

City of Key West

RFP Evaluation Committee Meeting – Sign-In Sheet

Solicitation Numbers:

- RFP 26-001

Date: March 16, 2026

Meeting Location: 1300 White Street, Key West, Florida 33040

Meeting Time: 1:00 PM (Eastern Daylight Time)

Department: City of Key West – Procurement / Finance Department

Attendee Sign-In

#	Name (Print)	Organization	Email	Signature
1	Joe W/Alston	Maryes Rubber Group	Joe@TropicalSud.com	
2	Clinton Cury	Tropical Shell + Grifter	Clinton.Cury@historictours.com	
3	Daniela Salume	City of Key West	daniela.salume@cityofkeywest-fl.gov	
4	Taylor Brown	City of Key West		
5	Daniel Passicano	City of Key West		
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				

3:00

Minutes

RFP Evaluation Committee Meeting

RFP 26-001 Hospitality House

Location: City Commission Conference Room, 1300 White Street, Key West, Florida 33040

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at [3 : 04 AM] by Lucas Torres-Bull

2. Roll Call/Attendance

The following members were present:

[Taylor Brown], Committee Member

[Daniela Salume], Committee Member

[David Marsicano], Committee Member

[Lucas Torres-Bull], Procurement Representative (non-voting)

3. Purpose of Meeting

The purpose of the meeting is to evaluate the responses received in response to Request for Proposal (RFP) No. [RFP 26-001], for the Historic Building Rehabilitation Lease and Adaptive Use Hospitality House and to rank the firms based on their overall proposals in accordance with the evaluation criteria outlined in the RFP.

4. Overview of Evaluation Criteria

Evaluation Representative reviewed the evaluation process and criteria, which included the following:

Category	Points
1. Experience: a. Successful track record of rehabilitating and operating facilities similar to the proposed Project. b. Demonstrated ability to operate and maintain adaptive reuse real estate projects once completed, including addressing on-going maintenance needs.	30

	c. Sufficient staff and consultant resources to deliver the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project.	
2.	<p>Financial Capacity:</p> <p>a. Proven ability of Respondent to possess or attract equity and debt capital for projects similar in scope and cost to the proposed Hospitality House Redevelopment Project as evidenced by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Financing comparable projects. ii. Access to sufficient debt and equity for the project proposed. iii. On-going relationships with financial sources. 	25
3.	<p>Project Vision and Key Objectives:</p> <p>a. Consistency of proposed vision and objectives for the project</p> <p>b. Responsiveness to key objectives.</p> <p>c. Fit and synergies of proposed use(s) and improvements with surrounding land uses.</p> <p>d. Overall ability of the project to add to the vitality of the surrounding Mallory Square area</p>	25
4.	<p>Feasibility:</p> <p>a. Evidence of ability of the Respondent to attract necessary public and private investment for the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project proposed.</p>	20

<p>b. Feasibility of the concept to address the needed physical improvement to and retrofit of Hospitality House in the near term.</p> <p>d. Cash flow projections that demonstrate the project, once operational, will meet all lease, debt service and operating expenses.</p>	
Total Points	100

1) Review of Submittals

The committee reviewed and discussed the submittals received from the following proposer:

1. Hayes Robertson Group, Inc
2. Tropical Shell & Gift, Inc

Note: Each firm’s submission was evaluated individually

2) Total Scoring and Ranking

After discussion, each committee member independently completed a scoring sheet. The individual scores were then compiled, and the firms were ranked in accordance with the results reflected in the Excel Scoring Matrix, which is attached to these minutes as a separate document.

3) Recommendation

Based on the following scoring outcome, the evaluation committee recommendation that the award for RFP 26-001 to ~~HTA~~ Tropical Shell & Gift

4) Adjournment

There being no further business or discussions, the meeting was adjourned at 3:23 PM.

Minutes prepared by:

Lucas Torres-Bull

Procurement Manager
03/16/2026

RFP 26-001 - Re-Bid Historic Building Rehabilitation Lease and Adaptive Use Hospitality House

#	Evaluation Category	Max Points	Evaluator Score	Key Evaluation Considerations	Notes / Justification
1	Experience	30	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Successful track record of rehabilitating and operating facilities similar to the proposed Project. b. Demonstrated ability to operate and maintain adaptive reuse real estate projects once completed, including addressing on-going maintenance needs. c. Sufficient staff and resources to deliver the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project. 	<p>Some experience in rehabilitation projects.</p>
2	Financial Capacity	25	23	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Proven ability of Respondent to possess or attract equity and debt capital for projects similar in scope and cost to the proposed Hospitality House Redevelopment Project as evidenced by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Financing comparable projects. ii. Access to sufficient debt and equity for the project proposed. iii. On-going relationships with financial sources. 	<p>available capital.</p>
3	Project Vision and Key Objectives	25	24	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Consistency of proposed vision and objectives. b. Responsiveness to key objectives. c. Fit and synergies of proposed use(s) and improvements with surrounding land uses. d. Overall ability of the project to add to the vitality of the surrounding Mallory Square area 	<p>Improving Mallory Square, will fit well with the surrounding context.</p>

	4 Feasibility	20	17	<p>a. Evidence of ability of the Proposer to attract necessary public and private investment for the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project proposed;</p> <p>b. Feasibility of the concept to address the needed physical improvement to and retrofit of Hospitality House in the near term.</p> <p>d. Cash flow projections that demonstrate the project, once operational, will meet all lease, debt service and operating expenses.</p>	<p><i>Museum very feasible.</i></p>
Total Score: /100					

RFP 26-001 - Re-Bid Historic Building Rehabilitation Lease and Adaptive Use Hospitality House

#	Evaluation Category	Max Points	Evaluator Score	Key Evaluation Considerations	Notes / Justification
1	Experience	30	29	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Successful track record of rehabilitating and operating facilities similar to the proposed Project. b. Demonstrated ability to operate and maintain adaptive reuse real estate projects once completed, including addressing on-going maintenance needs. c. Sufficient staff and resources to deliver the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project. 	<p>Experience in rehabilitation of historic structures.</p>
2	Financial Capacity	25	24	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Proven ability of Respondent to possess or attract equity and debt capital for projects similar in scope and cost to the proposed Hospitality House Redevelopment Project as evidenced by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Financing comparable projects. ii. Access to sufficient debt and equity for the project proposed. iii. On-going relationships with financial sources. 	
3	Project Vision and Key Objectives	25	24	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Consistency of proposed vision and objectives. b. Responsiveness to key objectives. c. Fit and synergies of proposed use(s) and improvements with surrounding land uses. d. Overall ability of the project to add to the vitality of the surrounding Mallory Square area 	<p>Improvement in Mallory Square, use will fit well w/ surrounding structures in the area.</p>

			<p>a. Evidence of ability of the Proposer to attract necessary public and private investment for the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project proposed.</p> <p>b. Feasibility of the concept to address the needed physical improvement to and retrofit of Hospitality House in the near term.</p> <p>d. Cash flow projections that demonstrate the project, once operational, will meet all lease, debt service and operating expenses.</p>	<p>Property has been fenced for construction, opening up to the public will be an improvement and very feasible.</p>
4 Feasibility	20	19		
Total Score:			/100	

Handwritten signature/initials

RFP 26-001 - Re-Bid Historic Building Rehabilitation Lease and Adaptive Use Hospitality House

#	Evaluation Category	Max Points	Evaluator Score	Key Evaluation Considerations	Notes / Justification
1	Experience	30	28	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Successful track record of rehabilitating and operating facilities similar to the proposed Project. b. Demonstrated ability to operate and maintain adaptive reuse real estate projects once completed, including addressing on-going maintenance needs. c. Sufficient staff and resources to deliver the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project. 	<p>Historic Tours of America operates multiple historic attractions in Key West including the Key West Aquarium, Old Town Trolley, Shipwreck Museum, and Truman Little White House. Demonstrated experience rehabilitating and operating historic properties and tourism facilities.</p>
2	Financial Capacity	25	23	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Financing comparable projects. ii. Access to sufficient debt and equity for the project proposed. iii. On-going relationships with financial sources. 	<p>Proposal includes proof of financial backing from Historic Tours of America and estimated investment of approximately \$494k for rehabilitation and exhibits. Financial support and parent company backing demonstrate capacity to fund project.</p>
3	Project Vision and Key Objectives	25	23	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Consistency of proposed vision and objectives. b. Responsiveness to key objectives. c. Fit and synergies of proposed use(s) and improvements with surrounding land uses. d. Overall ability of the project to add to the vitality of the surrounding Malloy Square area 	<p>Concept proposes marine conservation exhibits including coral restoration and coastal ecosystem education connected to the Key West Aquarium. Project aligns with environmental education, tourism, and Malloy Square cultural activity.</p>
4	Feasibility	20	18	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Evidence of ability of the Proposer to attract necessary public and private investment for the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project proposed. b. Feasibility of the concept to address the needed physical improvement to and retrofit of Hospitality House in the near term. c. Cash flow projections that demonstrate the project, once operational, will meet all lease, debt service and operating expenses. 	<p>Proposal includes construction scope, preliminary budget, contractor commitments, and timeline targeting completion and opening in 2027. Operational support from existing HTA management team indicates project feasibility.</p>
<p>Total Score: 92/100</p>					

Hayes Robertson

RFP 26-001 - Re-Bid Historic Building Rehabilitation Lease and Adaptive Use Hospitality House

#	Evaluation Category	Max Points	Evaluator Score	Key Evaluation Considerations	Notes / Justification
1	Experience	30		<p>a. Successful track record of rehabilitating and operating facilities similar to the proposed Project.</p> <p>b. Demonstrated ability to operate and maintain adaptive reuse real estate projects once completed, including addressing on-going maintenance needs.</p> <p>c. Sufficient staff and consultant resources.</p>	<p>Hayes Robertson Group demonstrated strong relevant redevelopment and operating experience in Key West, including historic and waterfront properties, restaurant operations, and adaptive reuse projects. The proposal identifies an experienced local team of architects, engineers, construction, land-use, and coral restoration professionals with capacity to execute and manage the project.</p>
2	Financial Capacity	25		<p>a. Proven ability of Respondent to possess or attract equity and debt capital for projects similar in scope and cost to the proposed Hospitality House Redevelopment Project as evidenced by:</p> <p>2. i. Financing comparable projects.</p> <p>ii. Access to sufficient debt and equity for the project proposed.</p> <p>iii. On-going relationships with financial sources.</p>	<p>The proposal includes evidence of substantial available capital and a representation that the project will be self-funded without construction loans. Supporting financial projections and operating budgets further demonstrate capacity to complete redevelopment and sustain operations.</p>
3	Project Vision and Key Objectives	25		<p>a. Consistency of proposed vision and objectives.</p> <p>b. Responsiveness to key objectives.</p> <p>24. c. Fit and synergies of proposed use(s) and improvements with surrounding land uses.</p> <p>d. Overall ability of the project to add to the vitality of the surrounding Mallory Square area</p>	<p>The proposal presents a clear and cohesive vision for the Hospitality House as a historic museum, environmental education hub, coral nursery/aquaculture feature, sculpture garden, concession area, and public splash fountain integrated with Mallory Square. The concept is responsive to the City's historic, public-use, and waterfront revitalization objectives and would add activity and interpretation to the surrounding area.</p>
4	Feasibility	20		<p>a. Evidence of ability of the Proposer to attract necessary public and private investment for the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project proposed.</p> <p>b. Feasibility of the concept to address the needed physical improvement to and retrofit of Hospitality House in the near term.</p> <p>d. Cash flow projections that demonstrate the project, once operational, will meet all lease, debt service and operating expenses.</p>	<p>The proposal includes conceptual plans, a defined development team, cost estimates, operating pro formas, and a phased schedule through permitting, construction, and opening. Overall feasibility is strong, though successful implementation will depend on coordination with public agencies, adjacent uses, and regulatory approvals associated with the environmental and waterfront program components.</p>
		Total Score:	93/100		

RFP 26-001 - Re-Bid Historic Building Rehabilitation Lease and Adaptive Use Hospitality House

#	Evaluation Category	Max Points	Evaluator Score	Key Evaluation Considerations	Notes / Justification
1	Experience	30	29	<p>a. Successful track record of rehabilitating and operating facilities similar to the proposed Project.</p> <p>b. Demonstrated ability to operate and maintain adaptive reuse real estate projects once completed, including addressing on-going maintenance needs.</p> <p>c. Sufficient staff and resources to deliver the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project.</p>	<p>The proposer demonstrates extensive experience in the tourism and hospitality industry and has a long operational history in Key West through Historic Tours of America and its affiliated companies. The organization operates multiple visitor oriented attractions and facilities in the city and other historic tourism markets. This experience indicates a strong understanding of visitor services, tourism operations, and management of historic properties within high traffic tourism environments.</p>
2	Financial Capacity	25	24	<p>a. Proven ability of Respondent to possess or attract equity and debt capital for projects similar in scope and cost to the proposed Hospitality House Redevelopment Project as evidenced by:</p> <p>i. Financing comparable projects.</p> <p>ii. Access to sufficient debt and equity for the project proposed.</p> <p>iii. On-going relationships with financial sources.</p>	<p>The proposal indicates strong financial capacity supported by an established national tourism operator with multiple revenue producing operations. The proposer appears to have sufficient financial resources and operational backing to undertake the rehabilitation of a historic structure and support long term operations.</p>
3	Project Vision and Key Objectives	25	23	<p>a. Consistency of proposed vision and objectives.</p> <p>b. Responsiveness to key objectives.</p> <p>c. Fit and synergies of proposed use(s) and improvements with surrounding land uses.</p> <p>d. Overall ability of the project to add to the vitality of the surrounding Maloney Square area</p>	<p>The proposal presents a concept focused on activating the historic structure as a visitor oriented facility that complements the surrounding Maloney Square tourism environment. The vision includes visitor services, hospitality uses, and limited retail, which appear compatible with the location and the city's interest in adaptive reuse of historic properties.</p>
4	Feasibility	20	18	<p>a. Evidence of ability of the Proposer to attract necessary public and private investment for the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project proposed.</p> <p>b. Feasibility of the concept to address the needed physical improvement to and retrofit of Hospitality House in the near term.</p> <p>d. Cash flow projections that demonstrate the project, once operational, will meet all lease, debt service and operating expenses.</p>	<p>Based on the proposer's operational experience in Key West and other tourism markets, the project appears feasible. The proposer demonstrates familiarity with visitor oriented operations and the local tourism economy, which suggests a reasonable likelihood of successful implementation.</p>
Total Score:				94	

RFP 26-001 - Re-Bid Historic Building Rehabilitation Lease and Adaptive Use Hospitality House

#	Evaluation Category	Max Points	Evaluator Score	Key Evaluation Considerations	Notes / Justification
1	Experience	30	24	<p>a. Successful track record of rehabilitating and operating facilities similar to the proposed Project.</p> <p>b. Demonstrated ability to operate and maintain adaptive reuse real estate projects once completed, including addressing on-going maintenance needs.</p> <p>c. Sufficient staff and resources to deliver the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project.</p>	<p>The proposer demonstrates experience in the development and operation of hospitality and commercial establishments in Key West, including restaurant operations and redevelopment of historic structures. The development team includes professionals in architecture, engineering, construction, and environmental restoration. While the proposer has relevant local experience, the scale of historic redevelopment and adaptive reuse experience appears somewhat more limited compared to larger tourism operators.</p>
2	Financial Capacity	25	20	<p>a. Proven ability of Respondent to possess or attract equity and debt capital for projects similar in scope and cost to the proposed Hospitality House Redevelopment Project as evidenced by:</p> <p>i. Financing comparable projects.</p> <p>ii. Access to sufficient debt and equity for the project proposed.</p> <p>iii. On-going relationships with financial sources.</p>	<p>The proposer indicates that the project would be funded through available cash reserves and provides financial documentation demonstrating available funds. The proposal outlines development costs and operating projections. While the proposer appears capable of financing the project, the scale of financial resources appears more limited than that of larger institutional operators.</p>
3	Project Vision and Key Objectives	25	23	<p>a. Consistency of proposed vision and objectives.</p> <p>b. Responsiveness to key objectives.</p> <p>c. Fit and synergies of proposed use(s) and improvements with surrounding land uses.</p> <p>d. Overall ability of the project to add to the vitality of the surrounding Mallory Square area.</p>	<p>The proposal presents a creative concept focused on environmental education, historic interpretation, and activation of the Mallory Square waterfront area. Elements such as a maritime museum, coral restoration demonstration facility, sculpture garden, and interactive fountain are intended to enhance the public experience and contribute to the vitality of the area. The vision appears compatible with the historic setting and aligns with the broader goals of activating public spaces within Mallory Square.</p>
4	Feasibility	20	17	<p>a. Evidence of ability of the Proposer to attract necessary public and private investment for the Hospitality House Redevelopment Project proposed.</p> <p>b. Feasibility of the concept to address the needed physical improvement to and retrofit of Hospitality House in the near term.</p> <p>c. Cash flow projections that demonstrate the project, once operational, will meet all lease, debt service and operating expenses.</p>	<p>The proposal outlines a development plan including rehabilitation of the historic structure, public space improvements, and adaptive reuse or existing site features. The proposer demonstrates familiarity with the local regulatory environment and outlines a conceptual schedule for implementation. While the project includes several components that may require coordination with regulatory agencies, the overall concept appears achievable.</p>
Total Score:				84	

