City ordinance purchasing guidelines.

**OPTIONS / ADVANTAGES / DISADVANTAGES:**

1. The City Commission can approve city staff ranking and authorize the City Manager to negotiate and execute contracts, based on rates of pay and reimbursable expenses to the three (3) highest ranked firms, which include Arcadis U.S., Inc, Black and Veatch, and CDM Smith. City staff will engage financial consultants on a task order basis. Arcadis U.S., Inc. has the ability to complete rate studies for solid waste, stormwater, and waste water. Both Black & Veatch and CDM Smith ranked highest in their respective disciplines giving the City the best option in each, should Arcadis U.S., Inc. be unavailable or should the City decide to split the work load.
2. The City Commission can approve city staff ranking and authorize the City Manager to negotiate and execute contracts based on rates of pay and reimbursable expenses to Arcadis U.S., Inc. and Willdan Financial Services as both companies scored within the top 3 in both sections of the RFQ. Black & Veatch would become the third highest ranking overall. This option gives the City two firms that can cover the three rate study disciplines, but eliminates CDM Smith who greatly outscored Willdan in the Solid Waste section of the RFQ evaluation.
3. The City Commission could disapprove staff ranking for the financial consultant RFQ. This would leave the City without financial consultants on contract. All services in need would have to be



formally advertised for each individual task. This creates large lead times for staff and is very costly.

**FINANCIAL IMPACT:**

There is no financial impact of approving any of the options listed above. Contracts will be executed after the resolution is passed and services requested on a task order basis.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends the City Commission choose option 1, approving the evaluation team ranking from city staff and allowing the City Manager to negotiate and execute contracts for financial services with Arcadis U.S., Inc, Black & Veatch, and CDM Smith. These three companies ranked far higher than the other firms in the two sections of the RFQ.

Firm Name Arcaadis  
Response Check List

Elizabeth Michael Marilyn Karen Thaddeus

Mandatory Submittals	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Anti-Kickback Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Cone of Silence Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Public Entity Crimes Certification	X	X	X	X	X
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)	X	X	X	X	X
Company Information	X	X	X	X	X
Methodology and Approach	X	X	X	X	X
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants	X	X	X	X	X
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References	X	X	X	X	X
Correct Project Title	X	X	X	X	X
<b>Proposal Accepted as Responsive</b>	X	X	X	X	X

Points

Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)

Criteria	Points	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	50	50	50	45	50
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	40	40	35	40
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	40	40	25	40	40
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	40	40	40	35	40
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	20	20	30
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>		<b>190</b>	<b>195</b>	<b>175</b>	<b>175</b>	<b>200</b>

Points

Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)

Criteria	Points	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	50	45	50	45	45
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	35	40	35	40
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	40	35	40	40	40
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	40	35	40	35	40
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	20	20	30
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>		<b>190</b>	<b>175</b>	<b>190</b>	<b>175</b>	<b>195</b>

Additional Services

Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300 Points)

Criteria	Points	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Capital Financing Support	0-100	100	95	0	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	0	95	0	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	100	95	0	0	0
<b>Sub Total for Additional Services</b>		<b>200</b>	<b>185</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

Score for Stormwater/Wastewater

Score for Solid Waste

Additional Services

Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services

Solid Waste + Additional Services

Score for Stormwater/Wastewater	190	175	175	175	200
Score for Solid Waste	190	175	190	175	195
Additional Services	200	185	0	0	0
Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services	390	360	175	175	200
Solid Waste + Additional Services	390	360	190	175	195

Avg  $\frac{284}{282}$  storm/sewer  
solid waste



**Firm Name** Black + Veatch

**Response Check List**

Elizabeth                      Michael                      Marilyn                      Karen                      Thaddeus

**Mandatory Submittals**

Anti-Kickback Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Cone of Silence Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Public Entity Crimes Certification	X	X	X	X	X
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)	X	X	X	X	X
Company Information	X	X	X	X	X
Methodology and Approach	X	X	X	X	X
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants	X	X	X	X	X
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References	X	X	X	X	X
Correct Project Title	X	X	X	X	X
<b>Proposal Accepted as Responsive</b>	X	X	X	X	X

**Points**

**Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)**

Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	50	45	45	40	50
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	35	30	35	35
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	30	35	30	40	35
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	40	35	40	35	35
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	25	20	30
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>		<b>180</b>	<b>175</b>	<b>170</b>	<b>170</b>	<b>185</b>

**Points**

**Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)**

Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50					
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40					
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40					
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40					
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30					
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>						

**Additional Services**

**Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300 Points)**

Capital Financing Support	0-100	100	90	50	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	0	0	50	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	100	90	50	0	0
<b>Sub Total for Additional Services</b>		<b>200</b>	<b>180</b>	<b>150</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

**Score for Stormwater/Wastewater**

**Score for Solid Waste**

**Additional Services**

**Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services**

**Solid Waste + Additional Services**

		180	175	170	170	185
		200	180	150	0	0
		<b>380</b>	<b>355</b>	<b>320</b>	<b>170</b>	<b>185</b>

Avg Storm/Sewer 282



Firm Name CDM Smith

Response Check List

Elizabeth Michael Marilyn Karen Thaddeus

**Mandatory Submittals**

Anti-Kickback Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Cone of Silence Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Public Entity Crimes Certification	X	X	X	X	X
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)	X	X	X	X	X
Company Information	X	X	X	X	X
Methodology and Approach	X	X	X	X	X
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants	X	X	X	X	X
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References	X	X	X	X	X
Correct Project Title	X	X	X	X	X
<b>Proposal Accepted as Responsive</b>	X	X	X	X	X

**Points**

**Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)**

Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50				
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40				
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40				
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40				
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30				
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>					

**Points**

**Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)**

Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	50	50	50	45	50
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	40	40	35	40
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	40	40	40	40	40
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	40	40	40	35	40
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	25	20	30
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>		190	195	195	175	200

**Additional Services**

Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300 Points)	<b>Points</b>					
Capital Financing Support	0-100	100	0	50	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	100	0	50	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	100	0	50	0	0
<b>Sub Total for Additional Services</b>		300	0	150	0	0

**Score for Stormwater/Wastewater**

Score for Solid Waste

Additional Services

Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services

Solid Waste + Additional Services

	190	195	195	175	200
	300	0	150	0	0
	490	195	345	175	200

Avg Solid Waste 2.81



**Firm Name** ReAletis

Response Check List

Elizabeth      Michael      Marilyn      Karen      Thaddeus

Mandatory Submittals	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Anti-Kickback Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Cone of Silence Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Public Entity Crimes Certification	X	X	X	X	X
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)	X	X	X	X	X
Company Information	X	X	X	X	X
Methodology and Approach	X	X	X	X	X
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants	X	X	X	X	X
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References	X	X	X	X	X
Correct Project Title	X	X	X	X	X
<b>Proposal Accepted as Responsive</b>	X	X	X	X	X

**Points**

**Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)**

Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	45	40	50	45	40
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	40	35	40	35	35
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	35	30	30	40	35
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	30	30	40	35	35
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	20	20	30
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>		<b>170</b>	<b>160</b>	<b>180</b>	<b>175</b>	<b>175</b>

**Points**

**Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)**

Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50					
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40					
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40					
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40					
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30					
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>						

**Additional Services**

Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300 Points)	Points	Elizabeth	Michael	Marilyn	Karen	Thaddeus
Capital Financing Support	0-100	50	25	0	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	0	0	0	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	50	25	0	0	0
<b>Sub Total for Additional Services</b>		<b>100</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

Score for Stormwater/Wastewater  
 Score for Solid Waste  
 Additional Services  
 Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services  
 Solid Waste + Additional Services

Score for Stormwater/Wastewater	170	160	180	175	175
Score for Solid Waste	0	0	0	0	0
Additional Services	100	75	0	0	0
Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services	270	235	180	175	175
Solid Waste + Additional Services	0	75	0	0	0

Avg Storm/Sewer 226



Firm Name Willdan  
 Response Check List

Elizabeth Michael Marilyn Karen Thaddeus

**Mandatory Submittals**

Anti-Kickback Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Equal Benefits for Domestic Partners Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Cone of Silence Affidavit	X	X	X	X	X
Public Entity Crimes Certification	X	X	X	X	X
Information Page (Project name, name of firm, contact info, project leader)	X	X	X	X	X
Company Information	X	X	X	X	X
Methodology and Approach	X	X	X	X	X
Personnel Resumes & Subconsultants	X	X	X	X	X
Representative Financial Services Projects and Client References	X	X	X	X	X
Correct Project Title	X	X	X	X	X
<b>Proposal Accepted as Responsive</b>	X	X	X	X	X

**Points**

**Vendor Scoring Matrix (Sewer/Stormwater) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)**

Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	45	40	45	40	40
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	35	35	40	30	30
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	35	30	35	40	30
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	35	30	40	35	30
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	25	20	30
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>		<b>170</b>	<b>160</b>	<b>185</b>	<b>165</b>	<b>160</b>

**Points**

**Vendor Scoring Matrix (Solid Waste) Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 200 Points)**

Proposer's past performance and experience providing proposed services, including demonstrating relevant experience	0-50	45	40	50	40	35
Qualifications and experience of Project Manager	0-40	35	35	40	30	30
Qualifications and experience of Key Personnel	0-40	35	35	35	40	30
Qualifications, experience, and past performance of Proposer	0-40	30	30	40	35	30
Local Availability of Proposer	0-30	20	25	25	20	30
<b>Sub Total for Qualifications/Experience</b>		<b>165</b>	<b>165</b>	<b>190</b>	<b>165</b>	<b>155</b>

**Additional Services**

**Qualifications/Experience (Maximum 300 Points)**

Capital Financing Support	0-100	25	20	20	0	0
Financial and Compliance Reporting Support	0-100	0	0	20	0	0
Special Rate Determination Assistance	0-100	25	20	20	0	0
<b>Sub Total for Additional Services</b>		<b>75</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

**Score for Stormwater/Wastewater**

**Score for Solid Waste**

**Additional Services**

**Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services**

**Solid Waste + Additional Services**

Score for Stormwater/Wastewater	170	160	185	165	160
Score for Solid Waste	165	165	190	165	155
Additional Services	75	60	60	0	0
Storm/Wastewater + Additional Services	<b>245</b>	<b>220</b>	<b>245</b>	<b>165</b>	<b>160</b>
Solid Waste + Additional Services	<b>240</b>	<b>225</b>	<b>250</b>	<b>165</b>	<b>155</b>

Avg 259 Storm/Sewer  
 259 Solid Waste



# INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

To: John Paul Castro, Utilities Director

CC: Elizabeth Ignoffo, Permit Engineer  
Sue Snider, Purchasing

From: Cheri Smith, City Clerk *Cheri Smith / spH*

Date: April 2, 2015

Subject: **FINANCIAL CONSULTING SERVICES TO SUPPORT THE CITY'S SOLID WASTE SYSTEM, WASTEWATER SYSTEM, STORMWATER SYSTEM, MARINAS AND ECONOMIC CONSULTING; RFQ 15-002**

---

The following bids were opened Thursday, April 2, 2015 at 3:00 p.m. in response to the above referenced project.

1. Arcadis U.S. Inc.  
8201 Peters Road, Suite 3400  
Plantation, FL 33324
2. Black & Veatch  
1300 Concord Terrace, Suite 120  
Sunrise, FL 33323
3. CDM Smith, Inc.  
1715 North Westshore Boulevard, Suite 875  
Tampa, FL 33607
4. Raftelis Financial Consultants, Inc.  
950 S. Winter Park Drive, Suite 240  
Casselberry, FL 32707
5. Willdan Financial Services  
200 South Orange Avenue, Suite 1550  
Orlando, FL 32801