

KOTO

“Keep Old Town Old”

Dedicated to Preserving the Character and Appearance of Old Town

October 27, 2015

Historic Architectural Review Commission

3140 Flagler Ave

Key West, FL 33040

Re: 415 Grinnell Street

Dear Commissioners:

On behalf of KOTO and its 1000+ Facebook followers we respectfully request you conscientiously apply the HARC guidelines and accordingly reject the proposal for 415 Grinnell Street for the following reasons:

- 1) The guidelines declare an accessory garage highly visible from the public right-of-way inappropriate in the historic district. (Guidelines P40) 415 should not be allowed to locate a garage on the Grinnell Street elevation simply because it isn't an independent structure. It ruptures the streetscape.
- 2) The proposed house presents a solid first floor wall to the street as if a former porch had been encased with louvers. This would be expressly prohibited by the guideline stating the enclosing of a front porch is not appropriate (Guidelines P33). New construction should not be approved when it mimics that which is forbidden to historic structures.
- 3) The historic fabric of Old Town is characterized by open front porches and homes oriented toward the street whereas this design inappropriately turns its back to the neighborhood. The guidelines require site orientation to be compatible with existing historic construction located near the site. (Guidelines P53) The interior orientation of the proposed structure fails this requirement

4) The house is too tall. If FEMA regulations are dictating the height of the first floor above grade then the developers will need to compromise on the 9' and 10' interior ceiling heights to bring the home into scale with its neighbors. (Guidelines P53)

5) Most roofing in the historic residential zones consists of sloped gables or hipped roofs. (Guidelines P53) Roofing forms used in new construction must be visually compatible with . . . the streetscape and neighborhood. (Guidelines P 26). The horizontal roof lines (used to accommodate a roof deck) are not compatible with the neighborhood. With respect to the roof deck - the only residential "roof decks" in Old Town are widow's walks. Roof lines should not be compromised to facilitate that which will intrude on the street and surrounding neighborhood.

In summary, the 415 Grinnell proposal should be rejected for the foregoing specific reasons and for failing the more general requirements of "compatibility" (Guidelines p.38a & 53), and that new construction "harmonize" with existing historical building stock (Guidelines p.38) and be "in keeping" with the historic character of Old Town (Guidelines p. 38a). While we recognize that "good contemporary design" is not excluded, emphasis should be placed on the second half of the same sentence encouraging only new complementary design.

Please deny this project as proposed.

Dana L. Day

Karen O'Leary

On behalf of ourselves and the 1000+ followers of Keep Old Town Old

Jo Bennett

From: Enid Torregrosa
Sent: Tuesday, October 27, 2015 10:58 AM
To: Jo Bennett
Subject: FW: 415 Grinnell Street

To be included under comments for item 7

Thanks.

Enid

Under Florida law, e-mail addresses are public records. If you do not want your email address released in response to a public-records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by phone." Fl. Stat. 668.6076

From: Ellen Frogner [mailto:efrogner@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, October 27, 2015 10:51 AM
To: Enid Torregrosa
Subject: 415 Grinnell Street

Dear HARC Commissioners.

I want to tell this commission that what they have been allowing to happen in Old Town Key West is so very wrong.

As a fifth generation born and raised Conch, I have always been proud of our beautiful architecture and history. I was raised to believe that this is one of the best points of interest Key West has to offer. It is year round not seasonal. Our family lived at 620 Southard, one of the most beautiful homes on the island and later 1100 South Street.

My father (not a Conch) was a resident since the 50s, married a Conch and dedicated service to OIRF for years. What has happened to your pride in Historical Key West? This group of Commissioners should be ashamed of what they are allowing to happen. We must stop these inappropriate buildings from being approved.

Ellen Nettles Frogner

(proud to be the daughter of Larry and Judy Nettles, grandchild of Edwin and Elinor Trevor, great niece of Mary Trevor, great grandchild of Benjamin Douglas Trevor... and so on and so forth)..

Ellen

Frogner

Trust in the Lord with all your heart, lean not on your own understanding. In all your ways, acknowledge Him, and He will make your path straight. Proverbs 3:5-6