

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

August 28, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 1 of 7

<b>Call Meeting To Order</b>	
Chairman Rudy Molinet called the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission (HARC) Meeting of August 28, 2012 to order at <b>5:30 pm</b> at Old City Hall, in the antechamber at 510 Greene Street, Key West.	
<b>Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag</b>	
<b>Roll Call</b>	
	Commissioners present include: Donna Bosold, Theo Glorie, Maggie Gutierrez, Michael Miller, Vice Chairman Bryan Green, and Chairman Rudy Molinet.  Commissioners absent: Daniel Metzler  Also, present from City staff: Assistant City Attorney Ron Ramsingh, Historic Perseveration Planner Enid Torregrosa, IT Mike Rivera, and Recording Secretary Jo Bennett.
<b>Approval of Agenda</b>	
	Chairman Rudy Molinet inquired as to any changes to the agenda. Enid Torregrosa stated that item #3 the August 15, 2012 Minutes needs to be postponed since they were not ready for review and that items #7a and 7b were postponed by Staff prior to the meeting due to incomplete application information.  <b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the Agenda with changes as noted by Ms. Torregrosa be <b>Approved</b> . The motion <b>Passed</b> by a unanimous voice vote.
<b>Approval of Minutes</b>	
<b>1</b>	<b>June 26, 2012</b>  <b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the Minutes be <b>Approved</b> with the correction as noted by Bryan Green. The motion <b>Passed</b> by a unanimous voice vote.
<b>2</b>	<b>July 24, 2012</b>  Mr. Molinet read corrections to item #6 and item #8 into the record.  <b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Theo Glorie, that the Minutes be <b>Approved</b> with the correction as noted by Mr. Molinet. The motion <b>Passed</b> by a unanimous voice vote.
<b>3</b>	<b>August 15, 2012</b>  Minutes were <b>Postponed</b> during Agenda approval.
<b>HARC Planner's Report</b>	
	Ms. Torregrosa reported she will be on vacation in Paris starting September 01, 2012 and returning to work on September 24, 2012. Ms. Torregrosa added that during her time away Mr. Craig and Mr.

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

August 28, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 2 of 7

	<p>Cunningham will be covering for her.</p> <p>Mr. Molinet asked Ms. Torregrosa what happened to the old clock that was at the corner of Duval and Southard. Ms. Torregrosa stated she did not know but would try to find out. Karen Olson, City of Key Engineering Services Department, who was in the audience for an agenda item, responded that the clock was taken down for repair and is in the hands of the City's Public Works Department.</p> <p>Ms. Torregrosa announced that Wayne Giordiano the HARC Inspector just passed the test for Certified Plan Reviewer. Ms. Torregrosa added that this means that Mr. Giordiano will be able to help review plans for HARC and help determine if the plans submitted to the Building Department are the same as approved by HARC.</p> <p>Mr. Molinet asked Ms. Torregrosa for an update on the budget. Ms. Torregrosa responded that Don Craig is working on a document for proposed fees.</p>
<b>Assistant City Attorney's Report</b>	
	<p>Mr. Ramsingh stated that during the Code Hearing on August 22, 2012, for the appeal of the James Street denial, the Special Magistrate sent the item back to the HARC Commission for more clarification – ie. "What Guideline(s) were used for the denial." and "How the Guideline(s) were applied.". Mr. Ramsingh requested that a review and discussion of the James Street item be on the agenda for the next HARC meeting. Mr. Ramsingh also asked that the Commissioners review the meeting videos and be prepared to discuss the item in order to satisfy the Special Magistrate's request.</p> <p>Mr. Glorie asked Mr. Ramsingh about the multiple sandwich board signs that have been placed at the Post Office for "Parking" and what if anything can be done about them. Mr. Ramsingh responded that the concern needs to be reported to Code Compliance.</p>
<b>Old Business</b>	
<b>4</b>	<p>Demolition of seating area in front of the store at Front Street- <b>#501 Front Street- FMH Builders Inc. (H12-01-1234) Second reading.</b></p> <p>The applicant was not present but requested the item be heard in his absence.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> Ginny Haller presented her Staff report. Ms. Haller stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the second reading of a request for demolition, as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Haller stated that the proposed demolition will be for a structure that is not historic and will not be considered contributing in a near future.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> The Commissioners had no additional comments or discussion.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Bryan Green, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet No: 1 – Mr. Glorie</p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

August 28, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 3 of 7

<b>New Business</b>	
<b>5</b>	<p>Major Development Plan-Site development with hardscape and lighting design- <b>#522 Angela Street- City of Key West/ mbi/k2m (H12-01-1181)</b></p> <p>Anthony Sarno and Liz Newland presented the project. Mr. Sarno described the project design for the hardscape and lighting. Mr. Sarno also mentioned to the Commissioners that the Landscape Design was presented to the Tree Commission at the August 16<sup>th</sup> meeting and approval was received. Mr. Sarno stated that the design plans includes surface finishes, street furniture, new fountain and a perimeter fence on some site areas. Since there will be a difference in grade heights from the corner of Simonton and Angela Streets towards the parking area a ramp is proposed with artwork railings resembling fire. The proposed design includes the preservation of the old tree on Simonton Street. Liz Newland explained the paving and the use of each of the four (4) different pavers. Ms. Newland stated that the concept for the overall design is "Fire and Water". Ms. Newland stated that the proposed fountain at the corner of Angela and Simonton Streets will define the urban block and will give a pedestrian scale. Ms. Newland explained the fence facing Angela Street will also provide a pedestrian sense as well as an urban façade to this part of the block. Ms. Newland also reviewed the seating areas. Mr. Sarno described the three (3) different lighting fixtures their planned use on the site. Mr. Sarno and Ms. Newland remained to respond to questions from the Commissioners.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed site development of the parking lot and public spaces for the corner lot of Angela and Simonton Streets which belongs to the City of Key West. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the site will be developed with the construction of a new fire station, public bathrooms facilities and public transportation drop off. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is staff's opinion that the proposed hardscape elements are contemporary in design and are in keeping with the proposed new fire station as well as the surrounding urban fabric. Ms. Torregrosa also stated that it is staff's opinion that the proposed design and hardscape features are consistent with the guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed design brings architectural elements that will promote a sympathetic scale at the pedestrian level and a sense of an urban park rather than an asphalt parking lot, which is the actual perception of the existing site. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this project will require Planning Board and City Commission review since it is a Major Development Plan.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> Michael Miller recused himself.</p> <p>Theo Glorie asked if parking would remain on Angela Street. Mr. Sarno responded that it was his understanding that the parking would remain but that decision is not part of the project.</p> <p>Rudy Molinet stated that he wants to complement the applicant both the City and the architect. Mr. Molinet asked Mr. Sarno if there was a plan for the maintenance of the fountain. Mr. Sarno responded that they are working with the City to develop one.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Ms. Donna Bosold, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 5 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet Recused: 1 – Mr. Miller</p>
<b>6</b>	New wall sign with neon tube. Sign copy "Bad Apple"- <b>#422 Appelrouth Lane- Will Shepler</b>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

August 28, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 4 of 7

	<p><b>(H12-01-1239)</b></p> <p>Will Shepler presented the project. Mr. Schepler explained that their first design encountered issues when it was determined by Keys Energy that the sign would be too close to power lines therefore they had to change the design. Mr. Schepler stated that Keys Energy requires that the new sign must be at least 3'6" away from existing electric service drop. Mr. Shepler stated that the new design is based on the original but scaled back. Mr. Schepler stated that the channel letters will be 10 ¼" tall and each one will have red neon tube. Mr. Shepler stated that the sign will be 10'-8" high by 1' wide. Mr. Schepler remained to respond to Commissioner's questions.</p> <p><b>Public Comments:</b> There were no public comments.</p> <p><b>Staff Report:</b> <b>Design:</b> Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is a proposed installation of an aluminum projecting sign with channel letters and neon tubing on a 1940's structure. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the recipient building has art deco elements, was built as a commercial structure in 1961 and, according to a photograph circa 1965 used to have a projecting sign with neon tubing. Ms. Torregrosa stated that there is evidence that a marquee neon sign used to be located in the façade. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the applicant proposed a similar sign as the one showing in the circa 1965 photo from the Property Appraiser's records but the design is in conflict with actual regulations from Key's Energy. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the proposed design is consistent with the guidelines. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that the new sign will be in keeping with the historic character of the building and with its surroundings, the Strand marquee sign is in axis with Appelrouth Lane.</p> <p><b>Commission Discussion:</b> Michael Miller asked if the sign is back lit? Mr. Shepler responded that the sign is not back lit just painted a bright white. Mr. Miller asked what are the colors of the channels and the neon? Mr. Shepler responded that the channels are brushed aluminum and the neon will be red.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Mr. Michael Miller, that the item be <b>Approved</b> with the condition that the applicant supply samples of the neon color and the paint color to Staff for approval. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
<b>7a</b>	<p>Construction of two story structures- <b>#722 Caroline Street- Paul Saviski (H12-01-1364)</b></p> <p>The item was postponed by Staff prior to the meeting due to incomplete application information.</p>
<b>7b</b>	<p>Demolition of two existing structures- <b>#722 Caroline Street- Paul Saviski (H12-01-1364)</b></p> <p>The item was postponed by Staff prior to the meeting due to incomplete application information.</p>
<b>8a</b>	<p>New sexton's house, one and a half story- <b>Passover Lane- City of Key West/ Michael Miller (H12-01-1366)</b></p> <p>Michael Miller recused himself.</p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

August 28, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 5 of 7

Mr. Miller presented the project. Karen Olsen the Project Manager for the City was present to respond to questions. Mr. Miller explained Sexton and the uses of the house. Mr. Miller explained that the new entrance will be from Margaret Street. Mr. Miller described the design of the new proposed Sexton's house. Mr. Miller stated that this new building will house the Sexton's office, family room for visitors, the cemetery archives, bathroom facilities, maintenance room and the attic will be used as a mechanical and storage room. Mr. Miller stated that the project has a couple of issues to deal with since the area where the house is to be build has graves on one side and a Sausage tree on the other which restricts the structures footprint. Mr. Miller stated that ground penetration radar will be used to identify any graves in the construction area. Mr. Miller stated that the design was chosen in order to give the building the appearance equal to its importance. Mr. Miller stated that they are still working out the details for the building color and the finalization of the roof covering but would return to the Commission once the plans are finalized. Mr. Miller remained to respond to questions from the Commissioners.

## **Public Comments:**

There were no public comments.

## **Staff Report:**

### **Design:**

Enid Torregrosa presented her staff report. Ms. Torregrosa stated that a request for the construction of a new one and a half story civic structure as a replacement of the existing sexton's house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the structure will be located next to the Cemetery's main entrance and in axis with Passover Lane. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building is modeled on a Georgian style with a centered front portico supported by Tuscan columns and a symmetric façade. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building will have hip roofs that will not exceed 20'-6" on its highest point from grade. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new structure will have stucco finished walls, crowning molds on both the first and the half floors, metal casement impact windows. A wood paneled bay window is depicted on the south façade. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the plans also include the partial removal of the existing perimeter fence in order expose the new structure to the urban fabric. Ms. Torregrosa stated that new metal gates are proposed. Ms. Torregrosa stated that an old tree located adjacent to the cemetery's main entrance will be protected and preserved. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the building will be located on an AE-6 flood zone and it will be elevated to meet the FEMA requirements. Ms. Torregrosa stated that an ADA ramp is proposed on the front façade. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the proposed new design for the Sexton's house is in keeping with the surrounding historic fabric. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the new building will complete an urban façade; today's urban experience along the corner of Passover Lane and Margaret Street is a fenced lot in front of a building side with no architectural elements or quality. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed new design will create a building with a main entrance facing the street. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the proposed design complies with the guidelines, with the exception of setback requirements, and that the building will not have an effect on the historic urban context. Ms. Torregrosa concluded stating that this proposed design will require review and approval from the Planning Board.

### **Demolition:**

Ms. Torregrosa stated that this is the first reading for the demolition of the existing Sexton's house. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Sanborn map of 1962 depicts a footprint of a one story wood structure, with a porch facing south for tools storage. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the existing building is a one story CBS structure, rectangular in shape. Ms. Torregrosa stated that Staff understands that the request for this demolition should be reviewed using the demolition criteria of Chapter 102 Section 218 of the LDR's. Ms. Torregrosa stated that it is Staff's opinion that the Commission can consider the request for demolition as it is consistent with the criteria for demolitions in the historic district, Sec. 102-218 of the Land Development Regulations. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the proposed demolition will be for a structure that is not historic nor can it be considered contributing in a near future.

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

August 28, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 6 of 7

	<p><b>Commission Discussion:</b></p> <p>Bryan Green asked Mr. Miller to explain the way the building and fence are aligned and how the fence line goes. Mr. Miller indicated the path of the fence and pointed out that the new building will face the street without anything between it and the street. Mr. Green inquired about what steps will be taken to protect the Sausage tree. Mr. Miller and Ms. Olsen responded that they have already been working with the City's Urban Forestry Manager.</p> <p>Donna Bosold asked what happened with using the site that was acquired a few years ago. Ms. Olsen responded that the site does not have any access from any street only foot paths. Ms. Bosold also asked if anything is being done about chickens roosting on the roof. Mr. Miller stated that he did not know that there was a chicken problem on that corner</p> <p>Theo Glorie stated that he thinks the new building is a huge</p> <p>Rudy Molinet stated that it is his opinion that the new design is magnificent. Mr. Molinet stated that he is pleased with the project.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b></p> <p>A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
<b>8b</b>	<p>Demolition of existing sexton's house- <b>Passover Lane- City of Key West/ Michael Miller (H12-01-1366)</b></p> <p>In an effort to expedite the meetings all discussion took place during the discussion of item 8a.</p> <p><b>Actions/Motions:</b></p> <p>A motion was made by Mr. Theo Glorie, seconded by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, that the item be <b>Approved</b>. The motion <b>Passed</b> by the following vote: Yes: 6 – Ms. Bosold, Mr. Glorie, Ms. Gutierrez, Mr. Miller, Mr. Green, Chairman Molinet</p>
<b>Comments from Commissioners</b>	
	<p>Theo Glorie stated that he still has a problem with approving the demolition of the seating area. Mr. Glorie stated that he thinks there are too few places for visitors to sit and relax. Mr. Molinet reminded Mr. Glorie that the bench is on private property. Mr. Ramsingh reminded Mr. Glorie concerning the issues with having areas that will be utilized by the vagrants.</p> <p>Bryan Green lead a discussion concerning what next steps needed for the Survey. Ms. Torregrosa stated that the Survey will be presented to the Planning Board on September 5<sup>th</sup> and then it will be going to City Commission. Ms. Torregrosa stated that when she returns from vacation she will start planning Public Workshops to discuss the survey's results with the public. Ms. Torregrosa added that those Workshops are needed to help determine what will be the next steps as it relates to the additional Historic buildings identified in the survey. Ms. Torregrosa stated the next steps are just to educate. Ms. Torregrosa stated that HARC will need to have a Workshop itself to determine what will be presented at the public workshops. Mr. Miller stated that he would like to see Mr. Green create a document for the framework for the public workshops. The bottom line is that much discussion is needed concerning the survey and how to use it.</p> <p>Theo Glorie asked when will the signage workshop be scheduled. Ms. Torregrosa responded that due to the need to work on the grant and the survey she has not found the time to work on the Sign Workshop, which would be both HARC and Planning Board working together for the solution but</p>

# Minutes of the Key West Historic Architectural Review Commission

August 28, 2012

**DRAFT**

Page 7 of 7

	would start working on the organization for the workshop to be scheduled sometime in November.
<b>Adjournment</b>	
	<b>Actions/Motions:</b> A motion was made by Ms. Maggie Gutierrez, seconded by Mr. Bryan Green, that the meeting be <b>Adjourned</b> . The motion <b>Passed</b> by a unanimous vote.  Meeting adjourned at <b>6:56 pm</b> .

Submitted by,

*Jo Bennett*

Administrative Coordinator  
Planning Department